

RAJYA SABHA

***SUPPLEMENT**

TO

SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE

(Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)

Thursday, February 08, 2018/ Magha 19, 1939 (Saka)

THE UNION BUDGET, 2018-19

General Discussion - Contd.

SHRI MANAS RANJAN BHUNIA, making his maiden speech, said: I think that this Budget is against the concept of federalism. We protest it. Our Chief Minister protested demonetization. The effect of demonetization was on the poor and unprivileged people. Many people have committed suicide. Their voice was not heard properly by the Government. This is not a healthy symbol of the Parliamentary democracy. We protested that sudden and hasty implementation of the GST would not give any positive effect. Ms. Mamata Banerjee and Dr. Manmohan Singh protested along with others. But Government did not bother about what the Opposition was saying. The result is that agricultural and Industrial growth has come down. Only the service sector has witnessed a little rise. Employment generation is in negative. When the growth is coming down, the employment generation cannot be high. Hon. Finance Minister's mission is to strengthen agriculture, kisans, health, education, employment, MSME and infrastructure, but where is the money, is not explained. For the benefit of the people and about the prevention and treatment of diseases, the approach of the Central

***This Synopsis is not an authoritative record of the proceedings of the Rajya Sabha.**

Government is ambiguous and confused. Ayushman Bharat programme sounds good if implemented properly. I think that it will be a great benefit to the multinational insurance companies not for the benefit of the people as within a short period of time Bill goes up and up which gives benefit to the insurance companies. As far as the issue of agriculture is concerned, it is mentioned that the income of the farmers will be doubled in 2022. We may be informed how it will be fulfilled. Two crore employment in a year were promised but it is far from reality. In this Budget he again reiterated that 70 lakh employments would be generated. Where from will it come? Under MNREGA 100 days job is still lagging in different States. West Bengal got the first place in creation of 100 days' employment. We prayed to the Central Government for some moratorium but it was neither considered nor granted. Finance Minister has mentioned about 'Beti Bachao Beti Padhao'. I humbly submit to the hon. Finance Minister to follow the path of Ms. Mamata Banerjee in this regard who has initiated many welfare schemes for women. MSME is a very important component in the industrial development which has come down. There is no relief to the poor, middle class, salaried people. Inflation has reached an inflammatory level. Government and the hon. Prime Minister are very sympathetic to the industrial sector. Therefore this Government cannot be called as farmers-friendly, middle class-friendly, poor-friendly. This Government will be termed as big industry-friendly and rich-friendly. Farmers have not been provided any relief in terms of the banking loans and credit limit. I will salute the Finance Minister, if he announces that he is going to waive the debt burden of the entire farmers of India. For the Minimum Support Price, the advice of Dr. Swaminathan must be considered. There are so many fibres in the nature. There should be no concentration only on Bamboo Mission in this Budget Speech. The Government is urged to approve a natural fibre mission to include all natural fibres. Railway projects of West Bengal have been neglected in the Rail Budget. There is no reflection of survey of metro projects. Eight local trains have been withdrawn. This budget is a rosy gossip but not a reality.

SHRI DILIP KUMAR TIRKEY: Announcement regarding MSP made in the budget is welcome but there should be no irregularity while determining the MSP. Health insurance for 10 crore families is welcome but it should have been for every Indian citizen. Many aspirations of Odisha have not been met in this budget. It has been totally neglected in the budget. Upgradation of railway stations of Odisha, announced in previous budgets has not yet started. Government is urged to revert to previous sharing pattern of central schemes for Odisha as it is a tribal dominated state. It is requested to restart BRGF and IAP in Odisha. There should be greater role for states in deciding and finalising central schemes. The complete process of allocation and fund release of central schemes needs to be reviewed with necessary improvements. Government is urged to open branches of banks in Odisha rapidly to promote financial inclusion. Central Government should give 90 percent and states should bear 10 percent share in state disaster response fund. Government should release states' monthly share of tax on 1st of the month instead of 15th of the month. Central Government should not interfere in selection of districts for 'model of development' as it violates 'Cooperative Federalism'.

SHRI HARIVANSH: As per the Aser Report 10 crore children have come into formal education system without learning mathematics. The responsibility for teaching them needs to be fixed. Our public sector undertakings are bearing a loss of rupees 70 crore everyday. The responsibility for this needs to be fixed. According to economists, the country is in a fiscal debt trap. There were a number of ordnance factories in the country, but there was always import of weapons because it involves commission. There are many incomplete projects in the country. They were built after spending a lot of money. Benami property law was not implemented for many years. Universal Social Security Scheme is very beneficial for the poor. Pradhan Mantri Suraksha Yojana, Jyoti Beema Yojana, implementation of food security act, electronic payment under PDS and MGNREGA, provision of cylinder under Ujjwala Yojana, "Aayushman" scheme for healthcare have benefitted the poor. Allocation for agriculture, infrastructure and social security has laid foundation for a new India.

The society has witnessed the impact of social security schemes on the poor in Bihar. Under the leadership of Nitishji, for the first time, Bihar has achieved a higher growth rate than other larger states. It is the result of development with justice. Ever since coming into power in 2014, the Government has taken action against black money and benami properties. The entire fiscal deficit, as reflected in the current budget, owes itself to the earlier days. We have huge burden of foreign debt, but this Government has repaid some of that. The earlier governments have left behind a legacy of corruption and misgovernance. I would like to thank the hon'ble Prime Minister that he has not made a populist budget having an eye on 2019 election. It is a bold step. The budget spending will focus on three areas-employment, agriculture and health. Over the last three years, India's foreign policy has witnessed a sea change. It is becoming more articulate now. It includes proposals which are mutually beneficial

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: At the time when Andhra Reorganization Bill was being legislated a commitment was made. That commitment should be honored now. The genuine demands of the people of Andhra Pradesh should be fulfilled. I fully endorse the proposed uplift of the poor, farmers and women etc in the budget. Definitely, we are with the Government in doing all these good things. A number of schemes covering all sectors have been announced in the budget. But that is not supported by budgetary arithmetic. The Budget has supported the Modicare, but allocation is not there to meet that promise. Budgetary exercise turned out to be something playing deception on the people and the honesty and integrity of the entire exercise stands serially compromised. The philosophy of your economic management is a mechanism articulated for transferring the resources. There exists economic inequality. The majority of the population is getting nothing but a very handful section of the people is garnering extra money. In successive Budget they have made this thing. Only one percent of our population has increased their national wealth. This process needs to be reversed. The burden on the people is increasing. The extortion from the people is increasing. You had given concession on direct corporate tax. You have imposed extra burden on the rest people. The post GST indirect tax burden, State and Central

tax together, has gone way above the pre-GST indirect tax burden. Direct and indirect tax mismatch is one of the indicators of greater extortion from people. Direct and indirect tax mismatch is a matter of tax theft. Even after giving all the concessions, whatever tax is assessed by the tax administration, remained unpaid. There is undisputed assessed tax which has not been collected. Much has been talked about black money and other things. The black money is generated under the patronization of your tax administration. This is another way of extorting people and benefitting your community. National Health Protection Scheme is a good scheme and supported by all. The total expenditure of the Government has fallen. In order to achieve the fiscal deficit target, expenditure has been reduced. It impacted the generation of employment. It cannot be generated in a year, it can be generated by expanding productive activities and project acceleration in the economy which can be done through industries, service establishments, expansion etc. For all these, a lot of investment is required. The gross capital formation has taken a nosedive. The agricultural sector and rural development is your priority but the allocation in this Budget to the above has fallen in real terms. Your allocation to rural, agriculture and allied services has come down. The Central expenditure on education has also fallen. It is a false statement that Government has already given one and a half times the cost of production for rabi crops and they have decided to give it further for kharif crops. The statement should be withdrawn. Please don't cheat the people. The agricultural workers and the rural poor are migrating due to their falling income. There is increase in MNREGA allocation. The allocation for National Health Mission has been reduced. The mandays created are going down despite efforts by many of the State Governments. The State Government, despite the difficulties, are administering the scheme to give relief to their people. The poor people are made to work, but their payment is not made. This aspect needs to be seriously considered by the Government. Employment is not being generated. The employment generation is actually negative. The job losses have existed due to the closure of factories. Lots of people have lost their jobs in private telecom sector. The Government is taking casual and contract workers from the Team

Lease. The Team Lease's observation is that in the manufacturing sector the jobs have declined. 21 lakh new jobs have been created under Pradhan Mantri Rozgar Protsahan Yojana. But this yojana was implemented only in garments and apparel sector by way of the Government bearing the burden of employer share of the EPF contribution for the new jobs generated. The hon. Finance Minister is extending it to all sectors. Around nine lakh crore of rupees are spent on garment-apparel sector itself for paying this. No employment is generated. But the money is flowing from the Government Exchequer to the business houses. It is another away of transfer being articulated by this budgetary exercise to take out people's money. The Government officials claim that 57 per cent of the workforce are self-employed, and 69 per cent of these self-employed are earning below Rs.7,500 a day. Your Economic Survey is talking about fall in investment leading to a decline in employment generation. In the name of 'Ease of Doing Business', the labour's rights are being snatched and slavery is being sought to be imposed. The States, particularly led by the Opposition parties, are being subjected to economic repression. They are suffering a lot political influence through your Centrally-controlled officials in different States. This must be corrected to prevent serious unrest throughout the country. But you prefer to remain silent in the matter of your going down in the rank of 'Global Hunger Index. In respect of basic human development parameters like maternal mortality rate, infant malnutrition death at child birth etc., you are going down and down. In the Budget, course correction is required. This practice of transferring from millions to a few must be reversed.

SHRI C.M. RAMESH: I wish to focus mainly on the Andhra Pradesh Re-organization Act. I would like to speak in Telugu. So, kindly make arrangements for interpretation. Refund of taxes and population-wise deferred tax collections have caused a loss of about Rs. 3,800 crores. Among other issues I wish to highlight the formation of Vizag Railway Zone, establishment of Greenfield Crude Oil Refinery Petro-chemical Complex, financial assistance to capital 'Amravati', institutes of national importance, formation of Dugarajapatnam Port at Nellore, increase of Assembly seats and

delimitation, anomalies in taxation matters, steel plant at my district, namely, Kadapa district, establishment of Vizag-Chennai Industrial Corridor, Visakhapatnam and Vijayawada metro, rapid rail and road connectivity to Amravati, development assistance to backward districts, payment of power dues in DISCOM, Schedule IX Institutions and Schedule X Institutions, formation of Greyhounds Training Centre in Andhra Pradesh.

SHRI RAJARAM: The fiscal deficit target set for year 2018-19 is little higher than that for the last year. The Government is avoiding to take risks keeping fiscal deficit in view, so, my question is whether the dream of making the country a developed nation would be realized through this budget? This Government had promised to provide the double price to the farmers for their crop but the problems of farmers are yet to be resolved. Presently, the potato farmers are worried over their potato crop, they are not getting even cost price of their production. Today farmers are agitated and angry. Their agony must be considered and efforts should be made to instigate it. This Government has completed 4 years in office but loans of farmers haven't been waived off. The Budget does not give any details of expenditure for health insurance scheme to provide Rs. 5 lakh to 10 crore families. The Government has fixed a target of distributing free-of-cost gas connection to 8 crore women, but it should also consider how their gas cylinder would be refilled. It was promised before election to provide employment to two crore people, but not even thousands could be provided jobs. Now, Budget mentions about providing employment to 70 lakh people. How would these 70 lakh people get employment? The "Swachh Bharat Abhiyan " was widely publicized, crores of rupees were spent on it but what is its outcome. I urge the Government that the schemes, as chalked out in the Budget, may be implemented honestly.

SHRI RAJEEV CHANDRASEKHAR: I have been consistently arguing for the need of cleaning up governance and creating opportunities for all in the country. I support the model of entrepreneurial, led growth and efficiency in our economy. The poor people are depressed and hopeless because they do not have

institutional support that gives them a fair chance to use their skills, hard work and intelligence to change their lives and this institutional support must contain health, education, and security solutions. Prime Minister Narendra Modi's Government is heading forwards this direction when we look at the real picture in MAY 2014. The Narendra Modi Government took office at the back of an economy that was inarguably left in tatters. There was broken banking system due to NPAs, shattered investor confidence due to corruption and scams and years of profligate spending that had created fiscal crises. Now, let us come back to where we are today. Over the last four years GDP, per capita income and FDI flows have increased, foreign exchange reserve have creased 400 billion dollars, inflation has moderated. The decades of crony capitalism and piggy banking on public sector banks have come to an end, battle against corruption is under way, ease of making investment and doing business has increased. The real inclusive growth is not just about profligate spending. It is also about an architecture that ensures non-leading spending. GST and demonetization are two important reforms. Opposition to demonetization may be due to over all dependence on cash for their politics but to oppose GST is the height of political hypocrisy of congress. I request Finance Minister to accelerate and expedite the findings of the one man Committee on One Rank One Pension and also the Seventh Pay Commission Anomalies Committee. Today, the internet and technology are fast changing the landscape of our lives, economy and business. ICT sector is great opportunity for our nation to emerge as a global superpower and unleash the next wave of investments and jobs. I would urge the Government to create a new National Telecom and Technology policy to mark this the 25th year of opening of the telecom sector. This Government is slowly and steadily transforming country and bringing in the faith and confidence in Government back amongst those who had long been forgotten by in the Government. This Government is certainly fostering a culture of honesty and trustworthiness in the system to develop India on fast track.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: This is most unusual Budget as it is the first Budget after the presentation of which the Prime Minister comes on a delayed live telecast for almost half-an-hour to demystify, to decode and to explain the Budget. I am going to judge the Budget and speak on it, not by my criteria but by the Finance Minister's criteria. This Budget makes three promises--Agriculture, Health and Employment. I would speak on each of these three and finally want to say something on the economic situation. The Government in April, 2014 made a promise that it will enhance the profitability in agriculture by ensuring minimum 50 per cent profit over the production. But on 6th of Feb, 2015 this Government filed an affidavit in the Supreme Court saying that an increase of 50 per cent on costs is unrealistic and is not possible to be given. But again in 2018, the Government announces in the Budget that MSP would be set at 50 per cent profit over the cost of production. For all major rabi crops in the last financial year of the UPA Government, MSP was already well over 50 per cent over the cost of production. The Finance Minister is promising for kharif. The numbers available with the CACP show that for all rabi crops, in 2013-14, what the BJP is promising had already been accomplished by the UPA Government. For major kharif crops, barring the common variety of paddy, in most of the major crops, the MSP was already 50 per cent over the cost of production. The promise is a grave disservice to economic facts which show that the UPA Government in 2013-14 had already achieved that 50 per cent norm. The Government said that increasing MSP adds to inflation. Now, as elections come closer, the Finance Minister says that MSP is necessary for curing agricultural distress. It is a good thing that MSP reality has been realized and the Finance Minister has abandoned the theology that higher MSP means higher inflation! Higher MSP leads to rural prosperity but you have to assure that MSP is actually received by all the farmers. Announcing MSP is one thing and farmers getting MSP is another. Second big announcement is related to the National Health Protection Scheme. I was speaking on the Finance Minister's first big promise to set the MSP at 50 per cent over the cost of cultivation. The point is that this 50 per cent profit over the cost of cultivation was already implemented by Dr. Manmohan Singh's

Government in 2013-14. The Finance Minister has not indicated 50 per cent profit over which cost of cultivation. So, my first question to the hon. Finance Minister is this 50 per cent profit is over which cost of cultivation. He has announced that there will be a national health protection scheme and Rs. 5 lakh insurance cover for 10 crore families. This is an absolutely welcome statement to make. It was first Rashtriya Swasthya Bima Yojna, RSBY with thirty thousand rupees. Then it got transferred to the Ministry of Health. It increased the cover to one lakh rupees in 2016 and it has become rupees five lakhs now. The scheme of one lakh rupees was not implemented. Now, suddenly, a scheme of five lakh rupees is announced. The experience of health insurance scheme in the last 12 years shows that it benefits insurance companies. It does not benefit patients. I would urge the Finance Minister not to follow the US model of universal healthcare based on insurance. I want the hon. Finance Minister to follow the Kerala model and to follow the Tamil Nadu model. My request to the hon. Finance Minister is: please take a pause, please have a re-look. Tertiary care is provided when the priority is secondary care and primary care. The Health Insurance Model creates a demand because corporate hospitals and private hospitals want to get the premium money. We support universal health coverage. We do not support universal health coverage on insurance model. Demonetization and GST has led to formalization of the economy. Informal sector is becoming formal sector. We welcome this. However, to say that because these jobs have become formal, all these are new jobs, this is completely wrong. My request to the hon. Finance Minister is make the data public. Let it be analyzed. We need better indices of employment, but to say that we have solved the jobs problem in India, I think, is a gross exaggeration. All surveys show that job-creation is actually coming down. I urge the hon. Finance Minister not to keep repeating this propaganda that 7.5 million jobs are being created. The formal sector has become bigger because of GST and demonetization, but this does not mean that the rate of employment has suddenly accelerated because of demonetization, GST and other issues. In the ease of doing business, we have moved 42 places. When Dr. Manmohan Singh was the Prime Minister, we moved from 142 to 100.

The basic assumption in ease of doing business is to remove as many regulations as possible. So I request the hon. Finance Minister to have a more intelligent approach to the removal of regulations. Some regulations for health, safety, environment, protection of labour, etc are required. We should not worry about country's rankings. India can't be compared with any other country and the Government must not have comparison our states. You must have cooperative federalism where States work with each other. The GST Council is a good innovation, the Finance Minister deserves credit for running the GST Council in a consensual manner, we should not abandon this approach to federalism. I want to say that the claims made by the Finance Minister on agriculture are vastly exaggerated. We will support the newly announced health insurance scheme. But, I have an apprehension that it will only help private sector and it will not help the real patients. The government must not exaggerate the acceleration in job creation.

SHRI MAHESH PODDAR: This budget is committed to all the priorities of the country and will accelerate their implementation. The Government believes in "Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas". This Budget is going to meet the expectations of all sectors and people of all sections of the country. The budget has convinced the common men of the country that the farmers of the country will be successful to get their income doubled by 2022. There is not only assurance in the budget but there is proper provision for everything therein. 22,000 rural hubs will be setup which will acquire maximum market benefits. 1,000 hectare will be added to include women self-help groups with organic farming. Rs. 200 crore will be invested for medicinal plants. Budgetary provision for food processing industry has been enhanced. 42 state of the art food parks will be established. Provision of Rs. 500 crore for agro logistic facilities and Rs. 1200 crore for Bamboo Development Mission has been made. Now, the farmers will be able to get the benefit of Kisan Credit Card for animal husbandry also besides agro activities. The additional solar energy generated by the farmers will be procured by the government or the power companies, which will become their additional source of income. Provision of Rs. 10,000 crore has been made for fishery, Aqua Infra Fund and animal

husbandry, etc. 8 crore more women will be included through Ujjwala Scheme. 2 crore more toilets will be constructed in coming two years. 4 crore poor families will get free electricity. A special irrigation scheme will be launched in 96 drought-prone districts with a budgetary provision Rs.2600 crore. A dedicated housing fund will be created to provide accommodation to the rural and urban poor. The Prime Minister has given importance to women empowerment and youth empowerment. Under the principle of Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas, he will be moving forward with all.

SHRI NEERAJ SHEKHAR: This budget takes care of their interest only, it has nothing to do with the poor people and farmers of the country. This budget represents this government. This budget is not in the favour of farmers. I want to say here something for farmers. We come from rural areas. This government do not talk about farmers. This government talks for industrialists. The foremost matter in the budget is MSP. Hon'ble Finance Minister has said that they will give one and a half fold MSP to the farmers. But how will you do this. Our top most agro experts had suggested formulas for this. It will be given on the cost only. *(Speech unfinished)*

Discussion not concluded.

SPECIAL MENTION

Demand to indicate Distinctly the Data regarding Generation of Employment under Current Government in the EPFO Network

SHRI P.L. PUNIA: My special mention is about clarification of beneficiaries in EPFO network. The present Prime Minister of the country had made a promise during the general election to provide employment to two crore people per year. The Ministry of Labour has proposed to incorporate people engaged in self-employment, under Pradhan Mantry MUDRA Yojna. I urge upon the government to show new employments created during the tenure of present government separately in the enrolment figures under EPFO. Apart from this, such

employments may also be mentioned, which are lost after implementation of demonetisation and GST.

(Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu associated.)

Desh Deepak Verma,
Secretary-General.

rssynop@sansad.nic.in

**ERRATA TO THE SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE DATED
08TH FEBRUARY, 2018**

Page No.	Line No.	Correction
100	8	Delete 'with'.
103	20 & 21	Read 'proved to be' for 'was said that it was'.