

RAJYA SABHA

***SUPPLEMENT**

TO

SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE

(Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)

Wednesday, February 07, 2018/ Magha 18, 1939 (Saka)

MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS -

Contd.

SHRI ABDUL WAHAB: I appreciate the Government of Modiji! Because they are taking great care in Muslim women's case! As a Muslim, I am appreciating the efforts taken by the Government to protect the rights of Muslim women. Sending them to streets, and their husbands to jail. About the triple talaq Bill, some efforts made by the Ministry of External Affairs. There was the initiative for changing the passport colour to orange instead of blue for classifying the Indians under different category. Especially in the case of Haj, they are taking good steps by reducing whatever subsidy we have! They have already taken it back. The Supreme Court was giving ten years, but now the Government has taken it back in 8 years itself.

SHRI SANJIV KUMAR: Jharkhand is known as tribal home land. Tilak Majhi, Seedho Kano and Chand Bhairev, were the freedom fighters of Jharkhand. In the President's Address it has been mentioned that a museum regarding freedom fighters would be constructed in the Jharkhand. It is very sad to say that neither their names have been mentioned in any of the book nor their portraits have been put-up anywhere in the Parliament. Nothing has been done for

*This Synopsis is not an authoritative record of the proceedings of the Rajya Sabha.

Naxals Problem, but 15 innocent tribes have been shot down in Bakoria. It is the first time that budget of the State Assembly has been passed without debate. And this is the first incident of the country that the Chief Minister has abused Leader of the Opposition on the floor of the House. As far as corruption is concerned two ex-Chief Secretaries have been punished for corruption. People are starving in the Jharkhand and farmers are committing suicide.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: This Address talks of new assurances. There is no mention of status of assurances made earlier. It does not mention the accounts of the Government of last three and half years. Government is of the view that all assurances made earlier have been fulfilled but it is not so. This Address negates the reality. No mention has been made about the status of the projects announced earlier. It has been mentioned that every youth does not want employment but 'Start-up'. Nothing has been mentioned about security factor, foreign policy of India and diplomacy. It has been mentioned the prestige of India has gone up in international scenario as Indian Judge has been elected in the International Court of Justice whereas he has been re-elected and this fact has not been mentioned. Situation on the borders and in the Maldives has not been mentioned in the Address. It would have been better that the Government of the day accept this that former Prime Ministers of India had also extended their contribution for nation building. Earlier also nation had many achievements to its credit. Please do not insult achievements made by our scientists. Our Government takes credit of establishing 5 IITs, IIM in Ahmedabad in 1961, the Bhabha Atomic Research Centre Trombay, Mumbai, space Application Centre in Ahmedabad in 1966. First Nuclear test was carried out by India at Pokhran in 1974, launching of India's first satellite Aryabhata in 1974, India's first mission to Mars-Mangalyaan was sent into space in 2013. Hence, to say that nothing concrete was achieved in the country during our tenure is like insulting history, all scientists, all institutions and country. The average annual GDP growth rate during UPA Government's ten-year tenure was 7.9 per cent.

After the year 2004, our country multiplied its GDP four times within a decade under the UPA regime. Prior to that, in the reign of BJP, the economy of the country was very poor. It cannot be said that India had no identity before this Government. The present Government made so many tall promises which proved wrong. The Prime Minister had the International Yoga Day observed in the United Nations' Organization. It is a good thing. In our Government's regime also, United Nations' Organization observed it unanimously but it is never mentioned. It is true that there is criticism and opposition in politics but both the treasury bench and the opposition are imperative in democracy. It was mentioned in the President's Address that our economy is rising very high but it doesn't reflect so. The investment rate was 34 percent in our regime whereas, today, it is 26.9 percent. New industries are not being set up, manufacturing is not taking place, more and more expenditure is being incurred at the advertisements of 'Make In India'. It is amazing that the foreign direct investment in defence sector has come to the tune of Rupees 1 crore and 13 lakhs in this Government's regime. So far as defence is concerned, it is stated in the Address that participation of private sector is being promoted. There is no transparency in your government. You have come into power by making allegations but it will not stay long. There should be truth in the allegations. You have honoured the person who is behind the biggest scam of the country. You are also associated with cricket. We also play cricket. But you have made that person head of cricket, whose statement benefitted you. One more thing is about the Rafael deal. It was being discussed in 2005 and we had issued global tenders for that. It took seven years and three jets of three companies had been shortlisted. That time, it was decided that 18 jets will be acquired in finished state and a public sector company i.e. H.A.L. will develop 108 jets with transfer of technology. The Prime Minister had decided to visit Paris and France and thereafter he declared that 36 jets will be procured at a huge price of 1,570 crore. The price was enhanced from 526 crore to 1,570 crore. It was said that we will bring private sector. You can bring the private sector but not at the cost of the country and defence PSU. Qatar procured 12 Rafael Jets at the cost of 694 crore but we gave 1,570

cores in 2015. Are we not supposed to put a question? It has to be answered. The country was informed that it was done due to emergency purchase. Whether there are two different laws to deal with the corruption. One for us and another for your people and your governments. Government machinery and administration is being misused in the country which should not be done. This conflict is not good. To defame and harass one's political opponents with the intent of revenge, is not a good thing. In the long run, I would say that please remember those with respect who worked for nation building and do not insult your preceding governments.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI NARENDRA MODI), replying to the debate, said: A detailed discussion has taken place in the House on the Motion of Thanks to the Hon'ble President's Address and nearly 38 Hon'ble Members have expressed their opinions here. Whether it is a matter of employment, corruption, income of farmers or foreign policy - all the Members expressed their views on a number of similar subjects. Most of the Hon'ble Members were taking a chance to give a description of their old governments. Which political party should do what, neither I have any right to say anything on it, nor I have anything to say. You made a mention of 'Aayushman Bharat Yojana' here, but gave examples of America and Britain. This logic is not justified. We should think from our country's point of view.

There is a lot that needs to be done for healthcare in our country. We have to understand how we can work in accordance with aspirations of the country. We have introduced "Ayushman Bharat Yojana". It may have shortcomings, but it is for the welfare of the country. Congress should constitute its taskforce to study "Ayushman Bharat Yojana". The ultimate objective of the scheme is welfare of the poor and lower middle class families. If the poor are afflicted with diseases, everything is negated. Sometimes they have to borrow from money lenders and sometimes they prefer to bear affliction rather than borrowing money. There may be more learned and experienced countrymen than us inside and outside our country. We have to think of the ways to make "Ayushman Bharat Yojana" accessible to 40-50

crore people of the country. It is an insurance scheme. Nobody should have any problem if the poor of the country are benefitted from this scheme. If there are any shortcomings in the scheme, we should collectively think of improving it. All people are welcomed to give their suggestions for improvement of this scheme.

If our country's ranking in 'Ease of Doing Business' has improved, it should be a matter of pride for every citizen of the country. Whether our government has done it or other government did it, that can be decided at the time of election. When it is not possible to attack the government, credit rating agency itself is criticized. While criticizing the BJP, you start criticizing India. In politics it is okay to criticize, but when you cross the limits, it is detrimental to the country. Honourable President has envisaged a new India in his speech. Swami Vivekananda and Mahatama Gandhi had also talked about the concept of a new India. Congress says that it wants the old India that belonged to Gandhiji. Gandhiji had opined that Congress was no longer required. We are trying to follow those footsteps. Nobody would want India where there was jeep scam, submarine scam, bofors scam and helicopter scam in the armed forces. Nobody would want India where emergency was imposed, where Jai Prakash Narayan, Morarji Desai and lakhs of people were imprisoned. Nobody would want India where people are deprived of their democratic rights, newspaper offices are locked and thousands of innocent Sikhs are massacred.

When the Tandoor murder case took place, the administration had not taken any action against the high profile persons. A culprit, who murdered the thousands of people, had been taken away from the country by an aeroplane. You went to Davos and we also went there, but you sent a person there with someone's letter. You want such an India. You don't want 'New India'. Hon'ble President mentioned 'Jandhan Scheme'. You criticized it. You say that it was started earlier. We should accept the facts. This record is available that 31 crore jandhan accounts were opened in 2014. You say that we are a name changer, not a game changer. But the fact is that we are aim changer. We achieve target. Whatever target we fix, we make a roadmap to

achieve it by mobilizing the resources and by doing hard work. We work in the direction to get rid of the country from the problems. The congress party wants its ovation. It is natural. I mentioned such a fact in my speech from the rampart of the Red Fort that all previous Governments and State Governments had contributed in the development of the country. While such fact was not mentioned in the speech of Prime Ministers of Congress Party. The things which happened before the year 2014, they are in your account. You wish to take credit. Your rule is too much strange. It is to say about Aadhar that you had started it. This credit must be gone to you. But in this House on 7th of July, 1998 then the Minister for Home Affairs said in his reply to a question that Multipurpose National Identity Cards will be used for issuing Passports, Driving Licences, Rations Cards, Healthcare, Admission in educational institutions, employment in public and private sector, life and general insurance, as also for maintenance of land records and urban property holdings. Aadhar was envisaged twenty years ago. This vision was of Atal Bihari Vajpayee. But we are giving you credit that you had started Aadhar. We have kept national interest first then party and we take decision in the interest of the nation.

The Supreme Court had ordered to constitute SIT, but the previous Government didn't decide about that for three years. We set up the first SIT. Congress didn't implement the Benami Property law for 28 years. The Benami Property law had been passed in both the Houses 28 years back, but rules weren't framed for it, it was not notified and it was stagnating. The erstwhile opposition was not responsible for it. We have seized benami property worth Rs. 3500 crore so far. It was not so that the Insolvency and Bankruptcy Code was not known, but it was not implemented to serve the interest of a number of people, it should be credited to you. We took decisions to instill confidence in the industrial sector of the country, the global community towards India, Indian rules and laws. When we implemented 'One Rank, One Pension', it required Rs. 1000 crore whereas the country was cheated for four decades as far as its implementation was concerned and the last Government had made a provision of merely Rs. 500 crore just before the election. A mid-night

celebration was held for GST and Congress boycotted it. Whatever negativity is there regarding GST, all those are getting credited to your account. It was stated about neem-coating that this too was initiated by the last Government, but if any scheme is left incomplete and unfinished, it causes more losses than benefits. Neem-coating strengthens urea and as such even less quantity of urea can work. Secondly, it brings qualitative change in urea which enhances production. Urea used to be taken away by factories instead of farmers, subsidy used to be released in the name of farmers and it reached to factories. Therefore, we ensured hundred percent neem-coating of urea instead of thirty five percent as well as neem-coating of imported urea before its arrival and as a result of it today there is no scarcity of urea. We ought to stop making announcements in Railway budget as previous Governments had announced more than 1500 such schemes of railway, which were later not taken care of at all. I took initiative regarding all the stuck projects and reviewed those using progress technology. Projects finalized about 30-40 years before came before us, foundation had been laid but no progress was made on those afterwards, projects remained stuck. I didn't say that these projects belonged to previous Governments and started reviewing each project. This country is a continuity, Governments keep on changing as we have democracy here, so we can't stop these. I have cleared projects worth more than Rs. 9 lakh crore so far. Whosoever forms a Government, it is his/her responsibility to run it well. As far as Food Security Bill is concerned, why the previous Government couldn't implement it for an year? I believe, whatever decision is taken, it may be taken with all preparedness to execute it. You said that fertilizer factories were opened during your regime, but these also got closed down and thousands got jobless during your regime itself. We are working on this through policy changes. Today, we are working towards rapid growth of factories lying closed at Gorakhpur in Uttar Pradesh, at Barauni in Bihar, at Sindri in Jharkhand. Jagdishpur Haldia Pipeline has been linked with it so that gas may be supplied from there and the functioning of these factories may be facilitated. This is the region in the country where such an

arrangement would enhance the possibility of development of eastern India.

Eastern states of the country should be developed and the country should see balanced development. We are working on the basis of a simple development theory. Azad Sahab has raised this objection that why Amit Shahji did not speak about Sardar Patel in his speech. I liked that you remembered Sardar Sahab. In recently held Gujrat elections, Sardar sahib figured in Congress Party's literature. It was a welcome change. I think this tradition should continue. But, post election, you seem to have forgotten him. You tried to use his name for political gain. You have raised the issue of Bharat Ratna, which you allege was a subject outside the President's Address. When you raise such issues, they reflect on you also. I have been a Chief Minister, Azad sahib had also been a Chief Minister. From my experience as chief minister, I can say that you have to go into the details of the things. The irrigation projects developed over the years are meant for farming. For several years, we did not create canal network. I have identified 99 irrigation projects and spent huge money on them, so that farmers get water. Fifty projects are already over; the rest will be completed soon. If you had adopted a holistic approach, the work you undertook, would have been completed back then. In our country, more budget allocation means more satisfaction. Not many care to look at outlay, much less look at output. Outcome is seldom discussed. We have decided to present outcome report in Parliament, so that it could be ascertained that money is spent for the purpose, it is earmarked for. Who can object to doubling of farmer's income? The problem is that farming land is fragmented. Through use of technology and modernization, we can hope to increase farmer's income. There was a time when farmers thought sugarcane farming is not possible without flood irrigation. But now sprinklers are being used for sugarcane irrigation. Earlier banana cultivators had to spend money on uprooting banana stem. But now according to the results produced by an agriculture university, the same can be used for making fabric and sustain parched land. Thus, wastage has been turned into wealth. For benefit of sugarcane farmers, we have made ethanol 10 percent. This move is likely to secure farmers. We have

introduced “Kisan Sampada Yojana”. The chain between farm and market has several weak links. We have to adopt a comprehensive approach to improve this situation. Farmers have started online sales on “Inam Yojana” and have raised thirty six thousand crore rupees. We will have to move towards value addition, in order to raise the income of farmers. Use of solar energy in farming can raise farmer’s income, as this will lead to farmer spending less on diesel and electricity.

State Governments can reduce their expenditure by buying electricity. Bamboo had been considered as tree from last 90 years but it was considered as grass in whole world. We made it grass by making law. Now import of Bamboo for making match sticks, kites, incensed sticks is not required and farmers have got a new means of earning.

In Bee-keeping sector much could have been done. In last four years we have established 11 Integrated Bee-keeping Development centres. Now there has been 38 percent increase in honey production. Today the demand of bee wax instead of chemical wax is increasing in whole world and in future we can capture global market. This work would be very easy for the farmers. If we could integrate animal husbandry, fisheries, poultries, value addition together, it would provide the farmers an opportunity to double their income at homes. Condition of farmers would improve but for this to happen we need to make efforts and it would bring positive results.

Today Swachh Bharat Abhiyan, Make in India, Jan-Dhan Yojna, International Youth Day, Action on black money and surgical strike are being made mockery of in the country. But why the constitutional status to OBC Commission is being opposed? Now OBC have got awaken. This section is contributor to society and is asking for its right. It is not allowed to be passed in the name of adding new things. To save vote bank law against Triple Talaq is being opposed and this logic is being given that if someone's son is sent to jail what his parents would eat? But if any Hindu does second marriage he is sent to jail, why no thought is given to his family. A man harassing a woman is also a son of somebody. Why all

restrictions are put on girls why boys are not asked the reasons of their coming late at nights. Where does he go. After all someone need to take care that boys are also given sanskars. It is social pollution and for this it would be better if we all act together. 'Ujjwala Yojna' is one of the biggest means of women empowerment and people engaged in start-up should take up the work of clean cooking in mission mode.

There should be innovation of Solar power based new 'chulhas'. Clean cooking is necessary for the health of women. These are not any political agenda, these are the works in national interest. Toilet and cleanliness are more the behavioural issues than the infrastructural issues. Unless there are behavioural changes, we can not get a break-through. Through advertisement we are educating the people for behavioural changes. A lot of money of poor people was spent by you people for advertising in the newspapers on the birthdays of certain persons. This is for the behavioural changes for which we all have to make efforts. Wherever your State Governments are there, you tell them to allot budget for bringing behavioural changes. Whenever something is talked about dynasty, it was painful and it creates anger also. It is but natural, but I do not want to hurt someone of you politically. The most affected people by the inflation are the lower-middle class and the middle class. We have tried to control the inflation between 2 and 6 per cent. We have tried to provide security and to save the families of middle class and lower-middle class by taking these steps. This Government has done a very big and important work by reducing the bank interest rate and providing subsidy to the families of poor and middle classes for constructing houses. We have reduced the interest rate upto 4 per cent for the loan of rupees 9 lakh and upto 3 per cent for the loan of rupees 12 lakh for constructing houses. Similarly, we have provided the exemption upto 3 per cent for the loan of rupees 2 lakh for old houses in the villages. We have co-operated middle class and lower-middle class in fulfilling their aspirations. Real Estate Regulator Act i.e. 'RERA' was enacted. We have made many amendments in it, which would benefit the common people. We have focussed on empowering the consumers in Consumer Protection Act. We have established Bhartiya Jan Aushadhi Kendras for providing cheaper

medicines to the people. We have reduced the cost of 'Knee-Implants' and 'Stents'.

We worked in a mission mode and more than 22 lakhs of dialysis sessions have been completed till date. People belonging to middle class are able to save thousands of crores by using LED bulbs. The President in his Address has advocated for holding simultaneous elections for Lok Sabha and State Assemblies. This practice was in force till 1967 except on one or two occasions, but it was not criticised then. I am in favour of a detailed discussion in this regard for saving a huge amount of money being spent in elections on regular intervals in the various parts of the country. I hope that all of us will be able to move forward in this regard in the same way like we had taken many decisions in the past for the benefit of next generations.

All the amendments moved were either withdrawn or negatived.

The Motion of Thanks was adopted.

STATUTORY RESOLUTION

Increasing Rate of Basic Customs Duty (BCD) on Chana (Chickpeas)

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE AND THE MINISTER OF CORPORATE AFFAIRS (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): I move that in pursuance of Section 8A (1) of the Customs Tariff Act, 1975, read with sub-section (3) of Section 7 of the said Act, this House hereby approves of Notification No.25/2018-Customs, dated 6th February, 2018 which seeks to increase the rate of basic customs duty (BCD) on chana (chickpeas) falling under tariff item 0713 20 00, of the Customs Tariff Act from 30% to 40%.

The Resolution was adopted.

WITHDRAWAL OF MEMBER

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am reading Rule 255. It says, 'The Chairman may direct any member whose conduct is in his opinion grossly disorderly to withdraw immediately from the Council and any member so ordered to withdraw shall do so forthwith and shall absent himself during the remainder of the day's meeting.' I am asking you, Mr. Ramesh, under Rule 255, to withdraw from the House. Mr. Ramesh has to go out; either he will go out, or, he will have to be removed.

Desh Deepak Verma,
Secretary-General.

rssynop@sansad.nic.in

**ERRATA TO THE SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE DATED
07TH FEBRUARY, 2018**

Page No.	Line No.	Correction
67	9 &15	Read "sealing" for "ceiling".
74	10	read 'that' after 'employment'.