

RAJYA SABHA

***SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE**

(Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)

Thursday, August 10, 2017/ Shravana 19, 1939 (Saka)

FAREWELL TO THE HON'BLE CHAIRMAN

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Ten years is indeed, a very long association. Before becoming the Chairperson of this House as the Vice-President of India, you had experience in various fields of public life. You had been a very distinguished diplomat; you had chaired important commissions, committees and universities but dealing with political fraternity was a different experience altogether. The Chairperson's job is very challenging in this House for the reason that this House, now has a changed character. Things start with a lot of acrimonious debate but nothing remains indefinitely held up. The Chair does play a role, which eventually does force the consensus. Chairman's job is a mixed job because you take the good with the not so good. Your tenure might have seen disturbances but also very high quality of debates on several occasions. I am sure we will all relish those debates and you will carry with you memories of those debates. Your tenure had many interesting anecdotes. I am sure, you retire from this House with great memories. We all recollect the sage advice that you kept giving to us and through us, to the country from time to time. We will always have memories of you as the Chair and how you lent dignity to the quality

*This Synopsis is not an authoritative record of the proceedings of the Rajya Sabha.

of debates in this House while presiding over it. We wish you very good health and many more years in the service of this country.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI NARENDRA MODI): I have firm belief that after a long service, today you would be moving towards a new area of operations because you have kept yourself very much physically fit. You belong to such a family which is having a history of public life nearly of hundred years. You come from the background of such a family which had active role in public life, especially with Congress. You have spent your life as a career diplomat. I came to know the meaning of this after becoming Prime Minister. Because the meaning of the their way of laughing, the way of their shaking hands cannot be understood immediately. Because they are trained like that. But you might have definitely used this diplomacy in the last 10 years. Most of the time of your tenure was associated with West-Asia. After retirement from there, most of your work was similar. But in these 10 years you have been assigned a different responsibility. You have tried your level best to discharge this within the limit of the Constitution. It is possible that there might also be some kind of squirm within you. But, today onwards you will have the joy of freedom and you would have the opportunity to work, to think and to talk as per your basic thought. Whenever I had meeting with you, I learnt many things from you. I certainly felt the insight that you had within yourself. So, I am heartily grateful to you. I express a lot of good wishes to you from the bottom of my heart. I, on behalf of both the Houses and my countrymen, express my gratitude towards you for the services, you rendered to the nation as a Vice-President. After your retirement your experience will be utilised for the social life. Due to the dignities of the Constitution of the nation, your time and strength would be utilised for the guidance of the nation and I wish so.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD): We all are bidding you a farewell here with heavy heart. I had the opportunity to know you for the last 38 years. I had first relation with you when you were the Chief of Protocol and I was appointed as head of Youth Organisation. After that no one was

appointed as Chief of Protocol. You had been a successful Chief of the Protocol in full time with Srimati Indira Gandhi. I had an opportunity to meet you when you were Ambassador to Saudi Arabia. You got several opportunities to render your services in the embassies of many countries. When I was the leader of Haj delegation from our country, you were Ambassador there. That time we had the opportunity to know each other closely. You had done commendable job as Vice-Chancellor Aligarh Muslim University. You chaired that group wherein you worked for all the sections of society so as to infuse confidence among people. There were people from all the parties in this. You took all in confidence and heard the people of all the groups and submitted your report within 11 months. The work performed by you as Chairman of the National Minority Commission will always be remembered. You have also authored many books and many countries have awarded you honorary degrees but you have never used them. You are also a golf sportsman. Now you will get sufficient time to fulfil the hobby. This tenure of yours was very magnificent. All the Chairmen, I have worked with, were very nice Chairmen, but you are the first Chairman with whom I have worked as Leader of Opposition very closely.

The Leader of the House and the Leader of Opposition are closer to the Chairman, so I got more opportunity to understand you. The way you have run the House in the last 10 years is very commendable. You got the benefit of being a diplomat throughout your life. A diplomat does not allow even his enemy to know about his ensuing decisions. You have graced this Parliament by your gentlemanness and your soft-spoken language. Now you would also get the chance to work in social life. I and on behalf of my party thank you a lot and wish for your long life.

PROF. RAM GOPAL YADAV: After having your guidance for a long time, we all are sad at this particular moment. You are multifaceted talented person. You have worked as Ambassador, Vice-Chancellor and Chairman of this House. But you might have faced more difficulties as Chairman of this House because the nature of working of this House is changed. Despite that there was always a

smile on your face. You have never scolded anybody. You have always tried to run the House in proper manner. You have never permitted any Bill to be passed in a din. It was your instruction that whoever presides the House, should not allow the bill to be passed in a din. At this occasion, I and on behalf of my party wish you a long life and also pray that you should be healthy and happy.

SHRI A. NAVANEETHAKRISHNAN: I would like to convey Mr. Chairman that our Amma had high esteem for him. Madam wanted me to get a good name from Mr. Chairman. I leave this to his judgment. Mr. Chairman is the upholder of the rule of law. The manner, in which Mr. Chairman dealt with each and every Member without any discrimination, prejudice, malice and bias, is called the rule of law. You enforce the rule of law and thus, uphold the Indian Constitution. I would like to submit that you are more judicious than any other judicially-trained personality. You conducted this House without any discrimination. I would also like to submit that you are a versatile genius. In one of your speeches you showed the real concern towards our Indian people. Indian people are facing two problems, that is, poverty and unemployment. I would like to submit that you are really a good role model for each and every Indian citizen. I pray to God to give you good health and long life

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: I would like to share some of the things which this House may not know. You always do yoga in the morning, and you do walking in the evening. That is yoga and walk, that is why you are still looking 60 when you are closer to 70. You were a number five batsman and a top agile wicket-keeper. When you were the Ambassador to Iran, you introduced cricket to the staff of the Indian Embassy in Iran and this gesture was welcomed by the Iran as well. One of your biggest achievements in the Rajya Sabha, is “no Bill in the din”. I have learnt several meaningful things from you and what you have done in this House. You extended the working hours of the functioning of the Rajya Sabha by one hour. You introduced the time limit for the Zero Hour. You also changed the system of ducking the questions. It was an intelligent move. You also introduced the concept of morning meeting and called it tea club. We were able to

share everything in those meetings. I would like to add that you never lost your sense of humour. I appreciate that you inspired all of us.

SHRI ALI ANWAR ANSARI: I would like to state that "sympathy" and " help" are inherent to your name. I would only like to add that you have lived up to your name here and proved it right. You, as a Chairman and Deputy Chairman, both of you have shown excellent tuning and coordination. I wish you a long and healthy future life on my behalf and on the behalf of my party.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: It is difficult for me to accept that you are retiring. You have performed an unprecedented responsibility to serve as the Chairman for two consecutive terms. You are a part of distinguished legacy of this House and our Country's history. You have given gravitas to this House. We discuss important things here and whatever be the acrimony, whatever be the differences, eventually we did come to very, very important conclusions, passed many legislations and you stood like a rock in defence of the rights of this House. The question, i.e., what control Rajya Sabha has over this complex called Parliament House and what is the role of the Rajya Sabha is still unresolved. I hope that my colleagues here will continue to resolve this problem. You had a very distinguished career. Apart from your glorious reputation as a career diplomat, you rendered various services to the country as an intellectual, as a contributor in addressing various problems relating to human rights, the Kashmir issue, etc. You were as the best umpire that Aligarh University has ever produced. I want to pay my respects that you have conducted the proceedings of the House in a meticulous fashion according to rules. At the crucial moment of decision about the Lokpal, you adjourned the House. We were bitterly upset. And, unfortunately, we do not have Lokpal even today. But, at that time, we had our differences. But, your contribution, must be placed on record. You shifted the Question Hour. It has made the House more productive and also giving all of us a chance for that one hour in the morning to raise issues of public importance through the Zero Hour. It is very good, because it gives an opportunity for Members to reflect on the real conditions of the people and that of the country. Another

contribution is about your insistence that no legislation can be passed in a din. Next is the question of the Rajya Sabha Television. You favoured an independent Rajya Sabha Television Unit. Shri Shyam Benegal, produced a monumental series called Samvidhaan. There are very many weaknesses which we need to correct. Thank you for steering that Channel in this manner. It also had a flavour of culture. We have illiterate people who could not read, but the philosophy was given to them through the songs. I would request you to continue to share your wisdom with us. We have had ideological differences, but we have a certain commitment and a commonness in terms of building a better India for ourselves and for our future. And, that better India can only happen if all of us are true to our own selves. I only wish that you continue to share your wisdom with all of us and the country, after you leave this August House.

SHRI DILIP KUMAR TIRKEY: It is a very sad day for all of us, as our Chairman is retiring. However, with sadness, it is day of joy that you have further added to the dignity to the post from which you are retiring. You have served the country by holding several important posts. You are the second person in the history of country, who served two terms as a Vice-President. I have learnt a lot from you in the last five years. You always encouraged us in the House and you supported the new members as well. You always encourage the sports. You keep on talking about weaker section of the society even outside the Parliament. I offer you best wishes from my side and on behalf of my party BJD and Chief Minister Shri Naveen Patnaik on this occasion and wish you a good health. I hope that you would continue to provide your guidance to all of us and to the country in future as well.

SHRI C.M. RAMESH: My Party and my Leader, Shri Chandrababu Naidu, we both have high regards for you. At the time when discussion over the bifurcation of the Andhra Pradesh was going on, you heard me patiently. I have learnt a lot of discipline from you. You ask us to speak only on the subject.

SHRI VEER SINGH: After 10 years, we are bidding farewell to you from the House. The memories linked to these 10

years will always remain with us. I was lucky to work under your guidance for 10 years with the blessing of respected bahen Kumari Mayawati. You always heard the treasury benches, opposition and all others persons and gave time to all the persons. You served the country as Vice-President and Chairman of this House. You have taken the best decisions while maintaining the dignity of the Constitution. You always had the feeling of "Vasudhav Kutumbakam". During Question Hour, whenever any member asked a question regarding country's interest or in the public interest, you always allowed him fully. You had been a good sports person. I wish you a good future and healthy life. You are a writer too, so I wish that the citizen and poor people of the country will be benefited through your abilities. I alongwith my Bahujan Samaj Party congratulate you.

SHRI MAJEED MEMON: It is no easy task to run this House. At times, I have occasion to witness that 'point of order' becomes the cause of disorder and there has been disruption and the Chairman finds it extremely difficult. The person on the Chair has extremely difficult job. Tremendous amount of patience, restraint, tolerance is required to be displayed by the Chair which was successfully done by the hon. Chairman for all these years. Your vast experience and your scholarly abilities indeed enhanced the dignity and quality of performance as the Chairman of this august House. For the past one decade you have enhanced the prestige of our country throughout the world. I am glad that we had a scholarly Vice-President for all these years. Your absence will be a great loss to us. Whether you remain Vice-President, Chairman or not but I am fully confident that you will remain an asset for our country, community and society. I alongwith NCP congratulate you for accomplishing this job in an excellent manner.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: I had the privilege of being a Member of this House during the whole of your tenure. Your eloquence and strong vocabulary has impressed us many a time. You were inclusive, accommodative and rotated supplementary questions among Members, so that attention is not focussed just on the right side

or the left side. You also looked towards the back-benchers, which is a special quality of yours for which we are very thankful. Even outside the House, in all the seminars and conferences, you have been very outspoken. You are concerned about the whole country. For bigger issues, you have given very simple solutions. We learnt a lot from you. You contributed significantly to the sanctity and the glory of this Chair.

SHRI SANJAY RAUT: I will only say that we all will miss you a lot. Your role has always been full of restrained and balanced ideas. I am very grateful to you that you maintained the dignity and glorious convention of this House. You always remained impartial. You never allowed anyone to break law or rule. You are bidding adieu from us, but not from the public life. I wish that we continue to work under your guidance. You have provided us Rajya Sabha Channel in inheritance. I have never seen this much impartial and informative channel anywhere in the world. I wish you all the best for your future and good health ahead.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: We shall miss your sagacity, scholarship, sense of fair play, patience and above all, your total commitment to secular values of this country. I shall never forget that you were the Chairman, who allowed 1984 to be discussed in this House and after you allowed that discussion, it was also taken up in the Lok Sabha. Similarly, when it came to the Gurudwara Bill, at a short notice, you allowed the Bill to be tabled and then, fortunately, it was passed without discussion. For me, you have been like an elder brother or a father. You gave small parties and independents a voice in this House. I am sure that in the years to come, the nation will always hear your voice with a lot of respect and reverence. I, on behalf of my Party, wish you good health and many, many years in the service of the nation.

SHRI NAZIR AHMED LAWAY: I am a junior member from J & K and have been watching you since last two years. I am very proud that whatever I have learned from you, will remember throughout from my life. I, on behalf of J & K states and my Government, wish you all the best. I am proud that I learned a lot in

this Parliament during your Chairmanship. I will pray to almighty for your good health.

SHRI D. RAJA: I had the privilege to welcome you when you were elected as the Vice-President of this country and the Chairman of this House. I can proudly call you a great reformer. The reforms, which you introduced, with regard to the Zero Hour, the Question Hour, the Calling Attention Motion, are all very significant. Now, you are demitting your office but we will be looking forward to your wisdom. You are one of the finest citizens of this country. The issues which you have been raising, the concerns you are expressing, they are our issues, they are our concerns, and we will be looking forward to get your guidance and valuable advice in the coming days. With these words, on behalf of my party, the CPI and on my personal behalf, I extend you best wishes for the future.

DR. KARAN SINGH: Your great achievements have already been mentioned by everybody. I am not going to repeat them. I am standing here simply because there have been so many beautiful Urdu shers. I would like to say a Sanskrit couplet because without Sanskrit your departure will not be complete. It is an aashirwad. You are on a higher Chair but I am older than you. So, I have the right to give you aashirwad.

DR. MANMOHAN SINGH: My thoughts go back to the days when you were first elected as the Vice-President and the Chairman of this House. As Prime Minister of India, I received maximum possible guidance and cooperation from you. For me, you have been a friend, philosopher and guide. People like you having great statesmanship have guided this country in various capacities from time to time. I would say that we all wish you good health.

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU: While demitting the office of the Vice-President of India and Chairman of the Rajya Sabha, you have laid high standards which are to be maintained in the coming times. Being a Member of the Rules Committee chaired by you, you gave me a chance to propose the change in the timing of the

Question Hour. You have laid a wonderful model to the parliamentary practices. I wish you all the best.

SHRI RAJEEV CHANDRASEKHAR: Your leadership of the House has been exemplary, dignified and honourable. It has been an honour to know you and to work with you. I wish you the very best and I hope you carry with you good memories of your time with us.

SHRI ABDUL WAHAB: You are a role model for us, especially for the Indian secular Muslims. I always say that India is the best place for any Muslim to live in the world under your leadership. We know the responsibilities of Indian Muslims in India. We all respect you and pray to the Almighty to give you sound health in your life.

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: On behalf of my Party and my Party President, Shri Y.S. Jaganmohan Reddy, I am really grateful to you for the contributions you have made for upholding the Parliamentary values and the way you have conducted the proceedings of the House. You have guided me as to how to raise issues as per the procedure, time management, focus on the subjects without deviation and optimal utilisation of time. I pray to the Almighty to keep you in good health and be in the service of the nation.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SOCIAL JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT (SHRI RAMDAS ATHAWALE): We are happy that you have maintained dignity of this House for the last ten years. You have played a crucial role of strengthening India as per the Constitution of Dr. Baba Saheb Ambedkar. We are proud of you for conducting smooth proceedings of this House without any partiality and maintaining transparency. All of us are proud of you that you will keep on doing good things in future to strengthen unity of India.

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SKILL DEVELOPMENT AND ENTREPRENEURSHIP (SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY): In my personal life with you, I have travelled with you extensively. I know that you have some child-like imaginations and on the basis of these you want to do a lot in your life

related to aviation, cars and golf. You used to come to attend the Parliamentarian's car rally. I would desire and feel that once you are free with this great assignment, you will be a part of us and we would like to share those personal moments with you again.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: This is my thirteenth year in Rajya Sabha. Being a career diplomat, you were stickler to rules. You will not brook over-indulgence by Members of the House. In spite of our repeated over-indulgence, you were so kind to us. You had shown so much of love and affection on me, I will never be able to forget. I wish you a long and a healthy life.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EARTH SCIENCES (SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY): Respected Mr. Chairman, Sir, I can only say that I have learnt from you how to be patient while saying loudly but still exhibiting inner calmness. You have exhibited patience and guided us during the A.P. Reorganisation Act and still you did not take any drastic action. I wish the Almighty to give you good health and happy life.

SHRI K. RAHMAN KHAN: I had the pleasure of working with you for five years. I have learnt a lot during these years. You remained a forthright leader in this House and never hesitated in putting forth your views before this House. I pray to the Almighty for your sound health and happy life so that you continue to render your services to the nation.

MS. ANU AGA: Sir, by your values and behaviour, you have, at all times, brought dignity and stature to this House. You remained impartial and fair and never showed any preference for any person or party during disruptions in the House. When travelling, on one occasion, abroad with you, I saw the respect you commanded from the political heads and our Indian diaspora. We will miss your dignified presence and wish you best of health and look forward to guiding our nation with your love and wisdom.

SHRI K. PARASARAN: It has been a very wonderful experience in this House, particularly, when you were presiding. Your position as the Vice-president has added dignity to this office and this House as well. I pray to God to bless you with sound health and happiness and guide this nation with your knowledge and experience.

SHRI AMAR SINGH: Today is an important day for all of us. I congratulate you for being Chairman of this House for the last ten years with utmost nobleness, gentleness and dignity. I pray to the God for your sound health and long life.

SHRI M.P. VEERENDRA KUMAR: I thank you for the consideration and affection you showed me, not only made me feel that I should be in Rajya Sabha to discharge my responsibility, but you also made me feel that I should live. I wish you all the best.

DR. NARENDRA JADHAV: Sir, it has been a great honour for having associated with you for several years, even before your becoming the hon. Vice-President of our country. You were kind enough to release several of my books on Dr. Ambedkar and Gurudev Rabindranath. You have been a pillar of strength, a friend, a philosopher and a guide for me. I wish you all the best.

SHRIMATI ROOPA GANGULY: Sir, I remember the day when I received national award from you. We are learning a lot from you. I request you to please save frustrated people of Bengal after retirement.

SHRI NARESH AGRAWAL: Hon. Chairman Sir, a person is well known by the post he holds. But you have proved that the post is known by the person who holds it. You have encouraged us with regard to how to speak in this House, how to raise matters etc. I would say that you have helped me in maintaining discipline in the House. I wish you healthy and long life and continue to render your services to the nation.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sir, whatever positions you held, you were par excellence in those positions. All of us have great admiration for you despite some difference of opinion about your

rulings. It was a privilege for me to work with you as you protected, supported and guided me. I am very grateful to you for that. Some of the reforms made by you like shifting of Question Hour and Zero Hour Submissions has benefitted many Members, especially back-benchers. My best wishes and greetings to you for a happy and long and blessed life.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you, all the Members, Hon. Leader of the House, Hon. Leader of opposition, hon. Deputy Chairman, hon. leaders of political parties and hon. Members of the Rajya Sabha. A decade is a long time in the life of an individual. It is easy, yet prudent, to reflect upon it at this early stage. The eloquence of preceding speakers and the generosity of their sentiments is unmatched. I would be remiss if I did not acknowledge its intensity and thank them individually and collectively. I confess that I have been greatly benefitted from an eminent leader who is no longer with us in this world. I discovered in these years the validity of the dictum that wishing to be friends is quick work but friendship is a slow ripening fruit. It needs to be nurtured. I venture to think that I succeeded in a fair measure. The Chair is like an empire in cricket or a referee in a hockey match witnessing the play and the players, but without becoming a player. Its only source of reference is the book of rules. This House is a creation of the Constitution and reflective of the wisdom and foresight of the founding fathers who wished it to portray India's diversity and to be a calibrated restraint on hasty legislation. It has upheld democracy's sacred creed that discussion, instead of being a stumbling block in the way of action, is, in fact, an indispensable preliminary to wise action. Deviation from the golden rule contributes neither to diligent policy-making nor to our claim to be a mature democracy based on rule of law. In this context, I would like to recall as I did in August, 2012, the words of the most distinguished of my predecessors, Dr. Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan and I quote, "A democracy is distinguished by the protection it gives to minorities. A democracy is likely to degenerate into tyranny if it does not allow the opposition groups to criticise fairly, freely and frankly the policies of the Government. But, at the same time, minorities also have their responsibilities. Well, they have every right to criticise, their right to

criticise should not degenerate into wilful hampering and obstruction of the work of Parliament. All groups, therefore, have their right and have their responsibilities." I fervently hope that all sections of the House would seek to achieve this laudable objective. The manner in which they attend to their business is watched by the citizen body. As I leave this Chair, I wish the Rajya Sabha well. I wish success to its Members in the responsibility entrusted to them. I thank the Secretary-General, Shri Shumsher K. Sheriff and the officials of the Rajya Sabha Secretariat for the exemplary manner in which they attended to their responsibilities. An Urdu couplet is perhaps an appropriate way of farewell.

Aao Ki Aaj Khatm Karen Daastaan-E-Ishk,

Ab Khatm-E-Aashikee Ke Phasaane Sunaen Ham.

(Let's end the tale of love today. Let's tell the tale of end of love now.)

Jai Hind.

FAREWELL TO THE RETIRING MEMBERS

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We bid farewell to nine of our esteemed colleagues from the States of Gujarat and West Bengal after completion of their fruitful tenure in the Rajya Sabha. Being an integral part of Parliament, you can justly be proud of your role in the passage of legislations and formulations of public policies. You have, in your own ways, made yeomen contributions to nation-building. In my efforts to conduct the proceedings in an orderly manner, I might have been, under compelling circumstances, harsh to some of the Members at times. But I hope, you will forget and forgive. I will always be grateful to all of you for your cooperation. The parliamentary experience that you have gained is, no doubt, an invaluable asset, which will be useful for the wider arena of public life. I extend a hearty welcome-back to those who have returned to the House. Those who have not returned to this House, I am sure, will be

in better positions. We will miss them greatly. Whether we are in Parliament or outside, the people of our country expect us to set high standards of public behaviour. Today, when the people have become more aware about their rights, they expect the parliamentary institutions to be responsible and responsive to their aspirations and grievances. We, therefore, have an onerous responsibility to strengthen the popular faith in our democratic institutions. I wish you all good health and happiness and a rewarding future in the service of the nation. Thank you very much.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Some of our colleagues are retiring. I wish all the very best to those who have come back. We have always believed that this House has got remarkable features where policy, decision-making and laws, at several times, get amended in the House. And, therefore, almost every Member of this House leaves his impact on that policy formulation and formulation of legislation.

Mr. D. Bandyopadhyay was a very eminent Civil Servant in his days. I had the opportunity of serving with him on one of the Committees and I was extremely impressed with the depth of his suggestions. Mr. Dilipbhai Pandya has been most regular in attending the proceedings and the Committee meetings, and has been making his contribution to each one of them.

Mr. Sitaram Yechury is virtually now a veteran in politics and also in this House. We were contemporaries in the University. From students' organizations, we migrated into the political parties. I am delighted that he holds today the most important position within his Party. We have had the privilege of having him for two terms in this House. He has made an extremely valuable contribution as a parliamentarian to almost every debate in which he has participated. Mr. Sitaram Yechury, in every debate that he participated, raised the level of that debate. I think, we will continue to miss his absence. And, I do hope that sooner than later, he comes back to this House.

We wish all our three colleagues, who are retiring and not coming back, all the very best.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD): Everybody knows about the importance of this House, but I would like to take some names for the knowledge of so many people. Baba Saheb Ambedkar, the architect of the Constitution we quote, has been a Member of this very House. Rajkumari Amrit Kaur, freedom fighter and Health Minister in the Cabinet of Pandit Jawahar Lal Nehru was a Member of this very House. She established 'AIIMS' also. Bhupesh Gupta, Peelu Modi, Kuldip Naiyar Ji , P Ramamurthy, CPI (M) also has been Members of this House. Humayun Kabir and Rukmani Devi has also been Members of this House. Raj Kapoor's father Prithvi Raj Kapoor also has been a Member of this House. Dr. Tara Chand, historian too has been a Member of this House. Professor Nurul Hassan, Lata Mangeshkar and Khushwant Singh, a writer and journalist has also been Members of this House. Nargis Dutt, M.F. Hussain and Javed Akhtar has also been Members of this House. Kumari Nirmala Deshpande has been a Member of this House. Shivaji Ganeshan, Jai Lalita Ji, Shyam Benegal and Raj Narayan Ji has also been Members of this House.

Our two former Presidents Dr. Jakir Hussain and Shri Pranab Mukharjee and present President Shri Ram Nath Kovind Ji has been Members of this House. This House gave five Prime Ministers to our country- Smt. Indira Gandhi, Shri H.D. Devigowda, Shri I.K. Gujaral, Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee and Dr. Manmohan Singh. This House gave two Vice Presidents - Shri Gopal Swaroop Pathak and Venkaiah Ji. Thus, this House has given three Presidents, two Vice Presidents, five Prime Ministers and a number of artists and freedom fighters to the country. That is why, I want to tell, through this House, to so many colleagues who want to dissolve Rajya Sabha that Rajya Sabha is a treasure.

Now I want to express my gratitude to our 6 colleagues who have come back winning again. Lots of congratulations to Ahmed Patel Ji, Shri P. Bhattacharya Ji, Shri Derek O'Brien Ji, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Roy Ji and Ms. Dola Sen Ji. I also welcome Shrimati Smriti Zubin Irani Ji in this House.

There are three Members who have not been able to come back. I do not think that only opposition will miss Shri Sitaram Yechury. He was not attached to one party alone, but he was the property of entire nation. Sitaram Yechury Ji has been a political and social worker, economists, columnist and a writer. He has written a number of books and articles. He has been editor of several journals. You never left the company of socialism and secularism. For that, I congratulate you.

I want to congratulate Bandyopadhyay Ji of TMC also. He has been an IAS Officer. He served as Additional Secretary and Secretary, Revenue at national level here. I congratulate you for completing two terms. You have contributed in every capacity, you were placed. I congratulate Dilipbhai Pandya also. We did not get much opportunity to hear you. I was surprised to learn that you are active in Sangh from the age of 8 years. I would tell the Leader of the House that he should be in the first line. I wish for your happiness.

PROF. RAM GOPAL YADAV: First of all, I congratulate those Members- Ahmed Patel Saheb, Smriti Zubin Irani Ji -who have got elected again. Sitaram Yechury Ji will not be in the next Session but we will always remember him. He is not an ordinary Parliamentarian. He could have come to this House but, he was prevented from coming here because of the rules of his Party. Today, I would like to ask him in this House that since you are General Secretary of the Party, so please get the constitution of your party amended. Yechury Ji has contributed a lot. He has contributed in every discussion. He has contributed in raising the quality of discussion whether it be Bills or Resolutions. The entire House will miss you. Derek has got re-elected. Lots of congratulations to you.

Shri D. Bandyopadhyay has had a very sparkling career. He has given a marvellous contribution to the Committees he belonged to. Other Members have also contributed, but I do not know much about them. I wish for a bright future to the Members who are retiring. Those who have got re-elected will contribute more. I am very happy about this and I have congratulated them. Smriti Zubin Irani has gone from here. Lots of congratulations to Ahmed Patel Saheb. Yechury Ji, I will always remember you.

SHRI A. NAVANEETHAKRISHNAN: I adopt the speeches of the Leader of the House, the Leader of the Opposition and also of Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav. Shri Yechury is really an inspiring leader, role model to be followed by each and every citizen of India. Shri D. Bandyopadhyay is also a very nice person and he knows the administration best.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: I join with other Members of this House in bidding farewell to the retiring Members. I think this moment becomes emotional because we are all from various States belonging to different political parties with different ideologies. But all are with one common intention of the nation and the well-being of the people. We would definitely miss them and especially, Shri Sitaram Yechury whose contribution in this House is remarkable. His Motion of Impeachment against the High Court Judge will be in the annals of the Parliament history. Shri Bandyopadhyay is the first person to come to the House and the last person to leave. Shri Pandya is a very cool Member who has contributed to this House.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, while I bid farewell to three Members, it is to be noted that they are very important Members. Shri Sitaram Yechury and I started growing in our Youth Students Movement. All party leaders have spoken about Comrade Shri Sitaram Yechury and how the Parliament will be missing him. As many hon. Members have pointed out that Mr. Bandyopadhyay and Shri Jairam Ramesh used to be the first ones to be present in the House. I worked with Shri Dilipji in the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Law and Justice. He is a

very regular, meticulous and polite person. Comrade Sitaramji is our comrade and he will be playing a very historic role to see that the Communist movement advances in this country. I really wish them all the best for future because they are very valuable Members and we will be missing them.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: All of you have mentioned about Shri Debabrata Bandyopadhyay's punctuality and commitment. In fact, in the party he is known as disciplined Bandyopadhyay. He never leave this House without seeking permission. He was also one of the biggest players in the Singur Movement. I have spent much time with Shri Dilipbhai Pandya in the lobby. He is very soft-spoken. When I came here six years ago, I looked at Mr. Sitaram Yechury as a political rival and I still do. Mr. Yechury and I are ideologically very far apart. But only three feet apart here and it is the beauty of our great democracy. I wish Debuda, Mr. Dilipbhai Pandya and Mr. Yechury all the very best in their future endeavours.

SHRI ALI ANWAR ANSARI: I bid farewell to Shri Sitaram Yechury, Debuda and Pandyajji on their retirement. I have been reading and listening Sitaram Yechuryji since my student life. I would reiterate that we will miss them regularly as we need such committed persons today.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: I have worked with Mr. Bandyopadhyay in different capacities. He has been not only a professional guide but also a personal friend. He had also played a very important role in the drafting of the Forest Rights Act and the Land Acquisition Act of 2013. Sir, in the late 90's and in the early part of this century, the Leader of the House, Comrade Yechury and I used to spend our time arguing on behalf of our respective Parties on TV and other forums. Comrade Yechury and I drafted the Common Minimum Programme of UPA-I&II. Mr. Yechury was responsible, of course, for the troubles that both the Governments had. But, in spite of all the differences and sparring we have had, it has been a great delight, privilege and, a learning experience. The Left may not always

be right, but the Left is absolutely essential for the survival of secular values in this country.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: Today, three of our friends are leaving us. This House would, certainly, miss them. Bandyopadhyayji was a friend of my father. Pandiyaji and I always sat on the same side. I have always considered Sitaramji a friend, philosopher and a guide, though I have fundamental differences with his ideology. But he is a champion of the poor, marginalised sections and secular forces in this country. Sir, voices like his would always be required, if democracy has to thrive in this country. I am sure, wherever our these colleagues go, their voices would be heard with a lot of attention and with a lot of respect.

SHRI D. BANDYOPADHYAY: Sir, I was a novice in the matter of internal functioning of the House. But this House is a friendly place. Bitter debates do not result in any personal acrimony because one fights here for some ideology or some cause and not for self. All the members of staff always helped me. The Chairman, the Deputy Chairmen, Members of the Panel of Vice-Chairmen had all been highly considerate to this old man who had no earlier parliamentary experience. I thank you and all of them. I owe an obligation to my fellow Members, cutting-across party line, for their kind, considerate and friendly behaviour.

SHRI DILIPBHAI PANDYA: I thank Leader of the House and Leader of the Opposition for their comments for me. I am fortunate that Shri Lakshmanrao Inamdar inducted me in RSS at the age of 8 years. He was the person who made a tea seller the Prime Minister of India. He was mine Guru too. I also worked under the leadership of Shri Jayaprakash Narayan in Navnirman Movement. I have been working with Modiji since 1973 to till date. I have learnt from him the power of silence. I had been Chairman of municipality thrice. I enjoy listening more than speaking. When BJP won 2 seats in 1984, I was election-incharge in Gujarat. It is only because of our leadership that we never afraid of anything. Today, all the top

constitutional positions are occupied by the persons of RSS background. So, I appeal all of you not to oppose RSS anymore and don't teach us secularism as we are secular by birth.

* * * * *
* * * * *

SHUMSHER K. SHERIFF,
Secretary-General.

rssynop@sansad.nic.in

****Supplement covering rest of the proceedings is being issued separately.

**ERRATA TO THE SYNOPSIS OF DEBATE DATED
9th August, 2017**

Page No.	Line No.	Correction
288	21	Delete 'also'
289	3	Read 'Karachi' as 'Lahore'
289	4	Delete 'Lahore'
290	29	Read 'reached' as 'reach'
290	29	Delete 'after their win'