

-BHS/RL-HMS/7.00/3S

SHRI RAJEEV CHANDRASEKHAR (CONTD.): Since Shri Chidambaram referred to the current CEA, Chief Economic Advisor and Economic Survey many times in his speech, let me refer back to him...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Your time is over. ...(Time Bell)...

SHRI RAJEEV CHANDRASEKHAR: One minute, Sir. I will just end. Let me refer to him what his CEA, Chief Economic Advisor said in 2011 which I quoted in that year's Budget speech and I quote, "For India to develop faster and do better as an economy, it is important to foster a culture of honesty and trustworthiness. To cut down on corruption, we have to design policies in such a way that there is no incentive for enforcers of law to cheat." I wish that his Government had heeded that advice because this Government certainly does. Thank you, Sir. *Jai Hind*.

(Ends)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Now, the next speaker is Shri V. Vijayasai Reddy; not present. Now, Shri Jairam Ramesh.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, there is no Cabinet Minister. ...(Interruptions)... Can I speak tomorrow? I am very tired, literally very tired.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): No, we all have agreed that the House will run up to 8'o clock.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Okay, I will speak.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI VIJAY GOEL): He can speak tomorrow. There is no problem. The next speaker is there.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Let him speak.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (KARNATAKA): Sir, I rise to speak on a most unusual Budget. There have been many unusual Budgets in the past. The 1957 Budget of Shri T.T. Krishnamachari was an unusual Budget, it was a landmark Budget. The 1985 Budget of Shri V.P. Singh was an unusual Budget, it was a landmark Budget. The 1991 Budget of Dr. Manmohan Singh was the most unusual Budget, it was a landmark Budget. The 1997 Budget of Shri P. Chidambaram was also unusual and historic. The 2000 Budget of Shri Yashwant Sinha who unfortunately now is *persona non grata* with the BJP was also an unusual and historic Budget. Sir, the 2018 Budget is also an unusual and historic Budget. Why? Because it is the first Budget since 1948, since Shri R.K. Shanmukham Chetty presented Independent India's first Budget; this Budget is the first Budget after the presentation of which the Prime Minister comes on a delayed live telecast for almost half-

an-hour to demystify, to decode and to explain the Budget. Normally, after the Budget is presented, the Prime Minister usually congratulates the Finance Minister and says...

श्री मेघराज जैन : आप नई परम्परा डाल रहे हैं। ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री जयराम रमेश : मुझे बोलने दीजिए। मैंने आपको सुना है। ..(व्यवधान)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please, order in the House. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Normally, after every Budget, the Prime Minister congratulates... ...(Interruptions)...

श्री मेघराज जैन : आप नई परम्परा डाल रहे हैं। ..(व्यवधान)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please be seated. ...(Interruptions)... बैठ जाइए।

श्री जयराम रमेश : मैंने कोई आलोचना नहीं की है। मैंने सिर्फ बताया है..(व्यवधान)..

Sir, what is this?

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री भुवनेश्वर कालिता) : यह ठीक नहीं है, आप बैठ जाइए। Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री जयराम रमेश : प्रधान मंत्री टी0वी0 पर आए कि नहीं? ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री नीरज शेखर : सर, अगर ये disturb करेंगे, तो House adjourn होगा। ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री शंकरभाई एन0 वेगड़ : पहले माफी मांगो, बाद में बोलो। ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री जयराम रमेश : सर, यह क्या तरीका है?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please sit down.

...(Interruptions)... Please go to your seats. ...(Interruptions)... बैठ जाएं।

Please be seated. ...(Interruptions)...Thank you.

श्री जयराम रमेश : सर, मैंने प्रधान मंत्री जी की कोई आलोचना नहीं की। मैंने केवल यह कहा कि बजट के बाद पहली बार प्रधान मंत्री टी0वी0 पर आए और बजट का स्पष्टीकरण दिया। मैंने किसी की आलोचना नहीं की। ..(व्यवधान).. जो हकीकत है, वह मैंने कहा है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री भुवनेश्वर कालिता): बैठ जाइए। House को चलने दीजिए।

..(व्यवधान).. Please go to your seats. ...(Interruptions)... Don't come to the

Well. ...(Interruptions)... Please go to your seats. ...(Interruptions)...

(FOLLOWED BY DC/3T)

ASC- DC/7.05/3T

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, ...(Interruptions)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री भुवनेश्वर कालिता): आप लोग बैठ जाएं। ...(व्यवधान).... Please

go to your seats. ...(Interruptions)... Please...(Interruptions)... जब आपको

भी बोलने का मौका मिलेगा, तब बोल लीजिए।...(व्यवधान)... आपको बोलने का मौका

दिया जाएगा। ...(व्यवधान)... Please go to your seats. ...(Interruptions)...

Please carry on. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, if I am going to be disturbed, I am not going to speak. महोदय, मैंने क्या कहा है? मैंने सिर्फ यह कहा है कि बजट के बाद पहली बार प्रधान मंत्री टी.वी. पर आए और बजट का स्पष्टीकरण दिया।(व्यवधान).... मैंने क्या कोई गलत कहा?(व्यवधान)... यह तो हकीकत है।(व्यवधान)...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, will they dictate him? ...(Interruptions)... Will they dictate? Goyalji, please contain...(Interruptions)... Please contain your fleet. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Mr. Minister...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Everybody is free to speak their mind here. ...(Interruptions)... Nobody can...(Interruptions)... You cannot dictate. ...(Interruptions)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री भुवनेश्वर कालिता): आप लोग बैठ जाएं, बैठ जाएं। ...(व्यवधान).... Please go to your seats....(व्यवधान)... आप लोग बैठ जाएं।... (व्यवधान)...आप लोग बैठ जाएं, नहीं तो मुझे हाउस एड्जॉर्न करना पड़ेगा। ...(व्यवधान).... आप लोग बैठ जाएं। ...(व्यवधान).... Please go to your seats....(व्यवधान)... आप बैठ जाएं। ...(व्यवधान).. जब आपको मौका मिलेगा, तब बोल लीजिए।...(व्यवधान)..

The House is adjourned for ten minutes.

**The House then adjourned at seven minutes
past seven of the clock.**

KR/LP/3U/7.15

**The House reassembled at seventeen minutes past
seven of the clock,**

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN, (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA), in the Chair.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I request all the Members to keep the House in order; and allow every speaker to speak his or her views. Now, Shri Jairam Ramesh, he has just started his speech. He can continue.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, I had just started. There are different ways of looking at the Budget. You can look at the Budget, compare it with the Economic Survey that comes a day or two before the Budget; and my senior colleague, Shri Chidambaram did that. You can look at the Budget from the point of view what you expect from the Budget and judge the Budget. I will not do that. What I will do is to take the Finance Minister's statements in the Budget and ask the questions: Are they reasonable? Are they credible? Are they factual? So, I am going to judge the Budget and speak on the Budget, not by my criteria but by the Finance Minister's criteria. I want to start with

three big promises that are there in the Budget, Agriculture, Health and Employment. I want to take each of these three, and finally I want to say something on the economic situation. Sir, before 2014 Lok Sabha elections, the BJP Manifesto said the following:

“Agriculture is the engine of India’s economic growth and the largest employer. BJP commits highest priority to agricultural growth, increase in farmers’ income and rural development.” This is on page 27 of the 2014 Manifesto. “BJP will take steps to enhance the profitability in agriculture by ensuring minimum 50 per cent profit over the cost of production.”

(Continued by 3W/KS)

KS-KLG/3W/7.20

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (contd.): This is the BJP promise, made in April, 2014 – 50 per cent profit over the cost of production. On 27th of May, the new Government took over. I will not say ‘Prime Minister took over’ because then they would get very upset. The word ‘Prime Minister’ irritates them! The new Government took over and on the 6th of February, 2015, just nine months after the new Government took over, an affidavit was filed in the Supreme Court in the matter *Consortium of Indian Farmers Association* -- which is the Petitioner – *versus Union of India*, who is the Respondent. Sir, this affidavit would not have been filed without the approval of the Minister

concerned, who is the Agriculture Minister. It would not have been filed without the approval of the Finance Minister as well. What does this affidavit say? On the 6th of February, 2015, nine months after making the promise that MSP would be 50 per cent profit over the cost of production, this is what para no. 4 of the affidavit said -- “It is reiterated that MSP is recommended by CACP -- which is the Commission of Agricultural Costs and Prices -- on objective criteria considering variety of relevant factors. Hence, prescribing an increase of, at least, 50 per cent on costs may distort the market. A mechanical linkage between MSP and cost of production may be counterproductive in some cases.”

Sir, this is not what I am saying; this is not what the Congress Party is saying. This is what the BJP Government’s affidavit in the Supreme Court on the 6th of February, 2015 says, that MSP 50 per cent profit over the cost of production is unrealistic and is not possible to be given. This was said in 2015. Now, Sir, in 2018, the Finance Minister grandly announces in the Budget that MSP would be set at 50 per cent profit over the cost of production. There was a big change of mind from February, 2015, when they told the Supreme Court ‘we can’t do it’ to the 1st of February, 2018, when they said ‘we would do it’. Now, the Finance Minister has been very careful. He does not say what the cost of production is. He has left that

completely open. And we know -- Mr. Chidambaram said this and by now, over the last eight-nine days, every newspaper has been carrying articles – Dr. Ashok Gulati, who is India’s most eminent Agricultural Economist, has written a number of articles. I mention his name particularly because he seems to be a favourite of the people who advise the Prime Minister. Now, in one of Dr. Ashok Gulati’s articles in the *Indian Express*, on the 2nd of January, 2018, he had said, “India requires a TOP Budget”. And, what is TOP? It is tomato, onion, potato. The Prime Minister goes to Bengaluru a few days ago, on the 4th of February and says, ‘यह बजट TOP बजट है’. So, Dr. Ashok Gulati is probably read by people in the Prime Minister’s establishment.

Sir, there are three costs. One is A2, which is what the farmer pays for fertilizer, pesticide, seed and manure.

(CONTD. BY KGG/3X)

KGG/3X/7.25

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (contd.): There is A2 plus FL, which is family labour and there is comprehensive cost, and C2, which is the cost imputed value of land, imputed value of labour and imputed value of capital.

Sir, I have to disappoint the Finance Minister because if you look at all the 23 crops for which the MSP is set by the CACP, in 2013-14, which is the

last financial year of the UPA Government, if you look at the MSP for wheat, it was 106 per cent of MSP; not 50 per cent, but 106 per cent. That means, more than double the MSP. You look at gram. The MSP was 75 per cent over the MSP, not 50 per cent. You look at lentil, it was 64 per cent. Look at rapeseed mustard, it was 133 per cent. Sir, for all major rabi crops in the last financial year of the UPA Government, MSP was already well over 50 per cent over the cost of production.

What is the Finance Minister promising? I can understand that he is promising for kharif. Look at the situation for kharif. In the case of kharif, the last year of the UPA Government, 2013-14, the MSP for common variety of paddy was 36 per cent over the cost of production. We were getting to 50, but we were 36, not a very big gap! Look at bajra. It was 63 per cent over the cost of production. Look at soyabean; it was 48 per cent over the cost of production. Look at cotton, it was 61 per cent over the cost of production.

Sir, the moral of the story is very simple. Numbers available with the CACP, which is a Government body, under the Ministry of Agriculture, they show that for all rabi crops, in 2013-14, what the BJP is promising had already been accomplished by the UPA Government. For major kharif crops, barring the common variety of paddy, as I gave the example, in most of the major crops, the MSP was already 50 per cent over the cost of production.

Of course, my senior colleague called this Jumla Number One, but it is certainly true that this promise of the Finance Minister is vastly exaggerated and does grave disservice to economic facts which show that the UPA Government in 2013-14 had already achieved that 50 per cent norm.

Sir, for the first three years of this Government, we heard long sermons as to how increasing MSP adds to inflation. Now, as elections come closer, the Finance Minister says that MSP is necessary for curing agricultural distress. Sir, some time or the other, Finance Ministers do wake up to reality. I am glad, this Finance Minister has woken up to the MSP reality and has abandoned the theology that higher MSP means higher inflation!

(Contd. by KLS/3Y)

KLS/SCH/3Y-7.30

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (CONTD): Higher MSP leads to rural prosperity, of course, you have to assure that MSP is actually received by all the farmers. Announcing MSP is one thing and farmers getting MSP is another. I am not going into that because if I get into that, the argument from there will be 60 साल के लिए तो आप सत्ता में थे, तो आपने क्या किया? So, I don't want to get into that. But all I want to say is that on this MSP promise, the Government goes to the Supreme Court and says 50 per cent over cost of production is not

possible and changes its mind. I would like the hon. Finance Minister to take the House into confidence and tell us what forced him to change his mind from February 2015 to February 2018. Sir, let me now turn, just as my TDP friends have come into the Well, to the second issue. ...(Interruptions)... The second good idea in the Budget, and the Health Minister is present here, I am very happy that he is present because the second big announcement is related to the National Health Protection Scheme. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): No slogans, please. ...(Interruptions)... No slogans, please. Mr. Ramesh, you can carry on. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, I also want justice. ...(Interruptions)... I also want justice. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, I also want justice. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): No slogans, please. ...(Interruptions)... Please go to your seats. ...(Interruptions)... We have heard about it and the Government will look after it and take notice of this. ...(Interruptions)... Please go to your seats. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, I want justice. ...(Interruptions)... I cannot hear myself. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): You continue; I am hearing you. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN: You control them, Sir. ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Mr. Ramesh, please carry on, otherwise I will have to call the next speaker.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: I cannot hear. ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): The House is adjourned for ten minutes.

...

**The House then adjourned at
thirty-five minutes past seven of the clock.**

SSS-RPM/3Z/7.40

**The House reassembled at forty-four minutes past seven of the clock,
THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA) in the Chair.**

...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Shri Jairam Ramesh, please continue.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, before the break, I was saying that the Finance Minister has not told us in the Budget... ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please continue. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, I can't hear. ...(Interruptions)...

(Contd. by NBR/4A)

-SSS/NBR-PSV/4A/7.45

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please continue with your speech, Mr. Ramesh. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI NEERAJ SHEKHAR: Sir, Mr. C.M. Ramesh is a part of NDA. (Interruptions)... He has already spoken. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, I want justice. ...(Interruptions)... I need your protection. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री नीरज शेखर: महोदय, ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please continue with your speech. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, I cannot hear anything. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): You don't have to listen to them. I will hear you. Please continue with your speech. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Sir, how can he speak like this?

...(Interruptions)... We are not obliged to speak in the din.

...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, you ask them to go to their seats.

...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please, go to your seats. ...(Interruptions)... Please, listen to him. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: Sir, I have a suggestion to make.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please, listen to him. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: Sir, my suggestion is this. They are agitating and demanding that alliance *dharma* should be followed and the promises given should be fulfilled. Someone from the Government should respond to that and, thereafter, the House can continue as usual. Let the Government respond, because they are partner of NDA. They are asking to follow the alliance *dharma*. The placard says, 'Follow alliance *dharma*.'

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): One minute. The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs wants to respond. ...(Interruptions)... Please be seated. ...(Interruptions)...

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री विजय गोयल): महोदय, ...(व्यवधान)...
रमेश जी, मेरी बात तो सुन लीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... वेंकटेश जी, मेरी बात तो सुन
लीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... It is the response of the Government.
...(Interruptions)...

सर, मैं यह समझता हूँ कि आज सवेरे जब यह प्रश्न उठा था, तब भी हमारी
तरफ से यह कहा गया था कि वित्त मंत्री जब बजट के ऊपर अपना जवाब देंगे, तब
इनकी जो grievances हैं या जो भी मुद्दे हैं, उनका समाधान उसके अन्दर दिया जाएगा।
तो मैं समझता हूँ कि क्योंकि हमने ...(व्यवधान)... आप सुन लीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)...
हमने क्योंकि यह राज्य सभा में कहा था, इसलिए कल राज्य सभा में वित्त मंत्री इनका
जवाब देंगे। अगर ये संतुष्ट न हों, तो उसके बाद जैसा ठीक समझें, वे देख सकते हैं,
कदम उठा सकते हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी: महोदय, मेरा एक point of order है। ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please be
seated. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: Sir, I am on a point of order. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please be
seated. ...(Interruptions)... One minute. He has a point of order.
...(Interruptions)... Please be seated. ...(Interruptions)... Under what rule?

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: Sir, it is under Rules of Procedure and Conduct of
Business in the Rajya Sabha. ...(Interruptions)... My point of order is on the

conventions and traditions of the House. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, tradition of the House is this कि आप हाउस तब रन करेंगे, जब हाउस ऑर्डर में होगा। यह परम्परा है, यह ट्रेडिशन है या नहीं है? मैं एक बात कहना चाहता हूँ। अभी-अभी गोयल साहब ने कहा कि हमने सुबह वायदा किया था कि हम जब बजट पर बोलेंगे, तो इनकी grievances को उसमें satisfy करेंगे। सर, बजट मैंने भी सुना है। यूपीए सरकार ने जो प्रॉमिस किया था और करने जा रही थी, एनडीए सरकार ने इनको * दिया है। ...(व्यवधान)... इनके साथ * किया है। ...(व्यवधान)... Point of order यह है कि इनकी जो grievances हैं, इनकी जो शिकायतें हैं ...(व्यवधान)...

*** Expunged as ordered by the Chair.**

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): What is your point of order? ...(Interruptions)...

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी: यह तो वहाँ प्रकट हो चुका है। ...(व्यवधान)... महोदय, मेरा point of order सिर्फ इतना ही है। इस पर मैं आपकी रूलिंग चाहता हूँ। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI VIJAY GOEL: Sir, there is no point of order. ...(Interruptions)... This is no point of order. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): You have made your point. Now, Mr. Rangarajan. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: Sir, let me conclude. ...(Interruptions)... या तो ये चारों सदस्यों को ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): What is your point of order? ...(Interruptions)...

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी: महोदय, आप मेरी बात तो सुन लीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): What is your point? ..(Interruptions)... Thank you. Now, Mr. T.K. Rangarajan. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी: महोदय, मैं आपको बता ही रहा हूँ। ...(व्यवधान).... या तो इन चारों सदस्यों को आप कहिए कि अपनी सीट्स पर जाएँ, हाउस in order हो, वरना आपको पॉवर है, जैसे आपने रामचन्द्रन जी को निकाला था, वैसे ही इनको बुलाकर निकालिए, बाहर करिए। ...(व्यवधान).... जब तक हाउस ऑर्डर में नहीं है, तो जयराम रमेश जी कैसे बोल सकते हैं? ...(व्यवधान)....

SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN: Sir, we want a debate and discussion. ...(Interruptions)... I think, if there is no disruption, we can have a healthy debate. ...(Interruptions)... I request the ruling party, NDA leaders, to guide them.

(CONTD. BY PK/4B)

SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN (CONTD.): Otherwise, you can't have any discussion. ...(Interruptions).. You can't have any discussion means you can adjourn the House. ...(Interruptions).. They are your partners. They are your Ministers. ...(Interruptions)..

मानव संसाधन विकास मंत्री (श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर) : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, ऐसा है...(व्यवधान)..., I think, Shri Vijay Goel, the Minister of State in the Ministry of Parliamentary Affairs, has made it very clear and we have also requested them that when the Finance Minister speaks in this House --he has very clearly assured -- all their issues will be addressed, and वे जो भी solution देंगे, उसके लिए...(व्यवधान)...

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी : महोदय,...(व्यवधान)...

श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर : मैं आपके लिए बोल रहा हूँ...(व्यवधान)... Shri Jairam Ramesh was speaking peacefully and everybody was listening. So, blame game नहीं है।...(व्यवधान)... जयराम रमेश जी इतने समय से बोले, लेकिन किसी ने नहीं बोला है।...(व्यवधान)...

श्रीमती रेणुका चौधरी : ऐसा नहीं है, दो बार बोला गया है।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर : चूंकि ये अभी दूसरे हाउस का सुन कर बता रहे हैं, इसलिए हम उनको कह रहे हैं कि आपने राज्य सभा में मुद्दे उठाए हैं, तो राज्य सभा में उनका solution होगा।...(व्यवधान)... पहले उनको सुनिए।...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I have allowed Members to speak. ..(Interruptions).. I have requested Mr. Jairam Ramesh to continue his speech. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: How can I speak, Sir? ...(Interruptions)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I also allowed the point of order raised by other Members. But I don't see any solution. ..(Interruptions).. So, I adjourn the House for 15 minutes.

.....

The House then adjourned at fifty-two minutes past seven of the clock.

(Followed by USY/4C)