

-RL-HMS/2.00/1G

The House reassembled at two of the clock,  
**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN) in the Chair**

----

**STATUTORY RESOLUTION RE: INCREASING RATE OF BASIC  
CUSTOMS DUTY (BCD) ON CHANA (CHICKPEAS)**

&

**THE UNION BUDGET, 2018-19 (CONTD.)**

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Now, we will take up  
the Budget Discussion ...(Interruptions)... Shri P. Chidambaram.

-----

**\* Not recorded.**

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM (MAHARASHTRA):** Mr. Chairman, Sir, since  
yesterday, the House has been waiting to begin....

**श्री मेघराज जैन :** उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, चिदम्बरम जी ने करोड़ों छोटे व्यापारियों का  
अपमान किया है ..(व्यवधान)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Please sit down.  
...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

**कुमारी शैलजा :** सर, अगर ये इस तरह का व्यवहार करेंगे तो कोई बोल नहीं पाएगा।  
..(व्यवधान).. यह कोई तरीका है? ..(व्यवधान)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Please sit down.

...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Do you want the Budget Discussion or not? ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी :** सर, भारतीय जनता पार्टी चाहती है कि चिदम्बरम साहब अपने विचार न रखें, इस के लिए कोई-न-कोई बहाना ढूंढ़ रही है। ..(व्यवधान)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Please sit down.

...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी :** आपने चिदम्बरम साहब का नाम बुलाया है, लेकिन भारतीय जनता पार्टी के लोग जान-बूझकर उन्हें रोकना चाहते हैं। ..(व्यवधान)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Please sit down.

...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी :** इन की कोई बजट नीति नहीं है वरना मैं कोई कारण नहीं समझ सकता कि जब चिदम्बरम जी को आप ने बुलवाया है ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री मेघराज शर्मा :** चिदम्बरम जी ने ..(व्यवधान).. वे माफी मांगें। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा :** यह क्या तरीका है? ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री नीरज शेखर :** ये डर गए हैं। ..(व्यवधान)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Mr. Minister.

...(Interruptions)... The Parliamentary Affairs Minister. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी :** सर, अब सच्चाई सामने आ गयी है। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री रिपुन बोरा :** अगर नहीं सुनना चाहते, तो बाहर चले जाओ। ..(व्यवधान)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Please sit down.

...(Interruptions)... The nation is watching you. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा :** यह क्या तरीका है?.. Sir, invoke Rule 255 against the Ruling Party Members... ...(Interruptions)... यह क्या हो रहा है? ..(व्यवधान).. अनंत कुमार जी, यह क्या हो रहा है?

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Please sit down.

...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री मेघराज जैन :** इन्होंने करोड़ों छोटे व्यापारियों ..(व्यवधान).. ये माफी मांगें। ..(व्यवधान)..

**SHRI DEREK O' BRIEN:** Sir, we want the House to run. ...(Interruptions)...

Please allow Shri P. Chidambaram to speak. ...(Interruptions)...

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD):** Mr.

Parliamentary Affairs Minister, with a great difficulty, after a great deal of discussion between the Chairman and the leaders of the Opposition parties, we have succeeded that this House should function and this time, not a single Opposition Member has got up. It is the first time that the Ruling party does not want to discuss the Government Business. ...(Interruptions)... It is a total failure of the Government. ...(Interruptions)... It is a total failure of the Government to run this House. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI CHUNIBHAI KANJIBHAI GOHEL:** We are willing to run this House.

...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Please sit down.

...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा :** आप संसद चलाना चाहते हैं या संसद खत्म करना चाहते हैं?

**THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI ANANTHKUMAR):**

Sir, the hon. Leader of the Opposition is unnecessarily accusing that we don't want to run the House. ...(Interruptions)...

The Government wants to run the House. ...(Interruptions)...

We want to have a fruitful discussion. ...(Interruptions)...

We want to have a fruitful discussion on the Budget but if there are issues perturbing the hon. Members, they have every right to

raise those issues. ...(Interruptions)... At the same time,...

**KUMARI SELJA:** Sir, this is the way... ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANANTHKUMAR:** Sir, the hon. Leader of Opposition also should

advise his colleagues in the other House... ...(Interruptions)...

In the Lok Sabha, when the hon. Prime Minister was giving the reply to the Motion of

Thanks on the President's Address.... ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** It is the behaviour of the Parliamentary Affairs

Minister who is supposed to run the Parliament! If the Parliamentary Affairs

Minister himself becomes a party in disrupting the House, I am sorry about the conduct and behaviour of the Parliamentary Affairs Minister.

(FOLLOWED BY DC/1H)

-RL/DC-ASC/1H/2.05

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Please go back.

... (Interruptions)... Please go back. ... (Interruptions)...

**THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI ANANTHKUMAR):**

And in the other House, they behaved like this. ... (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Don't show all these things. ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANANTHKUMAR:** They did not allow the hon. Prime Minister to speak. ... (Interruptions)... It has never happened in the last 70 years of democracy, in the temple of this democracy. ... (Interruptions)... Ghulam Nabiji is a witness. Anand Sharmaji is a witness. ... (Interruptions)... They should have advised Sonia Gandhi. ... (Interruptions)... They should have

advised Rahul Gandhi. ... (Interruptions)..... They should have advised Mallikarjun Kharge. ... (Interruptions)... Why have they behaved so? I am not justifying that... (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Now, I request you that the House should be in order. ... (Interruptions)... Please. ... (Interruptions)... The House should be in order. ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANANTHKUMAR:** Sir, for the entire one-and-a-half hours... (Interruptions)... रोकने की कोशिश की है। ....(व्यवधान)....

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** Sir, I have a point of order. ... (Interruptions)...

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD):** The conduct and behavior of the ruling party and more so... (Interruptions)... The conduct and behavior of the Minister ... (Interruptions)...

**श्री अनंत कुमार :** जब माननीय प्रधान मंत्री बोल रहे थे ....(व्यवधान)...माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जब राष्ट्रपति के अभिभाषण पर चर्चा का जवाब दे रहे थे, तब कांग्रेस पार्टी ने ... (व्यवधान)....

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Mr. Minister, please cooperate. ... (Interruptions)... Mr. Ananthkumar, please cooperate. ... (Interruptions)...

**श्री अनंत कुमार :** रोकने की कोशिश की । ... (व्यवधान).... इनकी लोकतंत्र में कोई आस्था नहीं है। .... (व्यवधान)... They don't have any commitment to the democratic tradition. ... (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Mr. Ananthkumar, please cooperate. ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANANTHKUMAR:** I condemn it as a Parliamentary Affairs Minister. ... (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Please go back. ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANANTHKUMAR:** This is not proper... (Interruptions)... And they want cooperation from all the Members of the House! ... (Interruptions)... When the hon. Prime Minister, the Leader of the House, was speaking, they did not cooperate. ... (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Mr. Minister, whatever happens in that House, it cannot be repeated here. ... (Interruptions)...  
Whatever has happened in that House, don't disturb here  
... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANANTKUMAR:** Sir, I want you to continue the debate.  
... (Interruptions)... I want you to continue the debate. ... (Interruptions)...  
Let the debate continue. ... (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Then ask your Members to sit down. ... (Interruptions)... Ask your Members to sit down.

**SHRI ANANTHKUMAR:** Let Mr. Chidambaram speak. ... (Interruptions)...  
Yesterday, the hon. Prime Minister spoke for one-and-a-half hours.  
... (Interruptions)... He spoke for one-and-a-half hours  
... (Interruptions)... He gave the reply... (Interruptions)... He gave the  
reply to all the questions raised by the Opposition... (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Please sit down.  
... (Interruptions)... Tell your Members... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN:** Sir, ... (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Yes, you speak.  
... (Interruptions)... I have called Shri Derek O'Brien. ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN:** Sir, this is historic. ... (Interruptions)... The ruling NDA, the BJP MPs are disrupting the House. We want the discussion on the Budget. They do not have any answers. ... (Interruptions)... They cannot answer the questions on the Budget. ... (Interruptions)... They do not have any facts. They are disrupting the House. The nation must see. ... (Interruptions)... The BJP is disrupting the House. ... (Interruptions)... The NDA is disrupting the House... (Interruptions)... Come and debate. ... (Interruptions)... Come and debate with us. ... (Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Mr. Ananthkumar, please ask your Members to sit down. ... (Interruptions)... I appeal to you ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANANTHKUMAR:** Sir, our Members have no problem in cooperating in the debate on the Budget. ... (Interruptions)... Even our MoS, Finance is here. ... (Interruptions)... But Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, Ghulam Nabi Azadji, hon. Leader of Opposition, one of the senior-most leaders of the Congress party and Mr. Anand Sharma, इन दोनों को प्रधान मंत्री जी के खिलाफ ... (व्यवधान)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Do you want the discussion or not? ... (Interruptions) ...

**श्री अनंत कुमार:** माननीय प्रधान मंत्री के भाषण के समय ... (व्यवधान) ... कल उनके जवाब के समय इन्होंने गतिरोध किया। .... (व्यवधान) .... इन्होंने जो हंगामा किया, उसके बारे में माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी से दोनों को माफी मांगनी चाहिए। ... (व्यवधान) ....

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** No, no. ... (Interruptions) ... This House was orderly. ... (Interruptions) ... When the Prime Minister was speaking, this House was orderly. ... (Interruptions) ... This House was orderly. ... (Interruptions) ... I appeal to the Treasury Benches, please cooperate. ... (Interruptions) ... I appeal to you to please cooperate. ... (Interruptions) ...

**SHRI ANANTHKUMAR:** They should explain that. ... (Interruptions) ... They should explain why they behaved like that. ... (Interruptions) ...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** I appeal to you. ... (Interruptions) ...

**SHRI ANANTHKUMAR:** Sir, from 2004 to 2014, Manmohan Singhji was the Prime Minister. Before that also, many Congress Prime Ministers were there. ...(Interruptions)... When those Prime Ministers gave reply to the President's Address, then at no time, being a major Opposition party, the Bharatiya Janata Party ever thought of behaving like this. ...(Interruptions)...

(Followed by KR/1J)

KR/LP/1J/2.10

**SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN:** Sir, Treasury Benches are interrupting. ..(Interruptions).. What is this?

**THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI ANANTHKUMAR):** My request to you is ..(Interruptions).. It is a very sad example of intolerance. ..(Interruptions)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** I appeal to the Minister. ..(Interruptions).. You are the Parliamentary Affairs Minister. ..(Interruptions).. Please go back. ..(Interruptions).. I adjourn the House for ten minutes.

---

**The House then adjourned at eleven minutes past two of the clock.**

KS-KLG/1K/2.20

**The House reassembled at twenty-one minutes past two of the clock,  
THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN) in the Chair**

----

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Hon. Members, let us start the discussion. ...(Interruptions)... Please do not disturb. Please go back to your seats. ...(Interruptions)... Shri P. Chidambaram may speak now. ...(Interruptions)... Please go back. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM:** Sir, they are coming into the Well. ...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Shrimati Renuka Chowdhury, please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Please take your seat. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM:** Mr. Vice-Chairman... ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** Hon. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I want to make one submission. ...(Interruptions)... Yesterday we had a debate in this House.

For two full days we discussed the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address in a correct parliamentary manner. It is most unfortunate and unprecedented in the history of Indian Parliament that the Parliamentary Affairs Minister is encouraging disruption in this House. He wants the Opposition to apologize for what happened -- the dynamics -- in the other House. This House heard the Prime Minister. ...(Interruptions)... You should make a truthful statement. And the Parliamentary Affairs Minister who himself has violated every parliamentary norm, is not the right person to tell us about our commitment to democracy. ...(Interruptions)... We have a commitment to democracy. That is why we heard the Prime Minister, without disruption. We heard everyone, and there was no disruption. ...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Please go back. ...(Interruptions)... Please go back to your seats. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** There was no interruption. How can you say that? ...(Interruptions)... He has said so. ...(Interruptions)... Yes, he has questioned that. And I have the right to answer. ...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Mr. Ramesh, please cooperate. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** We cannot be bullied. You are holding the Parliament to ransom. ...(Interruptions)... They don't believe in democracy. ...(Interruptions)...

(FOLLOWED BY KGG/1L)

AKG-KGG/1L/2.25

**THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI ANANTHKUMAR):**

Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, it is very unfortunate that the Deputy Leader of the Congress Party Anand Sharmaji, is saying again and again that the Parliamentary Affairs Minister is inciting the situation. But, he should understand, and Ghulam Nabiji should understand that Smt. Sonia Gandhi herself is responsible for the awkward situation in the other House. ...(Interruptions)... He is talking about the commitment to democracy. What is his commitment to democracy, Sir? What happened in the other House is known to everybody. ...(Interruptions)... हमारे जो सदस्य हैं, वे आक्रोशित हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (T.K. RANGARAJAN):** You ask your Members to go back to their seats. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANANTHKUMAR:** Sir, Parliament comprises both the Houses. Combined together is Parliament. ...(Interruptions)... Hon. Prime Minister is

the leader of Parliament, whether he speaks in this House or the other House. His speech is obstructed. ...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Do you want the Discussion or not? ...(Interruptions)... I am asking you: Do you want the Discussion on the Budget or not? ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANANTHKUMAR:** Sir, the Members are agitated. ...(Interruptions)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (T.K. RANGARAJAN):** I request your party Members to remain silent. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANANTHKUMAR:** I request, through you, Mr. Chidambaram, the hon. Member and former Finance Minister to speak. ...(Interruptions).. Let the people listen. All our Members are agitated; they are protesting against the behaviour of the Congress Party Members in the other House. ...(Interruptions)... उनका आक्रोश तो अपनी जगह पर रहेगा। ...(व्यवधान)... वे आक्रोशित हैं, वे अपना आक्रोश दर्ज कराते रहेंगे। ...(व्यवधान)... इस बीच वे बोल सकते हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... वे बोल सकते हैं। उनको बोलने दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** Has he taken permission from the Chair? ...(Interruptions)...

**THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD):** Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I want to say one thing. The hon. Prime Minister spoke for nearly two hours in the other House on the Motion of Thanks to

the President's Address. It has never happened in seventy years that the Prime Minister was obstructed. ...(Interruptions)... The Prime Minister was disturbed for the full two hours. ...(Interruptions).. We are ready for a debate. As Ananthkumarji said, let Mr. Chidambaram speak on the debate. ...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Let Mr. Anand Sharma speak. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा :** माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, हमने सरकार से और सभापति महोदय से बात करके ...(व्यवधान)... संसद को सुचारु रूप से चलाने के लिए पूर्ण सहयोग दिया। ...(व्यवधान)... इस सदन के अन्दर माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी की बात सुनी गई, ...(व्यवधान)... पर उसके बावजूद मंत्रियों के द्वारा यह कहा जा रहा है ...(व्यवधान)... कि विपक्ष ने, कांग्रेस पार्टी ने बात नहीं सुनी। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, रिकॉर्ड निकाल कर देखिए, ...(व्यवधान)... प्रधान मंत्री बोले हैं और सबने सुना है। ...(व्यवधान)... प्रधान मंत्री को टोका-टोकी नहीं की, कोई व्यवधान नहीं था। ...(व्यवधान)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Chidambaram to speak now. ...(Interruptions)... You start speaking, please. ...(Interruptions).. We want the Budget Session to go on.

(Followed by KLS/1M)

KLS/1M-2.30

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** I have called Mr. Chidambaram to speak. ...(Interruptions)... You start speaking. ...(Interruptions)... Do you want this discussion to go on? ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM (MAHARASHTRA):** Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, ... (Interruptions)..

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** Mr. Chidambaram to speak. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM:** Sir, yesterday the House began the debate on the Budget. ...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** You speak.

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM:** Sir, the Prime Minister ...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** I appeal to the Treasury Benches to sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM:** We heard the Prime Minister with rapt attention yesterday when he was speaking on the Motion of Thanks to the President's Address. ...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN):** I have asked Mr. P. Chidambaram to speak. ...(Interruptions)... Sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM:** The Prime Minister spoke about the achievements in the last four years, and to that, the hon. Prime Minister is entitled to. ...(Interruptions)... The Budget is supposed to be a roadmap for the year ahead. ...(Interruptions)... Before the Budget is taken by the Government, in fact, ...(Interruptions)... It is a very researched document, a very argued document...(Interruptions)... It is fully supported by facts. ...(Interruptions)... That is the Economic Survey presented by the Chief Economic Advisor. ...(Interruptions)... Unfortunately, the Chief Economic Advisor has been...(Interruptions)... The patient is a terrible patient. ...(Interruptions)... What is the diagnosis of the Chief Economic Advisor? ...(Interruptions)... I thought the hon. Prime Minister would refer to the diagnosis. ...(Interruptions)... We understand that the patient is very ill, the patient may be even terminally ill. ...(Interruptions)... The doctor has prescribed further treatment. ...(Interruptions)... But we did not hear a word from the hon. Prime Minister. ...(Interruptions)...

(CONTD BY 1N/SSS)

SSS-RPM/2.35/1N

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM (CONTD.):** This is what the doctor is saying. He goes further and says, 'Our education... ...(Interruptions)... and I quote, "The issue that needs re-emphasizing is education, looking at the looming

technological headwinds... ..(Interruptions)... and the risk of there being a stall in India's convergence process,... ..(Interruptions)... the education challenge cannot be addressed soon, given India's alarming outcomes. ... (Interruptions)... The second challenge is agriculture and what did the doctor say? The doctor said... ..(Interruptions)... Listen to me. Most of us are from rural constituencies. Most of us owe our first allegiance to the farmers and this is what the doctor says... ..(Interruptions)... In the last four years, the level of real agricultural GDP and the level of real agricultural revenue have remained constant. In the last four years, real wages have not increased, real GDP has not increased in agriculture, which means, compared to other sectors, the farmer has become poorer and poorer when India's GDP rises. You claim that India's economy has grown by six per cent, six-and-a-half per cent, seven per cent,... ..(Interruptions)... the world's fastest economy. Thank God you have not claimed that we are growing at 100 per cent, but the fact is, while India is growing according to you, the farmer's real wages, the farming sector's real GDP has remained constant. What does that mean? Please understand. Please reflect on that. It means that the farmer, relatively to other sections of the society, has become poorer and poorer, ... (Interruptions)... The third challenge is employment. What does the doctor say about employment? He says,

“Providing India’s young and burgeoning labour force, with good, high productivity jobs will remain a pressing medium term challenge.”

...(Interruptions)... For four years you could not meet this challenge. You have one year left. How are you going to meet this challenge in one year? You don’t have any medium term plan. ...(Interruptions)... You have one year term more. If you have not addressed this challenge in the last four years, how are you going to address this challenge in one year? This is what the doctor said. Sir, it is unfortunate that the hon. Finance Minister, the Leader of the House, is not present when we started the Discussion on the Budget. In fact, I anticipated this. I anticipated that he would not be present. ...(Interruptions)... He will understand the numbers better than anyone else because he is in the chair...(Interruptions)... I think I understand it fairly well. I am therefore, prepared to ask him 12 questions. I know he won’t answer it here. He is not here. I hope he will answer it sometime in this House or I hope he will answer it somewhere. But somewhere the people in this country need answers to the 12 questions that I wish to ask the hon. Finance Minister on the numbers of this Budget. After I ask these questions, I want to talk about a few other things very briefly. The first question is, the Economic Survey said, “There are two macroeconomic vulnerabilities, the fiscal deficit account and the current

account deficit. Budget 2018-19 has made the fiscal deficit worse. As against the target of 3.2 per cent, you have fixed the target of 3.5 per cent and for the next year, as against the target of 3 per cent, you have fixed target at 3.3 per cent. What I want to ask the Government is, while we know the fiscal deficit number for the current year, I want to know what the current account deficit number for the current year is and what the current account deficit number for the next year is.

(Contd. by NBR/10)

-SSS/NBR-PSV/10/2.40.

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM (CONTD.):** Sir, Question No. 2: Every deficit target has been breached by the Budget. ...(Interruptions)... Fiscal deficit has been breached. Revenue deficit has been breached. ...(Interruptions)... Effective revenue deficit has been breached. ...(Interruptions)... Primary deficit has been breached. ...(Interruptions)... Will the impact of these deficits be inflationary? ...(Interruptions)... Currently, the Wholesale Price Index stands at 3.6 per cent. The Consumer Price Index in December stood at 5.2 per cent. ...(Interruptions)... Yesterday, the Reserve Bank of India said April-December, 2018, inflation will rise to 5.6 per cent. ...(Interruptions)... What I want to ask the

Government is: What is the Government's estimate of average WPI and average CPI in 2017-18 and 2018-19? ...(Interruptions)...

Question No. 3: Thanks to the Budget, Treasury Bond yields have increased rapidly in the last six days. ...(Interruptions)... On 31<sup>st</sup> January, the interest rate was 7.43 per cent. Yesterday, the yield on Treasury Bonds rose to 7.57 per cent. ...(Interruptions)... I cannot recall a six-day period in which Treasury Bond yield risen by 14 basis points. ...(Interruptions)... What I want to ask the Government is: Is this a signal that the interest rate across all instruments is going to rise? ...(Interruptions)... Is this the signal that we are being faced with inflation within six months to twelve months period? ...(Interruptions)...

Question No. 4: What is your assumption of the crude oil price in the Budget? ...(Interruptions)... Every Budget ...(Interruptions)... that crude oil prices will remain at a particular level. ...(Interruptions)... I remember, July 8, 2008, when crude oil prices crossed US \$ 147 a barrel. ...(Interruptions)... When you came to Government, you got a bonanza. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, crude oil prices went below US \$ 40 a barrel. ...(Interruptions)... But, you wasted that opportunity. ...(Interruptions)... Today, crude oil is US \$ 67 a barrel. I want to ask the Government: Suppose the crude oil price rises to US \$ 70 or 75 a barrel, what is the

impact of it on your Budget estimates? ...(Interruptions)... The most important question, on behalf of millions of people who ride two-wheelers, millions of people who travel in buses, millions of people who use tractors, will you ...(Interruptions)... increase retail price on petrol and diesel or will you cut the excise tax and give relief to the poor people? ...(Interruptions)... I want a definite answer. When crude oil prices rise, will you cut the excise duty rather than increase the price of petrol and diesel? ...(Interruptions)... You give us a definite answer -- 'Yes' or 'No'. ...(Interruptions)...

Question No. 5: ...(Interruptions)... By increasing the fiscal deficit from 3.2 per cent to 3.5 per cent in the current year, you additionally borrowed Rs. 48,000 crores. ...(Interruptions)... I want you to understand these numbers. ...(Interruptions)... They will understand it tomorrow or later. ...(Interruptions)... By increasing your borrowings by Rs. 48,000 crores and if you add Rs. 37,000 crore which ONGC borrowed on your behalf, total borrowings will be Rs. 85,000 crores. ...(Interruptions)...

(CONTD. BY USY/1P)

USY/1P/2.45

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM (CONTD.):** I want to ask you: Where did this Rs. 85,000 crores go in the Budget? What did you do with Rs. 85,000 crores? If you look at the numbers closely, the total expenditure increased only by Rs.

71,000 crores. Where additional borrowing is Rs. 85,000 crores, the total expenditure increases by Rs 71,000 crores. When you look closely, you find Revenue Expenditure – mark my words, Revenue Expenditure, not Capital Expenditure -- has increased by Rs. 1,07,371 crores. So, what have you done? You borrow Rs. 85,000 crores, ...(Interruptions)... Your Capital Expenditure is ....(Interruptions)... and you spend on revenue account an additional Rs. 1,07,371 crores. ....(Interruptions)...History will say that this is a spendthrift Government. ....(Interruptions)... All norms of fiscal prudence have been thrown out of the window and you have wasted money ....(Interruptions)...

Question No. 6: what is your Capital Expenditure? According to the Budget Estimates, 2017-18, it is a very serious number. ....(Interruptions)... I want you to note this number. According to the Budget Estimates for the current year, the Capital Expenditure was Rs. 3,09,000 crores. ....(Interruptions)... According to the Revised Estimates, the Capital Expenditure is only Rs. 2,73,000 crores. ....(Interruptions)... There is a shortfall of Rs. 36,000 crores. Please tell me, which are the schemes and projects that have been hit by the reduction in Capital Expenditure? ....(Interruptions)... Which projects have been hit? You should ask, whether Polavaram Project has been hit or a railway project has been hit or

a road project has been hit. ....(Interruptions)... Which project has been hit by the reduction of Rs. 36,000 crores in the Capital Expenditure? Please give us a list of projects that have been hit. ....(Interruptions)...

Question No.7: nominal GDP in 2017-18, according to the Budget, is estimated to grow at 10.5 per cent. ....(Interruptions)... The real GDP will grow by 6.5 per cent. So, nominal GDP will grow by 10.5 per cent, and the real GDP will grow by 6.5 per cent. ....(Interruptions)... Then, next year, you say nominal GDP will grow by 11.5 per cent. What I want to ask is this. ....(Interruptions)... Will this additional one per cent be reflected in the real GDP growth or in the inflation? ....(Interruptions)... According to yesterday's RBI statement, this additional one per cent will not come by way of growth, but will come by way of inflation. ....(Interruptions)... When the growth going to be the same for this year, you must answer, where this one per cent is going to go. ....(Interruptions)...

Now, we come to a very sensitive matter. ....(Interruptions)... Now we come to a very sensitive matter. ....(Interruptions)... Question No. 8. Before you assumed office, you had promised two crore jobs a year. According to the International Labour Organization (ILO), a proper job is employment that is certain, regular and reasonably secure. ....(Interruptions)... A 'job' is defined as employment that is certain. It is

regular. It is everyday, six days a week. And, it is reasonably secure.  
....(Interruptions)...

(Contd. by 1q – PK)

PK-NKR/1Q/2.50

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM (CONTD.):** A job is defined as an employment which is certain. ...(Interruptions).. Every day you go there. ...(Interruptions).. There is work, it is regular, it is everyday - six days a week, and, it is reasonably secure. ...(Interruptions).. That is a job. What is your definition of a job? ...(Interruptions).. You must answer this question. What is your definition of a job? How many ILO-defined jobs have you created in the last four years? ...(Interruptions).. In a lighter vein, I may say, will you now recommend to the ILO that frying *pakor*s is also a job? ...(Interruptions)..

Question No. 9: In the Budget Estimates, the customs duty for the current year was supposed to be Rs.2,45,000 crores. ...(Interruptions).. Very serious number, Sir! The customs duty estimate was Rs.2,45,000 crores. In the Revised Estimate, it is only Rs.1,35,000 crores. ...(Interruptions).. How did Rs.2,45,000 crores become Rs.1,35,000 crores? What is worse is, the next year, customs duty estimate is only Rs.1,12,500 crores. ...(Interruptions).. From Rs.2,45,000 crores, this year,

it has become Rs.1,35,000 crores and for the next year, it is Rs.1,12,500 crores. ...(Interruptions).. This is, despite in the Budget the Finance Minister has, across the board, imposed surcharge on customs duty. ...(Interruptions).. After all these, why is customs duty figure coming down to Rs.1,12,500 crores next year? ...(Interruptions).. Is there a story that you have not yet told the country and the people? If there is a story, please tell us the story. ...(Interruptions)..

Question No. 10: I am a little puzzled by these numbers. ...(Interruptions).. You have taken credit for service tax and excise duties up to 30<sup>th</sup> June, 2017 and also for excise revenue on non-GST goods. ...(Interruptions).. The GST came into effect on 1<sup>st</sup> of July, 2017. Your GST revenue collection for 2017-18 is estimated at Rs.4,44,631 crores. What I want to know is, you have accounted for service tax up to 30<sup>th</sup> June, you have accounted for excise duty up to 30<sup>th</sup> June, you have accounted for excise duty on non-GST goods for the whole year, and, then, you say GST revenue is Rs.4,44,631 crores. ...(Interruptions).. My calculation says this is for nine months. Somebody would ask how can it be nine months! March's will come in April; this is only for eight months. ...(Interruptions).. Then, when I hear the Finance Minister and the Finance Secretary saying

this is only for 11 months, how is the GST for 11 months? Please explain to us the mystery of this number. ...(Interruptions)..

Question No. 11: The Economic Survey, the good doctor that you hired in 2014, a competent doctor, Dr. Arvind Subramanian, says, the two things are worrying him - the fall in savings and the fall in investments. ...(Interruptions).. Unfortunately, please correct me if I am wrong, nowhere in his Budget speech has the Finance Minister even acknowledged that savings have fallen and investments have fallen. Nowhere. ...(Interruptions)..

(Contd. by PB/1R)

PB-DS/1R/2.55

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM (CONTD.):** But please understand one more fact. ...(Interruptions)... Corporate savings are not falling, which means, corporate profits have been good, corporate savings are more or less constant. ...(Interruptions)... It is household savings which have fallen. Individual household saving has fallen. ...(Interruptions)... As a result, gross fixed capital formation has fallen by five percentage points during your tenure. ...(Interruptions)... From a high of 35 per cent, today about 29 per cent is your GFCF; 29 per cent is your GFCF. ...(Interruptions)... Five per cent on GDP is a loss of investments. ...(Interruptions)...

In that background, I want to ask you the following. ... (Interruptions)... Corporation tax is expected to grow next year by only 10.15 per cent. Income-tax is expected to grow by 19.88 per cent. ... (Interruptions)... But GST is expected to grow by a whopping 67 per cent. GST is an indirect tax. ... (Interruptions)... Income-tax is a direct tax; corporate tax is a direct tax. ... (Interruptions)... All over the world, all economists are agreed that indirect taxes are regressive and you must give relief in indirect taxes, and income tax and corporate tax are progressive and you must increase them. ... (Interruptions)... What have you done? You have increased indirect taxes. ... (Interruptions)... You have taxed income tax, individual households but you have given relief to the corporate sector. ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:** As usual. As usual. Nothing new. As usual... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM:** Shall we tell the people? ... (Interruptions)... Shall we go out and tell the people that the philosophy of the NDA Government's taxation is burden the poor and pat the rich? ... (Interruptions)... Shall we go and tell the people? Shall we tell the people that the NDA Government believes in burdening the poor people with indirect taxes? ... (Interruptions)... Shall we tell the people that NDA

Government believes that you must tax individuals, hardworking middle class rather than the rich corporates? ...(Interruptions)... These are the twelve questions. I hope the Finance Minister will answer them in this House if he is allowed to speak by his fellow Members. ...(Interruptions)... If he is not allowed to speak by his fellow Members, I don't want you to strain yourself. ...(Interruptions)... I don't want you to raise your voice and affect your health. ...(Interruptions)... I am willing to take the risk. But I don't want you, Finance Minister, to take the risk. ...(Interruptions)... But please answer these twelve questions. ...(Interruptions)...

Now, Sir, I want to talk about three issues. ...(Interruptions)... They want issues. India has made a significant contribution to the English dictionary. ...(Interruptions)... The first time I heard this word from a BJP leader who coined the phrase, '*Chunavi Jumla*'. ...(Interruptions)... I don't know who did it. But somebody did it. ...(Interruptions)... Now, this word is India's NDA-BJP's great contribution to the English language, the word '*Jumla*'. ...(Interruptions)... I want to give time to my colleagues. I have taken 28 minutes. ...(Interruptions)... I will take another 12 minutes. I want to talk about three *jumlas*, *teen jumla*. ...(Interruptions)... We support the Triple Talaq Bill. But we don't support these triple *jumlas*.

...(Interruptions)... You bring the Triple Talaq Bill. We will pass it. But don't bring these triple *jumlas*. ...(Interruptions)...

(Contd. by 1s/SKC)