

KSK/MCM/12.00/1C

**The House reassembled at twelve of the clock,
MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.**

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : माननीय सभापति जी, एक प्रस्ताव है।

श्री सभापति : जी, प्लीज़ मि0 नरेश अग्रवाल।

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : बजट पर 12 घंटे चर्चा होनी चाहिए।.....(व्यवधान).....

श्री सभापति : बैठ जाइए, प्लीज़। सब लोग बैठ जाइए प्लीज़। Others may please sit down. Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra Rao, please sit down. I will hear you.

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : बहुत से मेंबर्स बोलना चाहते हैं, बजट की कमियां उजागर करना चाहते हैं। तो आज 12 बजे से बजट ले लीजिए रात 9 बजे तक, मैं यह प्रस्ताव रखना चाहता हूँ।

श्री सभापति : प्रस्ताव रखना है न?

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : हां, प्रस्ताव रखना है। आज 12 बजे से रात 9 बजे तक ले लीजिए, जिससे सब मेंबर्स इस पर बोल लें, और सदन चले।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Is it the sense of the House?

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Yes, Sir.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

MR. CHAIRMAN: I want to put it on record once again that as Chairman, I will not suspend the Question Hour unless there is broad consensus. There seems to be a broad consensus. That is why, today, there will be no Question Hour. We will go ahead with the discussion on the Union Budget, 2018-19. Mr. C.M. Ramesh, please go back to your seat. I will respond. I will ask you to speak from there. Mr. C.M. Ramesh, Mr. Venkatesh, Mr. Mohan Rao, please go back to your seats.

SHRI C.M. RAMESH : Sir, this is the third day since I had given the notice for the first time. This is a very sensitive issue. The State is burning there.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY (SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY): Sir, if you permit, I would like to give some suggestion.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mohan Rao, please sit down. Let everybody sit down. Mr. Ramesh, please sit down. I have a suggestion to Mr. Ramesh and others also, like Dr. Ramachandra Rao and others. Once the Chair says something, that should be followed. Otherwise, you know what happened yesterday. ...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

SHRI C.M. RAMESH: We respect the Chair, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO: I had mentioned this yesterday also. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: When somebody is there in the Well, I don't mention. I have received your notice.

DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO: Sir, I had raised this issue yesterday from my seat only. Today also, I am raising this issue from my seat.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Everybody will get an opportunity during the Budget discussion. The Budget discussion is for the purpose of raising such issues. Then, the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address is also a general discussion. I don't know why Members are concerned. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. C.M. Ramesh has raised an issue. Yesterday, he was agitated, and the Chair, naturally, was also agitated. I suggest that this issue should be sorted out in a proper manner. Mr. Y.S. Chowdary, your leader, wants to suggest something.

SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY: Sir, on behalf of the Government of India, I would like to mention here, at the cost of repetition, that the entire House is fully aware how the Andhra Pradesh Re-organization Act was

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

passed so unscientifically and unreasonably...(Interruptions)...for which both the national parties are responsible. ...(Interruptions)... Notwithstanding that, the present gridlock has to be unlocked. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is the solution?

SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY: I am coming to the solution. When we are talking about co-operative federalism, it cannot be partly co-operative. Respect has to be there for Members, not for numbers. So, in this case, for the last-three-and-a-half years, our Government could not implement certain commitments given during enactment of this Act, as well as...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What do you want to say?

SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY: Sir, my suggestion is that if the Government is willing, there are some issues of Special Category Status, bridging up the resource gap, capital development...(Interruptions)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : यह तो कांस्टीट्यूशनल क्राइसिस हो गया।....(व्यवधान).....

SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY: All these things are there. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, my request is...(Interruptions)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : यह तो कंस्टीट्यूशनल क्राइसिस हो गया।....(व्यवधान).....

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have called him for a solution. Please, be seated. ... (Interruptions)... He is not making a speech. He is giving a suggestion. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY: Sir, my request is that on behalf of the Government, if they can commit that the Finance Minister, while replying to the Budget discussion, will commit to resolve these issues within fifteen days, that is how I can request to solve this issue.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Vijay Goel.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI VIJAY GOEL): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I want to assure the Members that during the reply of the Budget discussion, the Finance Minister will sort out their issues.

SHRI NARESH AGRAWAL: He is not a Member; he is a Minister. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Ministers also have got a right to suggest. ... (Interruptions)... Dr. Ramachandra Rao, please go back to your seat. If you want to say something from there, you can say.

(Contd. by 1D – GSP)

GSP-SC/12.05/1D

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

MR. CHAIRMAN (Contd.): Dr. Ramachandra Rao, please go back to your seat. I will call you. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, there is a State-wide bandh in Andhra Pradesh. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Raja, I have not called you. ...(Interruptions)... Do you want the issue to be resolved or do you want the stalemate to continue? A suggestion has been given by him. I want to resolve the issue. ...(Interruptions)...

Secondly, the Budget Session is going on now and second part of the Budget Session is also there. So, we can use this occasion and sort out the issues. Congress Members, Dr. Subbarami Reddy, Dr. Ramachandra Rao, Shrimati Renuka, and other Members, Shri Vijayasai Reddy and all others, whoever is interested... ...(Interruptions)... Please. ...(Interruptions)... All of them can utilize this occasion by talking to the respective parties and then see to it that the issue is resolved. It is an emotive issue. The issue has to be addressed. It is a State issue. Please keep that in mind and cooperate with the Chair. Otherwise, what will happen is that the issue will remain the same and we will be losing the time otherwise also.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

So, as suggested by Shri Naresh Agrawal and agreed to by the House, I am proceeding with the Budget Discussion. ... (Interruptions)... Mr. Ramachandra Rao, do you wish to say something? ... (Interruptions)...

DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO: Sir, I am not only representing the anguish, hardship and the misery of the people of Andhra Pradesh, particularly of the youth... ... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is the point? ... (Interruptions)... If you want to speak on the Budget, I will give you time later on. ... (Interruptions)... To resolve the issue, what do you wish to say? ... (Interruptions)...

DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO: Sir, please tell me how many minutes have been allotted to me? ... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Bhaskar, please sit down. ... (Interruptions)... Mr. Subbarami Reddy, you also please sit down. ... (Interruptions)... If anybody wants to suggest a solution to the stalemate, he can... ... (Interruptions)... Don't speak on general issues. General issues have to be discussed in the Budget. ... (Interruptions)...

DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY: Sir, I will suggest a solution. ... (Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO: Sir, I am also worried about the propriety. ... (Interruptions)... Sir, you are the custodian of the Constitution. You are occupying the most respected Chair. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, if the respect of this Chair and this august House, which has passed the Andhra Pradesh Reorganization Act, which has... ...(Interruptions)... The then Prime Minister, Dr. Manmohan Singh, with the approval of the Opposition, with the suggestions and(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your suggestion? ...(Interruptions)...

DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO: Sir, when an assurance has been given to the House... ...(Interruptions)... If they are not adhered to, if they are not followed, and, if this House is incapable of protecting our rights, keeping our own words, what for the Constitution has created this House? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, the Leader of the Opposition, Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad. ...(Interruptions)... Please.

DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO: What are we supposed to do here by sitting? ...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

MR. CHAIRMAN: We can discuss it. ...(Interruptions)... Now, the Leader of the Opposition. ...(Interruptions)... I have called the Leader of the Opposition, please. ...(Interruptions)... Ramachandra Rao ji, please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Bhaskar, please sit down.

DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO: What for are we making laws?
...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Laws are being made and they are implemented.
...(Interruptions)... Now, the Leader of the Opposition, Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Sir, I have a point of order.
...(Interruptions)... The point of order has to be heard first, Sir.
...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is the point of order and under what rule?
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU: Sir, please allow me to make one suggestion.

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Sir, my point of order is under Rule 238(1), Rule 238(2), Rule 238A and Rule 255. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, I would like to draw your kind attention to this. Please permit me.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is the point of order? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Sir, I would like to draw your kind attention to Articles 74 and 75 of the Constitution of India. ...(Interruptions)... I have already mentioned the rule.

MR. CHAIRMAN: But what is your point of order? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Sir, please refer to Article 74. Let me read it. It says, “There shall be a Council of Ministers with the Prime Minister at the head to aid and advise the President, who shall, in exercise of his functions, act in accordance with such advice.”

(Contd. By YSR/1E)

YSR-PRB/12.10/1E

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY (CONTD.): Article 75(3) says that the Council of Ministers shall be collectively responsible to the House. ‘Collectively responsible’ is what I am emphasising on. Sir, as per Articles 74 and 75, which I have read out, the Government, the Cabinet headed by the Prime Minister is required to secure the confidence of the House, including its Ministers. If a Minister of a political party...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your point of order?

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Sir, that is what...(Interruptions)...
Please allow me to...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am allowing you. ...(Interruptions)... You are generally speaking. ...(Interruptions)... What has to be done by the Chair, leave it to the Chair. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Yes, Sir. ...(Interruptions).. I am coming to that, Sir. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, please allow me to conclude it. ...(Interruptions)... It is the Telugu Desam Party. I am naming the party today. Day before yesterday...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is the point of order?

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Telugu Desam Party is partnering with the BJP and is part of the Government and was party to the approval of the Presidential Address in the Cabinet. They have approved the Presidential Address in the Cabinet. There is a collective responsibility. The same Telugu Desam Party Member and the same Minister, Mr. Y.S. Chowdary, has now given a statement. You have also heard the statement. The same Minister is part of the Cabinet, which has approved the Presidential Address. If they want to differ with the Government, there are three options. ...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sit down, Mr. V. Vijayasai Reddy.

...(Interruptions)...

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Point No.1...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have raised the point of order.

...(Interruptions)...

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: First, they should have resigned from the

Cabinet. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have gone through the point of order.

...(Interruptions)... Even a Minister can give a suggestion.

...(Interruptions)... There is nothing wrong in that. ...(Interruptions)...

It is a collective responsibility. ...(Interruptions)... The Minister has

given the suggestion to end the stalemate. ...(Interruptions)... If you

don't want discussion...(Interruptions)... No arguments.

...(Interruptions).. Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... No argument.

...(Interruptions)... No point of order. ...(Interruptions)... Please sit

down. ...(Interruptions)... No point of order. ...(Interruptions)... Sit

down. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Ramesh, a Minister or a Member can

always give a suggestion and the Chair after

considering...(Interruptions)... I am also watching what is happening.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

...(Interruptions)... You have not concluded. ...(Interruptions)... I allowed you this much long. ...(Interruptions).. No constitutional misuse has taken place. ...(Interruptions).. Don't worry on that account. ...(Interruptions)... I want a solution. I want the House to run smoothly and peacefully so that everybody will get an opportunity to discuss...(Interruptions)... That is my purpose. ...(Interruptions)... In my discretion, I allowed him. He wanted to give a suggestion. That is a suggestion. It has nothing to differ with the Government. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: माननीय सभापति जी, मेरा point of order है।
...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down, Mr. Ramesh. ...(Interruptions)... यह कोई तरीका नहीं है।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: माननीय सभापति जी, मेरा point of order है।
...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You raise a point of order when there is order. ...(Interruptions)... If there is disorder by different people...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: मैं यहां से बोल रहा हूं। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: मैं वही कह रहा हूं। वे वहां से बोल रहे हैं और आप यहां से बोल रहे हैं। मैं क्या करूं? श्री वि. विजयसाई रेड्डी जी, please आप बैठिए। Please sit down.

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: सभापति महोदय, मैं तो point of order उठा रहा हूं। मेरा यह कहना है कि Constitution के Article 75 में, जब मंत्रिपरिषद् की सामूहिक जिम्मेदारी है, तो क्या एक मंत्री की उठाई बात पर दूसरा मंत्री उसको राय दे सकता है या उसके लिए कह सकता है? क्या ऐसा कोई नियम है? अगर एक मंत्री कोई issue उठाए, तो क्या दूसरा मंत्री उसको राय दे सकता है? मैं इस पर आपकी ruling चाहता हूं। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: आप बैठिए। Under Articles 74 and 75, the hon. Minister, who is a Member of this House, has got every right to give a suggestion. If he goes against the Government, then that will be a different situation. If somebody is giving a suggestion and that too with the permission of the Chair to resolve an issue...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: It can happen in a meeting with the Prime Minister, not in the Parliament. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. ...(Interruptions).. No, no. ...(Interruptions)... He has not protested. ...(Interruptions).. He has

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

given a suggestion. ...(Interruptions)... That is the end of the matter. I wanted the issue to be resolved to the satisfaction of the general...(Interruptions)... Otherwise, you had seen what happened yesterday. ...(Interruptions)... Stalemate...(Interruptions)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: सभापति महोदय, केवल Prime Minister assure कर सकते हैं, कोई Minister assure नहीं कर सकता है।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He has not assured...(Interruptions)... As the Finance Minister is not there, the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs has given the assurance that he will take it up with the Finance Minister. ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... I have not called you people. ...(Interruptions)... This will not go on record. ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... The Leader of the Opposition. ...(Interruptions)... (Contd. by VKK/1F)

-YSR/VKK-GS/1F/12.15

MR. CHAIRMAN (CONTD.): Please be seated. ...(Interruptions)... You don't want a solution'. ...(Interruptions)... You don't want any solution'. You don't want to run the House'. You don't want order in the House'. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Vijayasai Reddy, please sit down. ...(Interruptions).. This is not the way. ...(Interruptions)..

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Sir, you may expel me.

...(Interruptions)... It does not matter. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: It does not matter to you! ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Sir, what can I do? ...(Interruptions)..

MR. CHAIRMAN: You don't want to take the permission of the Chair.

...(Interruptions).. If everybody wants to take a posture and then want a particular type of action, then I have no problem. ...(Interruptions)... I have no problem. ...(Interruptions)..

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Please listen to me, Sir.

...(Interruptions)..

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing is going on record. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: *

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing is going on record except what is said from the Chair. ...(Interruptions)... Nothing should go on record in print, electronic or otherwise also in the records of the House.

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: *

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have the option of either naming you or taking action. ...(Interruptions)... I don't want to do it to the extent possible because I want the House to run. ...(Interruptions)... And you don't

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-08.02.2018

want to suspend the Question Hour. ...(Interruptions)... You don't want to cooperate with the Chair. ...(Interruptions)... How can these

*** Not recorded.**

two things happen? ...(Interruptions)... You can't eat the cake and have it again. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: *

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned to meet at 2 p.m.

**The House then adjourned at sixteen
minutes past twelve of the clock.**

*** Not recorded.**