

SK-VNK/1B/2.00

**The House reassembled at two of the clock,
MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we will continue with the discussion on the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address. ..(Interruptions).. Why do all of you stand up then? ..(Interruptions).. If LoP wants to say something, I will hear. But all of you take your seats. ..(Interruptions).. Let me say that this is the time for the discussion on the President's Address.

THE LEADER OF OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD): Sir, we know that. We also know that there was Zero Hour at 11 o'clock. We also know that there was Question Hour at 12 o'clock. Without having any respect for the Zero Hour, and the sentiments to be expressed by the Leaders and Members of various political parties and the States which they are representing here in this House, and the very important Question Hour, which is always there ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no; you see...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Let me finish. ..(Interruptions).. Sir, you have raised the issue that there is discussion on President's Address. Now going back, there was also the Zero Hour and there was also the Question Hour,

which we were interested to discuss. We were interested in having the Zero Hour. We were interested in having the Question Hour, without boycotting it. We were sitting on our seats. Sir, this House is being conducted under rules, regulations, procedures and conventions, and if the hon. Chairman is ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no; you cannot criticize the ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: No, no. ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Whatever be the ruling of the Chairman, you cannot criticize that. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: I am not criticizing the Chair.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Or the decision of the Chair. ..(Interruptions).

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: I am just reminding the duty of those who serve on the Chair that the proceedings of this House are being conducted under rules, regulations, procedures and conventions of the House. ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would request the hon. LoP ..(Interruptions)..
One minute, hon. LoP. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: So, each Chairperson, howsoever big he or she may be, howsoever small he or she may be, has to run this House according to the rules, regulations and procedures. ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, please. ..(Interruptions).. Hon. LoP, please. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would request the hon. LoP that the intention of all of you, of the hon. Chairman and also of myself is to run the House smoothly. ..(Interruptions).. Let me complete. ..(Interruptions).. Let me complete. ..(Interruptions).. बैठिए।...(व्यवधान)... So, the intention is to run the House smoothly.

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Yes, agreed.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: So, in that process, you may have one view, I may have a different view. It is also possible. If such a difference of views is there, and especially when you expressed that it is with regard to this morning when hon. Chairman was in the Chair, my advice is, please meet the hon. Chairman in his Chamber, discuss and sort it out. ..(Interruptions)..

***Expunged as ordered by the Chair.**

Anyhow, no observation against the Chairman will go on record. No remarks ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI RIPUN BORA: Sir, Chairman is Chairman. ..(Interruptions).. *

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, चेयर ने हरदम हम लोगों से यह आशा की कि हम नियमों के अनुसार चलें।...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI BHUPENDER YADAV: Sir, how can he say that *? ..(Interruptions)..

How can he say? ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI RIPUN BORA: Today, he had ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, please. ..(Interruptions).. You please sit down. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI BHUPENDER YADAV: Sir, how can he use such words? ..(Interruptions)..

(Followed by YSR/1C)

YSR-NKR/2.05/1C

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN (CONTD.): I am requesting you...(Interruptions)... Please meet the hon. Chairman in the Chamber. ... (Interruptions)... I would request the hon. Leader of the

***Expunged as ordered by the Chair.**

Opposition...(Interruptions).. You cannot sort it out here.

...(Interruptions)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : माननीय उपसभापति जी, आप मेरी बात सुन लीजिए।

..(व्यवधान).. चेयर हम लोगों से आशा करती है कि हम नियमों में रहकर

चलें।..(व्यवधान).. हम भी आशा करते हैं कि नियमों का सभी पालन करें।

..(व्यवधान).. नियमों के अंतर्गत हमें सुना जाए। ..(व्यवधान).. महोदय, हम

चेयर को कभी पक्षपात करता नहीं मानते।..(व्यवधान).. हम आज भी चेयर पर

अविश्वास नहीं करते।..(व्यवधान).. चेयर को भी यह मालूम है कि वे किसी दल

के सदस्य नहीं हैं।..(व्यवधान)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I understood.

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : पहले दिन चेयर ने हमें बड़ी आशा दिलाई थी और हमें उन

पर आज भी विश्वास है। हम उन पर अविश्वास नहीं कर रहे हैं। ..(व्यवधान)..

हम अविश्वास लाना भी नहीं चाहते, लेकिन जो व्यवहार हो रहा है,

नियमावली में

जो नियम बने हुए हैं, ..(व्यवधान).. अगर उन नियमों के अंदर हमें बोलने नहीं देंगे,
..(व्यवधान)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Talk to the Chairman.

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : महोदय, राज्य सभा का टी.वी. ..(व्यवधान)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why don't you meet hon. Chairman and speak?

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : * ..(व्यवधान)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...(Interruptions)... I will have to adjourn the House then. ...(Interruptions)... I will have to adjourn the House. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: No, Sir. ...(Interruptions)... Give me a chance to speak. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: On these matters, I request the hon. Members to meet the hon. Chairman in the Chamber and discuss. ...(Interruptions)... No more discussion on this matter. ...(Interruptions)... I cannot allow discussion on that. ...(Interruptions)... No discussion on this. ...(Interruptions)....

***Expunged as ordered by the Chair.**

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Give me a minute. ...(Interruptions)... Please understand this. ...(Interruptions).. What happened this morning between 11 o'clock and two minutes past eleven of the clock did not happen in the

Chamber. It happened in the full public view. ...(Interruptions)... Why should we go to the Chamber? ...(Interruptions)....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...(Interruptions)..

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Why should we go to the Chamber? ...(Interruptions)... Sir, we have full respect for the Chairman. ...(Interruptions)... What happened today has never happened since 1950. ...(Interruptions)... You check the record.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You should see the Rule. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, allow me to put on record what happened. ...(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...(Interruptions)...I have to go...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: No, no. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, there were 12 Zero Hour notices. ...(Interruptions)... There were three notices under Rule 267. There is a *parampara*, इस हाउस में परम्परा है, .. (व्यवधान)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You read the Rule. ...(Interruptions)... You read Rule 267. ...(Interruptions)... You can raise it only with the prior permission of the Chairman. ...(Interruptions)... He has exercised that Rule only. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Why was the House adjourned?
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You change the Rule. ...(Interruptions)... Rule 267 says that a matter under it can be raised only with the prior permission of the Chairman. And if hon. Chairman has exercised that Rule, what can I do? ...(Interruptions)... So, you change the Rule. ...(Interruptions)... You change the Rule. ...(Interruptions)... You change the Rule. ...(Interruptions)... You meet the Chairman. ...(Interruptions)... Meet the Chairman. ...(Interruptions)... No, no. ...(Interruptions)... I have to take up the discussion now. ...(Interruptions).. Otherwise, I will adjourn the House. ...(Interruptions)..

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, please hear me out. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Otherwise, I will adjourn the House.
...(Interruptions).. Do you want the discussion? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, the Leader of the Opposition has spoken.
...(Interruptions)... Two other political parties have spoken.
...(Interruptions)... There are eight or nine other political parties who wish to speak now. ...(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...(Interruptions)... I am not allowing a discussion...(Interruptions)... No, no. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: It is a question of point of order.
...(Interruptions)... Its importance is similar to a point of order.
...(Interruptions)... We want the protection of the right of every individual
Member...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is what I am going to do.
...(Interruptions)... To protect the right of Members to speak.
...(Interruptions)... No. ...(Interruptions)...(Interruptions).. I have to
resume the discussion on Motion of Thanks. ...(Interruptions)...

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD): Let
everybody speak, then we will tell you. ...(Interruptions)... Let every
Member speak at least for one minute. ...(Interruptions)....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot allow...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Half-a-minute...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Let everybody speak for half-a-minute.
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I can only allow discussion...(Interruptions)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : हाउस में यह परम्परा थी। ..(व्यवधान)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing any other discussion.
...(Interruptions)... Only on Motion of Thanks on the President's Address.
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, if we are not allowed to speak...(Interruptions)... I mentioned it yesterday also. ...(Interruptions)...
Our voices are being muzzled outside. ...(Interruptions)... And if our voice is muzzled inside the House, we are going to boycott for the whole day.
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned up to 3.00 p.m.

The House then adjourned at ten minutes past two of the clock.