

VNK-KLS/3C/6.00

**MOTION OF THANKS ON PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS (CONTD.)**

**SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, although the empty seats are staring at me...(Interruptions)... My voice is broken.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** There is enough number of Members for the evening session!

**SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY:** On my right side, there are empty seats, Sir. Anyway, Sir, 29 जनवरी को संसद के ज्वायंट सेशन में महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी ने 20 पत्रों के लिखित भाषण में कम से कम 11 प्रधानमंत्री योजनाओं का उल्लेख किया, जैसे- प्रधान मंत्री उज्ज्वला योजना, प्रधान मंत्री मुद्रा योजना, प्रधान मंत्री किसान सम्पदा योजना, वगैरह-वगैरह। इस तरह उसमें 11 योजनाओं का उल्लेख किया गया। उसमें क्या नहीं है? उसमें टॉयलेट भी है, डिजिटल वॉलेट भी है। उसमें स्टार्टअप भी है, स्टैंडअप भी है, लेकिन स्टार्टअप हुआ है क्या?

**संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री विजय गोयल):** सर, मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूँ कि सदन का समय दो घंटे के लिए बढ़ा दिया जाये।

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** It has already been decided in the Business Advisory Committee meeting that the House will run up to eight o'clock.

**श्री सुखेन्दु शेखर राय:** सर, मेरा सवाल यह बनता है कि क्या स्टार्टअप हुआ है? आम जनता स्टैंडअप भी कैसे करेगी? क्योंकि नोटबंदी और जीएसटी के डबल धमाके से जनता की कमर ही टूट गई है, तो वह स्टैंडअप कैसे होगी? इसका कोई तरीका इस अभिभाषण में नहीं बताया गया। जनता न तो यात्रा शुरू कर पायी, न ही खड़ा होने की कोशिश कर सकती है। इस प्रकार से इस अभिभाषण में जो भी बताया गया, वह इस साल कई राज्यों में विधान सभा और अगले साल लोक सभा चुनाव को मद्देनजर रखते हुए बताया गया है, इसलिए यह भी एक चुनावी जुमला जैसा है। हालांकि इस अभिभाषण में महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी के मन की बात नहीं कही गई, बल्कि हम हर रविवार जो मन की बात सुनते हैं, उसी को इस अभिभाषण में दोहराया गया है, इससे ज्यादा इसमें कुछ है नहीं।

इस अभिभाषण में दो नई चीजें बताई गई हैं। पेज संख्या 19 में बताया गया कि simultaneous election होना चाहिए और उसके लिए सदन को विचार करना चाहिए। यह प्रस्ताव कहां से आया? क्या चुनाव आयोग ने कोई ऐसा प्रस्ताव दिया है? क्या Constitution में ऐसा कोई प्रावधान है? संविधान को खोल कर कोई भी हमें दिखा दे कि इसमें इस संबंध में एक भी आर्टिकल है, एक भी प्रोविजन है, जहां पर यह बताया गया हो कि केन्द्र और राज्य का चुनाव एक साथ करना पड़ेगा। यह कहीं नहीं है और सन् 1967 से आज तक शायद ही कभी केन्द्र और राज्य का चुनाव एक साथ हुआ है, तो आप अचानक केन्द्र और राज्य का चुनाव एक साथ कराने के लिए इतना शोर क्यों मचाने लगे? ऐसा इसलिए कि आप संविधान को जड़ से उखाड़ना चाहते हैं, आप अपने

राजनीतिक स्वार्थ के कारण एक नया संविधान बनाना चाहते हैं। इसके अलावा कोई दूसरा कारण नहीं है। बताया जा रहा है कि इसमें बहुत खर्च हो रहा है, बहुत समय बरबाद हो रहा है।...(व्यवधान)... इसमें समय और खर्च की बात बताई जा रही है। आपने तो डिजिटल इंडिया बना दिया, तो आप ऑनलाइन चुनाव करा लीजिए। आप ऑन-लाइन चुनाव करा दीजिए, इससे खर्च बच जाएगा और समय भी बच जाएगा। इसमें महीने भर चुनाव कराने की कोई जरूरत नहीं पड़ेगी, पैरामिलिट्री टूप्स के deployment की कोई जरूरत नहीं पड़ेगी। आप ऑनलाइन चुनाव कराइए, डिजिटल इंडिया बन गया। ये सारे शोर और नारेबाजी ज्यादा दिनों तक नहीं चलते हैं।

अभिभाषण के पेज संख्या 2 में महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी ने बोला कि ट्रिपल तलाक बिल संसद में पेश किया गया, यहां भी सुबह बताया गया कि हम लोगों ने उसका विरोध किया। किसी भी पार्टी ने इसका विरोध नहीं किया, एक भी विरोधी दल ने इसका विरोध नहीं किया। हमारी मांग थी कि इस बिल में कुछ कमियां हैं, इसलिए इसको पहले सेलेक्ट कमेटी में भेजा जाए, वहां से scrutiny के बाद उसको यहां वापस लाया जाए, उसके बाद हम इस बिल को पारित करेंगे। यह एक संसदीय प्रणाली है। आप इस संसदीय प्रणाली को क्यों बरबाद करना चाहते हैं? आप पहले इसका जवाब दीजिए।

महोदय, इसमें बहुत सारी बातें बताई गई हैं। इसमें बताया गया कि हिन्दुस्तान बहुत आगे बढ़ गया। कितना आगे बढ़ गया? हमारे पास दो-चार रिपोर्ट्स हैं। UNDP डेवलपमेंट रिपोर्ट के अनुसार मानव विकास के हिसाब से दुनिया के 188 देशों में भारत का स्थान 131वां है। इसका मतलब यह है कि भारत से ज्यादा मानव विकास 130 देशों

में हुआ है। हमारे साथ तुलना सिर्फ कांगो, नामीबिया और पड़ोसी पाकिस्तान से किया जा सकती है, दूसरे देशों से नहीं। ऐसा हमारा डेवलपमेंट हुआ है। यहां तक कि हमारे पड़ोसी देश, श्रीलंका और मालदीव भी हमसे आगे हैं। यह UNDP की रिपोर्ट है, तृणमूल कांग्रेस की नहीं है। World Economic Forum's Inclusive Development Index-2018 हाल ही में निकला है, इसी महीने ही निकला है। उसके अनुसार six out of ten Indians still live on less than 3.20 dollar per day यानी कि 60 प्रतिशत अर्थात करीबन 78 करोड़ हिन्दुस्तानी 6 हजार रुपए महीने पर अपना दिन गुजारते हैं। न्यू इंडिया! कौन-से जीडीपी ग्रोथ रेट और एफडीआई की कहानी सुनायी जा रही है?

CIA, हालांकि यह अमेरिका की खुफिया एजेंसी है, यह हर साल दुनिया के सारे देशों के बारे में World Fact Report निकालती है। वे तो अमेरिका से बहुत नजदीक हैं, इसलिए उन लोगों को CIA के बारे में कोई आपत्ति नहीं होनी चाहिए।

(3डी/एनकेआर-एसएसएस पर जारी)

NKR-SSS/3D/6.05

**श्री सुखेन्दु शेखर राय (क्रमागत)** : CIA की रिपोर्ट को लेकर किसी को आपत्ति नहीं होनी चाहिए। CIA की World स्तर की 29 जनवरी, 2018 की रिपोर्ट से पता चलता है कि पहला, संतान पैदा करते समय गर्भवती माताओं की मृत्यु की संख्या के मामले में हिन्दुस्तान दुनिया के 180 देशों में 56वें स्थान पर है। इसका मतलब है कि मातृत्वकालीन मृत्यु के मामले में हमारे देश की तुलना में दुनिया के लगभग 120 देश

हमसे पीछे हैं। हम इतना आगे बढ़ गए हैं। क्या इस तरह हम नारी सशक्तीकरण करना चाहते हैं? दूसरे, बाल मृत्यु के मामले में भारत 133 देशों से आगे है। यहां 35.60 प्रतिशत शिशु, जिनकी उम्र 5 साल से कम है, वे चिन्ताजनक कम वजन के हैं और कम वजन वाले शिशुओं की संख्या में भारत का स्थान दूसरा है। वल्लाह, क्या बात है ? मैं अल्लाह नहीं बोल रहा हूं, वल्लाह बोल रहा हूं। ..(व्यवधान)..

इसके आगे देखिए - Global burden of disease published in the medical journal, 'The Lancet' से पता चलता है कि वर्ष 2016 में, भारत में 5 साल से कम उम्र के शिशुओं की संख्या 9 लाख हो गई - क्या यही भारत की प्रगति है ? यहां प्रति एक हजार नागरिकों पर एक डॉक्टर की सेवाएं भी नहीं मिलतीं - यह भी CIA की रिपोर्ट है। यहां प्रति एक हजार नागरिकों को अस्पताल में एक भी बेड नहीं मिलता - यह भी CIA की रिपोर्ट है, मेरी नहीं। भारत में 31 लाख जनता को एच.आई.वी. एड्स है और हम दुनिया में आज तीसरे स्थान पर आ चुके हैं। CIA रिपोर्ट के मुताबिक 71.5 प्रतिशत ग्रामीण जनता और 37.4 प्रतिशत शहरी जनता को सैनिटेशन फैसिलिटीज़ नहीं मिलतीं, फिर स्वच्छ भारत का नारा किस आधार पर दे रहे हैं , स्वच्छ भारत का नारा क्यों लगा रहे हैं ? इस नारेबाजी करने वाली सरकार को अगले चुनाव में जनता जवाब देगी।

अब मैं थोड़ा महामहिम राष्ट्रपति महोदय के अभिभाषण की तरफ आना चाहता हूं। इसके पेज 3 पर कहा गया है - “My Government is committed to doubling of farmers’ income by 2022.” यही बात बी.जे.पी. के 2014 के इलेक्शन मेनिफेस्टो में

भी कही गई है, फिर पिछले चार सालों में किसानों की आमदनी क्यों डबल नहीं हुई - इसका जवाब कौन देगा ? इसका कोई जवाब सरकार की तरफ से अभी तक नहीं आया। सिर्फ 2015 में 12,500 से अधिक किसानों ने देश में आत्महत्या की है। हर रोज़ 35 किसान खुदकुशी करते हैं, on an average. चार साल तक यह सरकार सोती रही और अब जब इसका अंतिम समय आ गया, तो कहते हैं कि हमें 2022 तक का समय दीजिए ताकि हम किसानों की आय डबल कर सकें। अब तक लगभग 40,000 किसान आत्महत्या कर चुके हैं। यदि इस सरकार को और चार साल की मोहलत मिलती है तो क्या उनकी इन्कम दोगुनी हो जाएगी, क्या आप यही कहना चाहते हैं?

महोदय, नीति आयोग के एक वरिष्ठ सदस्य ने इस बारे में क्या कहा है, नीति आयोग के वरिष्ठ सदस्य का वह डाक्यूमेंट मेरे पास है, यदि आप इजाजत दें तो मैं उसे टेबल पर भी रख सकता हूँ। यह Economic Times की 31<sup>st</sup> January, 2018 की बात है, राष्ट्रपति महोदय के अभिभाषण के दो दिन बाद, नीति आयोग के एक वरिष्ठ अधिकारी का उसमें एक guest column निकला, जिसमें उन्होंने कहा, and I quote “MSP is notified for 23 crops but effectively ensured only for two-three crops.” क्या यह फैलेसी नहीं है कि जब 23 फसलों के लिए एम.एस.पी. डिक्लेयर किया जाता है, लेकिन सिर्फ दो-तीन फसलों के लिए उसे इम्पलिमेंट किया जाता है?

किसानों के साथ इससे बड़ी धोखेबाड़ी की बात क्या हो सकती है ? He says, "MSP does not generate reasonable surplus (income) for the farmers." - नीति आयोग के एक अधिकारी ऐसा बोल रहे हैं।

(3E/DS द्वारा जारी)

USY-DS/3E/6.10

**SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY (CONTD.):** He says, "MSP does not generate reasonable surplus (income) for the farmers." नीति आयोग के अधिकारी बोल रहे हैं, "MSP does not generate reasonable surplus (income) for the farmers. Not surprisingly, farmers have been demanding effective implementation of MSP for all the crops and keeping MSP 50 per cent higher than cost." It was published in the Economic Times. मेरे पास Economic Times है, इसको मैं आपकी इजाजत से टेबल करना चाहता हूँ। सर, इसमें भी jugglery होती है और इसमें fallacy भी है। जैसे कि इसमें एक मेकैनिज्म है। CACP ने जो मेकैनिज्म अपनाया है, उसके नियम के अनुसार, दो तरह से कॉस्ट असेसमेंट होती है- कॉस्ट ए-2 और कॉस्ट-2. कॉस्ट ए-2 फॉर्मूला के अनुसार, फसल उत्पादन के लिए सीड, फर्टिलाइजर, मैन्योर, केमिकल्स, ह्यूमन लेबर, bullocks, मशीन लेबर, इरिगेशन एक्सपेंसेज, मेंटनेंस कॉस्ट आदि कॉस्ट ए-2 में आते हैं। अगर एमएसपी, कॉस्ट ए-2 + फैमिली लेबर, यानी किसान के परिवार, जो श्रम देते हैं, उसको भी जोड़ते हैं, तो उसके ऊपर अगर 50 परसेंट एमएसपी रेट रखा जाएगा, तभी वह

लाभदायक होगा, नहीं तो वह लाभदायक नहीं होगा। अभी तक यह खुलासा नहीं किया गया है। हमने बजट को सुना और पढ़ा, लेकिन उसमें कहीं भी यह नहीं बताया गया कि एमएसपी किसके आधार पर तय किया जाएगा, कॉस्ट ए-2 के आधार पर या कॉस्ट-2 के आधार पर? अगर कॉस्ट-2 है, तो यह भी एक धोखेबाजी है।

सर, अभिभाषण में सोशल और इकोनॉमिक डेमोक्रेसी का उल्लेख किया गया है। देश भर में, चाहे रेलवे स्टेशन हो, बस अड्डा हो, हवाई अड्डा हो, सड़क हो, जन-सुविधाएँ हों, हर जगह हम "स्वच्छ भारत" और "एक भारत, श्रेष्ठ भारत" के विशाल-विशाल बिल बोर्ड्स देखते हैं। इस अभिभाषण में भी बताया गया, लेकिन अच्छे दिन की बात अब नहीं बोली जाती, वह गीत पुराना हो चुका है। हाल में, प्रधान मंत्री जी Annual Davos World Economic Forum की मीटिंग में गए थे। जब तक प्रधान मंत्री जी वहाँ पहुँचे, तब तक International Rights Group, जिसे Oxfam कहा जाता है, उस Oxfam की रिपोर्ट निकली। उसमें जो बताया गया, उसको मैं एक लाइन में बताना चाहता हूँ। उसमें बताया गया - 'India's richest one per cent garner 73 per cent of the total wealth generated in the country in 2017.' सत्ता में इनके आने के तीन साल के बाद हिन्दुस्तान का यह चेहरा है कि 2017 में जो 73 परसेंट वेल्थ जेनरेट हुई, वह एक परसेंट के कब्जे में चली गयी, तो यह "सबका साथ, सबका विकास" नहीं है, बल्कि यह एक परसेंट के साथ एक परसेंट का विकास है।

सर, इस अभिभाषण में काले धन के बारे में कुछ भी नहीं बताया गया है, क्योंकि बोलने के लिए कुछ नहीं है। किसी नागरिक ने प्रधान मंत्री जी के दफ्तर में एक



आरटीआई ऐप्लिकेशन भेजी थी। वे साल भर इंफॉर्मेशन कमिश्नर के पास घूमते रहे, लेकिन आज तक उसका कोई जवाब नहीं मिला। उसमें पूछा गया था- यह बताया जाए कि नोटबंदी के बाद कितना काला धन सरकार के पास आया? एक साल बीत गया, लेकिन उस आरटीआई ऐप्लिकेशन का जवाब आज तक नहीं मिला है। यह भी गैर-कानूनी है, पेनल्टी होनी चाहिए थी। यह किसने बोला था कि अगर हम विदेश से काला धन लाकर गरीब जनता के खाते में 15-15 लाख रुपये नहीं जमा करते हैं और अगर नोटबंदी का शुभ फल छः महीने में नहीं मिलता है, तो हम चौराहे पर खड़ा होने के लिए तैयार हैं? यह किसने बताया था, यह मैं नहीं बोलना चाहता। मैं याद दिलाना चाहता हूँ। पहले तो Panama Papers निकला, जिसमें 500 से अधिक हिन्दुस्तानियों का नाम आया, फिर पिछले साल Paradise Papers में 900 से अधिक नाम आए। ये लोग स्वर्गवासी तो नहीं हैं ! Paradise Papers में नाम निकल गया, इसका मतलब ये स्वर्गवासी नहीं हैं, ये भारत में हैं। ये लोग पैराडाइज़ में नहीं रहते हैं। अगर हिम्मत है, तो व्हाइट पेपर निकालिए और बताइए कि पनामा पेपर्स और पैराडाइज़ पेपर्स में जिन हिन्दुस्तानियों का नाम आया है, हमने उनके खिलाफ यह कार्रवाई की है।

(3एफ/एमसीएम पर जारी)

PK-MCM/3F/6.15

**श्री सुखेन्दु शेखर राय (क्रमागत)** : जनता को आप खुलासा कीजिए। हिन्दुस्तान की जनता जानना चाहती है कि सरकार क्यों खामोश है? White Paper निकालिए, हमारी यह मांग है।

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** Mr. Sukhendu Sekhar Ray, you have one more speaker.

**SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY:** Don't worry, Sir. We are okay.

**SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN:** Don't worry, Sir.

**SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY:** You need not worry, Sir. We will adjust among ourselves.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** Fine.

**श्री सुखेन्दु शेखर राय** : पी0एस0यू0 बैंक के एन0पी0ए0 के बारे में इस अभिभाषण में एक भी शब्द नहीं बताया गया। जो कि अब यह एन0पी0ए0 10 लाख करोड़ तक पहुंच गया होगा। अगर सरकार में हिम्मत है तो willful default को criminal offence ऐलान करे, कानून में बदलाव लाएं, यह हमारी capability हो। फिर भी वे बैंकों को पैसा वापस नहीं दे रहे हैं। According to criminal law, this is a breach of criminal trust and cheating. So, both breach of criminal trust and cheating come under the purview of criminal law. आप आई0पी0सी0 को चेंज कीजिए, आप Cr.PC को चेंज कीजिए और उनके खिलाफ criminal proceedings कीजिए,

special court बनाइए। अगर हिम्मत है तो आप छू नहीं सकते, क्योंकि यह सरकार crony capitalism की सरकार है, किसानों की, गरीबी की, मजदूरों की सरकार नहीं है।

सर, रोजगार के बारे में बड़े-बड़े शब्द कहे गए हैं, लेकिन survey data of the Centre for Monitoring Indian Economy के अनुसार नोटबंदी के कारण 2017 के पहले चार महीनों में 15 लाख मजदूर बेरोजगार हो गए। This is the report of the survey data of the Centre for Monitoring Indian Economy, 2017. पिछले साल सिर्फ चार महीनों में 15 लाख बेकार। नोटबंदी के कारण अब तक न जाने कितने बेरोजगार हुए होंगे। ऐसा वे बता रहे हैं, हम नहीं। तो यह जुमले का फसाना है। हमने एक पुराना गीत सुना था, मुकेश जी का। "मेरा नाम जोकर" फिल्म के लिए शंकर जयकिशन ने लिखा था। "कहता है जोकर सारा जमाना, आधी हकीकत, आधा फसाना"। यह हकीकत से दूर ऐसा एक फसाना है, जो कि जुमला भरा हुआ एक फसाना है। लेकिन देश की जनता इसमें फंसना नहीं चाहती है।

सर, मैं खत्म करने वाला हूँ। कल मेरे लीडर देरेक ओब्राइन जी बोलेंगे। सर, आदरणीय वित्त मंत्री जी, जब 2014 में अमृतसर में चुनाव लड़ रहे थे, वहां पर उन्होंने IT ceiling के बारे में कुछ बोला था, इसका भी मेरे पास डॉक्यूमेंट है, पी0टी0आई0 की रिपोर्ट है, अगर चाहते हैं तो मैं उसको टेबल कर सकता हूँ। उन्होंने बोला था कि IT ceiling 2 लाख से 5 लाख करनी पड़ेगी। इससे तीन करोड़ जनता को लाभ मिलेगा। उन्होंने यह भी दावा किया कि अगर IT ceiling नहीं बढ़ती है तो trade or industry

बरबाद हो जाएंगी और इसी कारण चाइना और थाईलैंड भारत से आगे बढ़ गए। हालांकि वहां के चुनाव में आदरणीय वित्त मंत्री जी हार गए थे, लेकिन बाद में उन्होंने 50 हजार तो सीलिंग बढ़ायी थी, उसके बाद एक पैसा भी नहीं बढ़ाया और इस बार भी नहीं बढ़ाया। यह भी आधी हकीकत, आधा फसाना है। सर, वित्त मंत्री जी ने जो कुछ भी बोला तो बोला। लेकिन अभी देश में cow vigilantism शुरू हो गया, देश में लव जेहाद शुरू हो गया। इस पर एक शब्द भी इस अभिभाषण में नहीं है। हमारे बंगाल के एक मजदूर को राजस्थान में कुठार से मारा गया और उसके बाद उसको जिंदा जलाया गया। उसकी तस्वीर social site पर दिखाई गई। इस बारे में सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने कहा है कि उसको सोशल साइट पर नहीं दिखाना चाहिए।

(3G/SC पर जारी)

SC-PB/3G/6.20

**श्री सुखेन्दु शेखर राय (क्रमागत)** : हम चाहते हैं कि उसे social sites पर दिखाया जाए ताकि सारी दुनिया देखे कि हिन्दुस्तान में क्या हो रहा है।..(व्यवधान).. क्या यह नया भारत है? गौरक्षा के नाम पर यहां हर रोज हत्याएं हो रही हैं। क्या हम Republic of India में रहते हैं या Republic of Cow में हैं? क्या हम citizens of Republic of India हैं या citizens of Republic of Cow हैं, यह सवाल उठता है?

सर, अंत में मैं कैफी आजमी साहब की चंद लाइनें कहना चाहता हूं जिन्हें हेमन्त कुमार ने अपनी धुन में 'अनुपमा' फिल्म में गाया था।

"इक ख्वाब खुशी का देखा नहीं, देखा जो कभी तो भूल गए।

माना हम तुम्हें कुछ दे न सके, जो तुमने दिया वह सहने दो।  
क्या दर्द किसी का लेगा कोई, इतना तो किसी में दर्द नहीं,  
बहते हैं आंसू और बहें, अब इतनी तसल्ली रहने दो,  
या दिल की सुनो दुनिया वालो, या मुझको अभी चुप रहने दो।  
मैं ग़म को खुशी कैसे कह दूँ, जो कहते हैं उनको कहने दो।"

(समाप्त)

**SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN (TAMIL NADU):** Sir, I rise to thank the President who was kind enough to address both the Houses in the Central Hall. I have some differences with the President's speech on which I have given amendments which I will explain later.

Our President Address contained a lot of statistics about the performance of our Government. The *Economic Times* in its editorial headlines stated, "President Kovind or Economic Survey." The former Finance Minister — he does not belong to the Opposition; he was a former BJP Finance Minister — Shri Yashwant Sinha gave the opinion earlier that this Government is presenting a "Made to order statistics." I thought Shri Amit Shah would have replied to him. It is a "Made to order statistics." What you presented in the House, it was 'Made to order.' It is not the reality which I don't say. Mr. Yashwant Sinha has gone on record.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

While I am leaving these statements for the House to judge, let me bring to the attention of the House how realities are way away from the assertions made in the President's observation.

My friend, the hon. Member, Shri Navaneethakrishnan, spoke on NEET that how Tamil Nadu Government unanimously passed a Resolution. It was sent to the President. Actually, one Minister, the Central Minister, came to Chennai. She assured that 'we will try to get you one year extension.' Then only they passed it in the Assembly. After it was passed, I thought it will go to the President. Then I wrote a letter to the President. The President replied to me, 'The Home Ministry did not send me the Bill.' See, whether it is NEET or anything else, it is not just Tamil Nadu. Throughout India, the rural population cannot write that examination whether it is Bengal or whether it is Gujarat or whether it is U.P. Tamil Nadu only started expressing that feeling. Sir, take Jallikattu. You treat Tamil Nadu always differently. Again, Jallikattu is a problem. Our hon. Minister went to Madurai and assured the people that Jallikattu will be allowed. Then they said, "You will not be allowed."

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** Cooperative Federalism!

(Followed by 3h/SKC)

SKC-GS/3H/6.25

**SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN:** That is a part of cooperative federalism. So, not just we, even your own allies in the NDA, the Shiv Sena and the Telugu Desam Party, are unhappy with you.

Sir, I would now like to draw your attention to another part of the President's Address where they have talked about doubling the income of farmers by 2022. Shri Amit Shah spoke as if it was only this Government that worried about the *kisan*. No, Sir; before you, Lal Bahadur Shastri was also worried about farmers! He gave the slogan *Jai Jawan Jai Kisan*. Successive Governments were also worried about farmers, but nothing was implemented. The number of farmers committing suicide is increasing every year. The President's Address says, 'Wait for four more years'! By then the suicides would have increased manifold. How are we going to find a remedy to this problem?

Sir, the problems of water scarcity and irrigation in Tamil Nadu have been brought to the attention of the Government several times. What Tamil Nadu needs is water from the Cauvery river. Successive Governments have failed to provide legitimate share of the water and till now, the Government has not formed the Cauvery Management Board. Even the Supreme Court

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

had advised them to form the Board, but they did not do so. One Central Minister, Mr. Ananth Kumar, said that they would not give water to Tamil Nadu. It was not just a citizen of Karnataka who said so, but a Central Minister. Sir, ten lakhs of acres in Tamil Nadu are in need of water. The water required to irrigate those ten lakh acres is 15 TMC. Already Karnataka was supposed to have given 80 TMC of water to Tamil Nadu. So, what is happening is that instead of economic necessity, political compulsions are deciding the fate of the Cauvery issue. Yesterday, the hon. Prime Minister was speaking at a rally in Karnataka. He should have advised the people to give water to Tamil Nadu; they are our brethren. The Prime Minister's speeches are very popular. He could have advised the Karnataka people in this respect, but he did not do so. So, there are political compulsions. Karnataka is due for polls shortly. So, both the Central Government and the State Government there say, 'no water to Tamil Nadu'. I would like to know whether the Central Government treats Tamil Nadu as a part of India or not. The sufferers are farmers of the delta region of Tamil Nadu. Whatever farmers produce in Tamil Nadu is for the nation, but you deny them what is due to them. The *Economic Survey* speaks volumes about the impact of the weather on agricultural productivity. In such a situation, how can farmers'



**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

income double by 2022? It is a deliberate folly, deceiving the people and nothing more.

Sir, a lot of claims have been made about the employment scenario in the country. According to the report on employment, the Unemployment Survey, 2015-16, nearly half of India's workforce, that is 46.6 per cent, is self-employed. I don't consider self-employment to be bad, but I do not venture to call them 'pakora sellers'. The average annual income of self-employed people is Rs. 60,000. It means Rs. 5,000 per month and less than Rs. 200 per day. Can they survive? Can a family of husband, wife and two-three children survive?

(CONTD. BY HK/3J)

HK/3J/6.30

**SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN (CONTD.):** Dear, Sir, people become self-employed because there is no regular employment. You can see that autorickshaw drivers are B.A./M.A. today; Arrack sellers are B.A./M.A. Thanks to the neo-liberal policy, there is a type of economic growth which does not produce jobs, except low-paid jobs in the informal sector, and mainly contractual jobs in the organized sector. Even school teacher is on contract today. The economic slowdown and demonetization have killed

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

the job prospects of all round. Shrinking opportunities of rural employment have also aggravated the situation. In such a scenario, the claim of the Government on the employment scenario is far from truth. Our President started his Address mentioning about special dimension of our "*Vasudhaiva Kutumbakam*", that is what we call *Yaadhum Oore Yaavarum Kelir*. But, Sir, the Indian Government pushed back the Rohingyas when they sought refuge in our country. You say "*Vasudhaiva Kutumbakam*" and when somebody comes here you push them back. The biggest democracy in Asia, our country, which ought to have played a role in solving the Rohingya issue was silent and looked away from the issue. Why? When Pope goes to Dhaka, America sent its Secretary of State; UK and Canadian Ministers go there; Asian countries go. But India refused to go; India refused to intervene. Why? China is here to use that situation. They emerged as the peace keepers. The real thing is that Government of India's stance was negative. Why are they negative? They are so owing to their communal and ideological compulsions because Rohingyas are Muslims. So, you have your own ideological compulsions; you have communal compulsions. When everybody is involved in that, they don't want to involve in that. Sir, it is worthy to note that China played a mediatory role. The Foreign Minister of

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

China went there and he was able to negotiate with the parties, and the Chinese Foreign Minister called it three-phase solution. In short, all of India's actions since the outbreak of this round of violence in Myanmar have negated its position as a regional, sub-continental and Asian leader.

Sir, there is a mention about the benefits of development of the poorest of the poor. But in 2017 one per cent of the Indian population garnered 73 per cent of the additional wealth and the remaining 99 per cent of the population divided among themselves the remaining 27 per cent of the wealth created.

Sir, while the Government is so much lavish in its claim of upward journey in respect of Ease of Doing Business, in many places the President's Address is \* silent about India's going down in the rank of Global Hunger Index. He is very silent.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** You have one more speaker.

**SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN:** I understand. Sir, some 38 per cent of children in India suffer from stunting, where the height is limited by insufficient calorie

---

**\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.**

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

intake. Citing this 2017 Report "India: Health of the Nation's States", the Economic Survey emphasizes that malnutrition is the most important risk factor for 14.6 per cent of the children that results in disease burden in the country.

Sir, since I come from Tamil Nadu, I wanted to raise two or three points relating to Tamil Nadu.

(Contd. by DPS/3K)

DPS/ASC/3K/6.35

**SHRI T.K. RANGARAJAN (CONTD.):** Sir, in Keezhadi, there are 110 acres of land excavated, not even one per cent of work has been done. Permission to continue the excavation in 2018 has not been given by the Central Government. I request the Central Government to issue necessary orders to the Archaeological Department to continue the excavation. When I brought this issue to the notice of the House, as a Special Mention, the entire House supported that, including the Deputy Chairman. The State Government has allotted two acres of land for establishing a museum in Keezhadi to exhibit 5,000-odd artefacts found during the excavation. The Central Government has not even taken over the land up till now. The Central Government has not even started the preliminary work of

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

constructing the museum. The findings of Keezhadi will throw new light about the history of human civilization in India. Hence, I request the Government to pass necessary orders for continuing the invaluable excavation there.

Sir, the fate of livelihood of eight lakh workers engaged in manufacturing of crackers in Sivakasi and Virudhunagar in Tamil Nadu is hanging in balance as there is a case in the Supreme Court for banning the crackers. While the environment needs to be protected, we cannot ignore the lifeline of the eight lakh workers. The Government should come forward to exempt manufacturing of crackers for special occasions from the Environment Protection Act, 1986.

Finally, Sir, very importantly, I request the Government to come forward to adopt Thirukkural, which is the sacred book of Tamil, containing valuable ethics and guidance for the welfare of humanity, as our National Book as we have a National Bird, National Flower. I also request the Government to erect a statue of Thiruvalluvar inside the premises of Parliament. Thank you very much.

(Ends)

**SHRI T.G. VENKATESH (ANDHRA PRADESH):** Respected Vice-Chairman, Sir, thank you very much for giving me the opportunity to speak on the Motion of Thanks to the Address of the hon. President, on the eve of the commencement of Budget Session of the Parliament, on 29<sup>th</sup> January, 2018. I feel it as a privilege to express my opinions on behalf of our party, the Telugu Desam Party.

Sir, hon. President, in his Address to the two Houses of Parliament has detailed the programmes being undertaken by Government in the country during the year 2018-19. Initiating the Address, he informed the commitment of the Government towards its flagship programme "Swatchh Bharat" by 2019 under which taking up construction of toilets to the poor with the financial support of the Government. Really, it is a marvelous programme inculcating the health consciousness in the minds of the people of the country. The popularity it gained is very laudable. I request the Government to earmark sufficient funds for completing success of the programme.

Also, the Pradhan Mantri Ujjwala Yojana, to provide LPG connections to poor families, is a praise-worthy programme. The initiation taken by the Government on LPG subsidy 'Give It Up' campaign is marvelous. The

subsidy foregone by the people has, to a great extent, helped the poorest of the poor to get LPG connections.

(Contd. by KSK/3L)

KSK/LP/6.40/3L

**SHRI T.G. VENKATESH (CONTD.):** The Jan-Dhan Yojana scheme introduced by the Government has got a great momentum and the poor have opened bank accounts with a view to get financial benefit from the Government. Making the poor people to open bank accounts will not be sufficient unless the Government does something to provide financial benefit to these account holders. I suggest the Government to plan in such a way that every Jan Dhan account holder gets some sort of financial benefit.

Through his Address, hon. President has given all the details about the schemes and commitments made by the Government. But the commitments and promises made to the State of Andhra Pradesh, like funds to construct State capital Amaravati, release of deficit balance, construction of Polavaram National Project, etc., as per the Andhra Pradesh Re-organization Act, 2014, have not been included. I request the Government to include all the promises, along with the Special Financial Package announced by the Government to Andhra Pradesh.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

In his speech, hon. President has made no mention of the details of the Polavaram National Project in Andhra Pradesh. Proper funds are not being released to complete the project as scheduled by 2019. As this project is very important for the development of the newly-formed State of Andhra Pradesh, I request the Government to take necessary steps for its early completion without any delay.

While giving the details of the Railway works, hon. President stated that introduction of High Speed Bullet Train between Mumbai and Ahmedabad will be taken up by the Government of India. But there is no mention about the promised Visakhapatnam Railway Zone to the State of Andhra Pradesh. I request the Government to include the same.

Hon. President added that New Metro Rail Policy has been envisaged to lay emphasis on metro connectivity in various parts of the country. As there is no mention of the Metro Rail project announced for Andhra Pradesh, I request the Government to include the same for the development of newly-formed State of Andhra Pradesh and also the steel plant.

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** Sir, we support that.

**SHRI T.G. VENKATESH:** You supported the division of the State also.



**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

Sir, hon. President has also informed that the GST has been introduced with a view to achieve economic integration. The introduction of the GST has given rise to many problems in its implementation. The recommendations of the State Governments have to be taken into consideration for its proper implementation.

While giving the details of the setting up of Institutes of Eminence in the country, financial assistance of Rs.10,000 crores and autonomy of IIMs have also been announced. But there is no mention about setting up of the Institutions announced and funds allocated to the State of Andhra Pradesh such as NIT Building, Tribal University, Telugu Academy, etc. I request the Government to include the institutions promised and announced for Andhra Pradesh also in the list.

Hon. President has also informed that the bold decisions taken by this Government like demonetization, implementation of OROP in the Defence field, repeal of obsolete laws, launch of BHIM mobile payment system, Aadhaar payment system, one-nation-one-tax system through GST, sustained global growth, liberalization of FDI policy, facing terrorism, global affairs, global outreach, agreements with foreign countries, are leading to all-round development of the country.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

With all the above, I express my profound thanks to the hon. President of India, on behalf of Telugu Desam Party, for taking up all the developmental schemes with a request to honour the commitments made to Andhra Pradesh by releasing sufficient funds for completion of Polavaram National Project, establishment of Visakhapatnam Railway Zone, establishment of steel plant in Rayalaseema, development of Vizag-Chennai Industrial Corridor, rapid road connectivity between proposed State capital Amaravati and Telangana, Amaravati Metro Rail Project, development of Duggarajapatnam Sea Port, along with release of revenue deficit for five years and implementation of Special Financial Package announced in lieu of Special Category Status by the Government for the development of newly-formed backward State of Andhra Pradesh to develop at par with other States.

Sir, once again, I want to make a request. The Telugu-speaking people have been divided by the combined hands. At that time, the Congress Party was ruling the country and BJP was the main Opposition party. By them both together, the Telugu-speaking people of the State have been divided. Congress was in power, but BJP also supported it. Both of them had agreed to give a lot of benefits to the State of Andhra Pradesh

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

because all the investment was in Telangana, Hyderabad and other places. So, Andhra Pradesh became a poor State as compared to any other State.

(Contd. by 3M – GSP)

GSP-KLG/6.45/3M

**SHRI T.G. VENKATESH (ANDHRA PRADESH):** Sir, if you see the per capita income, it is excellent in Telangana, it is good in Karnataka, it is excellent in Maharashtra. All these States are in a good place and their per capita income is also good. We also should reach that level. Even if you see the recent Budget announcements, importance has been given to all the other States except Andhra Pradesh.

Once again, I request you to please ensure that Andhra Pradesh, which is a newly-born State, is taken care of for the development activities. Thank you.

(Ends)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** Thank you very much. Next speaker is Shri D.P. Tripathi.

**SHRI D.P. TRIPATHI (MAHARASHTRA):** Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, with due regard to the President of the Republic, I must say that this is the first Presidential Address, which has neither the dress nor the dressing. Why I

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

say this is that both the form and content are faulty. As the old Sanskrit saying, "गद्यं कवीनां निकषं वदन्ति", 'prose is the litmus test of poets', the prose of this Address is very stale and awful. To use Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee's metaphor, there is no smile in the speech.

Form becomes very important in expressing the imagination and dreams of people. Before I come to the analysis of the Address, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I must seek your permission to make a few points, and, I would make only new points; I would not repeat what other hon. Members before me have said.

Before I begin the discussion on the Presidential Address, I must point out the most shocking omission in this Address. There is no mention about the hope and the future of India, the children of India and their rights find no mention in the Address at all. Whereas if you look at the two Presidential Addresses that I want to discuss in comparison to the present one — the first is, the Presidential Address given by Dr. Rajendra Prasad after the first elected Parliament in 1952, and, the second is, the first Presidential Address given during the Prime Ministership of Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee in 1998 -- they all talked about the children. This is the first time that children are not mentioned. Where you talk about Beti Bachao, Beti Padhao, you don't read

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

your own Economic Survey, its social survey, which says that there are not one or two but twenty-one million unwanted girl children in India. I am not saying this; Economic Survey is saying this.

It is very good that through his maiden speech, the President of the ruling Bhartiya Janata Party, Shri Amit Bhai Shah, initiated the debate. He has made a few points. Before I come to the Address which he elucidated, explained and enlarged about the achievements of the Modi Government in all sectors of our national life, and, before I analyse a couple of points raised by him, I must ask him a question. If you have made so much progress in the NDA Government led by hon. Prime Minister, Shri Narendra Modi, why is it that India is behind even Pakistan, Bhutan and Nepal in the Happiness Index issued by the United Nations a few months ago?

(Contd.by SK/3N)

SK-AKG/3N/6.50

**SHRI D.P. TRIPATHI (contd.):** Why is it so? Kindly read the entire Happiness Index report and you will find it shameful where India is positioned.

The second point, you talked about many achievements and contributions. What I see about your Government is described very well in

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

the ancient text ‘शतपथ ब्राह्मण’, which says “वागहि वज्रः वागहि शस्त्रम् वागु सर्वं भेषजम् ” -- speech is the *vajra*, speech is the weapon, speech is the medicine for all diseases. So, speeches after speeches, speeches after speeches, without any actions -- this is the Government led by Shri Narendra Modi. This Address looks like Prime Minister’s election speech without its oratorical skills. Now, Shri Amit Shah talked about the great coalition *dharma* which he is following, how despite majority, after 30 years, they took all other partners along and formed the NDA Government. What is there; how are they running the coalition Government? You just heard Shri Venkatesh of Telugu Desam. He was talking about the step-motherly treatment meted out to the Andhra Government. His leader, Shri Chandrababu Naidu, is reported to have said to his MPs yesterday, which is ideally reported in the media today, ...(Interruptions)... not only to put pressure, but disrupt the Parliament, demand for the rights of people of Andhra Pradesh. This is what he has said. The recent statement of Shiv Sena Chief, Shri Uddhav Thackeray, is before all of you. From the Leader of the Opposition to Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray, all of them have talked about this doubling of the income of farmers. I will come to that later. But Shri Thackeray says that this promise is baseless. These are his words, not my

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

words. Then, the demand of the Telugu Desam has been supported by our friend, Shri Naresh Gujral, of the Akali Dal. So, the voices of your coalition partners are very great. This coalition seems to be uniquely cohesive where there are all kinds of voices. Prime Minister Narendra Modi last time quoted my friend, Nida Fazli, to the best of my memory, while replying to the Vote of Thanks to the President's Address last year. I think I should also quote Nida Fazli about the kind of coalition that you are running. निदा फाज़ली का शेर है।

"दुश्मनी कितनी भी हो, पर रिश्ता निभाते रहिए,  
दिल मिले या न मिले, हाथ मिलाते रहिए।"

This is how you are running the coalition.

The next point, I think, I should talk about the two Presidential Addresses and compare this one with the two Addresses. One, of course, is the Address, as I mentioned, in 1952, after the election of the first Parliament of independent India, the Address delivered by Dr. Rajendra Prasad. In many ways, it is unfair on my part to compare that one with the present one. Even then I must request you to read this Address because it gives a vision of new India. You are talking about new India in the concluding para of the Presidential Address. How this new India can be made, for that you should read this Presidential Address of 1952 where Dr.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

Rajendra Prasad talked about the high destiny of India, its civilisational values, the vision of a new country and wisdom and tolerance of spirit. He talked in detail about this. And you will be surprised to know that in the very first Address after the election of Indian Parliament in 1952, there were six large paragraphs about the foreign policy of India and international relations.

(Contd. by YSR/30)

YSR-SCH/6.55/30

**SHRI D.P. TRIPATHI (CONTD.):** How you should build the presence of your nation in the world is described in this. And, of course, all sections of society are mentioned in this. I am saying this because if you read it carefully, you will find that this Address has more emphasis on the Government and much less on the people whereas the Address by Dr. Rajendra Prasad talks about the onward march of the people, the basic essence of the people. लोकतंत्र की परिभाषा अगर संक्षेप में देनी हो, तो मैं कहता हूँ कि लोकतंत्र साधारण की असाधारणता है। Extraordinariness of the ordinary is democracy. जो शक्ति जनता में होती है, सामान्य जन में होती है, उसी से लोकतंत्र चलता है। In this Address, people are, more or less, absent. You do not talk about people's endeavours and efforts whereas the Address by Dr. Rajendra Prasad talks about all that.



**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

Now I come to another one from which you have not learnt any lessons and that is the first Presidential Address when Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee assumes office as Prime Minister of India. It gives a vision. One can agree or disagree with it, but that is beside the point. Kindly read it to know what vision it gives. I will quote a few things from that. First, it says that merely parliamentary arithmetic is not the basis of democracy. Cooperation, conciliation and consensus are essential for democracy. I am quoting it from this Address. Then it says that secularism is integral to Indian tradition. I am quoting the sentence from this Address, not from the manifesto of the Congress Party or the Nationalist Congress Party. It says that secularism is integral to Indian tradition. The Government is unequivocally committed to upholding secular values. This is what is said in this Address. In terms of foreign policy, it talks about Asian solidarity and regional cooperation, in fact, various groups of regional cooperation. Actually, it has a kind of perspective on foreign policy, a vision on foreign policy. You can agree or disagree with it, but that again is beside the point.

On comparing these two Addresses, especially this one of 1998 which says how you can build a new India, you will find that it gives that vision. It is not surprising that there is no mention of communal harmony in the present

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-05.02.2018**

Presidential Address. You should not be surprised that there is no mention of it because they have not learnt anything from their own NDA Government led by Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee. This is what is there. There is paucity of time. I have only 15 minutes and I have to cover other points also. Therefore, I am not quoting all these things in detail. There is a perspective on this. The present Address does not present a vision of India. The vision of India is based on tolerance, diversity and togetherness. And this one sentence in this Address of the President in 1998 is very important for you, the Members of the Treasury Benches, to learn. It talks about the governance that seeks to unify and not to divide the country. This is very important. I am not saying this. This is your President's Address during your own Government.

(Contd. by BHS/3P)