

PK-HMS/1N/12.00

**MR. CHAIRMAN (CONTD.):** Now, Question Hour.

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD):** Sir,...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** The Leader of the Opposition.

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** सर, हम लोगों का Zero Hour mention रह गया।

**श्री सभापति :** आपका आएगा।

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** कल दे दीजिए।

**श्री सभापति :** जरूर देंगे।

**नेता विरोधी दल (श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद) :** सर, मैं जानता हूँ कि यह Question Hour है और मैं समय न लूँ, लेकिन सदन में गतिरोध न बना रहे और ज्यादा-से-ज्यादा बिल पास हों, जिस कारण से सदन में गतिरोध बना है, मैं चाहता हूँ कि उस का कोई समाधान हो, ताकि सदन चले। इस में जितनी रुचि आपको है, उतनी ही रुचि विपक्ष को भी है।

सर, कल विधान सभा चुनाव के रिजल्ट आए, बहुत अच्छी बात है और राजनीति में लोग जीतते-हारते हैं, election में आरोप लगते हैं, यह कोई नई बात नहीं है, लेकिन कुछ आरोप लोकतंत्र के लिए भी ठीक नहीं होते, राजनीति के लिए भी ठीक नहीं होते, देश के लिए भी ठीक नहीं होते, देश की राजनीति के लिए भी ठीक नहीं होते और जिन पर आरोप लगा, उनके लिए भी और पूरी राजनीति के लिए भी ऐसे आरोप कभी घातक साबित हो जाते हैं।

**قائد حزب اختلاف (جناب غلام نبی آزاد) :** سر، میں جانتا ہوں کہ یہ کوئٹھن آوور بے اور وقت نہ لوں، لیکن سدن میں گتی-رودھ نہ بنا رہے اور زیادہ سے زیادہ بل پاس ہوں، جس وجہ سے سدن میں گتی-رودھ بنا ہے، میں چاہتا ہوں کہ اس کو کوئی سمادھان ہو، تاکہ سدن چلے۔ اس میں جتنی روچی آپ کو ہے، اتنی ہی روچی ویکش کو بھی ہے۔

سر، کل ودھان سبھا چناؤ کے رزلٹ آئے، بہت اچھی بات ہے اور راجنیتی میں لوگ جیتتے بارتے ہیں، الیکشن میں آروپ لگتے ہیں، یہ کوئی نئی بات نہیں ہے، لیکن کچھ آروپ لوک-تنتر کے لئے بھی ٹھیک نہیں ہوتے، راجنیتی کے لئے بھی ٹھیک نہیں ہوتے، دیش کے لئے بھی ٹھیک نہیں ہوتے، ان کے لئے بھی اور پوری راجنیتی کے لئے بھی ایسے آروپ کبھی گھاتک ثابت ہو جاتے ہیں۔

**श्री सभापति :** गुलाम नबी जी ...

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** Sir, I will take just half-a-minute.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please.

**श्री गुलाम नबी आजाद :** सर, ऐसा ही आरोप गुजरात के election में लगा। गुजरात के election में कई आरोप हमारे बारे में लगे, मैं उनकी चर्चा नहीं करता, कई हमारे colleagues के बारे में लगे, मैं उनकी चर्चा नहीं करता, कांग्रेस प्रेजिडेंट पर आरोप लगे, मैं उनका भी उल्लेख नहीं करता, लेकिन जब ये आरोप 10 साल देश के भूतपूर्व प्रधान मंत्री रहे और इस सदन के मेंबर ..(व्यवधान).. मैं कोई गाली नहीं दे रहा हूं। इस देश के भूतपूर्व प्रधान मंत्री, जो Finance Minister रहे हैं, जो रिजर्व बैंक के गवर्नर रहे हैं, इस देश के उपराष्ट्रपति, जोकि 10 साल उपराष्ट्रपति रहे हैं, इस देश के लंबे अरसे

تک سیکرٹری رہے اور بعد میں Foreign Minister رہے، श्री नटवर सिंह, इस देश के आर्मी चीफ दीपक कुमार, इस देश के Foreign Secretary श्री हैदर सलमान, इस देश के Ambassador श्री शंकर बनर्जी, श्री लांबा, श्री राघवन ...

**جناب غلام نبی آزاد :** سر، ایسا ہی آروپ گجرات کے الیکشن میں لگا، گجرات کے الیکشن میں کئی آروپ ہمارے بارے میں لگے، میں ان کی چرچا نہیں کرتا، کئی ہمارے ساتھیوں کے بارے میں لگے، میں ان کی چرچا نہیں کرتا، کانگریس پریزیڈنٹ پر آروپ لگے، میں ان کا بھی الیکھ نہیں کرتا، لیکن جب یہ آروپ، دس سال دیش کے سابق پردھان منتری رہے، اور اس سدن کے ممبر --- (مداخلت) --- میں کوئی گالی نہیں دے رہا ہوں۔ اس دیش کے سابق پردھان منتری، جو فائینس منسٹر رہے ہیں، جو رزرو بینک کے گورنر رہے، اس دیش کے اپ-راشٹریتی، جو کہ دس سال اپ-راشٹریتی رہے، اس دیش کے لمبے عرصے تک سکرٹری رہے اور بعد میں فارین منسٹر رہے شری نٹور سنگھ، اس دیش کے آرمی چیف دیپک کمار، اس دیش کے فارین سکرٹری شری حیدر سلمان، اس دیش کے امیسیڈر شری شنکر بنرجی، شری لامبا، شری راگھون ---

**श्री सभापति :** गुलाम नबी जी ..

**श्री गुलाम नबी आजाद :** श्री सभरवाल और प्रेमशंकर .. (व्यवधान) .. मैं खत्म कर रहा हूँ। जब इन पर आरोप .. (व्यवधान) ..

**جناب غلام نبی آزاد :** شری سبھروال اور پریم شنکر --- (مداخلت) --- میں ختم کر رہا ہوں۔ جب ان پر آروپ --- (مداخلت) ---

**SHRI RIPUN BORA:** Have some patience to hear. .. (Interruptions) ..

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-19.12.2017**

**श्री सभापति :** आप conclude कीजिए। ..(व्यवधान).. मैं solution ढूंढ रहा हूँ, आप बैठ जाइए। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा :** सर, सत्ताधारी दल नहीं चाहता कि सदन चले ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री भूपेन्द्र यादव :** आप नहीं चाहते ..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I have called Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad. ....(Interruptions)..

Please conclude. ....(Interruptions).. भूपेन्द्र जी, प्लीज आप बैठ जाइए। ..

(व्यवधान).. बैठ जाइए। ..(व्यवधान).. Please sit down. ...(Interruptions).. I will

give you an opportunity. ...(Interruptions).. Don't worry.

...(Interruptions).. Please sit down. ...(Interruptions).. I will give you an

opportunity. ...(Interruptions).. Ghulam Nabiji, please conclude.

...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** Sir, I am concluding. ...(Interruptions).. Let

me complete. ..(Interruptions)..

**श्री भूपेन्द्र यादव :** आपने मना किया था TV के ऊपर ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा :** किस ने मना किया? यह बिल्कुल गलत बात है ..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** The Leader of the Opposition is on his legs.

...(Interruptions).. Please sit down. ...(Interruptions).. Respect the

Leader. ...(Interruptions).. मैं दोनों तरफ के सदस्यों को कह रहा हूँ।

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-19.12.2017**

..(व्यवधान).. Hon. Members, today morning, in an informal meeting.....(Interruptions).. भूपेन्द्र जी, बैठ जाइए प्लीज। ..(व्यवधान)..

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** Sir, now, you can see who is not interested in the transaction of Business. ...(Interruptions).. Sir, now, you yourself can see which party is not interested in the transaction of Business. ..(Interruptions)..

**श्री सभापति :** बैठ जाइए, प्लीज। गुलाम नबी जी ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद :** मैंने कोई गाली तो नहीं दी।

**جناب غلام نبی آزاد :** میں نے کوئی گالی تو نہیں دی۔

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Ghulam Nabiji, I heard you. You have not given any *gaali*. But the point is, in the morning, I myself took an initiative on this issue. Anand Sharmaji was there. My suggestion was, it is not good for the country or for anybody if the House does not run properly. An issue has been raised. That is why I suggested as Chairman.....

(Followed by PB/10)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-19.12.2017**

PB-ASC/10/12.05

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD):** Sir, Dr. Manmohan Singhji's integrity and loyalty to his country has been questioned. ...(Interruptions)... It is questioned. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Nobody has questioned. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** Is he the person who is ... ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Many things are said this way or that way. Even the Prime Minister's name was taken. ...(Interruptions)... So, my point is, Dr. Manmohan Singh is the most respected person. ...(Interruptions)... There is no doubt about it. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** Is the former Prime Minister of India not loyal to his country? ...(Interruptions)... That is a big question. ...(Interruptions)... Is the former Vice-President of India not loyal to his country? ...(Interruptions)... That is a big question. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** We are finding a solution. Let everybody sit down, please ...(Interruptions)... You ask your colleagues to sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** Sir, this allegation has come from no less a person than the present Prime Minister of the country. ...(Interruptions)...

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-19.12.2017**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Ghulam Nabiji, ask your colleagues to sit down.

...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** So, the hon. Prime Minister of India should come in the House and make it clear ...(Interruptions)... and if the former Prime Minister and other leaders are proved wrong, action should be taken against them. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री सभापति:** बैठ जाइए प्लीज़। ....(व्यवधान)... बैठ जाइए ....(व्यवधान)... बैठ जाइए ....(व्यवधान)... बैठिए, बैठिए। गुलाम नबी जी conclude करिए। ....(व्यवधान)...

Please go to your seats. I have called the name of Ghulam Nabiji. He has spoken. It has gone on record. ...(Interruptions)...Please. He has spoken.

Don't worry. ...(Interruptions)... In the morning, we have an informal meeting where MPs come and meet me, the Chairman, and also bring certain issues to the notice of the Chairman. I myself suggested – the

leaders of different parties were there – that इस गतिरोध को समाप्त करना देश के हित में है, व्यवस्था के हित में है, इसलिए इसके बारे में बात करने के लिए पार्लियामेंटरी अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर श्री अनंत कुमार जी थे और विजय गोयल जी भी थे

.....(व्यवधान)..... यह कोई पद्धति नहीं है। What you are saying will not go on record also. Why do you waste your energy unnecessarily?

...(Interruptions)... What I was suggesting is ... ..(Interruptions)... Please.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-19.12.2017**

Please sit down. Please cooperate. We have to function, and I have already told you, 'My operation depends on your cooperation.' So, please see to it that the House functions. That was a suggestion I made. Shri Anand Sharma was there and other leaders were also there. So, I suggested to the Parliamentary Affairs Minister 'you talk to the Leader of the House, Shri Arun Jaitley and the Leader of the Opposition and other senior leaders also and find a way out to end this impasse.' This is one. Secondly, these issues have been raised earlier also. This is the third day continuously. We are losing important Business. So, I requested them that in the interest of the democracy and the functioning of the parliamentary system, we should come to an understanding. There are two ways. One, either the Chair gives a ruling or there is a broad consensus or agreement between the Ruling Party and Opposition Parties to sort out the issue and then move forward. These are the two ways. As far as the rule is concerned, I will not violate the rule. I have also told that. But I put a rider. I myself suggested that let there be some agreement between both the sides, let them discuss among themselves and then come with some suggestion. I will keep an open mind and then move ahead; and this was broadly agreed by all. Comments made by this side, comments made by that side, comments made against the



**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-19.12.2017**

Prime Minister, against the former Prime Minister -- all these things can be internally discussed and we must come to some understanding to see that the House functions properly and the dignity and respect of the Members as well as the institutions – this side or that side – and also the institution of Parliament has to be kept intact. Please keep this in mind. The Leader of the House has also come. He has taken note of what I am saying from here. But it cannot be done on the spur of the moment in the House.

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** Sir, it is a very good suggestion. I will only submit that let the meeting be held under the Chairmanship of the Leader of the House with the leaders of all political parties. It is not question of the Congress Party alone because the other Opposition Parties are equally concerned; and this is a question of privilege since Dr. Manmohan Singhji is a Member of the House.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please don't go to the issue again.

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** It should also be to his satisfaction.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Dr. Manmohan Singhji met me. He has expressed his concern, his feelings. I have talked to him and also understood what he meant. I have conveyed it to the right persons also. Then I have also received a note of what exactly has been said. (Contd. by 1p/SKC)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-19.12.2017**

SKC-LP/1P/12.10

**MR. CHAIRMAN (contd.):** I have also received a note from others where the Prime Minister was called names by certain people. All these are serious issues. So, we have to sort this out among ourselves rather than discussing it, making allegations and counter-allegations. That is not going to...  
...(Interruptions)... Your Leader is there. Don't worry. He is capable.  
...(Interruptions)... Your Leader is capable; don't worry. आप ऐसी बात मत कहिए।..(व्यवधान)..

**SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:** \*

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** You have not been given permission. What you are saying will not go on record. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI KIRANMAY NANDA:** Sir, he was the Prime Minister of India.  
...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Yes, undoubtedly. That is why he must be respected.  
...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANUBHAV MOHANTY:** Sir, Shri Narendra Modi is the Prime Minister of India. He must... ...(Interruptions)...

-----

\* Not recorded

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-19.12.2017**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please, let us go to the Question Hour. I would keep in mind what Dr. Ghulam Nabi Azad has said. ...(Interruptions)... आप बैठिए..(व्यवधान).. प्लीज आप बैठिए।..(व्यवधान).. आप बैठ जाइए। ..(व्यवधान).. A Prime Minister is the Prime Minister of the country. That needs to be kept in mind by everybody. He is the Prime Minister. A former Prime Minister is the former Prime Minister of the country. That too must be kept in mind. ...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI ANUBHAV MOHANTY:** Then why is he not coming and answering here? ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा :** मैं एक बात आपसे कहूँ। ..(व्यवधान).. ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री सभापति :** नहीं, नहीं..(व्यवधान)..गुलाम नबी आज़ाद जी ने कहा है ..(व्यवधान)..I have taken note of what you have said till the end. So, let me proceed. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा :** आपने चेयर से जो कहा..(व्यवधान)..आपने कहा, हमारे नेता प्रतिपक्ष ने भी कहा, हमने भी कहा, सभी लोगों ने कहा कि हम चाहते हैं कि सदन चले, सदन की गरिमा रहे और सदन के पास जो भी विषय हैं, उन पर बात चले।..(व्यवधान)..सर, प्रधान मंत्री की बड़ी जिम्मेदारी है। ..(व्यवधान)..हम उनका सम्मान करते हैं। ..(व्यवधान)..

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-19.12.2017**

**श्री सभापति** : ठीक है। ..(व्यवधान).. Thank you. Question No. 31.  
...(Interruptions)...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा** : प्रधान मंत्री इसका समाधान कर सकते हैं। ..(व्यवधान)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN**: Anand Sharmaji, please allow the House to go on. Question No. 31; Shri Anil Desai. ...(Interruptions)... Shri Anil Desai, supplementaries, please. ....(Interruptions)...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा** : नेता सदन उठकर बोल दें। ..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री प्रदीप टम्टा** : प्रधान मंत्री आएँ..(व्यवधान)..माफी मांगें।..(व्यवधान)..

**श्री सभापति**: आनन्द शर्मा जी बैठ जाइए। ..(व्यवधान).. किसको जवाब देना है..(व्यवधान)..यह हम तय करते हैं या आप तय करते हैं?..(व्यवधान)..लीडर हैं भई!..(व्यवधान)..

**THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY)**: We would try to explore and find a solution out of that. It would certainly be a privilege to invite all my colleagues including the Leader of the Opposition. We would discuss it and try to find a solution for this. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN**: Please.. ...(Interruptions)... That is the end of the story now, for the time-being. ...(Interruptions)... It will be taken up; don't worry. ...(Interruptions)... Nobody should sit and speak. Whatever they say should not go on record.











**Q. No. 31**

**SHRI ANIL DESAI:** Sir, the Government has set the target of achieving an installed capacity of 100 Gigawatt of solar power by 2022. We could achieve just 15 per cent of the target by June, 2017. In the last six months, there has not been as significant a progress as should have been there, since 85 per cent of the target is to be achieved in the next five years.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question, please. Make it very short.

**SHRI ANIL DESAI:** Sir, I am putting my supplementary question.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Yes, please put your supplementary question. You are a smart man; you know how to put smart supplementaries.

**SHRI ANIL DESAI:** Sir, the solution requires a huge capital. It is much needed for a transformation in the power sector. May I know from the hon. Minister whether in the given situation the remaining target of 85 Gigawatt of solar power installation can be achieved by 2022? Particularly, what steps have been taken for the active participation of private players in the power sector?

**SHRI RAJ KUMAR SINGH:** Sir, the current status is that against the target of 100 Gigawatts of solar energy to be achieved by 2022, we have achieved about 16.62 Gigawatts. A few weeks back, we have formally issued a

**Q.No.31 contd.**

trajectory of the bids that we would hold. This was issued to the public and to the industry, so that the industry could prepare for it. According to that, in the next three months we are going to have bids for about 7,000 Gigawatts more. Next year, we are going to have bids for 30,000 Gigawatts and the year after that we are going to have bids for 30,000 Gigawatts more. Now, this is for ground-mounted solar plants. This is apart from the bids which we would have for floating solar power plants for which we have assessed the potential. We have huge water bodies in Bhakra Dam, etc.

(CONTD. BY HK/1Q)

HK-KLG/1Q/12.15

**SHRI RAJ KUMAR SINGH (CONTD.):** We have huge water bodies in Bhakra Dam, etc. So, we have sent teams to assess the potential there. So, this is apart from what we will do in floating solar. And this is also apart from what ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Thank you, Minister. ...(Interruptions)... You ask the second supplementary. For the convenience of the House, I want to tell everybody that the other day there was a meeting of the Business Advisory Committee in which hon. Members informed me that only first few questions

**Q.No.31 contd.**

are coming and other questions are not coming. That is why two suggestions are given. One, questions being asked should be crisp and brisk; second, the Ministers also should not elaborate the answers. As and when there is a discussion, Ministers can add things. Keep it in mind.

**SHRI RAJ KUMAR SINGH:** Sir, I just conclude. ...(Interruptions)... Much of this is happening by the private sector. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल:** सर, इनकी गलती नहीं है, ये आई.ए.एस. से नेता बने हैं।

**श्री सभापति:** प्लीज, अभी आप गलती मत करिए।

**श्री राज कुमार सिंह:** सर, मेरी आदत है कि मैं किसी भी प्वाइंट पर एक्सप्लेन कर देता हूँ, ताकि कोई संशय न रहे। सर, ये जो सारे इंस्टालेशंस हो रहे हैं, ये थ्रू दि प्राइवेट सेक्टर हो रहे हैं, क्योंकि हम टैरिफ के आधार पर बिड करते हैं और प्राइवेट सेक्टर के डेवलपर्स आकर सोलर पार्क्स लगाते हैं। So, the private sector is fully involved in this.

**SHRI ANIL DESAI:** Sir, Maharashtra has a huge coastline measuring around 652 kilometres. It is next to Gujarat and Andhra Pradesh in the country. Sun rays are available uninterrupted almost nine months of the year barring only the monsoon season. May I know from the hon. Minister, through you, whether we are utilizing this uninterrupted sun rays for production of solar

**Q.No.31 contd.**

energy, which is one of the cheapest power and clean energy? If so, I would like to have details.

**SHRI RAJ KUMAR SINGH:** Sir, Maharashtra currently has an installed capacity of 7,700 megawatts of renewal energy. Out of which the total solar energy, which has been established in Maharashtra, is quite limited which is about 500 or 600 megawatts. But we have programmes for setting up solar energy in the coming two or three years. We have issued a bid, which has been successful, for 200 megawatts in which the tariff is Rs.3.15 per unit. We have issued three separate bids for 300 megawatts again, and a separate bid of 250 megawatts is likely to be issued by SECI for solar park. Apart from that, we have three solar parks under development in Maharashtra. One is Sai Guru Solar park, which is in Dhule district; another is Dondaicha Solar park that is also in Dhule district and another is Patoda Solar park that is in Beed district.

**श्री हुसैन दलवाई:** सर, जो डिस्ट्रिब्यूशन कंपनीज हैं, उनके बड़े पैमाने पर लॉसेस होते हैं और उसके लिए आप रूरल एरियाज को सब्सिडी देते हैं। वह जो सब्सिडी दी जाती है, उसकी वजह से ये लॉसेस होते हैं। तो ये जो सब्सिडी दी जाती है, उसका पैसा, उसकी निधि डिस्ट्रिब्यूशन कंपनीज को सरकार क्यों देती है?

**Q.No.31 contd.**

**श्री राज कुमार सिंह:** सर, जो लॉसेज़ होते हैं, वे लॉसेज़ सरकार को ही देने पड़ते हैं और सरकारें ही देती हैं। जो लॉसेज़ हैं, वे दो तरह के हैं, जिनमें एक तो सब्सिडी हुई। हमने अभी सभी स्टेट्स के ऊर्जा मंत्रियों के साथ बैठक की थी और उनसे हमने कहा था कि एक तो जो सब्सिडी देनी है, आप उसे डायरेक्ट बेनिफिट ट्रांसफर के माध्यम से दीजिए और जो भी सप्लाई हो, वह मीटर्ड हो, लोग अपना बिल पे करें। उसके अलावा भी लॉसेज़ होते हैं। यह सब्सिडी अलग है, लॉसेज़ अलग हैं। लॉसेज़ चोरी से होते हैं और लॉसेज़ होते हैं चूंकि कहीं-कहीं अनमीटर्ड सप्लाई है, बिलिंग नहीं होती है। तो इन लॉसेज़ को कम करने के लिए हमने एक टारगेट रखा है। हमने ऊर्जा मंत्रियों की बैठक में जो टारगेट रखा, वह यह रखा है कि जनवरी, 2019 तक 15 परसेंट से कम लॉसेज़ हो जाने चाहिए। उसके बाद हम 15 परसेंट से ऊपर के लॉसेज़ को टैरिफ में एक्सेप्ट नहीं करेंगे, ऐसा हम रेगुलेशन लाएंगे। इससे सभी मंत्री सहमत थे। तो हमने लॉसेज़ को कम करने की यह डेडलाइन दी है।

(1आर/एकेजी-केएसके पर आगे)

AKG-KSK/1R/12.20

**श्री महेश पोद्दार :** सभापति महोदय, विगत एक-दो वर्षों में solar power और wind power की दरें 3 रुपए प्रति यूनिट से कम होती जा रही हैं, जबकि thermal power की दरें 4 रुपए/5 रुपए प्रति यूनिट है। इस सस्ती बिजली का फायदा देश की सारी discoms को मिल रहा है। मेरा प्रश्न यह है कि इस सस्ती बिजली का फायदा आम

**Q.No.31 contd.**

लोगों तक कब तक पहुँचेगा, चूँकि अभी तक किसी discom ने दरें कम करने की घोषणा नहीं की है? मेरा दूसरा प्रश्न यह है कि क्या इस फायदे को discoms अपने घाटों को पूरा करने के लिए उपयोग कर रही हैं या इसका फायदा आम जनता तक दिया जाएगा?

**श्री राज कुमार सिंह :** सर, अभी जो bids हुई हैं, उनमें solar power की जो lowest bid आई है, वह 2 रुपए 44 पैसे प्रति यूनिट है और wind power की जो lowest bid आई है, वह 2 रुपए 65 पैसे प्रति यूनिट है। यह काफी कम है। अभी जो ultra mega power plants हैं, उनका भी जो tariff है, वह लगभग उतना ही है, लेकिन फिर भी यह जो trajectory है, उसके हिसाब से solar power और wind power के tariffs और कम होंगे, यह हमारा अनुमान है। अभी ये bids हुई हैं, इसके बाद फिर solar generating stations establish होंगे, जिसमें 18 महीने लगते हैं, उसके बाद फिर यह power on stream आएगा। अभी हमारी जो total installed capacity है, यह करीब 60 हजार मेगावॉट है, जो हमारी installed capacity की करीब 18 परसेंट ही है, यह और बढ़ेगी। जब इसका generation होगा, तब दरें कम होंगी।

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** माननीय मंत्री जी, देश में जितनी माँग है, उससे ज्यादा उत्पादन है, इस कारण बहुत से power stations बंद हो रहे हैं। हमारे बहुत से power stations बंद हैं, क्योंकि उनके द्वारा उत्पादित बिजली कोई लेना नहीं चाहता है। राज्यों में बिजली की चोरी इतनी ज्यादा है कि हर राज्य की विद्युत दर अलग-अलग है। उत्तर

**Q.No.31 contd.**

प्रदेश में घरों में नई दर 7 रुपए तक कर दी गई है। मार्केट में 3 रुपए प्रति यूनिट की बिजली available होने के बाद अगर हम 15 परसेंट loss भी जोड़ लें, तो उस loss को जोड़ने के बाद विद्युत दर 4 रुपए प्रति यूनिट से ऊपर नहीं होनी चाहिए। मैं आपसे जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या सरकार कोई ऐसा law ला रही है कि पूरे देश में बिजली की दर एक हो और बिजली माफी वाली जो योजना है, जो चुनाव के लिए बनाई जाती है, वह बिजली माफी योजना न लानी पड़े?

**श्री राज कुमार सिंह :** सर, यह power purchase cost, cost का एक element है। इसके अतिरिक्त distribution cost होती है, जो सिस्टम लगा है, उसकी cost होती है, establishment cost होती है। उसके बाद फिर जो losses होते हैं, वे होते हैं और cross subsidy होती है। एक segment of consumers है, जो दूसरे segment of consumers को subsidize करता है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** क्या आप 15 परसेंट loss को subsidy में जोड़ रहे हैं?  
...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति :** प्लीज़, प्लीज़ ...(व्यवधान)... आप मंत्री जी को बोलने दीजिए।

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** ये गलत उत्तर दे रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... हम भी ऊर्जा मंत्री रहे हैं।  
...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति :** उसका क्या उपाय है, आपको मालूम है। ...(व्यवधान)... अगर किसी ने कोई गलत सूचना दी है, तो उसका उपाय क्या है, आपको मालूम है।

**Q.No.31 contd.**

**श्री राज कुमार सिंह :** आप बताइए कि इसमें क्या गलत है?

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** गलत यह है कि आप 15 परसेंट line loss मान रहे हैं। पूरे world में 2 परसेंट line loss है। ... (व्यवधान)... अगर आप 13 परसेंट ले रहे हैं, तो आप उसमें agricultural loss कैसे जोड़ रहे हैं?

**श्री राज कुमार सिंह :** एक मिनट रुक जाइए। ... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति :** यह पद्धति नहीं है। अगर आप दोनों को आपस में बात करनी है, तो फिर अलग से बात करिए। यहाँ सदस्य सवाल पूछेंगे और मंत्री जवाब देंगे। अगर सदस्य के मन में अरमान है, वे असंतुष्ट हैं, तो उसका तरीका क्या है, नरेश जी बहुत सीनियर हैं, उनको मालूम है।

**श्री राज कुमार सिंह :** सभापति महोदय, लगता है कि हम लोग दो अलग-अलग विषयों के बारे में बात कर रहे हैं। ये बात कर रहे हैं कि कितना line loss होना चाहिए और हम बात कर रहे हैं कि कितना line loss है। आज के दिन अगर हम उत्तर प्रदेश को ही ले लें, तो line loss 21 परसेंट है। हमने कहा है कि उसको 15 परसेंट से कम लाएँ। ... (व्यवधान)... ये आँकड़े हमारे पास हैं। हमने कहा है कि उसको 15 परसेंट से कम लाएँ। यह target है। अब इसे ideal world में कितना होना चाहिए, तो ideal world में loss 5-6 परसेंट होना चाहिए, लेकिन यह ideal world नहीं है। यहाँ चोरी होती है, यहाँ unmetered supply होती है। यह ideal world नहीं है, इसीलिए ये losses इतने ज्यादा हैं। अगर हमें tariff कम करना है, तो उसके लिए एक तो losses कम करने



**Q.No.31 contd.**

होंगे, जिसके लिए हमने ऊर्जा मंत्रियों से बात की है और दूसरा, जो बहुत सारे losses subsidized category की आड़ में चले जाते हैं, फिर उसको clear करना होगा, transparent करना होगा, जिसके लिए हमने कहा है कि आप DBT पर जाइए और metered supply हो।

(समाप्त)

(1एस/एससीएच पर आगे)













SCH-GSP/12.25/1S

**प्रश्न संख्या - 32**

**श्री मो. नदीमुल हक :** सर, एम्स का जो इन्फ्रास्ट्रक्चर है, वह पूरे देश में अभी stressed है। अगर यह बोला जाए, 'operation successful, patient dead', तो कोई गलत बात नहीं होगी।

**جناب ندیم الحق :** سر، ایمس کا جو انفراسٹرکچر ہے، وہ پورے دیش میں ابھی stressed ہے، اگر یہ بولا جائے، 'operation successful, patient dead'، تو کوئی غلط بات نہیں ہوگی۔

**श्री सभापति :** नहीं-नहीं, कोई पेशेंट डेड नहीं होना चाहिए, प्लीज़, आप ऐसा मत बोलिए।

**श्री मो. नदीमुल हक :** सर, कहीं डॉक्टर नहीं है, कहीं इक्विपमेंट नहीं है, कहीं ब्लड बैंक नहीं है तो कहीं पोस्ट-मॉर्टम की फैसिलिटी नहीं है। पटना के एम्स से पेशेंट्स को दूसरे हॉस्पिटल्स में रैफर किया जाता है। दिल्ली में AIIMS इतना overcrowded है कि अगर एक डॉक्टर के पास दस पेशेंट देखने का टाइम है, तो वहां पर 200-300 पेशेंट्स की लाइन लगी हुई है।

अभी हाल में मंत्री जी इलेक्शन में बहुत बिज़ी रहे हैं, लेकिन मैं मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूं कि क्या कभी इन्होंने एम्स में स्वयं विज़िट किया है? क्या इन्होंने अपनी आंखों से देखा है कि वहां पर क्या हाल है? अभी जो वहां की स्थिति है, उसको इम्प्रूव करने के लिए वे क्या स्टेप्स ले रहे हैं?



## Q. No. 32 (contd.)

**جناب ندیم الحق :** سر، کہیں ڈاکٹر نہیں ہے، کہیں ایکوپمینٹ نہیں ہے، کہیں بلڈ بینک نہیں ہے تو کہیں پوسٹ مارٹم کی فیسلٹی نہیں ہے۔ پٹنہ کے ایمس سے پیشینٹس کو دوسرے ہاسپٹلس میں ریفر کیا جاتا ہے۔ دہلی میں ایمس اتنا ہے کہ اگر ایک ڈاکٹر کے پاس دس پیشینٹ دیکھنے کا ٹائم ہے، تو وہاں پر دو سو، تین سو پیشینٹس کی لائن لگی ہوئی ہے۔

ابھی حال میں منتری جی الیکشن می بہت مصروف رہے ہیں، لیکن میں منتری جی سے پوچھنا چاہتا ہوں کہ کیا کبھی انہوں نے ایمس میں خود وزٹ کیا ہے؟ کیا انہوں نے اپنی آنکھوں سے دیکھا ہے کہ وہاں پر کیا حال ہے؟ ابھی جو وہاں کی حالت ہے، اس کو امپروو کرنے کے لئے وہ کیا اسٹیپ لے رہے ہیں؟

**श्री जगत प्रकाश नड्डा :** मैं माननीय सदस्य को बताना चाहता हूँ, जहां तक All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS) का सवाल है, अभी तक six All India Institute of Medical Sciences operational हुए हैं। 2006 से लेकर 2009 तक इस दृष्टि से इस काम को आगे बढ़ाया गया। All India Institute of Medical Sciences ने अपने experiences से अपने सिस्टम को और इम्प्रूव करने की कोशिश की है। शुरू में जब All India Institute of Medical Sciences बने, तो उनमें बहुत ज्यादा centralization था, जिसके कारण सभी चीजों में बहुत रुकावट थी। उस रुकावट को दूर करने हुए इसे decentralize किया गया और decentralization में कंस्ट्रक्शन से लेकर, equipment procurement से लेकर, establishment of the faculty तक सब चीजों को बहुत decentralize किया गया है।

मैं माननीय सदस्य को यह बताना चाहता हूँ कि पिछले एक साल में ही हम लोगों ने कुल मिलाकर 688 faculties को एपॉइंट किया है। We have put them on place.

**Q. No. 32 (contd.)**

میں یہاں ایک بات یہ بھی بتانا چاہتا ہوں کہ All India Institute of Medical Sciences کے standards کو ہم dilute نہیں کر سکتے ہیں، اس لیے جہاں ہم faculties کے interviews بارمبار لے رہے ہیں، وہیں 'Found Not Suitable' کی संख्या بھی بہت زیادہ ہے، اس لیے کوشش کرنے کے باوجود بھی کئی جگہ پر faculties کی کمی رہتی ہے۔ ہم لوگوں نے پوری کوشش کی ہے، جیسا میں نے بھی بتایا ہے کہ 1380 faculties کے interviews میں 688 have been put in place in 2017 itself. لگاتار ہم کوشش کر رہے ہیں، لیکن ساتھ ہی ان کے standards کو dilute نہیں کر رہے ہیں۔ ہم AIIMS brand name کو ہی replicate کرنے کی کوشش کر رہے ہیں۔ AIIMS کے ساتھ ہم نے mentor institutions کو بھی جوڑا ہے۔ All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Delhi, PGI, Chandigarh and JIPMER کو ہم نے mentor institutions بنا دیا ہے۔

**श्री मो. नदीमूल हक :** सर، अभी कुछ दिन पहले Max Hospital में एक बच्चे को dead declare कर दिया गया था, जिसे बाद में जिंदा पाया गया। दिल्ली गवर्नमेंट ने उस हॉस्पिटल का लाइसेंस कैंसल कर दिया है। मुझे मंत्री जी से पूछना है, क्या इनका मंत्रालय यह कंसिडर कर रहा है कि अगर AIIMS या कोई गवर्नमेंट हॉस्पिटल इस तरह का नेग्लिजेंस करे, तो क्या उनका लाइसेंस भी कैंसल किया जाएगा?

**جناب ندیم الحق :** سر، ابھی کچھ دن پہلے میکس ہسپتال میں ایک بچے کو ڈیڈ دکلئر کر دیا گیا تھا، جسے بعد میں زندہ پایا گیا۔ دہلی گورنمنٹ نے اس ہسپتال کا لائسنس کینسل کر دیا ہے۔ مجھے منتری جی سے پوچھنا ہے، کیا ان کا منترالیہ یہ کنسڈر کر رہا ہے کہ اگر ایمس یا کوئی گورنمنٹ اس طرح کا نیگلیجینس کرے، تو کیا ان کا لائسنس بھی کینسل کیا جائے گا؟

**Q. No. 32 (contd.)**

**श्री सभापति :** यह तो सुझाव है।

**श्री जगत प्रकाश नड्डा :** यह प्रश्न AIIMS से जुड़ा हुआ नहीं है, लेकिन फिर भी मैं इसमें एक बात कहना चाहता हूँ कि भारत सरकार ने Clinical Establishments Act पास कर रखा है, जो model act है। उस ऐक्ट को स्टेट्स को adopt करना है और इम्पलिमेंट करना है। मैंने सभी Chief Ministers को लिखित रूप में यह भेज दिया है और जब उनसे मेरी बात हुई, तो व्यक्तिगत रूप में भी मैंने उनसे कहा है कि यह जो Model Act है, Clinical Establishments Act, इसको आप लागू कीजिए और इसके तहत सभी इंस्टीट्यूशंस को लाइए। इतना ही नहीं, हमने उनसे यह भी कहा है कि अगर आपको इसमें कुछ changes करने हैं, तो आप अपनी State Legislative Assembly में इसे ले आइए और वहां इसमें में जो minor changes आप करना चाहते हैं या कुछ improvement करना चाहते हैं अथवा कुछ नये clauses जोड़ना चाहते हैं, तो आप जोड़ सकते हैं, लेकिन don't leave this area unregulated.

**SHRI P. BHATTACHARYA:** Sir, if you go to AIIMS, you will find that it is practically a *bazaar*. Thousands of patients are there in queue and there are no Doctors to see them, treat them and give them proper medicines, etc. Why is it happening? I had a talk with so many Doctors. They said that they had no time to see thousands of patients. One Doctor cannot see more than 400 patients every day. Sir, keeping this in mind, whether the Minister is thinking to set up another AIIMS-like institution near Delhi where the serious patients can go for treatment and expert Doctors can treat them there.

(Followed by SK/1T)

SK-RPM/1T/12.30

**SHRI JAGAT PRAKASH NADDA:** Sir, load on the All India Institutes of Medical Sciences has increased because the State hospitals have not been able to do good in the sense that they have been referring cases to All India Institutes of Medical Sciences. I would like to make it clear here that during the time of Atal Bihari Vajpayee ji, we thought that we should make more AIIMS so that we are able to see that the patients do not come to Delhi and they are taken care of. That is why Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Rishikesh, Patna and Bhopal AIIMS came up and now I am happy to share with you that cases from Odisha and other States have reduced. We are trying to see to it that these All India Institutes of Medical Sciences should become more operational and more oriented. ..(Interruptions).. लेकिन एक बात मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि these All India Institutes of Medical Sciences were made when NDA Government was there and the second time when we are making seven more All India Institutes of Medical Sciences, that is also being done during the NDA Government.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Thank you. Now, Shrimati Kanimozhi. ..(Interruptions) ..

**SHRI P. BHATTACHARYA:** Sir, there are ..(Interruptions) ..

**Q. No. 32 (contd.)**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please, please. भट्टाचार्य जी, आप बहुत अनुभवी और सीनियर नेता हैं। यदि आप खड़े हों तथा मैं आपको बोलने के लिए समय नहीं दूँ, तो यह अच्छा नहीं लगेगा, इसलिए कृपया आप बैठ जाएं।

**SHRI P. BHATTACHARYA:** Sir, the doctors are ..(Interruptions)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** No, no. This is not allowed.

**SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI:** Thank you, Sir. Every year, around thirty-five to forty-five thousand students clear the MBBS exam. But when it comes to specialization, there are only seventeen thousand seats. We do have a lot of gaps to be filled between the number of MBBS students who clear the exam and the seats available in specialization. Because of that, in many hospitals we do not have specialists. What is the Government planning to fill in this gap? I would also like to know when in Tamil Nadu, AIIMS is going to be opened.

**SHRI JAGAT PRAKASH NADDA:** Sir, as far as post-graduate students are concerned, we have reduced the teacher and the taught relationship in the sense of ratio. That is why this year only we have been able to add five thousand more PG seats. That is a big jump and a leap which we have taken. At the same time, we are also trying to see to it that how measures

**Q. No. 32 (contd.)**

can be taken so that we increase the number of students being taught by a teacher. We have to go to the MCI and get it cleared through the MCI. So, a lot of procedural problems are there, but still in one year we have taken a leap of five thousand students.

As far as All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Tamil Nadu, is concerned, it is related to the issue of land and the place where it is to be done. We are working on it.

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** Sir, my friend has given very wrong information to the House. If I want, I can move a privilege motion against him. In future, please, you may take credit for the schemes outside in the public meetings, but don't mislead the House. He has said that during their Government they announced and made All India Institutes of Medical Sciences. Let me tell this House, yes, in 2004, one month before the elections, the announcement was made by the then NDA Government. So, within one month, I don't think in any part of the world, there is a Government which, by announcement, is supposed to have made the All India Institutes of Medical Sciences. I know you have so many magics, but not on the floor of the House. Please, for God sake, ..(Interruptions)..

Q. No. 32 (contd.)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Ghulam Nabi ji, please put the question.  
..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** No, no. ..(Interruptions).. I can move a privilege motion. ..(Interruptions)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** You have put it on record also. ..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** I have put it on record. So, this was an announcement. There was no Cabinet decision. There was no Planning Commission allotment. That was done when Manmohan Singh ji came. I was the Health Minister. We got the Government clearance. We sanctioned Rs. 250 crores. ..(Interruptions).. You announced Rs. 850 crores.  
..(Interruptions)..

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Ghulam Nabi ji, please, you have to ask the question.  
..(Interruptions)..

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** The foundation stone was laid and inauguration was done during my time. So, let it be clear that that were not their work.

I would also talk about the question raised by our colleague -- he is here -- about another AIIMS coming up. (Contd. by YSR/1U)

## Q.No.32 (contd.)

YSR-PSV/12.35/1U

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD (CONTD.):** Again, during my period, Hooda sahib gave 300 acres of land free of cost in Jhajjar near the International Airport. And within three months' record time, we made a 90-room OPD.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Question, please.

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** And the second AIIMS was to come up there with almost Rs.2,000-3,000 crore. What is the progress of that? In the same premises, we had sanctioned another one and Dr. Manmohan Singh laid the foundation stone of that. Its cost was about Rs.3,000 crore. It is the National Cancer Institute. Tomorrow, of course, they will say, because they will cut the *feetah*, that they have made it. What is the progress of that?

**SHRI JAGAT PRAKASH NADDA:** Sir, the Governments work in continuity. I have never said that the UPA did not do anything. I only said that the decision of making new AIIMS came during the NDA.



Q. No. 32 (contd.)

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** You take the record. ...(Interruptions)...  
Take the record right now. ...(Interruptions)... Take the record right now.  
...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI JAGAT PRAKASH NADDA:** Sir, I said...(Interruptions)... It was  
during Atal Bihari Vajpayee's time that the NDA Government decided to  
open...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** I wrote here the word 'made'.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please, Ghulam Nabiji.

**SHRI JAGAT PRAKASH NADDA:** Sir, the Governments work in continuity.  
They had also been working in continuity. As far as Jhajjar is concerned,  
fast progress is going on and it will be coming up very soon.

(Ends)









**Q.No.33**

**SHRI DEVENDER GOUD T.:** Sir, GST is a big financial reform in independent India. I would like to know from the Finance Minister what the revenue collection is after the introduction of GST and whether it has increased or decreased. I request you to provide the details since July, if possible.

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY:** Sir, the main question does not really relate to the revenue aspect. It relates to a letter written by the Telangana Chief Minister with regard to the works contract. Nonetheless, I will answer it. I think we have been making steadied progress as far as the revenues are concerned. And as far as the revenues of the States are concerned, in the Constitution Amendment itself and the laws which have been enacted, it is provided that the year 2015-16 will be taken as the base year for all the States and a 14 per cent increment would be given to them on an annual basis which would be ensured by the GST Administration itself for the first five years. Therefore, the first increment would factor in an increase for the year 2016-17 when there was no GST and the second one would be for the year 2017-18. That is the basis on which it has been calculated. Till date, every State is taking 2015-16 revenue as the base and adding two 14 per cent increments, the

**Q.No.33 (contd.)**

bimonthly revenue split, two months at a time, and the States are being paid accordingly on the basis of the revenue which is being collected.

**SHRI DEVENDER GOUD T.:** Sir, what are the reasons for keeping the petroleum products and other products out of GST? And when are you going to bring them under the GST?

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY:** Sir, the Constitution Amendment Bill which has been passed by the Parliament and ratified by the State Assemblies actually has not kept petroleum products out. Petroleum products are a part of the GST but a decision to levy the GST on petroleum products can be taken only after the GST Council takes a decision, and the Council takes a decision by a 75 per cent or three-fourth majority itself. Therefore, we don't need to amend any law if petroleum products are to be brought into the GST framework. The constitutional amendment provides for it but I think when the Council takes up the decision with regard to its inclusion, only then will it come within the GST framework.

**श्री अजय संचेती:** सर, यह जीएसटी की दर क्या रहेगी और different slabs में उसके rates क्या रहेंगे, यह निर्णय जीएसटी काउंसिल करती है। जीएसटी काउंसिल का निर्णय होने के बाद अलग-अलग स्टेट्स में अलग-अलग मिनिस्टर्स, चीफ मिनिस्टर्स

**Q.No.33 (contd.)**

स्टेटमेंट्स देते हैं कि यह ठीक नहीं है, यह होना चाहिए, वह होना चाहिए, जबकि जीएसटी काउंसिल में प्रतिनिधित्व सभी स्टेट्स का होता है। तो जिस निर्णय के वे सहभागी हैं, उसके होने के बावजूद वे बाहर जो कहते हैं, क्या उसका कोई constitutional impact इस जीएसटी बिल पर आता है?

**श्री सभापति:** मंत्री जी, बोलिए।

(1डब्ल्यू/वीएनके पर आगे)

VNK-VKK/1W/12.40

**श्री अरुण जेटली :** सभापति जी, जीएसटी काउंसिल में हर राज्य के वित्त मंत्री रहते हैं। इसमें 29 राज्यों के वित्त मंत्री, यूनियन टेरिटरीज़ के प्रतिनिधि और उसके अलावा केन्द्रीय वित्त मंत्री तथा केन्द्रीय वित्त राज्य मंत्री रहते हैं। यह उसका कोरम रहता है। अभी तक हम लोगों की परंपरा रही है कि हम लोग हर महीने एक बार मिलते हैं, शायद दिसम्बर के महीने में हम लोग न मिलें, लेकिन जनवरी के महीने में इस बार फिर दोबारा मिलेंगे। इसमें टैरिफ्स के संबंध में जितने भी निर्णय होते हैं, उसके लिए काउंसिल की एक फिटमेंट कमेटी है, वह पहले अपनी रिप्रेज़ेंटेशन्स को कंसिडर करके अपनी सिफारिश देती है। वे सिफारिशें फिर काउंसिल के सामने आती हैं और काउंसिल के अंदर उनके ऊपर विस्तृत रूप से चर्चा होती है और रेट्स तय होते हैं। मुझे यह बतलाते हुए खुशी इस बात की है कि अभी तक जितने भी निर्णय हुए हैं, वे सभी सर्वसम्मति से हुए हैं, कोई ऐसा निर्णय नहीं हुआ है, जो वोट के माध्यम से हुआ हो।



**Q.No.33 (contd.)**

चूंकि हम लोकतंत्र हैं, इसलिए लोकतंत्र में बहस होती है। अब बाहर लोग क्या कहते रहें, बाहर की राजनीति क्या है, उसका अपना स्थान है, लेकिन काउंसिल के भीतर कम से कम अभी तक मैंने इस प्रकार की राजनीति नहीं देखी है।

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM:** Sir, I am not satisfied with the answer given by the Finance Minister to the second supplementary of Mr. Goud and I think the hon. Finance Minister avoided a direct answer. Of course, the law allows petroleum products to be brought under GST. And then, the Finance Minister gave a technically correct answer that the GST Council will decide. The question really is: When will the GST Council decide? When will the GST Council take up this subject and what is the position of the Central Government, which has virtually a veto on the decision of the GST Council? Let me explain, Sir. Just one minute. If you go by crude oil prices of May, 2014 and say in October, 2017 – since then there has been a rise in crude oil prices – prices fell by 49 per cent, allowing for exchange rate variation, price of petrol and price of diesel should have come down by at least 20 per cent at the retail level. But, at the end of October, 2017, the price of petrol was the same as it was in May, 2014 and the price of diesel was Re.1 more than in May, 2014. Question is: Now that BJP is in power in 19 States, as

**Q.No.33 (contd.)**

they rightfully claim, and they are in power in the Centre, what prevents the Government from moving the GST Council to decide that petroleum products should be immediately brought under GST?

**श्री सभापति :** कौन-सी पार्टी कहां पावर में है, वह तो हमारा इश्यू है नहीं।

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY:** Sir, the hon. Member, when he asked me this question, is certainly familiar with the whole issue and, in fact, more than familiar. He will recollect that when UPA was in power, they knew the limitations as far as petroleum was concerned. So, in the 115<sup>th</sup> Constitutional Amendment, which was proposed, petroleum was kept completely out of GST. The UPA Constitutional Amendment draft proposals presented before the Parliament did not include petroleum products ever to be a part of GST itself because UPA well knew that it will be a deal breaker between the Centre and the States if you bring petroleum in. And, therefore, you did not make even an effort. Now that you are in Opposition, you have a far greater flexibility in reversing your position. That is a different matter. After a great deal of consultation, we had managed to persuade all the States to agree to bring in petroleum within GST itself. But the States reluctantly agreed to do so. In the initial draft, they were not agreeing. In meeting after meeting of the

**Q.No.33 (contd.)**

Empowered Committee, we persuaded them and finally, the deal with the States was that petroleum will be brought in the GST as far as the Constitutional Amendment was concerned.

(Contd. by BHS/1X)

-YSR/BHS-NKR/1X/12.45

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY (CONTD.):** It will be only when the States decide and agree upon it that the Council will have the power to then decide to bring the petroleum into the GST. As far as the Central Government is concerned, we are in favour of bringing it - Let me categorically state this - but we would await the consensus of the States. I do hope that at some stage sooner than later the States agree to the consensus.

As far as the October 2017 prices, that you have mentioned, are concerned, yes, we are equally concerned as far as the petroleum prices are concerned. There was a rise as far as the crude prices were concerned. Therefore, we did bring down some Central duties. We also wrote to all the States to bring down the State duties. Please do not forget that a large part of the taxation on petroleum is also the State taxes on petroleum itself. I am glad a number of States governed by the BJP brought the prices down. The

**Q.No.33 (contd.)**

UPA States singularly refused to bring down the prices down as far as the petroleum was concerned in October.

**SHRI K.T.S. TULSI:** Sir, part (c) of the Question is whether it is a fact that Government of Telangana has gone to Supreme Court on GST. The answer to that Question is: 'We have no information.' But according to the media reports, the Chandrashekhar Rao's Government has decided to go to the Supreme Court for imposing GST on works contracts. Also, the State is raising the issue that Mission Bhagiratha, Mission Kakatiya, irrigation projects, road building etc. should not be taxed. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Short question please.

**SHRI K.T.S. TULSI:** They were taxed in the VAT regime at 5 per cent. Now, the taxation under GST has brought it down from 18 per cent to 12 per cent but still 5 per cent to 12 per cent, there is a huge gap, which is hitting their economy and the development projects. What would the hon. Minister like to say?

**Q.No.33 (contd.)**

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY:** Sir, on the service sector contracts, as a category and a class, the GST Council have decided that there would be a 18 per cent GST. This was firmly decided for the entire country itself. Thereafter the Chief Minister of Telangana raised this issue in regard to the works contract as far as the State Government works contract and the Governmental works contracts were concerned. The matter was then put up before the GST Council again. The GST Council, after a detailed consideration and the recommendations of the fitment committee and after discussing it with all the State Governments, reviewed that decision. The reviewed decision was that as far as the works contracts are concerned, which are executed by the Governments, the rate would be brought down to 12 per cent but if the material component of that contract itself, like in many irrigation projects, is below 25 per cent then the GST rate would be 5 per cent. So, you now have a dual rate - 5 per cent if the material component is below 25 per cent and in other cases 12 per cent. Also, please remember when you speak in terms of 12 per cent or 5 per cent, the input taxations are quite heavy. For instance, in the works contract as the regime stands today, there are inputs in a construction industry which are taxed at either 28

**Q.No.33 (contd.)**

per cent or 18 per cent. So, a bulk of what you say is 12 per cent would actually get subsumed and absorbed once the input tax credit of that 28 per cent or 12 per cent is taken into consideration. Therefore, the Council has taken a decision. To the best of my knowledge, we have no information of anybody having gone to Court.

(Ends)











**Q.No.34**

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Q. No. 34. Shrimati Sarojini Hembram, not present. Any supplementaries please? Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu.

**SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU:** \*Hon'ble Chairman Sir, the way you manage the House is becoming sensational. I wish it becomes historical too. Good Wishes.

(Contd. by RL/1Y)

-BHS/RL-DS/12.50/1Y

**SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (CONTD.):** Respected Chairman, I take this opportunity to question on the preparedness of the Government at the Centre as well as the States to look at the World Health Organization's advisory about smoking and passive smoking which is becoming a major hazard to the lungs throughout the nation, in particular, cosmopolitan and metropolitan habitations. The passive smoking, in the smog like situation, is creating a dangerous situation, not only in the National Capital of Delhi but

---

**\*English translation of the remark made in telugu today (19.12.2017)**

**Q.No.34 (contd.)**

also Mumbai which was faced recently with the recent fog formations there and enhancement of the smog. Whether your Health Ministry is getting prepared to work out an advisory and to ensure that people with the risks of the passive smoking are provided with health inputs and the medicare support free of cost. Thank you very much.

**SHRI JAGAT PRAKASH NADDA:** Sir, as far as smoking is concerned, the COTPA, which is The Cigarettes and Other Tobacco Products Act, 2003, is very exhaustive and we have very seriously implemented it. Now, as far as the COTPA in other countries is concerned, India is considered to be third or fourth as far as the adherence part is concerned. You might have seen that public smoking has reduced tremendously as far as this smoking is concerned. But this question is related to e-cigarettes. As far as the e-cigarette part is concerned, the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare is aware about it and we have formed three groups. One is the legal implications of this e-nicotine drug induce system; another was the health effects and the third is the advocacy. All three sub-groups have given their reports. The Ministry is working on it. We are looking for the legal opinion also and very soon, we will be deciding the course of action. Many

**Q.No.34 (contd.)**

countries have regulated it and many countries have banned it. We have to take a legal opinion on it and we will be working on it.

**श्रीमती रजनी पाटिल :** सर, मैं आपके माध्यम से मंत्री जी से यह कहना चाहती हूँ कि जो सवाल पूछा गया है, उसमें स्पेसिफिकली यह पूछा गया है कि क्या ई-सिगरेट्स, निकोटीन एंड फ्लेवर्ड हुक्के के लिए सेंट्रल गवर्नमेंट ने कोई चेतावनी दी है? उसके जवाब में केन्द्र सरकार ने कहा है कि इस तरह की कोई चेतावनी नहीं दी गई है। जो आजकल के नए टीनएजर्स हैं, जब वे बाहर पार्टी में जाते हैं, पब्स में जाते हैं, तो वहाँ वे हुक्का लेते हैं, ऐसा हम सब जगह देखते हैं और पिक्चर्स में भी देखते हैं। अगर आप उसके लिए कोई चेतावनी नहीं देंगे, तो उस पर कोई restrictions नहीं लगेगी। मैं आपके द्वारा मंत्री जी से यह पूछना चाहती हूँ कि उसके ऊपर पाबंदी लगाने के बारे में सरकार ने क्या सोचा है?

**श्री जगत प्रकाश नड्डा :** सर, हमारे पास कमिटी की रिपोर्ट आई है, जिस पर हम वर्क कर रहे हैं और लीगल ओपिनियन लेते हुए हम इस पर ऐक्शन लेंगे।

**श्री सभापति :** सप्लिमेंटरी समाप्त हो गया, मगर मैं सदस्यों और देश के लोगों के ज्ञानवर्धन के लिए मंत्री जी से यह पूछना चाहता हूँ कि यह ई-सिगरेट क्या है?

**SHRI JAGAT PRAKASH NADDA:** This is actually Electronic Nicotine Delivery System. इसमें निकोटीन का एक कैपस्यूल होता है, जिसको हीटिंग से गर्म किया जाता है और उसके बाद उसमें से puff लेते हैं। उसमें जो vapor होता है, that

**Q.No.34 (contd.)**

gives निकोटीन which is not tobacco but it is having nicotine और nicotine से जो excitement और effect होता है, वह उनके मस्तिष्क में सीधा आता है। So, tobacco has got nicotine. But this is without tobacco. It is only a capsule of nicotine जिसको वे vapor के रूप में लेते हैं।

(समाप्त)

(1Z/DC-MCM पर आगे)











-RL/DC-MCM/1Z/12.55

**प्रश्न संख्या 35**

**श्री सभापति :** श्री राजकुमार धूत उपस्थित नहीं हैं। Any supplementaries please?

**श्री अमर शंकर साबले :** महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से जानना चाहता हूँ कि bone marrow transplant और blood transfusion process को छोड़कर और किसी उपचार पद्धति के बारे में क्या सरकार ने विचार किया है?

**श्री जगत प्रकाश नड्डा :** सर, अभी तक तो bone marrow transplant ही हम कर रहे हैं और blood transfusion के माध्यम से हम कर रहे हैं और इसी प्रोसेस को हमने अभी तक जारी रखा है।

**SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY:** Sir, considering the number of patients suffering from Thalassemia and genetic disorders are increasing in India and the Gene Therapy is considered to be the sole promising cure of the disease, I would like to know whether the Ministry proposes to fund the new research on Chemotherapy or not. That is my question, Sir.

**SHRI JAGAT PRAKASH NADDA:** Sir, ICMR undertakes this research work and we are taking it. Many projects are there and we shall see to it that what more we can do.

**SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:** Sir, the hon. Minister is aware that most of these, the gene is carried through marriage, and children often end

**प्रश्न संख्या 35 (क्रमागत)**

up as innocent victims of this life-long debilitating illness. Would the Health Ministry put out notices and inform people, particularly, when you have insisted on registering marriages, that the couples will actually do a blood test before they get married? I think we have to educate the country that don't worry about the caste that you are going to marry, but do look into your gene banks before you marry because you are going to make the children victims unnecessary.

**SHRI JAGAT PRAKASH NADDA:** Sir, to check Thalassemia, we have issued guidelines and we are working on three strategies. Number one strategy is RBSK (*Rashtriya Bal Swasthya Karyakram*), where we are detecting it at an early stage. In the class 7<sup>th</sup> or 8<sup>th</sup>, we are trying to see to it and every year, more than 20 crore children are checked as far as the Thalassemic patients are concerned, minor or major. That is number one. And, therefrom, we detect, see to it and start counselling. This is one strategy which we have adopted. Another strategy is, in the ANC, ante natal check-ups of the mother, we are testing that the mother should not be minor or major Thalassemic patient. So this is another area where we are trying to do it. And the third is counselling. In that counselling, we are trying

## प्रश्न संख्या 35 (क्रमागत)

to see to it that when one gets married, kindly get checked up and if the patient or the mother is minor Thalassemic, she has to be very careful about it.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Now, question no. 36. Shri Surendra Singh Nagar.  
...(Interruptions)...

**SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:** No, no. These are all post-marriage.  
...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Please. ...(Interruptions)... Shri Surendra Singh Nagar.  
...(Interruptions)...

**SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:** The idea is to inform...(Interruptions)... before they get married so that they...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Shri Surendra Singh Nagar. He is not present.  
...(Interruptions)... Renukaji, please. ...(Interruptions)... Please.  
...(Interruptions)...

**प्रश्न संख्या 35 (क्रमागत)**

**SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY:** We didn't get that. You should pull up the Minister. He should give me a reply. ..(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** No pulling up and no getting up also, please. ..(Interruptions)...

(Ends)











## प्रश्न संख्या – 36

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Questioner not present. Any supplementaries please?

**श्री बसावाराज पाटिल :** माननीय सभापति जी, यह जो बैंक का विलिनिकरण होने के बाद बड़ी मात्रा में वाल्यंटरी रिटायरमेंट के बारे में कहा जा रहा है और उसके बारे में एक्शन भी लिया जा रहा है। एक तरफ भारत जैसे जहां सबसे ज्यादा जनसंख्या वाला देश है, तो इस प्रकार की नीति के कारण अगर बेरोजगारी बढ़ेगी तो फिर आगे भविष्य में बेरोजगार ही देश के लिए समस्या बन सकते हैं। ऐसे करते समय सरकार क्या सोचती है, मैं जानना चाहता हूं।

**श्री अरुण जेटली :** माननीय सभापति जी, State Bank of India की 5 subsidiaries स्टेट बैंक में मर्ज की गई हैं। स्टेट बैंक ऑफ इंडिया और मर्जर के बाद भी स्टेट बैंक की तरफ से कोई VRS स्कीम की घोषणा नहीं की गई। जब subsidiaries ने मर्ज किया तो मर्ज करने से पहले subsidiaries ने अपने employees को यह option दिया था कि अब हम स्टेट बैंक के अंदर मर्ज कर रहे हैं तो यह वी0आर0एस0 ऑप्शन है। तो उन entities ने अपनी ऑप्शन दी थी, कुछ उनके कर्मचारियों ने express किया था, जिसको उन्होंने स्वीकार किया और कुछ ऐसी applications थीं जो स्वीकार नहीं हुईं, लेकिन merger के बाद स्टेट बैंक की तरफ से कोई ऐसी प्रस्तावना नहीं है।

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Thank you. Now, Shrimati Jaya Bachchan.  
..(Interruptions)...

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** There is no privatization. ...(Interruptions)...

## प्रश्न संख्या – 36 (क्रमागत)

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Tapanji, please. ...(Interruptions)... Now, Shrimati Jaya Bachchan.

**श्रीमती जया बच्चन :** सर, मेरा Thalassemia के ऊपर था।

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Now, Shri Kiranmay Nanda.

(Followed by KR/2A)

KR/SC/2A/1.00

**SHRI KIRANMAY NANDA:** May I know from the hon. Minister whether there is any proposal to merge any other scheduled bank?

**SHRI ARUN JAITLEY:** This issue is open. At the moment, we are concentrating on strengthening some of these banks.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Hon. Finance Minister, Question Hour is over. प्लीज़, बैठ जाइए। मित्रो, I have to share with you what I have said in the beginning. In the Business Advisory Committee, hon. Members have requested the Chair, almost in unanimous in saying that we must go, at least, up to ten questions. In spite of the fact that two Members were absent today, we were able to reach only six questions. Please keep it in mind that in future

**प्रश्न संख्या – 36 (क्रमागत)**

the question has to be crisp and the answer also has to be sharp and up to the point. Today because it is only beginning and then ..

**SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN:** We need answer also.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** Without answer how can it be? Without question there can't be answer. Please don't worry on that count. I am there to ensure that answer is given. If a wrong answer is given, you know what is the way out to get it rectified and answered also. The House stands adjourned ..(Interruptions).. Please, please प्लीज़, एक मिनट। अभी लंच करने के लिए समय है। The House stands adjourned till 2.00 p.m.

---

**The House then adjourned for lunch at one minute past one of the clock.**