

DC-ASC/1A/11.00

The House met at eleven of the clock,  
MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair

---

**PAPERS LAID ON TABLE**

**श्री सुदर्शन भगत** : महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्रों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:—

- (a) Annual Report of the Indian Council of Agricultural Research (ICAR), New Delhi, for the year 2016-17.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the Indian Council of Agricultural Research (ICAR), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.
- (d) Statement by Government accepting the Annual Accounts and Audit Report of the above Council, for the year 2015-16.
- (e) Statements giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) and (b) above.

**SHRI RAJEN GOHAIN**: Sir, I lay on the Table—

(1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013:—

- (a) Fortieth Annual Report and Accounts of the Burn

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

Standard Company Limited (BSCL), Kolkata, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.

(2) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) above.

**श्री सुदर्शन भगत :** महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्र सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ:—

(1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (3) of Section 29 of the Central Agricultural University Act, 1992:—

(a) Annual Report of the Central Agricultural University, Imphal, Manipur, for the year 2014-15.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above University.

(2) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) above.

**SHRI MANSUKH L. MANDAVIYA:** Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

(a) Annual Accounts of the National Institute of Pharmaceutical Education and Research (NIPER), Ahmedabad, Gujarat, for the year 2015-16, and the Audit Report thereon, under sub-section (4) of Section 23 of the National Institute of Pharmaceutical Education and

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

Research (NIPER) Act, 1998.

- (b) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the paper mentioned at (a) above.

**SHRI C. R. CHAUDHARY:** Sir, I lay on the Table—

I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution (Department of Consumer Affairs), under sub-section (6) of Section 3 of the Essential Commodities Act, 1955:—

- (1) G.S.R. 929 (E), dated the 29<sup>th</sup> September, 2016, publishing the Removal of Licensing Requirements, Stock Limits and Movement Restrictions on Specified Foodstuffs Order, 2016.
- (2) S.O. 3341 (E), dated the 28<sup>th</sup> October, 2016, publishing the Removal of Licensing requirements, Stock limits and Movement Restrictions on Specified Foodstuffs (Amendment) Order, 2016.

II. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution (Department of Food and Public Distribution) Notification No. G.S.R. 165 (E), dated the 23<sup>rd</sup> February, 2017, publishing the Warehousing (Development and Regulation) Registration of Warehouses Rules, 2017, under Section 52 of the Warehousing (Development and Regulation) Act, 2007.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017

**REPORTS OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY  
STANDING COMMITTEE ON COMMERCE**

**श्री भूपेन्द्र यादव (राजस्थान) :** महोदय, मैं विभाग संबंधित वाणिज्य संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति के निम्नलिखित प्रतिवेदन (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) प्रस्तुत करता हूँ:-

- (i) 132<sup>nd</sup> Report on Demands for Grants (2017-18) of Department of Commerce, Ministry of Commerce and Industry; and
- (ii) 133<sup>rd</sup> Report on Demands for Grants (2017-18) of Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion, Ministry of Commerce and Industry.

(Ends)

**REPORTS OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORT, TOURISM AND CULTURE**

**SHRI MUKUL ROY (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I present the following Reports (in English and Hindi) of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture:—

- (i) Two Hundred Forty Fourth Report on Demands for Grants (2017-18) of the Ministry of Civil Aviation;
- (ii) Two Hundred Forty Fifth Report on Demands for Grants (2017-18) of the Ministry of Culture;
- (iii) Two Hundred Forty Sixth Report on Demands for Grants (2017-

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

- 18) of the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways;
- (iv) Two Hundred Forty Seventh Report on Demands for Grants (2017-18) of the Ministry of Shipping; and
- (v) Two Hundred Forty Eighth Report on Demands for Grants (2017-18) of the Ministry of Tourism.

(Ends)

**REPORT OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON COAL AND STEEL**

**श्री अली अनवर अंसारी (उत्तर प्रदेश):** महोदय, मैं खान मंत्रालय की 'अनुदान मांगों (2017-18)' के संबंध में विभाग संबंधित कोयला और इस्पात संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति (2016-17) के अट्टाईसवें प्रतिवेदन की एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

**REPORTS OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON FINANCE**

**DR. MAHENDRA PRASAD (BIHAR):** Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Finance (2016-17):—

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

- (i) Forty-sixth Report on 'Demands for Grants (2017-18)' of the Ministry of Finance (Departments of Economic Affairs, Expenditure, Financial Services and Investment & Public Asset Management);
- (ii) Forty-seventh Report on 'Demands for Grants (2017-18)' of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Revenue); and
- (iii) Forty-eighth Report on 'Demands for Grants (2017-18)' of the Ministry of Planning.

(Ends)

**REPORTS OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY**

**SHRI P. BHATTACHARYA (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Information Technology (2016-17):—

- (i) Thirty-fifth Report of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2017-18)' of the Ministry of Communications (Department of Telecommunications);
- (ii) Thirty-sixth Report of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2017-18)' of the Ministry of Electronics and Information Technology; and

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

(iii) Thirty-seventh Report of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2017-18)' of the Ministry of Communications (Department of Posts).

(Ends)

**REPORT OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON PETROLEUM AND NATURAL GAS**

**SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA (ASSAM):** Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Eighteenth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Petroleum and Natural Gas (2016-17) on 'Demands for Grants (2017-18)' of the Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas.

(Ends)

(Followed by 1B/KR)

KR-LP/1B/11.05

**REPORTS OF DEPARTMENT- RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT**

**श्रीमती छाया वर्मा (छत्तीसगढ़)** : महोदय, मैं विभाग संबंधित सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति (2016-17) के निम्नलिखित प्रतिवेदनों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखती हूँ :-

- (i) Thirty-sixth Report of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2017-18)' of the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment (Department of Social Justice and Empowerment);
- (ii) Thirty-seventh Report of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2017-18)' of the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment (Department of Empowerment of Persons with Disabilities);
- (iii) Thirty-eighth Report of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2017-18)' of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs; and
- (iv) Thirty-ninth Report of the Committee on 'Demands for Grants (2017-18)' of the Ministry of Minority Affairs.

(Ends)



Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017

**REPORTS OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON URBAN DEVELOPMENT**

**SHRI ANIL DESAI (MAHARASHTRA):** Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Urban Development (2016-17):—

- (i) Fifteenth Report on 'Demands for Grants (2017-2018)' of the Ministry of Urban Development; and
- (ii) Sixteenth Report on 'Demands for Grants (2017-2018)' of the Ministry of Housing and Urban Poverty Alleviation.

(Ends)

**REPORTS OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE**

**SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports of the Public Accounts Committee (2016-17):—

- (i) Sixty-fourth Report on the subject "Shared Mobile Infrastructure Scheme" based on Para No. 2.2 of C&AG Report No. 17 of 2014 relating to the Ministry of Communications and IT;
- (ii) Sixty-fifth Report on the subject "Nutrient Based Subsidy Policy For Decontrolled Phosphatic & Potassic Fertilizers" based on the C&AG Report No. 16 of 2015 relating to the Ministry of Chemicals and Fertilizers; and

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

- (iii) Sixty-sixth Report on the subject “Non-Compliance by Ministries/Departments in timely submission of Action Taken Notes on the Non-Selected Audit Paragraphs (Civil and Other Ministries)”.

(Ends)

**STATEMENT RE. IMPLEMENTATION OF TWELFTH REPORT OF  
DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON  
RAILWAYS**

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (SHRI RAJEN GOHAIN):** Sir, I make a statement regarding Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Twelfth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Railways on 'Safety and Security in Railways'.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017

**STATEMENT RE. IMPLEMENTATION OF TWENTY-FIRST REPORT OF  
DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE  
ON CHEMICALS AND FERTILISERS**

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CHEMICALS AND  
FERTILISERS (SHRI MANSUKH L. MANDAVIYA):** Sir, I make a statement  
regarding Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the  
Twenty-first Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing  
Committee on Chemicals and Fertilizers on Demands for Grants (2016-17)  
pertaining to the Department of Fertilizers.

(Ends)

**ANNOUNCEMENT RE. GOVERNMENT BUSINESS FOR THE WEEK  
COMMENCING 20<sup>th</sup> MARCH, 2017**

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY  
AFFAIRS (SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI):** With your permission, Sir, I  
rise to announce that Government Business during the week commencing  
the 20<sup>th</sup> of March, 2017 will consist of: -

1. Consideration of any items of Government Business carried over from  
today's order paper consisting of:-

(a) Further General Discussion on Union Budget, 2017-18.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

(b) Discussion on working of the following Ministries :-

- (i) Railways
- (ii) Personnel, Public Grievances and Pension.
- (iii) Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises

2. Discussion on the working of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting.

3. Consideration and agreeing to the amendments made by Lok Sabha in the Maternity Benefit (Amendment) Bill, 2016, as passed by Rajya Sabha.

4. Consideration and return of the Appropriation Bills relating to following Demands for Grants, after they are passed by Lok Sabha: -

- (a) Supplementary Demands for Grants (General) for 2016-17.
- (b) Demands for Grants for 2017-18.
- (c) Supplementary Demands for Grants (Railways) for 2016-17
- (d) Demands for Excess Grants (Railways) for 2013-14

5. Consideration and return of the Finance Bill, 2017 after it is passed by Lok Sabha.

6. Consideration and passing of the Human Immunodeficiency Virus and Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome (Prevention and Control) Bill, 2014.

7. Consideration and passing of the following Bills, as passed by Lok Sabha:

- (a) The Factories (Amendment) Bill, 2016

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

(b) The Admiralty (Jurisdiction and Settlement of Maritime Claims) Bill, 2016.

(Ends)

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I had made a request to the hon. Chairman, under Rule 267, to suspend today's listed Business of the House. A gross constitutional impropriety has been committed by the Governor of Goa. ..(Interruptions).. I would like to bring it to your notice that the Governor ..(Interruptions).. Please allow me. ..(Interruptions).. If you don't allow me, how will I convince you? ..(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Digvijayaji, I have to only caution you on one point. ..(Interruptions).. Please, please, I have to caution you only on one point. You see, you know the rules that the Governor's role can be discussed only on the basis of a substantive motion.

(Continued by 1C/KS)

KS-KLG/1C/11.10

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN** (contd.): Therefore, I cannot allow a discussion under Rule 267. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** Sir, but, at the same time... ...(Interruptions)...

Sir, please hear me out. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल:** सर, आप इनकी बात सुन तो लीजिए। ....(व्यवधान)... आप सुन लीजिए, गंभीर बात है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** Sir, the point I am trying to make is that under Rule 267, I have the right to raise an issue. If the motion is not there, at least, allow me to say what I want to say. ...(Interruptions)... The point that I am trying to make is that she has said, “ I didn’t speak with the Centre. No one approached me.”

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You cannot criticise the Governor.

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** “Then, Parrikar informed me around 6.30 p.m. on Sunday that he would show up with supporters. They came, and I spoke with them for about an hour-and-a-half.” She said, “I am a psychologist; so, I studied and analysed it. I saw their signatures on the letters. I deliberated on the matter. The Congress had not shown up. I called Arun Jaitley around 9.30 in the evening ...” ...(Interruptions)...

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY**

**AFFAIRS (SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI):** Sir, you have already given your ruling; आपने रूलिंग दी, उस पर भी सवाल उठाया जा रहा है। ....(व्यवधान)... यह ठीक नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)... रूलिंग न मानना, इससे ज्यादा कुछ नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री मेघराज जैन:** सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने अपना डिस्मिसन दिया। ...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Digvijayaji, the point is, there is another rule which says that you cannot make an allegation against a person, whether he is a Governor or an ordinary person... ...(Interruptions)... Let me complete. ...(Interruptions)... Let me complete. ...(Interruptions)..

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD):** But he is only referring to what the Governor has said.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I agree. But let me complete. ...(Interruptions)... Okay. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल:** माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, ...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please listen to me. My only point is, a Governor's conduct can only be discussed on the basis of a substantive motion. Now, he is discussing the Governor's conduct. That is my point.

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** A number of times, we have discussed it. There are a number of precedents when... ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No. You bring a substantive motion. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल:** सर, यहां पर कई बार डिस्कशन हुआ है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD):** When the Arunachal Pradesh issue came up, we discussed it here.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** It can be done only on the basis of a substantive motion. ...(Interruptions)... Hon. LoP, it can be only on the basis of a substantive motion. Why don't you move a substantive motion? ...(Interruptions)... No, no. Digvijayaji, you are a senior Member. ...(Interruptions)... Digvijayaji, please. You are a senior Member. Sit down. ...(Interruptions)... You are a senior Member. ...(Interruptions)... Why don't you move a substantive motion then? Why do you want to speak without a motion? ...(Interruptions)... I have to go by the rules. ...(Interruptions)... I have to go by the rules. No, please. ...(Interruptions)... Digvijayaji, please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** Sir, this House is competent to discuss it. ...(Interruptions)... The House is supreme.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No, you can bring a substantive motion. The hon. Chairman would consider it. There is no motion here. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** Then, take the sense of the House on whether this motion of mine may be converted into a substantive motion.



**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Then, you give notice for that, notice for discussion under Rule 267, which is not being permitted by me. ...(Interruptions)... I have not permitted it.

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** Sir, the House is supreme. Please take the sense of the House.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No, no. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** Take the sense of the House. The House is supreme. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No, no. Digvijayaji, you are a well-experienced Member; you were the Chief Minister twice. Yes, the House is supreme, but the notice has to be examined by the hon. Chairman. You give notice to the hon. Chairman.

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** Sir, at least, allow me to say something. ...(Interruptions)... Then, take it up on Monday.

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल:** मंडे नहीं, अभी। ...(व्यवधान)... आप हाउस की सेंस ले लीजिए।  
...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You give notice. I cannot allow a discussion like this. ...(Interruptions)... No. I, now, take up Zero Hour submissions. Shri

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

Sukhendu Sekhar Roy. ...(Interruptions)... No. I cannot allow the discussion. Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Roy.

**SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY:** Sir, the Government of India has decided... ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI:** Sir, I have a point of order. ...(Interruptions)...

(FOLLOWED BY RSS/1D)

RSS/1D/11.15

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** Sir, I am on a point of order. Under Article 164(1) of the Constitution of India...(Interruptions)... ये हाउस चलाएँगे या आपको इधर आना है? ...(व्यवधान)... आप बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Article 164(1) of the Constitution. Okay. I have noted. I will read it.

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** Sir, my point of order is, the Constitution says very clearly about the duties of a Governor and the power of the Governor to appoint the Chief Minister. Sir, Article 164 does not say anywhere that the Governor is supposed to consult the serving Union Cabinet Minister... (Interruptions)...

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No, no. You are discussing the conduct of the Governor.

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** The Constitution does not allow the Governor to consult... (Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now, you are discussing the conduct of a Governor which I am not permitting. That is what I am saying.

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** The Constitution does not allow the Governor to consult the serving Cabinet Minister about the formation of a Government or appointment of Chief Minister...(Interruptions).... Sir, please. This is important. Parliament is in Session. A Governor of a State says that she would not have, while appointing a Chief Minister, consulted the Leader of the House...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No, you are coming for a discussion on the conduct of the Governor. That you do by giving a substantive motion, not this way....(Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** Sir, I am sorry. This House is supreme. This is final.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I know that. Yes, I agree with you... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** The Governor....

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** If you think that the Governor has violated the provisions of the Constitution, you bring a substantive motion. Why don't you do that? You are going by newspaper reports. I am not bothered about such reports. Anand Sharmaji, I have made it clear. For every Member I am saying. Anand Sharmaji, I have made it very clear... (Interruptions)... If you think that the Governor has violated any provisions of the Constitution, please give a substantive motion rather than putting me into trouble. I cannot allow you this way to discuss the conduct of a Governor. Now, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Roy.

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** Sir, I respect the Chair's ruling. Respecting your ruling, at the same time, I am asking for another ruling. We cannot discuss the conduct of a Governor.... (Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You move a substantive motion.

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** We can discuss the conduct of a serving Cabinet Minister. I am sorry. The Leader of the House has to answer.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** For what? For that also, you can give a motion. Where is the motion for that?

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** I am sorry, Sir. This House has every right....(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No, no. I have not allowed it under Rule 267. Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Roy, you start speaking.

**SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY:** How can I speak in this din? You bring the House in order....(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No, I have not allowed it under Rule 267. I cannot. Yechuryji, you know the practice. There is a convention... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI SITARAM YECHURY:** I am helping you. You say that yes, the Minister is answerable to the House. A separate notice should be given. When that will be given, it will be accepted and the Minister has to answer.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** No problem. Let a motion be given. Let him give a motion. See, if they think that any Minister has violated any provisions of the Constitution, there can be a motion for that. We can discuss that. I have no problem. But, this is not the way. No, no; I am not allowing. Sukhenduji, you start.

**SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY:** Sir, the Government has decided to sell the Bengal Chemicals and Pharmaceuticals Company... (Interruptions)...

**कृषि एवं किसान कल्याण मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री परषोत्तम रुपाला) :** सर, इन्होंने गोवा में दावा करने की सलाह नहीं दी। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति :** आप Opposition में नहीं हैं, आप गवर्नमेंट में हैं, आप बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री परषोत्तम रुपाला :** सर, इन्होंने गोवा में दावा करने की सलाह नहीं दी, अभी ये सभा गृह में क्यों बाधा खड़ी कर रहे हैं? ...(व्यवधान).... तब ये क्या कर रहे थे? ...(व्यवधान).... इनको वहाँ जाना चाहिए था। ...(व्यवधान)....

(1ई/एससीएच पर जारी)

KGG-SCH/1E/11.20

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** The guidelines of the Sarkaria Commission are violated. ...(Interruptions)...

**कृषि एवं किसान कल्याण मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री परषोत्तम रुपाला) :** गोवा में क्या कर रहे थे आप?... (व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति :** रुपाला जी...(व्यवधान).... रुपाला जी...(व्यवधान).... रुपाला जी, आप अपोज़िशन में नहीं हैं, आप ट्रेज़री में हैं, आप मिनिस्टर हैं, आप बैठिए।...(व्यवधान).... आप बैठिए...(व्यवधान).... दिग्विजय सिंह जी, आप बैठिए।...(व्यवधान).... आनन्द शर्मा जी, प्लीज़, आप बैठिए...(व्यवधान)....

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Please allow the Zero Hour submission to proceed. Please allow; otherwise, I will have to adjourn the House.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

...(Interruptions)... No, this is an irresponsible way. ...(Interruptions)..  
Digvijaya Singhji, you are a senior Member. ...(Interruptions)... I have to go  
by the rules. Please give notice. Shri Sukhendu Sekharji, you may start.  
Nothing else will go on record.

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA: \***

**MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION OF CHAIR****CONCERN OVER STRATEGIC SALE OF BENGAL CHEMICALS &  
PHARMACEUTICALS COMPANY AND BRIDGE & ROOF COMPANY**

**SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, during the  
partition of Bengal, Acharya Prafulla Chandra Ray established Bengal  
Chemicals & Pharmaceuticals Company Limited and it was the first  
Swadeshi company in India. Since more than a century, the company is  
working but, unfortunately, the Government has decided to sell out the  
company. Sir, I would like to place before you that this company's factories  
are located in Mumbai, Kanpur, Banihati and Maniktala and also sales

-----

\* Not recorded.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

offices at Patna, Cuttack, Hyderabad, Chennai and Delhi. This is the only public sector company in Asia which is manufacturing anti-venom serum in the country. The company has earned a profit of more than Rs. 1 crore in the last year. In spite of that, the Government has decided for a strategic sale of this company.

Apart from the Bengal Chemicals and Pharmaceuticals, the Government has decided for a strategic sale of another public sector company, that is, Bridge & Roof, which is a Mini-Ratna company and the Government wants...

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** Ours is a very serious issue, please allow us.

**SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY:** Please know that this is also a serious one. Why are you obstructing me? ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Only what Shri Sukhendu says will go on record and nothing else will go on record.

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** \*

**SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY:** Thousands of labourers are suffering. This Bridge & Roof Company is a Mini-Ratna company declared by the

-----

\* Not recorded.



**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

Government of India. They have hundreds of orders with them. Still, the Government has decided for a strategic sale of this company. In this way, the public sector companies are being sold out and thousands of labourers will be rendered jobless not only in Bengal but in different parts of the country.

Therefore, I would urge upon the Government, through you, Sir, to review the decision of sale so that the companies are saved. The Bengal Chemicals & Pharmaceuticals Company Limited is the first Swadeshi company of this country. It was established during the Swadeshi Movement where anti-partition movement was going on in 1905. Therefore, Sir, I would urge upon the Government that it should restrain itself from selling out the Bengal Chemicals & Pharmaceuticals Company Limited and the Bridge & Roof Company Limited forthwith. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

**SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI (TAMIL NADU):** Sir, I associate myself with the mention made by the hon. Member.

**SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I too associate myself with the mention made by the hon. Member.

**श्रीमती सरोजिनी हेम्ब्रम (ओडिशा) :** सर, मैं माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करती हूँ।

**कुछ माननीय सदस्य :** सर, हम भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करते हैं।

(समाप्त)

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Thank you very much. Now, Shri Pramod Tiwari.

**SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI:** Sir, the Leader of the Opposition wants to say something and my issue can be taken up after that. ...(Interruptions)...

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD):** Sir, an issue was raised by Shri Digvijaya Singh and you said that the Governor's conduct can't be discussed here.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Not in this way. It can be by a motion. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** He has not raised the issue of the conduct of the Governor. He has mentioned only what the Governor has said in an interview. First of all, she had said that she did not expect BJP to form the Government. Though she had not expected it, the BJP formed the Government. That is her opinion. Simultaneously, she is saying that she

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

spoke to the Leader of the House, the Finance Minister at 9.30 and asked him about the formation of the Government.

(Followed by KLS/1F)

RPM-KLS/1F/11.25

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You come with proper notice. ... (Interruptions)... You come with proper notice. ... (Interruptions)... That is only for suspension. ... (Interruptions)...

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD):** Shri Anand Sharma has rightly said... ... (Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Come with proper notice. ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** Shri Anand Sharma and Shri Digvijaya Singh have rightly said that we are not discussing only the conduct, but how come a Governor can take the plea that she sought the permission of a particular Cabinet Minister! ... (Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** That is the conduct of a Governor. ... (Interruptions)... That is the conduct of a Governor. ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** This has never happened in the past. ... (Interruptions)... We are not alleging it.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** You give proper notice. ... (Interruptions)...

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** It has never happened. ...(Interruptions)...

This is her own statement. ...(Interruptions).. This is the statement of Governor of Goa which is being reproduced. ...(Interruptions)... How can a Governor seek the permission of a Union Minister for forming a Government of a particular party? ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Your motion is.. ...(Interruptions)... Give notice. ...(Interruptions)...

**संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी):** सर, इनका हाल वैसा ही है, जैसे खिसियानी बिल्ली खम्भा नोंचे। ...(व्यवधान)...सर, इन्हें जनता ने जनादेश नहीं दिया है। ...(व्यवधान)...सर, यह आपके आदेश का अपमान है। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, यह आपकी रूलिंग का अपमान है। ...(व्यवधान)...सर, जनता के जनादेश का अपमान तो है ही, साथ में आपकी रूलिंग का भी अपमान है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** There is a procedure. ...(Interruptions)..

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी:** सर, हम आपकी रूलिंग चाहते हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** There is a procedure. ...(Interruptions)... If you want to give notice, give it in the Notice Office. Hon. Chairman will examine it. Allow or disallow, it is up to the hon. Chairman. ...(Interruptions)... All of

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

a sudden you cannot bring a motion without the permission of the Chair.

...(Interruptions)... Sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** May I quote the rule to be observed while speaking? ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Which number? ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** It is Rule No.238. ...(Interruptions)... The procedure is in Rule 238(A). The procedure is that I have to give intimation to the Chairman. So, I have given intimation to the Chairman. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I would request the hon. Members of Opposition that if you are serious, draft a proper motion and give it to the Chairman. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल:** सर, रूल्स में ऐसा कहीं नहीं लिखा है। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, रूल्स में ऐसा कहाँ लिखा है? ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी:** सर, हम माननीय सदस्यों से रिक्वेस्ट करेंगे कि ये सब्सटेंटिव मोशन लाएं और सब्सटेंटिव मोशन के बाद आप इसके ऊपर चर्चा कर लीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, हम चर्चा के लिए तैयार हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** There is a procedure. ...(Interruptions)... I am already asking you to go by procedure. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी:** हम चर्चा के लिए तैयार हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... You give a substantive motion.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Shri Ritabrata Banerjee. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी:** सर, जिस तरह से ये जनादेश का अपमान कर रहे हैं, इससे नुकसान इनका ही होगा। ...(व्यवधान)... एक तरफ़ ये जनादेश का और दूसरी तरफ़ चेयर की रूलिंग का अपमान कर रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... आप तो अपमान महासभा बन गए हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Shri Ritabrata Banerjee. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी:** सर, इनसे पूछिए कि ये चाहते क्या हैं? ...(व्यवधान)...क्या ये डिसकशन चाहते हैं? ...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Shri Ritabrata Banerjee. ...(Interruptions)... You start. ...(Interruptions)...

#### **DEMAND FOR STOPPING STRATEGIC SALE OF SOME ALLOY STEEL PLANTS BY SAIL**

**SHRI RITABRATA BANERJEE (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I stand here to voice the demand of the people of Bengal in general and Durgapur in particular to save the industrial city of Durgapur and stop the strategic disinvestment of Alloy Steel Plant. ...(Interruptions)...The Government has decided to strategically do the disinvestment of the Alloy Steel Plant which is one of the

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

most important crowns of SAIL, which is capable of producing most special steels of nearly 500 varieties for use in science and technology, defence applications, submarines, research projects, neutrino experiment, high speed railways and many other very sophisticated technologies and strategic applications. It is not merely a plant, rather over the last 50 years, it has been developed as a strategic unit of the nation.

(Contd by 1G/SSS)

SSS-PSV/1G/11.30

**SHRI RITABRATA BANERJEE (CONTD.):** The Alloy Steel Plant Collective took all pains to discharge its mighty role in national interest despite the fact that its regular employees' strength have been reduced from 7400 to mere 954 but did not compromise with its production and quality. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, the net loss in Alloy Steel Plant is nominal within SAIL. ...*(Interruptions)*... The move of Strategic Sale of ASP by SAIL Board is demoralizing the Steel Collective which works overtime to keep SAIL in a commanding height against global meltdown especially on steel industry. ...*(Interruptions)*... The industrious city of Durgapur is facing a tremendous problem and one after another industries have been closed down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, from 13<sup>th</sup>-21<sup>st</sup> November, 104 km long march has

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

been conducted, with the marchers spending the night in the house of the workers and labourers. The long march was without any flag and had the pictures of Dr. Bidhan Chandra Roy and Jyoti Basu. ...(Interruptions)... On 5<sup>th</sup> March the united people of Durgapur formed a 9 km long human wall from DPL Factory gate to Bankura More with the demand of saving Alloy Steel and Durgapur industrial area. ...(Interruptions)... Sixty-two thousand families have signed the memorandum urging to save Durgapur. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, through you, I want to say that all the local trade unions cutting across their affiliation and political ideology have come together and joined hands in Bardhaman District to fight this onslaught. I urge upon the Central Government, through you, to stop the Strategic Disinvestment of Alloy Steels Plant and different units of SAIL to bring out the steel collective of a very demoralizing scenario and motivate them to exert optimum efforts to regain the glory of SAIL and save Durgapur and West Bengal. ...(Interruptions)... Thank you, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

(Ends)

**SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU):** Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.



**SHRI K. K. RAGESH (KERALA):** Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

**PROF. JOGEN CHOWDHURY (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

**SHRI K. SOMAPRASAD (KERALA):** Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

**SHRI AHAMED HASSAN (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

**SHRI K. T. S. TULSI (NOMINATED):** Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

**SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN (UTTAR PRADESH):** Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

**SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY (WEST BENGAL):** Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

**श्रीमती कहकशां परवीन (बिहार):** महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय से सम्बद्ध करती हूँ।

**श्री राम नाथ ठाकुर (बिहार):** महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय से सम्बद्ध करती हूँ।

(समाप्त)

**संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी):** सर, मेरी तो इनसे यह रिक्वेस्ट है कि इन्होंने पूरे समय, जिस तरह से अभी भी और इससे पहले भी ...(व्यवधान)... सर, आपकी रूलिंग के बाद ...(व्यवधान)... आपने रूलिंग दे दी कि if they want a discussion, they can bring a substantive motion. They are questioning your ruling . This is the first point. यानी पहले तो जनता के जनादेश पर क्वेश्चन, फिर आपकी रूलिंग पर क्वेश्चन और फिर देश के लोगों के जनादेश का अपमान। ...(व्यवधान)... तो मेरी इनसे रिक्वेस्ट यह है कि अगर ये हाउस नहीं चलाना चाहते, हर दिन हाउस को डिस्टर्ब करना चाहते हैं, तो ये बता दें, हम उस तरह से फैसला करेंगे। ...(व्यवधान)... लेकिन हाउस और जनता के पैसे को...(व्यवधान)... हम इस तरह से पानी में जाने नहीं देंगे। ...(व्यवधान)... अगर इन्हें चर्चा नहीं करनी है, सदन में केवल हंगामा करना है, तो ये तय कर लें कि क्या करना है। ...(व्यवधान)... तब फिर सरकार तय करेगी कि सदन चलाना है या नहीं चलाना है।

...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** One second, please. ...(Interruptions)... Please, please ...(Interruptions)... Now, please listen to me. I am requesting you to please listen to me. I am only asking you. I am not against any discussion. Mr. Naqvi also said that they are also ready for a discussion. The only question is, you have to observe the formalities. ....(Interruptions)... Now please... ...(Interruptions)... Ghulam Nabiji, I

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

should be allowed to speak. When the Chair is standing and when the Chair is speaking, shouting slogans is something I cannot tolerate. I want to convey something. That should be allowed. Ghulam Nabiji, I am saying that this is too much. I am only saying that if you think I am not reasonable, you have every right to tell me. LoP can also tell me. I am only saying this.

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** We are not casting any aspersions on....

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** I know that, but please listen to me. ....(Interruptions).... Listen to me. What is this? ...(Interruptions)... Digvijayaji, what is this? Now please listen to me. I am not denying or refusing any discussion. I am only saying that if you want to discuss this issue which has been raised by hon. Member, Shri Digvijaya Singh, i.e. the conduct, this way or that way, of the Governor, then please give a formal notice, a substantive motion. It is under the rules.

(Contd. by PK/1H)

PK-VNK/1H/11.35

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN (CONTD.):** Please give a formal notice. I will request the hon. Chairman to allow this. We can have a discussion on this any time. There is no problem. But this is not the way. ...(Interruptions)..

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

That is what I have to say. ...(Interruptions).. Then, I will have to adjourn the House. ...(Interruptions).. Yes, Digvijaya Singhji. ...(Interruptions)..

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** Sir, I have a point of order. ..(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Yes; you tell me what your reaction to what I said is.

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** Sir, I have a point of order. I have the greatest regard for the Chair. As you know, I have been in the Legislature since 1977.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Yes.

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** Therefore, Sir, my request is that this is not an allegation. This is a statement that she has made publicly. This is number one.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Okay. Then, why don't you give a motion?

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** Sir, please hear me out. ...(Interruptions).. Sir, please hear me out. Again, I have made no allegation. The point is, Mr. Arun Jaitley is a Member of this House. He has a right to reply also. Therefore, he is not covered by Rule 238. But, Sir, I have made no allegation. I want to raise this issue in the public domain, in this august House, that she has not only.....(Interruptions)..

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Then, give a separate notice. ..(Interruptions)..  
Okay. ....(Interruptions).. You should not create problems in Zero Hour.  
..(Interruptions).. Give a separate notice. Okay. ..(Interruptions)... Why in  
Zero Hour? ..(Interruptions).. You are, unnecessarily, encroaching upon  
the time of others.

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** I agree with you, Sir. ...(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Even for that, a notice is required.  
....(Interruptions)..

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** Sir, we will give you a substantive  
motion.....(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Even for that, a notice is required.  
....(Interruptions).. I am saying only that.

**SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH:** We will immediately give a substantive motion to  
be taken up on Monday. ....(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Even if you want to discuss the conduct of the  
Leader of the House, for that also, we should have intimation. For that also,  
you have to give notice. ...(Interruptions).. That also can go only by rules.  
One cannot just *suo motu*, all of a sudden, say that, Sir, I have an allegation  
against a Minister, 'X', 'Y'. No. I am not allowing this. ...(Interruptions).. I

am not allowing. ...(Interruptions).. Shri Harivansh. ...(Interruptions).. I am not allowing. ...(Interruptions).. I will adjourn the House. ..(Interruptions).. No, please. ..(Interruptions).. I am not allowing. ..(Interruptions)..

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** सर, मेरा एक प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**SHRI SHARAD YADAV:** Sir, I have a point of order..(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Yes, what is the point of order Sharad Yadavji?

**श्री शरद यादव :** उपसभापति जी, मैं बहुत अदब से आपकी परमिशन से सब लोगों से निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि जब चेयर से यह कह दिया गया कि आप इस पर Substantive Motion लेकर आइए, उसके बाद तो कोई सवाल नहीं उठता है। उपसभापति जी, मैं आपकी रूलिंग से पूरी तरह से सहमत हूँ और मैं आप लोगों से विनती करूंगा कि आप इस मोशन को सोमवार को लेकर आइए।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति :** ठीक है।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री दिग्विजय सिंह :** शरद जी, हम सोमवार को इस मोशन को लेकर आएंगे, लेकिन इसमें हमें आपका सपोर्ट मिलना चाहिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

**SHRI SHARAD YADAV:** We will support you.

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** सर, मेरा प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर यह है कि आर्टिकल 164 में गवर्नर अपने को advice करने के लिए मंत्रिमंडल/मुख्य मंत्री का गठन करता है। इसका

मतलब यह है कि वह मुख्य मंत्री उसी दल से चयनित करेगा, जो दल सबसे बड़ा हो।  
...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति :** यह तो ठीक है।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** सर, उसका interpretation कीजिए ...(व्यवधान)... ऐसा नहीं है कि गवर्नर किसी को बुला लेगा। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति :** इसलिए मैं बोलता हूँ कि यह मेरा काम नहीं है।...(व्यवधान)... गवर्नर का काम मैं कैसे कर सकता हूँ? ...(व्यवधान)... यह मेरा काम नहीं है।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** अगर गवर्नर गलत करता है, तो फिर कौन करेगा? ...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** If there is a problem, you give a substantive motion notice. ..(Interruptions)..

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** सर, हम ओरली नोटिस दे रहे हैं।...(व्यवधान)...

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** The hon. Chairman will consider it. ..(Interruptions).. No, no, sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Shri Harivansh; nothing more. ..(Interruptions)..

**THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD):** Sir, can I suggest something? ....(Interruptions)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Okay.

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** The hon. Deputy Chairman is saying that we should give a substantive motion notice. We agree that we will give a

substantive motion notice. Can the House be adjourned for one hour, so that we could give a substantive motion notice? ...(Interruptions)....

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI):** You can't say that House be adjourned. ..(Interruptions).. क्या हर चीज ये तय करेंगे? ...(व्यवधान)...

**PLIGHT OF COMMON MAN DUE TO ECONOMIC BURDEN IMPOSED BY GOVERNMENT**

**श्री हरिवंश (बिहार) :** उपसभापति जी, आम जनता, जिसको हम सर्वशक्तिमान मानते हैं ...(व्यवधान)... जिसके जीवन में बेहतरी लाने के नाम पर हम सब यहां बैठे हैं, उसकी स्थिति क्या है? ...(व्यवधान)... मैं इस सदन के माध्यम से इसको तीन ताजा उदाहरणों के द्वारा केन्द्र सरकार और देश के सामने रखना चाहता हूँ। ...(व्यवधान)... पहला, बैंकों का ताजा निर्णय कि विभिन्न खातों में न्यूनतम बैलेंस या औसत बैलेंस न रखने पर बैंक ग्राहकों पर penalty plus public service tax लगेगा।...(व्यवधान)... यह खबर पहले आई थी, पर जन विरोध को देखते हुए संकेत मिला कि केन्द्र सरकार शायद आम जनता के हित-पक्ष में खड़ी होगी।...(व्यवधान)... पर दो दिनों पहले भारतीय स्टेट बैंक के चेयरमैन का बयान पढ़ा कि हमें केन्द्र सरकार से ऐसी कोई सूचना/सलाह नहीं मिली है और हम 11 करोड़ जन-धन खाते maintain करते हैं, तो यह fine/penalty लगेगी।...(व्यवधान)...

(1जे/एनकेआर-पीबी पर जारी)



NKR-PB/1J/11.40

**श्री हरिवंश (क्रमागत) :** यह मात्र एक penalty है।... (व्यवधान).. Fund transfer, चैक देने, ATM charges में revision, वगैरह के नाम पर तरह-तरह के शुल्क बैंक customers से ले रहे हैं।... (व्यवधान).. सभी सरकारी और गैर-सरकारी बैंकों द्वारा, खास तौर से Private Banks द्वारा की गई, नोटबंदी के दौरान खुली लूट, सबने देखी।... (व्यवधान).. क्या सरकारी और निजी बैंक जनहित के लिए हैं या जनता पर तरह-तरह के टैक्स लगाने या वसूलने के लिए हैं? ... (व्यवधान).. पैसे वाले जो अरबों का loan लेकर भाग जाते हैं, उन्हें दंडित करने की कोई व्यवस्था 70 सालों में हमने नहीं बनाई है।... (व्यवधान).. इसी तरह भारतीय रेल में टिकटों के New Dynamic Pricing Model का हाल है। रेल टिकट महंगे हो गए हैं।... (व्यवधान).. यही हाल भारत में चलने वाली Airlines का है। खास तौर से Private Airlines की हर चीज, लगेज, refreshment आदि, जो न्यूनतम सुविधाएं अपेक्षित हैं, वह न दो, बेचो। ... (व्यवधान)..

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** The House is adjourned up to 12.00 hours.

-----

**The House then adjourned at forty-one minutes past eleven of the clock.**

**(12.00-1.00 P.M. - Question Hour)**

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017

KGG-NKR/1Y/2.30

The House reassembled after lunch at thirty-four minutes two of the clock,  
MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair

**SUPPLEMENTARY DEMANDS FOR GRANTS (GENERAL) 2016-17**

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (SHRI ARJUN RAM MEGHWAL):** Sir, I lay on the Table, a statement (in English and Hindi) showing the Supplementary Demands for Grants (General) 2016-17.

(Ends)

(Followed by KLS/1Z)

KLS/1Z-2.35

**PRIVATE MEMBERS' BUSINESS**

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Now it is Shri Tiruchi Siva's Resolution. How are you getting it again and again? Earlier you had a Bill. It is a good thing. Congratulations. Now you can move the Resolution.

**RESOLUTION RE: AMENDING THE PREVENTION OF CRUELTY TO ANIMALS ACT, 1960**

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (TAMIL NADU):** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I move the following Resolution:-

“Having regard to the fact that:-

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

- (i) from time immemorial, India has been an agrarian economy as the agricultural sector employs 263.1 million Indians, which accounts for 54.6% of the total Indian workforce;
- (ii) agriculture contributed 15.4% of the Gross Value Added in 2015-16;
- (iii) over the years, indigenous breeds of cattle have been the backbone of the agricultural economy as prior to the introduction of modern farm equipments, agriculture would not have been possible without cattle and even today, cattle play an important role in agricultural activities, particularly for the small and medium farmers;
- (iv) bull power is used for ploughing and transportation, which saves electricity and consumption of large volumes of fossil fuel that are harmful to the environment;
- (v) India imported 2.28 lakhs TMT of crude oil and other petroleum products in the year 2015-16, worth Rs. 5.24 lakh crores, 60 lakh tonnes of diesel worth Rs. 4000 crores which can be potentially saved by replacing tractors by cattle for the purposes of ploughing and transportation;
- (vi) cattle manure has been traditionally used in India as fertiliser which helps reduce reliance on chemical fertilisers and pesticides, that have a negative effect on soil quality and harm quality of food crops produced as India consumed 256 lakh tonnes of fertilizers in 2014-15;
- (vii) indiscriminate use of fertilisers and pesticides in agriculture has been linked to spread of diseases through food products but use of dung and urine from cattle has a positive impact on the environment and soil quality, with no negative effects on health;

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

(viii) a higher dependence on fossil fuels and chemical based farm inputs significantly raises the cost of farming resulting in higher food prices;

(ix) by increasing reliance on cattle in agriculture, one can reduce cost of food products and avoid negative effects on environment and health;

(x) cattle used in agriculture are reared with great care, and are fed a high-quality diet, including grass fodder grown exclusively for the cattle and their health is monitored and taken care of on a periodic basis by qualified veterinary doctors;

(xi) native breeds of cattle are gradually being phased out due to the onslaught of modern farm equipments and the import of exotic breeds;

(xii) as per the Livestock Census conducted by the Department of Animal Husbandry, Dairying and Fisheries of the Government of India, the total indigenous cattle population in India has reduced by 8.94% from 1660.15 lakhs in 2007 to 1511.72 lakhs in 2012, which is a small fraction of the total actual requirement for cattle for agricultural practises;

(xiii) the population of exotic breeds of cattle has increased by 20.18% in the same period, from 330.6 lakhs in 2007 to 397.32 lakhs in 2012;

(xiv) owing to the decline in the population of the indigenous bulls, artificial insemination is increasingly being relied upon for breeding of cows;

(xv) article 48 of the Constitution of India directs that the State shall endeavour to take steps for preserving and improving breeds of animals; and

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

(xvi) all possible steps are needed to be taken to preserve, improve and protect the stock of indigenous cattle of the country,

this House urges upon the Government to: —

(a) suitably amend the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960 to exempt bulls from the application of provisions that restrict their utility and training for various purposes by using of various techniques to train them to perform agricultural tasks such as ploughing and transportation;

(b) include the amended Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960, in the Ninth Schedule to the Constitution of India; and

(c) take steps to encourage and incentivise the use of indigenous cattle for agricultural purposes and improve their health and stock.”

Sir, it is a very important Resolution which may appear to be very simple, but involves our rich tradition, culture and the native people of this country. From time immemorial India has primarily been an agrarian country. Of course, our nation contributes 15.4 per cent of the GVA, Gross Value Added, in the years 2015-16. It employs 263.1 million Indians which accounts for 54.6 per cent of the total work force. Sir, today India like many other developing countries with a rich agricultural tradition and heritage of their own, the worse improved agriculture forms as a substitute or

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

synonymous with the increasing use of high yielding variety seeds and usage of chemical fertilizers, pesticides and tractors among other modern inputs.

Sir, the spread of modern technology or the modern methods uprooted several traditional agricultural methods like that of crop rotations, use of cattle and inter-cropping patterns which have been an integral part of heritage. However, in the goal of increasing the short-term yield, the long-term impacts of these modern methods have been severely neglected. Sir, we should not ignore certain facts. Over the years, indigenous cattle have been the backbone of the agriculture of our country rather our economy. Prior to introduction of modern farm equipments, carrying on agricultural activities would not have been possible without the use of cattle. From ploughing to transportation, use of dung and urine as manure and fertilizers, use of cattle for agriculture are many. Even today cattle are an integral and important part of agriculture particularly for the landless, the marginal and the small farmers. Sir, the bulls are used for ploughing and transportation. This not only helps to save consumption of power but also in using volumes of fossil fuels that are harmful to the environment. Fossil fuels are a primary source of energy, no one can deny, but at the cost of what? Sir, the fossil fuels release carbon dioxide, sulphur dioxide, nitrogen oxides and carbon

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

monoxides among other Green House gases that will severely harm the environment as such. The consequences, in the long run, will be felt. Burning of fossil fuels is one of the primary causes of global warming. It results in the rise of temperature, flooding of low-lying areas in sea levels and submerging of islands. Sir, sulphur dioxide is one of the pollutants released by the fossil fuels, which causes acid rain. Acid rain not only leads to destruction of monuments but also severely affects crops due to acidification. We cannot ignore this very, very important thing. As of today, fossil fuels are being extracted and mined at an exorbitant cost to meet the current demand and supply. However, it is estimated that fossil fuels would become extinct in the long run since this is a non-renewable energy. It is highly likely that fuel prices will also increase steeply in the future. Sir, in the year 2014-15, the sale of tractors in India was 5.51 lakh. In 2015-16, India imported 2.2 lakh TMT of crude oil and other petroleum products worth Rs. 5.24 lakh crores.

(Contd by 2AA/SSS)

SSS-MCM/2A/2.40

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (CONTD.):** It is estimated that 60 lakh tonnes of diesel worth Rs. 4000 crores can be potentially saved by replacing tractors with

cattle for the purposes of ploughing and transportation. This would have a huge saving not only economically, but also environmentally. Sir, cattle dung has been traditionally used in India as manure and fertilizers. This tremendously helps to reduce the reliance on chemical fertilizers and pesticides that have a negative effect on the quality of the soil as well as harms the quality of food crops that are produced. Sir, given the serious issue of depleting ground water sources, over utilization of chemical based fertilizers and pesticides is further adding to the problem of non-usability of existing ground water resources. Sir, India consumes 256 lakh tonnes of fertilizers in 2014-15. Indiscriminate use of pesticides and fertilizers in agriculture has also led to the rampant spread of diseases through food products. Use of such inputs leading to ground water contamination has been linked to gastric cancer and hypertension and stomach cancer among a number of other diseases. Sir, however, on the other hand, dung and urine from cattle contain various natural minerals which are extremely beneficial for the soil and have other environmental friendly uses as well. Dung is also collected and used as biogas to generate electricity and heat. The gas is rich in methane and is renewable, stable and an inexpensive source of electricity. Further, the use of dung as manure has no negative



**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

impact on our health. Sir, a high dependence on fossil fuels and chemical-based input for agriculture not only harms the environment, but is also extremely expensive. The usage of such inputs significantly raises the cost of farming which is not feasible for the small and marginal farmers who are living a hand-to-mouth existence. Such farmers find it more economical to rear bulls rather than to purchase or rent tractors. Sir, in order to maintain their agricultural inputs they get loans from the banks which they are not able to repay and we hear so many number of farmers committing suicides in recent days across India. Not only in any particular region, but across India, farmers commit suicide only for the reason that they don't get rain, they don't get water, and for incurring costs on inputs for agriculture like pesticides and fertilizers which they believe would fetch them more yield, which rather put them to disastrous end. So, the use of chemical fertilizers and pesticides rather than helping the farmers brings their life to an end. So, it is very imminent. Sir, we have to consider that. It has to be replaced with a traditional and heritage form of cultivation. Use of cattle will not only help the farmers, but also preserve the soil as well as the food products that are cultivated. Sir, as per the Livestock Census conducted by the Department of Animal Husbandry, Dairying and Fisheries of the Government of India, the

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

total indigenous cattle population in India has reduced by 8.94 per cent from 1660.15 lakhs in 2007 to 1511.72 lakhs in 2012 lakhs, which is a small fraction of the total actual requirement for cattle for agricultural practices. On the other hand, the population of exotic breeds of cattle has increased by 10.18 per cent in the same period, from 330.6 lakhs to 397.32 lakhs in 2012. So, native breed of our cattle are diminishing and are being extinct whereas the exotic breeds of cattle are increasing in number. What is the result of that? Sir, I have got a very good example. There is a saying in Tamil about the cows which yield milk. I think, the milk which the cows yield has a protein which is called Beta-Casein, A-1 and U-1, A-2 and U-2. The milk which native cows are giving has A-2 and U-2. It helps the people to live in good health and, of course, blood circulation is increased.

(Contd. by NBR/2B)

-SSS/NBR-SC/2B/2.45.

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (CONTD.):** Whereas milk, which breed cows are giving, has A1 and U1 and they are the source of cancer. Sir, this is not something which is imaginary; it is proved by way of research. So, milk that we get from our native cows keeps our children healthy; whereas, milk

given by exotic breed cows brings new diseases. Just to get more milk, we cannot keep the health of our people at stake.

Owing to this decline in cattle population, artificial insemination is increasingly been relied upon for breeding cows. This is a very sad thing. Not only is the process of artificial insemination expensive, but it also led to a reduction in the demand for bulls. Sir, bulls are used for plowing, transportation, breed cows and also for other sports like *Jallikattu*.

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** That is the real purpose.

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Yes; maybe. Why not?

So, when native bulls actually become extinct, the focus on certain specific breeds through the process of artificial insemination also results in loss of genetic variation. In fact, according to a recent news report, 59 live bulls of Jersey breed imported from Denmark! Studies have shown that due to artificial insemination and the way animals are treated, the life span of animals is drastically impacted. In an ideal situation, cattle live for around 25 years. However, animals that are intensively milked live up to only around 10 years. So, Sir, our cows also will become extinct in the coming years. Other breeds will be imported. These also live for a short period. And, even for insemination and growing cattle, we have to depend on other nations.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

So, my point is, when we have a rich tradition and heritage, we are just giving it up for more income. But, in reality, we would not get more income, rather we are only keeping the lives of our children and the country at stake. So, the native cattle in India have evolved in perfect harmony with their local region and adapting to the local environment conditions. The State of Tamil Nadu has six indigenous cattle breeds -- Kangayam, Pulikulam, Umbalachery, Barugur, Alambadi and Malai Maadu. However, today, owing to increase in artificial insemination and lesser people rearing cattle, most of these breeds have dwindled to a few thousands and are on the verge of extinction. This is majorly due to lack of incentives to farmers, introduction of tractors and popularization of exotic breeds.

Sir, I think, hon. Deputy Chairman is well aware, now-a-days, the people are reverting back to original form of cultivation. They are totally giving up chemical fertilizers as organic products are being welcomed by consumers as well as farmers. It is more remunerative to farmer as well as it is healthier for consumer. Now, I am converting my farm into organic. Earlier, we were using chemical fertilizers. Now, agriculture experts instructed me to totally stop that. Only two native cows and two native bulls are enough for 15 acres of land whose cow dung and urine can be used as

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

manure as well as pesticides. People are waiting for produce that come out from such farm. So, awareness has come. But, we are resorting to other means.

Article 29 of the Constitution says that it is the fundamental right of every citizen, residing in any part of India and having a distinct culture of its own, to conserve the same. Article 51A of the Constitution directs that it is the fundamental duty of every citizen to value and preserve the rich heritage of our composite culture.

Artificial insemination is the worst thing which we have to stop immediately. When we have got our own bulls used for plowing, transportation and sports, these can otherwise be used for breeding our own cows.

I should confess here and I tender my apology for telling this. Through artificial insemination, cow may breed and give milk. But, its natural pleasure is deprived. It is not just saving an animal from cruelty meted out by human or anyone else. Just because it does not have voice, we should not underestimate its feelings. It has to give birth to a cow and for that it has to be with a bull.

(CONTD. BY PK/2C)

PK-GS/2C/2.50

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (CONTD.):** But you are totally depriving it of a bull. No bull is there, whereas it is impregnated, it gives birth and it also gives milk. Sir, I am very sorry to say this, but I have to share this. They are all animals. How can we deprive them, just for the sake of milk or money? Only artificial insemination can fetch you more money does not mean that we should use this technique. I think, Sir, we have to apply our mind. We should have some humanitarian consideration, not only with fellow human beings, but also with animals, who come along with us and who are always with us. So, there are many such things which I would like to say; I think it is not out of place. Cows and bulls are being domesticated. They are brought up like children. Not only in Tamil Nadu, but also in many other areas, these animals are being used for other activities. In Tamil Nadu, there is an ancient tradition that has been observed for over 2,000 years, the Jallikattu, a bull taming sport, conducted as a part of the annual Pongal festivities to celebrate the harvest season. A glimpse of the Jallikattu sport can also be seen in the ancient relics from the Indus Valley Civilization, which are on display at the National Museum, New Delhi. So, it is not something which is

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

happening today. It is there since the Indus Valley Civilization and is still in the National Museum, New Delhi. So, it requires the use of indigenous breed of bulls. The bulls are identified, nourished and trained for the event. They are not tortured. They are fed well as that of a child. Without activities like the Jallikattu, a lot of native breeds will be sent to slaughter houses. With reduced availability of bulls, farmers will be forced to adopt artificial insemination techniques, which is cost prohibitive, and is in direct contravention of *in situ* conservation. So, Sir, in a bid to extract more commercial value and more milk from the cows, artificial insemination methods are used rather than breeding of the indigenous breeds of a cattle. Thus, a ban of traditional and cultural practices such as Jallikattu, Kambala in Karnataka, etc. further aggravates the problem of extinction of indigenous cattle. Sir, societal peace and harmony comes about by taking proactive action and not just by talking about it. Despite religious, class and caste diversities prevalent in India, many principles, functions, events are sustainably shared for a peaceful co-living. Jallikattu is one such festival that is celebrated with full enthusiasm across the State of Tamil Nadu, by the people, breaking through numerous class, caste and religious barriers. So, Sir, the native bulls or the native cattle are essential for agricultural purpose,

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

to preserve our ancient and heritage method of agricultural farming. Moreover, it is in the interest of small and marginal farmers who consider it better to rear a bull to maintain their livelihood than to resort to chemical fertilizers to get some more yield in the farms. Sports like Jallikattu will also encourage the people to develop that. Here, I would like to quote Article 51A. It says, "It shall be the duty of every citizen of India to promote harmony and the spirit of common brotherhood among all the people of India transcending religious, linguistic, regional or sectional diversities." Sir, just for an example, I say, it does not create any controversy, rather, it brings in more harmony among the people of various culture, diversities, castes, classes and religions. In Madurai, the Muslim Imams offer holy ash to the bulls before the sport is started. In fact, in Madurai, the first bull that enters the arena belongs to a Scheduled Caste family. Further, in Dindigul, the Christian priest hoists the flag to start the event and in Alanganallur, priest belonging to the Scheduled Caste perform a puja before the vadaivasal is opened. So, there is no caste barrier. No religion is there. People are together. For example, if people have to come together, some festivals have to be there. When Ramzan comes, we go there. When Christmas comes, we come to a place. When Deepavali comes, they go



**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

to other places. Like that, such events also bring people together. Some sports, by showing some reason, if curtailed, may spoil the ancient heritage, culture and tradition of the country. So, Sir, in the interests of several things, I am moving this Resolution; namely, first, to preserve the traditional form of agriculture and also to save the interests of small and marginal farmers who cannot afford to pay for the chemical fertilisers.

(Contd. by PB/2D)

PB/2D/2.55

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (CONTD.):** And it contaminates the soil. It depletes the ground water. It spoils even the food products. The crops which are produced in that soil by way of these inputs cause harm and it is hazardous to the health of human also. So, we have to replace it. It is high time we concentrated on it. The Ministers are here. The Government is here. All the learned Members are also here, Sir. Should we give it up for other expectations which don't fetch anything?

So, Sir, I would like to conclude with my emphasis on social harmony. In light of the importance of social harmony, it is a goal that must be pursued at all costs. In light of the directives mandated by our Constitution and importance of the events like Jallikattu, the bulls, the native cattle, have to

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

be protected. Sir, events like Jallikattu play an important role in maintaining such harmony, which I just mentioned as an example.

Given the added benefits in achieving this goal by events such as Jallikattu and the Constitutional importance granted to the same, the Government must also take steps to preserve this unique culture and heritage of our country. I also urge the Government to take all positive steps to promote the use of indigenous cattle, and actively engage in preserving and protecting the native breeds.

For that, the House urges upon the Government to take the following measures:

(i) Suitably amend the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960, to exempt bulls from the application of provisions that restrict their use and training for various purposes. This includes the use of various techniques to train them to effectively perform their agricultural tasks such as ploughing and transportation.

(ii) Include this amended Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960, to the 9<sup>th</sup> Schedule of the Constitution of India; and

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

(iii) Take steps to educate, encourage and incentivize people about the numerous uses of indigenous cattle for agricultural purposes and improve their health and stock.

Thank you very much, Sir.

(Ends)

*The question was proposed.*

**SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (TELANGANA):** Respected Deputy Chairman, before starting my observations on the submission of my esteemed colleague, Shri Tiruchi Siva, for suitable amendment to the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, I salute the recent Marina March which has replicated the Dravidian Renaissance, the inherent, indigenous, native, traditional emotions and their importance. By reflecting their commitment to the Tamil heritage which is part of the Dravidian heritage and which is part of the larger Indian heritage, the Marina March has attracted the attention of all the sensitive citizens of the globe.

Sir, we have our own cock fights in Andhra Pradesh, we have our own type of bull fights in Rayalaseema, we have our own bullock cart races in Telangana and the variety of races, variety of seasonal and festive-related celebrations involving the animals are there almost all across the nations.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

With the focus on the Jallikattu, the World Council of Indigenous Peoples and their indigenous traditional habits, is again focusing to enlarge the demand to encourage, sustain and preserve the traditional knowledge and traditional festivity.

(Contd. by 2e/SKC)

SKC/2E/3.00

**SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (contd.):** We have forgotten to protect the earthworm. The protection of earthworm is directly related to organic farming. Organic farming is directly related to the health of the ecology, the environment and human beings. What is happening to soil health all over in the absence of earthworms is well known not only to the illiterate farmers of our country, but also to our extraordinary agricultural scientists. Yet, we are not able to protect the earthworms. Not just the earthworms, we are not able to protect the frogs and tortoises either. Where is this leading to? We advocate and champion the cause of protection of our biodiversity, but until and unless we protect the original natural resources such as earthworms, frogs and tortoises, we won't be able to protect organic farming. How are we going to protect agriculture in the real sense?

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

Sir, recently, I travelled to Maharashtra. I visited the Kaneri Math at Siddhagiri, the place of Kolhapur Maharaja. Sambhaji Maharaj is here in this House. In the *Siddhagiri gowshala*, I saw the rarest of the rare breeds of cattle and cow. *Sahiwal, khillari, dangi, ongole* and other breeds are not seen in their original form in our agricultural fields, but I could see the rarest of the rare breeds of cow of not just India, but of the world there. I visited *Narasimha Wadi* on the banks of the Krishna River, just 70 kilometres away from Kolhapur. Even there I could see the commitment, care and concern to protect the original breed of cattle so as to protect organic farming and to preserve the traditional knowledge, the real treasure of our natural breeds, and the relevance of our indigenous breeds. In this context, I would like to again talk about my own State, particularly Andhra Pradesh's, *kodi pandalu*. It looks odd in these modern times, but it is *shastra*, respected, Sir; it is *kukkuta shastra*. It has got astronomical and astrological relevance. The colours of the fighting cocks, especially the winning cocks, were used to adjudge the relevance of planets and their effects in a particular year. They are centuries and millennia old. There was a necessity to depend on them because they did not have ready calculations or calendars. They used to depend on this *kukkuta shastra*, these cock fights, during the time of

*Sankranti, Maha Sankranti or Makara Sankramana.* Likewise, *jallikattu* and all other traditional fights have their significance. It is not just for encouragement and enthusiasm, but also to protect the nativity of breeds. Can anybody imagine a hybrid variety of the bull taking part in *jallikattu*, bull fights in Rayalaseema or bullock cart races in Telangana? Only the native, original and well-bred bulls can take part in such races.

(CONTD. BY HK/2F)

LP-HK/3.05/2F

**SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (CONTD.):** These are having the relevance directly to the traditional knowledge and their preservation. Hence, I appreciate the initiative of Tiruchi Sivaji to focus on this vital aspect and to lead towards preservation of traditional festivities involving animals. At this juncture and in this context, I plead to the modern and the newer generation, while you take part in those traditional heritage-oriented festivities and competition between animals, ensure to have humanitarian ground and ensure not to give them any sort of anaesthesia-type of medication just to win your race. This is the reflection of the traditional heritage of Indian sub-continent to protect that. We need to have the traditional capacities to continue our activities with the modern

understanding of the age-old traditions. For that, the initiative by Tiruchi Sivaji is appreciable and I welcome it. Thank you, very much.

(Ends)

**श्री बसावाराज पाटिल (कर्णाटक) :** माननीय उपसभापति जी, आदरणीय श्री तिरुची शिवा इस हाउस में आज जो खास Resolution लाए हैं, उसके लिए मैं कहना चाहूंगा कि वे एक बहुत महत्वपूर्ण विषय लेकर आए हैं। सरकार को इस पर बहुत गंभीरता से सोचते हुए इसके सभी पहलुओं पर विचार करना चाहिए। उन्होंने अपने अध्ययन के द्वारा यह जितना बड़ा काम किया है, उसके लिए मैं श्री तिरुची शिवा का अभिनंदन करता हूँ।

आधुनिकता के नाम पर हम अपनी वास्तविकता और कुछ परंपरागत सच्चाइयों को कितनी दूर तक नजरअंदाज कर सकते हैं और इसके क्या दुष्परिणाम होते हैं, इसके बारे में हमें गंभीरता से सोचना होगा। एक जमाने में भारत में केमिकल्स और फर्टिलाइजर्स के कारण पंजाब दुनिया का सबसे आकर्षक स्थान बना, लेकिन आज पंजाब सबसे ज्यादा कैंसर रोग पाया जाने वाला राज्य बन गया है। इस प्रकार तात्कालिक सुख के लिए, थोड़े समय के आनंद के लिए अनंतकाल के दुख को भोगना देश के हित में ठीक नहीं होगा। भारत की जो संस्कृति है, जीवन शैली है, वह उत्तम है।

उपसभापति जी, एक होती है घर की माँ, दूसरी धरती माँ और तीसरी गौ माता होती है। इन तीनों माताओं के बीच में एक अन्यान्य संबंध है, जिसके आधार पर यह सृष्टि चलती है। भारत की गाय के गोबर, भारत की गाय के गौमूत्र के द्वारा जमीन की

फर्टिलिटी बढ़ती है। घर की माँ उसके उत्पाद को यूज करती है, घर के बाल-बच्चों को और सबको दूध पिलाती है। इसके कारण जो एक सुंदर वातावरण बनता है, वह घर के लिए बहुत आनंददायक होता है। इस महत्वपूर्ण गाय की रक्षा आवश्यक है।

उपसभापति जी, हमारे देश में इसको कामधेनु कहा गया है। इसको केवल नाम के लिए कामधेनु नहीं कहा गया है, बल्कि इसलिए कहा गया है कि यह बहुत उपयोगी जंतु है। जब गाय के दूध से घी बनता है, तब उसमें ऑक्सीजन की मात्रा 47 परसेंट तक पहुंच जाती है। इतना ही नहीं, सृष्टि के अंदर गाय एकमात्र ऐसा प्राणी है, जो ऑक्सीजन लेती है और दुनिया को वापस ऑक्सीजन देती है। दूसरा अन्य कोई प्राणी ऑक्सीजन लेकर दुनिया को वापस ऑक्सीजन नहीं देता है। ऐसी कई चीजों के कारण उनके इस Resolution को रखने का समर्थन करते हुए मैं सरकार से विनती करता हूँ कि अपने देश की जो भी परंपरागत ब्रीड है, उसका जो गोबर है, जिसके अन्यान्य उपयोग के कारण अच्छा अन्न बनता है, अच्छे फल बनते हैं, अच्छी तरकारी बनती है, इन सब चीजों को छोड़कर, हमारी जेनरेशन केमिकल्स के नाम पर जो एक बरबादी की ओर चली जा रही है, उसको रोकना होगा। इसके कारण आज का अन्न खाकर हमारी सारी कमाई एक प्रकार से हॉस्पिटल को जा रही है।

(KLG/2G पर जारी)

KLG-KSK/2G/3.10

**श्री बसावाराज पाटिल (क्रमागत):** नेपाल हमारा पड़ोसी देश है, उस देश के अंदर आज भी गाय को एक राष्ट्रीय प्राणी के नाते स्वीकार किया जाता है। वहां जिस प्रकार



एक मनुष्य के ऊपर आहत करने पर जितना बड़ा अपराध माना जाता है, उतना ही बड़ा अपराध गाय के ऊपर आहत करने पर माना जाता है। हमारे देश में परंपरागत गौ की आने वाली कितनी ही रेस हैं, जैसे कि हमारे कर्णाटक में देवणी है, मलेनाडुगिड्डा है, खिलारी है, कृष्णवेड़ी है। आज इस प्रकार की अलग-अलग जाति की गौ-संपत्ति अपने देश के अंदर है, जिनका विकास होना चाहिए और जिनके आधार पर हमारा विकास होना चाहिए। इससे न केवल पैसे बचेंगे, बल्कि इंसान स्वस्थ रहेगा, आरोग्य रहेगा और आरोग्य रहने के कारण आदमी स्वस्थ रहेगा और जो पैसा रोज दवाखाने को जाता है, वह भी बचेगा। आज कैंसर, इत्यादि नाम के भयानक रोग जो अपने देश को खा रहे हैं, उससे भी हम बच सकते हैं। अपने देश की एक-एक ब्रीड की महत्ता इतनी है कि अगर आज भी वर्ल्ड में दूध का कॉम्पिटिशन होता है, तो the top two highest milk-yielding breeds in the world are Indian breeds. इसमें वर्ल्ड कॉम्पिटिशन में आंध्र प्रदेश की होंगल 49 लीटर तक दूध देती है। इस प्रकार इतिहास के पन्नों में आधुनिकता के नाम पर हम अपनी कुछ मौलिक चीजों को खो बैठे हैं। हमने अभी तक जो गलती की है, वह की है, लेकिन इसे आगे ले जाना आत्मघातक होगा। मुझे एक प्रकार से डर लगता है कि अगर इसी प्रकार का नेग्लिजेन्स रहेगा, तो शायद हमें अपनी सभी ब्रीड्स को एक एग्जिबिशन की वस्तु के रूप में देखना पड़ेगा। बाद में इसके अभाव में हम जिंदगी में कितने भी तड़पेंगे, हमारी गई हुई वह मौलिक संपत्ति हम वापस नहीं ला सकेंगे। इस प्रकार यह हाई-ब्रीड, जिसमें न आनंद है, जिसमें न आरोग्य है, जो स्वास्थ्य के लिए उपयोगी नहीं है, विश्व में यह साबित हो गया है कि भारत का ए-वन और यू-वन दूध

और उसके सभी प्रोडक्ट्स मनुष्य के स्वास्थ्य के लिए और नाना प्रकार के रोगों से मुक्ति के लिए सर्वश्रेष्ठ हैं। इन सब चीजों को जानते हुए मैं आदरणीय तिरुची शिवा जी के इस महत्वपूर्ण संकल्प का समर्थन करता हूँ।

उपसभापति जी, मैं अभी गुजरात गया था। अहमदाबाद में इसकी 12 जातियां हैं, जैसे नक्षत्र होते हैं, ऐसे 12 प्रकार हैं। एक विदेशी कंपनी वालों ने एक नंदी, he asked for Rs.8 crore to purchase that bull. वे क्या करते हैं कि उसे ले जाते हैं और सीमेन क्रॉस ब्रीड कराते हैं, उससे 80 करोड़ रुपए कमाते हैं। जैसा तिरुची शिवा जी ने कहा, जैसे मनुष्य की फीलिंग्स होती हैं, वैसे ही प्राणियों की भी फीलिंग्स होती हैं, नेचुरल ब्रीडिंग होनी चाहिए। नेचुरल ब्रीडिंग के आधार पर जो उत्पत्ति होती है, वह अनंत काल के लिए, स्वास्थ्य के लिए, अपने जीवन के सुखी जीवनयापन के लिए महत्वपूर्ण होती है। इन चीजों को ध्यान में रखते हुए हमारे देश में इन फर्टिलाइजर्स से छुट्टी लेना जरूरी है। आज जनता की तरफ से तेजी से यह आवाज आ रही है और लोग ऑर्गेनिक फूड की तरफ जा रहे हैं, ऑर्गेनिक आहार के पीछे आज लाइन लगा कर खड़े हो रहे हैं। वे कहते हैं कि हमें यह तरकारी चाहिए, हमें यह चीज चाहिए। इस प्रकार भारत की अपनी जो अनमोल संपत्ति है, जो गौ-वंश है, इसके पीछे केवल धार्मिक भावनाएं नहीं हैं। यह एक सहज बात है कि अगर मेरे कष्ट में किसी आदमी ने कोई सहायता दी, तो हम उसे याद करते हैं, उसे स्मरण करते हैं, वैसे ही एक गाय के इस देश में जन्म लेने के बाद, उसकी मृत्यु के बाद भी अगर उसे गाड़ा जाता है, तो दो साल

के अंदर जमीन से जो उसका कैमिकल एक्शन होकर निकलता है, वह लगभग आठ हजार रुपए का एक प्रकार का फर्टिलाइजर बन कर निकलता है।

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Time is over. Please conclude.

**श्री बसावाराज पाटिल:** इन चीजों को ध्यान में रखते हुए, माननीय उपसभापति जी, मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से विनती करता हूँ कि तिरुची शिवा जी के इस संकल्प को सरकार बहुत गंभीरता से ले और इस देश की अनमोल संपत्ति को बचाकर एक स्वस्थ भारत का निर्माण करने की दृष्टि से महत्वपूर्ण काम करे। मैं यही प्रार्थना करता हूँ, धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

(2H/जीएसपी-एकेजी पर आगे)

GSP-AKG/2H/3.15

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** As Mr. La. Ganesan has to catch a flight, let me call him first. Of course, Mr. Jairam Ramesh has agreed.

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** But, Sir, he should listen to me also.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** Yes, yes. He will be happy to listen to you. At least, the Chair will listen to you. Don't worry.

**SHRI LA. GANESAN (MADHYA PRADESH):** Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I thank you for the opportunity given to me. Sir, I whole-heartedly support the Resolution moved by my friend, and, hon. Member of this House, Shri

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

Tiruchi Siva. I went to him and appreciated the way the Resolution was drafted and the way he spoke while presenting the Resolution. Sir, I am here to support this Resolution. वास्तव में यह Resolution बीजेपी के मेम्बर द्वारा present किया जाना चाहिए, लेकिन अगर इसको डीएमके के मेम्बर present करते हैं, तो मुझे बहुत खुशी होती है।

Sir, I will make one or two brief points as all the points have been mentioned by Siva ji and are mentioned in the Resolution also. Sir, now-a-days, the dogs, our local, Indian dogs, swadeshi dogs, are not seen. In Tamil Nadu, we call rajapalayam dog or kombai dog, which is very watchful, and which is a traditional one. Now-a-days in houses also, the pet dogs are there. They never bark, they never bite but they are called dogs. This is the position everywhere.

Let us take the example of a variety of rice seed, *Japonica Indica*. It is a cross-breed between the *videshi* seed and Indian seed. We eat that rice, and, so, in our blood also, already the *videshi* and *swadeshi* are mixed. In the same way, as he rightly mentioned, there are cows and the bulls. Our Ongole bull, Kangayam bull, or, even Sindhi also, are not prevalent now-a-days. Gradually, they are decreasing now. Only to get more milk artificially, we are bringing more and more jersey cows and other cows. Already Mr.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

Siva has mentioned about the capacity of the milk, the strength of the milk, and the protein content of the milk. Sir, we all are consuming that. Gradually, a day will come when you won't be able to call yourself an Indian. When everything is mixed, our blood will also be mixed blood. Only *swadeshi* will not be there in our blood. So, I think, a very important point has been mentioned by Mr. Siva, and, I agree with him.

Sir, as far as Jallikattu is concerned, it is a blessing in disguise. The main thing was to give permission to conduct Jallikattu. Of course, with the efforts of the State Governments and with the cooperation of the hon. Prime Minister and the Central Government, we were successful in conducting Jallikattu. Sir, what has happened is that, *saath-saath*, an awareness has come in the people of Tamil Nadu, particularly, kisans, students and youngsters, that they have to protect our swadeshi cows, swadeshi bulls. That is an important thing. Now, immediately after all this, Mr. Siva has moved this Resolution. So, Sir, once again, I say that I whole-heartedly support this Resolution. Sir, Jallikattu is observed for only one day in a year. For all the other 364 days, the bull is maintained only for breeding, for production just as the indigenous cows. This is the most important aspect. We don't simply want to protect the celebration of Jallikattu but the

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

maintaining of the cows for that purpose is very important. This has created awareness in Tamil Nadu. That is why, I whole-heartedly support this move. There are some things which people are not aware of. They should be properly educated. The *kisans* or other people grow their cows or bulls in their houses but after some time, after a particular age, when that animal is not useful for ploughing, or, if some cows are there, which are not able to give milk, then, they sell it. As he himself rightly mentioned, now-a-days, it has been found that if only the urine and the dung of these animals are properly maintained, it can give more income to the *kisan* than what he can get from the cows that give milk. (Contd. by SK/2J)

SK/2J/3.20

**SHRI LA. GANESAN (CONTD.):** This has been proved beyond doubt. Awareness should be created among the *kisan* also. One more thing is that transportation of cows also is very cruel. I also demand, it is not mentioned in it, that transportation of the cows should be stopped. Most of the cows and bulls are transported to Kerala for butchering. That should also be stopped. Also, the cows are transported in a very inhuman way.

**MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN:** There are more incidents of cancer in Kerala because of that, I am telling you.

**SHRI LA. GANESAN:** That is why in one short sentence, I would say in Tamil, '*nattai padukakka vendum, aanal mattaiyum padukakka vendum.*'

(Ends)

**SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH (TAMIL NADU):** Thank you, Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir. We all really stand with the farmers and also the traditional way of ploughing by farmers in our place, especially in our State of Tamil Nadu, which is actually a State of agriculture. People, mainly our forefathers, they all depended only on agriculture as their main source of income. So, as I come from an agrarian State, I do want to put forth my views. First of all, I have to thank the Central Government on behalf of people of Tamil Nadu for early clearance of the Jallikattu Bill, which paved the way for the conduct of Jallikattu this year in the State. As rightly pointed out here by my colleague, the organic farming has to be promoted in the nation as general. Cattle manure has been traditionally used in India as a fertilizer, which has been clearly brought out here.

**(THE VICE-CHAIRMAN, SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA, in the Chair)**

I also want to state here that Tamil Nadu being the first in agriculture industry, our then hon. Chief Minister, a mass leader and our revered, Dr. *Puratchi Thalaivi Amma*, set up five model villages to promote organic

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

farming. Tamil Nadu will boast of its eco-friendly organic villages. As part of its efforts to promote organic farming, the Tamil Government, under the dynamic leadership of our late leader, hon. *Puratchi Thalaivi Amma*, announced five model organic villages in Vellore, Erode, Dharmapuri, Tiruvannamalai and Krishnagiri districts. The eco-friendly initiative was taken to strengthen the integrated pest management, that is, 150 eco-friendly villages were set up in the State. She made this announcement in the wake of concerns over the deterioration of organic content in the soil. A programme under the Centre's National Mission for Sustainable Agriculture would ensure the villages to adopt no-pesticide, no-insecticide concept to promote organic farming. Based on these pilot projects, a number of villages were raised. She also announced seven new liquid bio fertilizer production units and two organic fertilizer testing units besides a laboratory complex in the Department of Organic Agriculture at the Tamil Nadu Agriculture University. Incidentally, out of 17,500 fertilizer samples tested by the fertilizer control laboratories in the State, 635 samples were found to be non-standard and legal action was initiated against the defaulters. Another major announcement which the Government made under the leadership of



**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

hon. *Puratchi Thalaivi Amma* was selling of *Amma* seeds. *Amma* seed was proposed and *Amma* outlets were formed across the State.

(Contd. by YSR/2K)

-SK/YSR-RPM/3.25/2K

**SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH (CONTD.):** In a bid to encourage farmers to use high quality certified seeds, the Government set up *Amma* Seed Agency by coordinating with the Government Seed Farms, Seed Production Units and farmers. The agency was set up with adequate staff at Rs. 156.74 crore. The quality seeds produced here will be supplied as *Amma* seeds through *Amma* outlets at reasonable rates. This is one part of the Tamil Nadu Government's efforts to intensify grain production for the fiscal year. Despite poor monsoon, grain production stood at 110,00,000 tonne per year. Despite the monsoon failure, the grain production shot up thanks to the farmers who switched to millet cultivation instead of water-intensive paddy crop.

I also wanted to put forth here one thing which is about the traditional ploughing methods used by farmers. Why have they gradually reduced using them? Why have they started using tractors which run on diesel? Because that was time-consuming and the farmers wanted to speed up the

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

process. Earlier when they used to start ploughing the field in the morning, it used to go on up to two o'clock or three o'clock. Now everything is about time management. This is the ground reality.

Coming from farming background, I know this. Earlier, many people from rural areas used to come to do all kinds of jobs like ploughing the field and weeding. Nowadays we don't get people for these jobs. Why? Because it is time-consuming. The traditional way of ploughing the field used to take a lot of time. Gradually, people started using tractors. That also should be looked into.

Bulls are part and parcel of our life. We rear them as our children and we take care of them. Then they are used for bull-taming sport. It is our tradition. It is a heritage of Tamil tradition. These bulls were fed like a child. They were fed all good things. They were happily kept at home.

In Spanish bull fighting, bulls are killed. But here bulls are pampered. We only rear them for keeping up with our tradition and culture. Jallikattu has become a part and parcel of our life. After the Government passed the legislation, it is going to be a regular event in our State.

Use of cow dung is a natural way of improving soil health. It enhances soil fertility. This way we can reduce the use of fertilizers and pesticides.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

The use of cow dung, which is popularly known as gobar gas, gives healthier and more fertile soil. We have to take a turn from here to there. But the main thing is that people have gradually stopped using traditional ploughing methods. Now the people have become aware of time management and they want more things to be done in a short duration.

(Contd. by VKK/2L)

-YSR/VKK/2L/3.30

**SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH (CONTD.):** The ground reality is that we don't get farmers. Why? Improve farming methods and encourage farming among people. Minimum support price is not there. There is frequent monsoon failure. So, there was no harvest and many people lost their paddy. They lost their crops. It was burnt. So, we are looking forward in this regard. We want the farming community to be lifted up. We have to encourage farming. We have to give them proper education. Give them proper techniques and give them more. Most of the farming community leave farming because they don't get what they have invested in it. So, they move out. They sell their lands. If it is in city, they sell their land for exorbitant rates and real estate owners benefit. Then, what happens to farming? In a

few years, or in another 10-20 years, we will have money but where will be food?

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** Please conclude now.

**SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH:** So, we have to make improvement in the whole thing. Improve farming methods and give them latest techniques and methods. We have to encourage farming. We have to give them Minimum Support Price and give them whatever they have spent. It has to be profitable for the farmers. Farming should become more profitable. That is the main thing. I support it and I also congratulate him. A battle has begun. The view of the Central Government should be as to how to improve agriculture in India and how to improve the living standards of farmers in India and how to make farming community more blessed in this country. Thank you so much.

(Ends)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** Thank you. Next speaker is Mr. B.K. Hariprasad.

**SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD (KARNATAKA):** Thank you, Vice-Chairman, Sir. I rise to support the Resolution moved by Mr. Siva on agrarian issues. Sir, as

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

you know, in this country, almost 65 per cent of the population is involved in agricultural activity. In terms of contribution to the GDP, agriculture may not contribute more than 20 per cent, but in terms of the employment generation, it contributes almost 54 per cent. When compared to the service sector, agriculture contributes almost 54 per cent and employment generation of service sector, I think, is around 18 per cent. Mr. Siva has moved this Resolution and it is regarding the agricultural activities. We all know this. It is an age-old practice. Animals and human beings co-exist in this world and in this country. Especially India being a vast country with diversity, we have seen different types of culture all over. Right from Kashmir to Kanyakumari and from Narmada to Brahmaputra, we have seen how animals and human beings co-exist. If you talk about animals, especially Mr. Siva was talking about Jallikattu, of course, farmers are also human beings. They also need some recreation and entertainment. As I said, animals and human beings co-exist. They love their animals. When I see here, they talk of cow and bull. I come from the coastal part of Karnataka where the agricultural activities are mainly dependent upon buffaloes. We groom buffaloes; we love buffaloes. During the non-agricultural season, they have a buffalo race called *Kambala*, where in a muddy slushy field, there will

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

be buffalo races with pairs of buffalo tied to ploughs. Really, it is one of the oldest traditions of Karnataka, especially in the coastal belt. It is a 900-year old tradition which has been practised.

(Contd. by BHS/2M)

-VKK/BHS-VNK/2M/3.35

**SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD (CONTD.):** When it comes to buffaloes, I can see, in this country, discrimination is a part of life. Whereas the cow is protected very well, buffaloes are totally neglected. Sir, I was shocked about PETA. I believe in non-violence on any kind of animals whether it is cow, buffalo or chicken or whatever it is. I believe in that but when it comes to horses, horse is also a part of the agricultural activities but in most of the places, especially, in Delhi and Bangalore, there are huge horse races. The jockey sits on the horse, whips the horse but no PETA goes there because it is the sport of the elite. When it comes to the sports of the farmers, definitely, these PETA or whatever the organisations, they raise objections whether it is *Jallikattu* or *Kambala*. Sir, for *Jallikattu*, as Shrimati Vijila and Mr. Siva said, they groom the bulls with love and affection as we groom the buffaloes with love and affection. We do not treat them as enemies or treat them cruelly. All the 365 days, we groom them, we feed them and only once

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

in a year, after the completion of agricultural activities, as a kind of sport, we encourage these farmers. Unfortunately, it was banned almost ten years back. Mr. Oscar is the patron of this *Kambala* sport in Udupi and Mangalore. He knows pretty well better than me. These animals contribute to the development of the region. As we all know, today, India is the largest producer of milk in the world. That is because we protect and groom these animals whether it is buffaloes, cows or bulls. It is not *Jallikattu* alone or buffalo race or the horse races, even as Bhaskarji said, the cock fights. In some places we have goat fights. All these animals also need some sports. I think there should not be any objection to this. I thank Mr. Jairam Ramesh for giving me permission to speak before him because I have to catch a flight. So my support is to Mr. Siva regarding this. There should not be discrimination against buffaloes because it does not mean that we should only protect cows. Buffaloes are also a part of our life and the milk of buffaloes has got more protein than the cow. It should also be protected. ... (Interruptions)... I do not go into the religious aspect. Sir, as you know, even in Assam the goat fights are there. We have been seeing. So, I think, what Mr. Siva has moved is a commendable Resolution. I think the

Government should come out and support this. Thank you very much, Sir.

(Ends)

**श्री मेघराज जैन (मध्य प्रदेश) :** आदरणीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, तिरुची शिवा जी ने जो संकल्प प्रस्तुत किया है, वह वास्तव में स्वागत योग्य है। उन्होंने अपने उद्बोधन में संपूर्ण बात यानी सभी विषयों को लिया है। मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय कृषि मंत्री जी का ध्यान इस ओर आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ कि किसान के लिए गाय और बैल इसलिए आवश्यक है, क्योंकि खेत का wastage बैल खाए, गाय खाए और गाय का wastage खेत खाए ताकि इससे किसान की लागत कम हो जाए। यह आवश्यक है और हमने यह प्रयोग करके देखा है। जैविक कृषि के लिए गोबर आवश्यक है, जब कि आज हमारी स्थिति यह हो रही है कि हमारी भूमि खराब हो रही है, जैव विविधता नष्ट हो रही है, प्रदूषण बढ़ रहा है, हमारा जल प्रदूषित हो रहा है, रासायनिक कीटनाशक और रासायनिक खाद के कारण अनाज प्रदूषित हो रहा है और उसके कारण अनेक बीमारियां हो रही हैं। अगर जैविक खाद का प्रयोग किया जाए, तो हम इन सब बीमारियों से बच सकते हैं, स्वस्थ रह सकते हैं और अपने पशुओं को बचा सकते हैं। इसके साथ ही हम इस तरह से किसान की लागत कम कर सकते हैं। ये सब इसके वैज्ञानिक कारण हैं और केन्द्र सरकार के जो अनुसंधान केन्द्र हैं, वहां के वैज्ञानिकों ने इसके बारे में अनुसंधान किया है। जिस समय मैं करनाल के अनुसंधान केन्द्र में था, उस समय जब वहां पर एक युवा वैज्ञानिक बोलने के लिए खड़ा हुआ, तो जिन्होंने यहां पर Jersey और Holstein लाने का विचार किया था, जो रिटायर हो गए थे, उनके पैर छू



कर उन्होंने कहा कि सर, मैं आपका बहुत सम्मान करता हूँ, आप हमारे गुरु हैं, पर अगर मेरा वश चलता, तो मैं आपको फांसी पर लटका देता।

(2एन/एनकेआर-आरएल पर जारी)

NKR-RL/2N/3.40

**श्री मेघराज जैन (क्रमागत) :** मैं वहां उस कार्यक्रम में मौजूद था। उन्होंने कहा कि जो जरसी का दूध और Holstein का दूध है, वह देश के लिए घातक है और बीमारी का कारण है। गेहूं के बारे में अनुसंधान करने वाले वैज्ञानिकों ने कहा कि अगर गाय का मूत्र, बैल का मूत्र, पानी के साथ खेतों में दिया जाए तो हमारी गेहूं की फसल अच्छी होगी। गन्ने पर रिसर्च करने वाले वैज्ञानिकों का कहना है कि गन्ने के खेत में अगर गौमूत्र का पानी दिया जाए तो गन्ना लंबा होगा, मोटा होगा और मीठा होगा। उसमें शक्कर ज्यादा होगी। ऐसा वैज्ञानिकों ने कहा है। मेरा कहना है कि वैज्ञानिकों की एक कमेटी गठित करके कृषि मंत्री जी इस बारे में देखें।

आज हिन्दुस्तान के अंदर लगभग 200 गौशालाएं ऐसी हैं, जहां गौमूत्र पर आधारित औषधियां बन रही हैं। मनुष्य उनका लाभ ले रहे हैं। मैं स्वयं, जब मेरी तबियत खराब होती है या जरूरत पड़ती है तो गौमूत्र का सेवन करता हूँ। अनेक लोग गौमूत्र का सेवन करते हैं। गौमूत्र पर आधारित हमारे यहां अनेक गौशालाएं चल रही हैं, जो किसी अनुदान पर आश्रित नहीं हैं। इसलिए मेरा निवेदन है कि समग्र रूप से गाय के बारे में, बैलों के बारे में हम ध्यान केन्द्रित करें। आज देश में हम जितना कीटनाशक प्रयोग करते हैं, उससे हमारा पानी खराब हो रहा है। गौमूत्र के प्रयोग में कुछ लगता नहीं है। यदि

गाय का मूत्र एकत्रित किया जाए और इसके साथ हमारे किसान नीम, करंज के पत्ते, सीताफल के पत्ते, बेशर्म के पत्ते, धतूरे के पत्ते और थोड़ा आकरा डालकर, उबालकर, उसका कीटनाशक बना लें, फिर कोई दूसरा कीटनाशक डालने की जरूरत नहीं है। इसे हमारा किसान अपने घर में तैयार करके पैसा बचा सकता है और हमें प्रदूषण से भी मुक्ति मिल सकती है। इसलिए मेरा निवेदन है कि तिरुची शिवा जी ने जो संकल्प सदन में प्रस्तुत किया है, उनके संकल्प पर गम्भीरता से विचार करने की आवश्यकता है। अभी हमारे यहां वलसाड के पास वागलधारा नामक एक स्थान है, जहां कैंसर का निशुल्क उपचार पंच-द्रव्यों से होता है। वहां लोगों की भारी भीड़ लगी रहती है। वैसे ही बीकानेर में पंच-द्रव्यों का प्रयोग करके एक अस्पताल खोलने की तैयारी चल रही है। इसके अलावा टाटा मैमोरियल कैंसर अस्पताल में भी इस पर प्रयोग हुआ और पाया गया कि जो लोग गौमूत्र का सेवन करते थे, उनका हीमोग्लोबिन कीमोथेरेपी के बाद भी गिरता नहीं है। इसलिए इन सब चीजों पर वैज्ञानिक आधार पर अनुसंधान सरकार द्वारा कराया जाना चाहिए। जहां प्राइवेट लोग यह काम करते हैं, उस पर कई लोग विश्वास करते हैं, कुछ नहीं करते हैं। इसलिए मेरा माननीय कृषि मंत्री जी से निवेदन है कि इन सभी लोगों की एक कमेटी बनाई जाए। कानपुर गौशाला में, हमारे तोशनीवाल जी ने ऐसा यंत्र बनाया है, जो काम एक tractor करता है, वे सारे काम बैलों को चलाकर उस यंत्र से किए जा सकते हैं। बैल से बिजली पैदा की जा सकती है, बैल से चक्की चलाई जा सकती है, बैल से श्रैशर चलाए जा सकते हैं। हमारी जो केन्द्र सरकार की कृषियंत्र निर्माण से संबंधित कार्यशालाएं हैं, वहां उसी प्रकार के यंत्र बनने चाहिए और किसानों

को वे यंत्र दिए जाने चाहिए ताकि हमारे बैल भी सुरक्षित रहें, किसान की लागत भी कम आए और जैविक कृषि भी हम गोबर से कर सकें। इन सारे कामों को करने के लिए मैं कृषि मंत्री जी से निवेदन करता हूँ और तिरुची शिवा जी ने जो संकल्प सदन में रखा है, मैं उसका अनुमोदन करते हुए निवेदन करता हूँ कि उन्होंने कृषि मंत्री जी से जो सिफारिश की है, उस सिफारिश में मैं उनका साथ देता हूँ। मुझे ईर्ष्या हो रही है कि ऐसा संकल्प मुझे यहां रखना चाहिए था, लेकिन उन्होंने इसे सदन में रखा। काश मुझे इसे यहां रखने का मौका मिलता। इन शब्दों के साथ मैं उनका अभिनंदन करता हूँ और संकल्प का समर्थन करता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (KARNATAKA):** Sir, I rise to oppose Mr. Tiruchi Siva's Bill. Mr. Tiruchi Siva is an old friend of mine. He has also gained Parliamentary fame for his Private Member's Bill. His earlier Private Member's Bill created history. But before I speak on his Bill, let me say straightway....

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** It is a Resolution and not a Bill. ...(Interruptions)...  
Mine is a Resolution and not a Bill.

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** Sir, before I speak on his Bill....

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** No; you have to speak on the Resolution.

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** Let me say straightway that all my life I have been inspired by Silappadikaram, Manimekalai and Thirukkural. My wife is a Tamilian and I am as much a Tamilian as *Amma* was. If *Amma* was a Tamilian, I am also a Tamilian. So, I am a great admirer and a student of Tamil history and Tamil culture. I myself have written a number of articles on the Tamil Nadu model of development which is far superior to the Gujarat model of development.

(Contd. by DC/20)

-RL/DC-DS/20/3.45

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (CONTD.):** So, I want to say this. What I am now going to say, I am sure, will not appeal to many of my friends here in the House because the objective of Mr. Siva is not animal welfare. The objective of Mr. Siva is not organic farming. यहाँ गलती से कृषि मंत्री को बिठाया गया है, असली निशाना तो पर्यावरण मंत्री हैं। पर्यावरण मंत्री को यहाँ ...(व्यवधान)...

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** You cannot decide about my intention...  
...(Interruptions)...

**श्री जयराम रमेश :** निगाहें और कहीं, निशाना और कहीं! His real objective is not organic farming. His real objective is not improving agricultural practice. His real objective is not animal welfare. His real objective is to bring back

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

Jallikattu. That is his real objective. Mr. Tiruchi Siva has given 16 reasons for improvement in Indian agriculture and Radha Mohan Singhji will agree with all of them. I also agree with all of them. Organic farming must be promoted. केमिकल फर्टिलाइजर्स के इस्तेमाल पर कुछ नियंत्रण होना चाहिए। Traditional agricultural practices should be encouraged. इसमें कोई दो रायें नहीं हो सकती हैं। Farm mechanization should not destroy the animal economy. I agree with it 100 per cent. My friend Basawaraj Patilji said that cow is a *Kamadhenu*. Yes; cow is a *Kamadhenu*. We should protect, preserve and worship this *Kamadhenu* along with the other dark *Kamadhenu*, the buffalo, which is, unfortunately, neglected in our society. So I agree with all that has been said, but, to do all this, जैन साहब, सुनिए। आपका मकसद सही है, पर आपके मकसद को पाने के लिए शिवा जी क्या करना चाहते हैं? ये Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act में संशोधन लाना चाहते हैं। यह अजीब-सी बात है! ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री मेघराज जैन :** मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि जो पशु क्रूरता निवारण अधिनियम है, उसमें केवल 200 और 250 रुपये तक का जुर्माना है। मैं सात साल तक गोसंवर्धन बोर्ड का अध्यक्ष रहा हूँ और मैं जानता हूँ कि लोग इस अधिनियम का किस प्रकार से दुरुपयोग करते हैं। उसके अंतर्गत लोग इतने बैल और गाय हत्या करने के लिए ले जाते हैं, लेकिन उनके ऊपर कोई कार्रवाई नहीं होती है, इसलिए उसमें संशोधन होना चाहिए।

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** Sir, may I continue? The Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960, यह कैसे बना? मुझे अफसोस है कि शिवा जी ने इस ऐक्ट का गौर से विश्लेषण या अध्ययन नहीं किया। राज्य सभा की एक नॉमिनेटेड मेम्बर हुआ करती थीं, जो एक मशहूर महिला थीं और उनका नाम रुक्मिणी देवी अरुंडेल था।  
...(व्यवधान)...

**कृषि मंत्री (श्री राधा मोहन सिंह) :** सर, हमारी एक मीटिंग है, इसलिए मैं अभी जा रहा हूँ। हमारे राज्य मंत्री यहाँ बैठे हैं, मैं फिर आ जाऊँगा।

**श्री जयराम रमेश :** सर, सन् 1952 से लेकर सन् 1962 तक रुक्मिणी देवी जी नॉमिनेटेड मेम्बर रहीं। Rukmini Devi Arundale, a pure blooded Tamilian, was a Nominated Member of this House from 1952 to 1962. She moved a Private Members' Bill that India must have an Act for prevention of cruelty to animals. उन्होंने उस प्राइवेट मेम्बर्स बिल को पेश किया। उस समय के प्रधान मंत्री, पंडित नेहरू उससे बहुत प्रभावित हुए और उन्होंने रुक्मिणी देवी जी से यह निवेदन किया कि आप यह बिल withdraw कीजिए, सरकार एक कानून बनाएगी। तब सन् 1960 में Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960 बना। संविधान के कुछ प्रावधान थे और उन प्रावधानों के तहत वह ऐक्ट बनाया गया।

(2पी/एमसीएम-केआर पर जारी)

MCM-KR/2P/3.50

**श्री जयराम रमेश (क्रमागत) :** अब तिरुची शिवा जी क्या करना चाहते हैं? तिरुची शिवा जी इस एक्ट में संशोधन लाना चाहते हैं और वे क्या संशोधन लाना चाहते हैं? इन्होंने कहा है : Bull must be removed from the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. Why? Because bull must be trained; and bull must be equipped for agriculture. I want to inform my friend, he can do all these things without amending the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. Now, all that you have said in the Resolution about bulls, I agree with. But my difference with you is this. The State Government is fully empowered. All States are fully empowered to pass their own laws for improving the quality of livestock. You don't need to amend the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. The Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act is to prevent cruelty. It is not meant to train bulls. It is not meant to improve the milk yield. It is not meant to improve organic agriculture. It is meant to prevent cruelty to animals. That's it. ..(Interruptions).. I will take two minutes and conclude. The Tamil Nadu Assembly had passed the Tamil Nadu Animal Preservation Act, 1958; and most States have passed Animal Preservation Acts because according to Entry 15, List-II of the Indian Constitution, it says, "State is responsible for preservation, protection and improvement of animal stock and

prevention of animal disease.” यानी कि राज्य सरकार का पूरा अधिकार है कानून बनाने के लिए, उत्पादकता बढ़ाने के लिए। Why doesn't the State Government amend the Tamil Nadu Animal Preservation Act, 1958 to fulfill the 16 objectives that you want to fulfill through your amendment to the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act? सर, मैं जल्लीकट्टू में नहीं पड़ना चाहता हूँ। यह बहुत भावुक मुद्दा बन गया है। मैं साफ कर देना चाहता हूँ, जो मैं यहां कह रहा हूँ, वह मैं यहां व्यक्तिगत रूप में कह रहा हूँ, क्योंकि मेरी पार्टी ने भी यह स्टैंड लिया है कि जल्लीकट्टू होना चाहिए पर मैं जल्लीकट्टू के विरोध में रहा हूँ। मैं जब पर्यावरण मंत्री था, तभी मैंने यह निर्णय लिया था कि जल्लीकट्टू पर प्रतिबंध लगाना चाहिए। सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने मेरे निर्णय को सही बताया। पर बाद में बहुत कुछ चला और वह जल्लीकट्टू का चैप्टर अब बंद हो चुका है, उसको मैं नहीं खोलना चाहता हूँ। अभी तमिलनाडु को पूरा अधिकार है कि साल के एक दिन में जल्लीकट्टू बनाने का और कोई नहीं रोक सकता, कानून नहीं रोक सकता। पर उसके बाद अब यह बिल लाना मुझे नहीं पता चलता कि इसका मकसद क्या है? जल्लीकट्टू आज भी हो सकता है, आज के कानून के आधार पर! Let me translate it for you. According to the laws of the land passed by this Government with the cooperation of all parties Jallikattu is permitted. Now, what do you hope by amending the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act? I fail to understand. There is nothing. Let me say once again very clearly, please read the Act. There is nothing in the Act that prohibits the State



Government from doing any of the 16 things that you wanted. There is nothing in the Act.

(Continued by 2Q/KS)

KS-SC/2Q/3.55

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (contd.):** The Act only prevents cruelty. How can you remove a bull? Tomorrow, you would start removing animal after animal and you would not have any Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act! So, why do you want to remove only the bull? The reason why you want to remove the bull is that it is because of *jallikattu*. But on *jallikattu* you have already got the Government pass an Ordinance. That Ordinance became a law; the Assembly approved it. *Jallikattu* can now be performed. Fourteen people have died because of *jallikattu* this year. उसके बारे में कोई शोक व्यक्त नहीं करता है। 14 व्यक्ति मारे गए हैं, जल्लिकट्टू की वजह से, लेकिन उसका कोई ज़िक्र नहीं होता है। वह सब छोड़िए, ये छोटी-छोटी बातें हैं। आप जल्लिकट्टू कर सकते हैं, धूम-धाम से मना सकते हैं, लेकिन इस कानून में संशोधन क्यों लाना चाहते हैं? Sir, Mr. Tiruchi Siva is a very, very close friend of mine. Our friendship goes back many years. I agree with the 16 reasons that he has given for his Resolution. But I disagree with the conclusion of this Resolution. The 16 reasons -- Sudarshan Bhagatji is here -- आपके लिए हैं, लेकिन ये जो दो तीर

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

अंत में इन्होंने मारे हैं, वे आपके लिए नहीं हैं क्योंकि उसका और इन्होंने यह जो विश्लेषण किया है, इन दोनों के बीच में कोई संबंध नहीं है। So, I request Mr. Siva not to persist with this Resolution; Rather, he should persist with putting pressure on the Government to promote organic farming, to promote animal welfare, to improve animal productivity, to improve dairying, to protect indigenous breeds, to protect indigenous varieties and so on. He should not persist with this folly of amending the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960, which has stood this country well.

Sir, when passing this Bill in 1960, Rukmani Devi had said, “The test of a civilized society is how it treats its animals.” If Mr. Tiruchi Siva’s amendments are approved, I am afraid, we would have opened the doors for becoming an uncivilized society.

(Ends)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** Thank you. Shri D. Raja. You have only two minutes.

**SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU):** Sir, at the outset, I congratulate our colleague, Mr. Tiruchi Siva, for this Resolution.

What is the essence of this Resolution? The essence is to urge upon the Government to:-

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

(a) suitably amend the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960, which has been referred to by my colleague, Shri Jairam Ramesh, to exempt bulls from the application of provisions that restrict their utility and training for various purposes by use of various techniques to train them to perform agricultural tasks such as ploughing and transportation;

(b) include the amended Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960, in the Ninth Schedule to the Constitution of India; and

(c) take steps to encourage and incentivise the use of indigenous cattle for agricultural purposes and improve their health and stock.”

This is the essence of the Resolution, Sir.

Before making my observations, I must salute the youth of Tamil Nadu, the students who came together and gave a collective expression to the aspirations of the Tamil people on the issue of *jallikattu*. Yes, this Resolution does have a context. It has reference to the recent events in Tamil Nadu where people wanted *jallikattu*; all political parties wanted *jallikattu*. The youth came together and stood by what they believed in. It is a part of the Tamil culture. It is a part of the Tamil tradition.

(CONTD. BY RSS/2R)

RSS/2R/4.00/

**SHRI D.RAJA (CONTD.):** India is a country with tremendous diversities, India is a country of composite culture, and this Tamil culture must be understood in a proper historic perspective, and appreciated. That is how the young people stood together and fought for jallikattu. Sir, let us understand that jallikattu became a turning point in the polity of Tamil Nadu, in the polity of the whole country, and it has made tremendous impact on the thinking of political parties and politicians in this country, and the young people of Tamil Nadu. They did not stop with jallikattu only. They said, "Let us say no to Pepsicola. Let us promote indigenous drinks." This is what the young people of Tamil Nadu declared. They said, "Come on, let us say no to Pepsicola. Why should we promote such drinks? We can promote indigenous drinks." That is a campaign going on. Now, she spoke. She is from that district. Thamirabarni river is there, and even I have my own understanding of law. The court, somehow, allowed the Cola company and other companies to take huge amount of water. So, what is going to happen to our water resources? So, we are talking about cattle. Yes, we should increase the population of our cattle. Our cattle population should increase,

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

and we should also protect and preserve our water bodies and water sources.

Having said that, Sir, now, I take the point what our friend, Mr. Jairam Ramesh, has touched upon. Yes, it is 1960 law, and yes, we should be worried about cruelty to animals, cruelty to human beings, and we should be worried on both counts. But, what do you mean by cruelty to animals? That is the point. I can be more objective than Mr. Jairam Ramesh. I do not own land. I do not own cattle. So, I can be more objective. What do you mean by cruelty to animals? Because, I see in Tamil Nadu in the houses of farmers, agriculture workers, cattle are there around. Cows, bulls, buffalos, they are all living as family members. They live within house premises, and they take care of these animals. This jallikattu is a sport; it is a game only at the time of Pongal festival which is the main festival of Tamil people. During that period also, people decorate these cattle, cows, bulls and buffalos. They give them good bath; they paint their horns; they garland them, they take them around, and they treat them as human beings that way. They are all family members. They are all family animals. So, let us not get into that argument as though it is cruelty to animals. What do we mean by cruelty? That is the point, and that is where the case went to the Supreme Court, that is where

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

the case went to the court, the Judiciary, and that is where the State Government had to intervene in the situation, and the State Government had to take the opinion of all political parties. That is where the elected State Legislative Assembly had to take up this issue, and had to pass its own law in the State Legislative Assembly. So, we are a country who believe in the rule of law; we are a country having our own Constitution, we should respect our Constitution. That is why, there is an Act called the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. This is an Act of the Parliament, and if there is a need to amend this Act of Parliament, this Parliament is supreme; this Parliament is competent to do that. That is why, my friend, Mr. Tiruchi Siva, has brought this issue for the consideration of this Parliament.

(contd. by 2s/KGG)

KGG-HMS/2S/4.05

**SHRI D. RAJA (contd.):** We will have to stand by the rule of law. I go by Mr. Jairam Ramesh. Why should we have an Act of Parliament? Why should we have Constitution? Why should we have Judiciary? We are bound by Parliament Acts. This Parliament Act needs certain Amendments in a changed situation, at a time when we need to acknowledge and appreciate the great diversities of our country. This law needs certain appropriate

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

Amendments. That is why he has brought this up. It is for the Government to take this in a proper perspective. This Parliament has to consider this. I am saying that it is not only for Tamil Nadu. Tomorrow, it can be for some other State also; maybe, for Karnataka or for some other States. After all, we are a civilized country and we can't have a kind of authoritarian rule. We have to go by certain laws. The civilized society, the civilized nation needs civilized laws. That is where this Act needs certain Amendments at this point of time.

Once again, I salute the young people of Tamil Nadu who have given a proper expression to the aspirations and to the cultural values of Tamil Nadu. It applies to all parts of our country, to all the young people. We will have to come forward taking up such issues in the interest of the country and its progress. I appreciate this Resolution. I urge upon the Government to give due consideration to this Resolution. Thank you.

(Ends)

**महंत शम्भुप्रसादजी तुंदिया (गुजरात) :** उपसभापति जी, आदरणीय तिरुची शिवा जी जो संकल्प लेकर आए हैं, उसके संदर्भ में इस सदन में सभी ने अपनी बात रखने का प्रयत्न किया है। मैं भी इस संदर्भ में अपने मन के विचार से जुड़ी कुछ बातें यहां रखना चाहूंगा।

महोदय, शिवा जी द्वारा यह संकल्प पेश किए जाने के संबंध में उनका ध्येय क्या है, इस बारे में श्री जयराम रमेश जी ने बताया कि उनका ध्येय कुछ और है और यहां बिल में संशोधन लाने के लिए ध्येय, पशु पर क्रूरता के संदर्भ में कुछ और बताया जा रहा है। महोदय, भारतीय परम्परा में कृषि और ऋषि की संस्कृति को बहुत महत्व दिया गया है और हमारे यहां कृषि और ऋषि आधारित संस्कृति पर देश और गांव जी रहे हैं। महोदय, कृषि के आधार पर जीने वाले लोग गाय को मानते हैं, पूजते हैं और हमारे शास्त्रों में तो गाय के लिए "गावो विश्वस्य मातरः" कहा गया है, मतलब गाय पूरे विश्व की माता है। महोदय, गाय का दूध संपूर्ण आहार की श्रृंखला में आता है। उसके गोखल के सेवन से मानव जीवन को बहुत आरोग्य मिलता है। इस से लगभग 75 प्रकार के रोग नष्ट हो जाते हैं। आज के जमाने में ऑर्गेनिक फूड और जहां हम chemical fertilizers का उपयोग करते हैं, उससे हमें शुद्ध, सात्विक खाद्य पदार्थ नहीं मिलते जब कि गाय के गोबर के प्रयोग से अच्छे खाद्य और सब्जी मिलती है। मगर जैसा कि आदरणीय जयराम रमेश जी ने बताया, उसके संदर्भ में मैं इस सदन के माध्यम से कुछ और बात रखना चाहता हूं। मैं गुजरात से आता हूं। हमारे यहां एक मंदिर में कुछ महीने पहले एक हाथी को permission लेकर पाला गया, लेकिन उसे केवल पालने के लिए नहीं पाला गया था, हाथी को गणपति का अवतार मानने वाले लोगों ने गणपति को भगवान मानते हुए उसकी पूजा करने के लिए वहां रखा था। अब उसके ऊपर वहां पशु क्रूरता अधिनियम के अंतर्गत एक केस हो गया। उस समय मेरे ध्यान में एक किस्सा और आया। महोदय, हम घोड़े का प्रयोग बग्घी के लिए करते हैं और यहां जो पशुओं की बात करते हैं, उन



पर क्रूरता के संदर्भ में बात रखते हैं, तो मैं यह कहना चाहूंगा कि हमारी भारतीय परंपरा में, भारतीय जीवन पद्धति और ज्ञान में धर्म शास्त्रों में लिखा गया है कि ...

(2 टी/एएससी पर जारी)

ASC-KLS/4.10/2T

**महंत शम्भुप्रसादजी तुंदिया (क्रमागत) :** 84 लाख प्रकार की योनियों के जीव इस धरती पर पनपते हैं। मनुष्य के अलावा उनमें जितने भी जीव हैं, उनकी चार कोटि में अलग-अलग प्रकार से गणना की गई है। हम लोग जब पशुओं की बात करते हैं, तो पशुओं के संदर्भ में वन्य जीवन के आधार पर रहने वाले पशुओं की अलग बात है और मानव द्वारा परिपालित होने वाले पशुओं का उपयोग होता है। यहां गाय का उपयोग होता है, बैलों का उपयोग होता है, भैसों का उपयोग होता है, भेड़-बकरियों का उपयोग होता है। भेड़ों का ऊन के लिए उपयोग होता है, इसलिए हम उसका परिपालन करते हैं। हम बकरियों को भी पालते हैं और हम यहां यातायात के प्रयोग हेतु घोड़ों को भी पालते हैं। हम यहां इस तरह के विचार के लिए इकट्ठा होकर यह सोच रहे हैं और आदरणीय शिवा जी ने जो यह संकल्प लिया है, यह अच्छा संकल्प है।

जहां तक गौ-संवर्धन की बात है, जहां तक भारतीय परम्परा की बात है, आपके क्षेत्र में, आपके राज्य में अलग से उत्सव होते होंगे, हमारे यहां गुजरात में अलग से उत्सव होते हैं। हमारे यहां भी पशुओं के लिए उत्सव मनाये जाते हैं। हमारे यहां त्योहार मनाए जाते हैं तथा पशुओं को पूजा जाता है और उनको सम्मान दिया जाता है। जहां तक पशु क्रूरता अधिनियम की बात है और उसमें सुधार लाने की बात है, तो इस बारे में

मेरा स्पष्ट रूप से यह मत है कि वन्य जीवन के आधार पर जीने वाले जो पशु हैं, उनके लिए अलग से संशोधन होना चाहिए और जो मानव द्वारा पालित पशु हैं, जो मानव जीवन के लिए उपयोगी हैं तथा जिनका हम कृषि क्षेत्र में अच्छे तरीके से उपयोग करते हैं, ऐसे पशुओं के लिए अलग से संशोधन होना चाहिए।

महोदय, आदरणीय शिवा जी जल्लीकट्टू के संदर्भ में जिस ध्येय से यह संकल्प लाए हैं, मैं यह कहना चाहूंगा कि भारतीय परम्परा में जितने भी उत्सव हैं, जितने भी त्योहार हैं, वे मूल रूप से मानव जीवन में अपने धर्म की स्थापना के लिए और अपनी संस्कृति के संवर्धन के लिए रखे हुए हैं, यदि आप उस संदर्भ में भी यह संकल्प लाए हैं, तो बहुत अच्छी बात है। मैं आपकी सराहना करते हुए, अपनी बात को समाप्त करता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** Mr. Elangovan.

You have only two minutes. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI T.K.S. ELANGO VAN (TAMIL NADU):** Thank you, hon. Vice-Chairman, Sir. While I rise to support Mr. Tiruchi Siva, I have to make certain clarifications in this House as a reply to my hon. colleague, Shri Jairam Ramesh. Rukmani Devi Arundale was a resident of Chennai. She might have insisted for an Act, Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, but did not talk about Jallikattu at that time. It means she knows what is Jallikattu. Sir, he also said he knows Thirukkural, Silappadikaram and other things. There is

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

one Thirukkural which I want to quote. **(Please fill in Tamil)** which means *maadu* is cattle in Tamil. Education is the most invaluable among all wealth, rest are not wealth. Cattle are called as wealth. That was the only wealth of the people of Tamil Nadu in the rural areas. Even today there are temple bulls in every village which will not be touched upon. Those bulls can do any atrocity. They can go to any field to eat. Nobody will touch it, nobody will question it. If somebody tries to throw stone on a bull, that fellow will be sent out of the village. That is how bulls are treated in Tamil Nadu. Sir, this Jallikattu is part of a celebration with the bulls. It is not cruelty to bulls. The question which I want to raise is this. He raised the point that there should be an amendment. Hon. Jairam Ramesh did one thing successfully by stating that it is not the subject for the Minister of Agriculture, so he can go. He wanted Environment Minister to come back. The Minister also left. Sir, we need an amendment.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** You have to conclude now.

**SHRI T.K.S. ELANGOVAN:** In one minute, I will conclude. There is a need for an amendment to the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. One point about which we have doubt is that this amendment was made by the

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

Government of India on the advice of PETA, an organization where an American citizen is the Chief Executive Officer.

(Contd by 2U/SSS)

SSS-LT/2U/4.15

**SHRI T. K. S. ELANGO VAN (CONTD.):** This American citizen is challenging every Tamilian. Sir, a festival, a cultural festival can support commercialism, but a cultural festival should not be stopped for the sake of commercialism. *Jallikattu* should not be stopped for the sake of killing Indian animal bulls and bringing Jersey Bulls. That is not the way. We want an amendment to the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. Shri Siva talked much about agriculture, farming and everything, but the ultimate idea is to see that *Jallikattu* is performed because the most petted animal in Tamil Nadu are the bulls. The most pampered animal in Tamil Nadu are the bulls. So, this amendment should be made. With these words, Sir, I conclude. Thank you. ...(Interruptions)...

(Ends)

**SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH:** If PETA enforces this, the bulls can be included in the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. At that time, the UPA-II brought it. At that time DMK was also a part of that. So, we wanted to..

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** This is totally unwarranted.

**SHRI T. K. S. ELANGOVAN:** Don't challenge us. When we were in power, *Jallikattu* was there. When they came to power, it was stopped.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** We will not go into that. ...(Interruptions)... Okay, please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

(Ends)

**कृषि एवं किसान कल्याण मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री सुदर्शन भगत) :** माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, माननीय सदस्य श्री तिरुची शिवा द्वारा निजी सदस्य संकल्प में आग्रह किया गया है कि पशुओं के प्रति क्रूरता का निवारण अधिनियम, 1960 के उन उपबंधों के अनुप्रयोग से बैलों को छूट देने के लिए, जो उन्हें खेती एवं परिवहन जैसे कृषि कार्यों के निष्पादन में विभिन्न तकनीकों द्वारा प्रशिक्षण देकर उनकी उपयोगिता एवं प्रशिक्षण से रोकते हैं, में उपयुक्त संशोधन करें; संशोधित पशुओं के प्रति क्रूरता का निवारण अधिनियम, 1960 को भारत के संविधान की नौवीं अनुसूची में शामिल करें और कृषि प्रयोजनों हेतु स्वदेशी मवेशियों के उपयोग को प्रोत्साहित करने तथा उनके स्वास्थ्य में सुधार एवं उनकी संख्या बढ़ाने के लिए कदम उठाएं।

इस संबंध में मैं सदन को बताना चाहूंगा कि पर्यावरण, वन एवं जलवायु परिवर्तन मंत्रालय पशु क्रूरता निवारण अधिनियम, 1960 को अधिनियमित एवं क्रियान्वित कर रहा है, इसलिए भाग (क) और (ख) मेरे मंत्रालय से संबंधित नहीं हैं। हालांकि पशुपालन डेयरी और मत्स्यपालन विभाग कृषि प्रयोजनों हेतु देशी गोपशुओं के प्रयोग

को बढ़ावा देने, प्रोत्साहित करने तथा उनकी उत्पादकता, स्वास्थ्य और संख्या में सुधार हेतु पहले से ही योजनाएँ कार्यान्वित कर रहा है।

राष्ट्रीय गोकुल मिशन को दिसम्बर, 2014 में देश में पहली बार विशिष्ट रूप से देशी बोवाइन नस्लों के विकास के लिए और संरक्षण के लिए प्रारंभ किया गया है। इस योजना में गोकुल ग्रामों की स्थापना की जा रही है। अब तक कुल 14 गोकुल ग्राम स्वीकृत किए जा चुके हैं। राष्ट्रीय गोकुल मिशन के अंतर्गत 27 राज्यों से आए 35 प्रस्तावों को 582.09 करोड़ की राशि के साथ स्वीकृत किया गया है।

(KLG/2W पर जारी)

KLG-NBR/2W/4.20

**श्री सुदर्शन भगत (क्रमागत):** जिसमें से 216.6 करोड़ रुपए की राशि जारी की गई। मैं यह भी बताना चाहूंगा कि इससे तमिलनाडु को 16 करोड़ रुपए जारी किए गए हैं। राष्ट्रीय बोवाइन प्रजनन कार्यक्रम (एनपीबीबी) को फरवरी, 2014 में प्रारंभ किया गया। इस कार्यक्रम का उद्देश्य किसानों के द्वार पर प्रजनन आदानों की सुपुर्दगी के माध्यम से बोवाइन आबादी का आनुवांशिक उन्नयन करना है। साथ ही जैविक खेती के विकास के लिए देश में एक नई योजना "परंपरागत कृषि विकास योजना" प्रारंभ की गई।

महोदय, राष्ट्रीय डेयरी योजना-1, विश्व बैंक सहायता प्राप्त राष्ट्रीय डेयरी योजना को फरवरी, 2012 में प्रारंभ किया गया। यह योजना गौ-पशुओं तथा भैंसों की 12 देशी नस्लों के विकास और संरक्षण पर भी ध्यान केन्द्रित करती है। देश में दुग्ध का उत्पादन तथा उत्पादकता बढ़ाने के लिए और दुग्ध उत्पादन को किसानों के लिए

लाभकारी बनाने के लिए नई योजना "राष्ट्रीय बोवाईन उत्पादकता मिशन" की शुरुआत की गई है। योजना में चार घटक शामिल हैं। पहला, पशु संजीवनी, इसके तहत पशु स्वास्थ्य पत्र (नकुल स्वास्थ्य पत्र), साथ ही साथ पशु यूआईडी (पशु आधार) द्वारा पशुओं की पहचान शामिल है। इस योजना के तहत 8.8 करोड़ दुधारू पशुओं की पहचान की जा रही है और उनका डाटा INAPH डाटा बेस में अपलोड किया जा रहा है। दूसरा, उन्नत प्रजनन तकनीक, तीसरा, देशी नस्लों के लिए राष्ट्रीय बोवाईन जेनॉमिक केन्द्र की स्थापना और चौथा, ई-पशुधन हाट पोर्टल, देश में पहली बार राष्ट्रीय इस तरह का पोर्टल स्थापित किया गया है।

मंत्रालय द्वारा डेयरी उद्यमशीलता विकास योजना चलाई जा रही है। योजना के अंतर्गत सब्सिडी प्रदान की जा रही है। पशुधन स्वास्थ्य एवं रोग नियंत्रण देशी बोवाईन नस्लों समेत पशुधन संख्या के बीच रोगों के नियंत्रण और रोकथाम हेतु कार्यान्वित की जा रही है।

महोदय, मंत्रालय द्वारा कार्यान्वित की जा रही उपरोक्त योजनाओं में तेजी से की कार्यवाही एवं प्रगति के आलोक में मैं माननीय सदस्य से अपने इस संकल्प को वापस लेने की अपील करता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** Shri Tiruchi Siva,  
are you withdrawing your Resolution, or, should I put it to vote?

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (TAMIL NADU):** Sir, before that, I wish to say a few words.

First of all, I thank all the hon. Members. Sir, around ten hon. Members have deliberated on this Resolution for which I am very, very thankful.

The intention behind moving this Resolution was interpreted in another manner by my esteemed colleague and former Minister, Shri Jairam Ramesh. I don't deny it. Yes; my intention is for *Jallikattu*. But, at the same time, you cannot undermine my advocacy for organic farming and to protect and preserve indigenous cattle. It is no less than that. For example, as I said, while moving my Resolution, we have to preserve the traditional and ancient form of agricultural methods in our country. And, Sir, due to introduction of modern farm equipment, so many people have been displaced, lost jobs and, moreover, cattle are becoming extinct. Secondly, chemical fertilizers and pesticides which we are using are contaminating groundwater, spoiling soil, depleting water table and whatever it produces is very, very harmful to the health of people.

(CONTD. BY PB/2X")



PB/2x/4.25

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (CONTD.):** So, considering all these aspects, I am saying this. I agree with what my senior colleague, Mr. Oscar Fernandes, told me. When we revert back to the traditional form of agricultural methods, we will fall short of the requirement, the mismatch between demand and supply. But we have to find some other ways. We cannot totally give-up that. See, I don't want to leave moveable and immovable property to my children in the future. I want to live them in a world where they can have good water, good food and in a very hygienic atmosphere. Everyone of us has got that responsibility. We all think that we are leaving some estate to our people. No, that won't make them to live happily. After some ten or twenty years, in the present situation, they will be having oxygen cylinders to breathe. War will break out for the sake of water. So also, food will be in a very big demand. When the population in our country is increasing, the agricultural lands or cultivable lands are coming down. The production has to be increased. So, whatever we produce should be healthy in nature. That is the main reason for my bringing or moving this Resolution. I think, when the Minister replied, he was very much concerned about the cattle. I am concerned about the indigenous cattle. The imported or the other

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

breeds like Jersey, Persian and all these breeds or even insemination bulls which are being brought will totally spoil our country, the health of our people as well as the cattle. So, my foremost reason is that.

The second is, one of my points in this Resolution was to amend the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. Why have I brought that? The Tamil Nadu Government has enacted a law unanimously and it has been, of course, supported by the Central Government also that Jallikattu can be performed and that Cruelty to Animals Act will not be a hindrance to that. But why then I move it again here? As my colleague, Mr. Raja, pointed out, it is an Act of Parliament and the Parliament can any time by way of another amendment supersede the Act which was passed by the Assembly. Moreover, the Act which was passed by the Assembly can be challenged in a court of law, and why I am concerned, I want to be very explicit. Only one Member spoke against this Resolution and that too only on one point. On the surface of it, he appeared to be very low but, at the end, he said, just by way of taking out bulls, don't open the gate or don't take us back to the barbarian society. I don't understand how. Sir, he said that I have not gone through the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act fully well. Of course, I may not like you because you were a Minister. You were concerned with that.

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

But, as a Member of Parliament, I have gone to the extent I need to. Section 22 empowers the Central Government and Section 24 of the PC Act talks about, 'Power of Court to prohibit or restrict exhibition and training of performing animals.' Training of Performing Animals is one category and when you are using a bull for ploughing, when you are using it for transportation, the man on the cart will be whipping. Will you say that it is a cruelty to the animal? Yes, they will. Only in 2011, when he was the Minister for Environment — there is nothing wrong in that; it is a history — the Notification was made. Section 22 says, 'No person shall exhibit or train (i) any performing animal unless he is registered in accordance with the provisions of this Chapter; (ii) as a performing animal, any animal which the Central Government may, by notification in the official gazette, specify as an animal which shall not be exhibited or trained as a performing animal.' Sir, the Gazette Notification by the Central Government in the year 2011 -- when he was the hon. Minister -- included it. See which are the animals in that? They are 'Bears, Monkeys, Tigers, Panthers, Lions and last of all 'Bulls'. Sir, all the other animals are forest animals, whereas, bull is being domesticated. It is used for agricultural purposes. Why should it be brought into that? That is what my colleague, Mr. Elangovan, said. Some organization which has its

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

headquarters in USA is deciding what should happen in India.

...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** No, no. That is not true. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** I don't mean 'you'. I don't mean 'you'. Who is challenging it again and again in the court of law? It is that organization which is interested in this. I don't blame you. You have done something when you were in the office. That's all.

(Contd. by 2y/SKC)

SKC/2Y/4.30

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (contd.):** But who is challenging it again and again? It is the PETA, an organization which has its headquarters in the USA. Now, what interest do they have in India? They want to kill our traditional forms of agriculture.

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** Sir, a Cabinet Minister of this Government is also in agreement on this.

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** I shall come to that point later.

So, they want to kill traditional methods of agriculture in our country. Now, we are cutting down some *karuvelam* trees in Tamil Nadu. These trees had been planted by the US. There are many other things, like *Pepsi*,

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

that the hon. Member here mentioned. They are bringing all these things here to spoil the health of the people of our country. They are only commercializing things. It is in an attempt to do so that they want to take away our bulls. This would mean that people would not nurture them and they won't need them for agricultural purposes when trends change. When tractors were being brought in, I said that it consumed more of fossil fuel and that it was hazardous. We experience global warming only because of the excessive use of fossil fuels. We have many conventions taking place all over the world to ponder over bringing down global warming, which country needs to cut down what emissions, and so on. But no country is prepared to do that, whereas the farmers are being forced to do away with traditional methods of farming. Tractors came in and fossil fuels came in, which emit so many Greenhouse gases. So, that needs to be restored. They are attempting at this. When bulls are not used for agriculture, farmers won't rear them. When *jallikattu* is banned, they would not tame bulls for sport. When they are not available for breeding cows, artificial insemination would come in. So, there would be no need for rearing bulls after some time. We could then tell our children in some exhibition, 'this is a bull; this is what was found in our country once!' Do you want that to happen? So, bulls need not

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

be brought in the category of ‘performing animals’. We don’t perform anything anywhere. For that matter, what is happening with elephants? They are tied with iron chains in the temples. They are used for begging on the streets. Why have they not paid attention to them? It is a forest animal. When they did not pay attention to the elephants, why are they paying attention to the bulls?

Sir, through a Notification in the Gazette in 2011, bulls were brought in. After that, our Party, when we were in power in Tamil Nadu, bypassed this Notification and conducted *jallikattu* with permission from the Court, though with some restrictions. Of course, we have been partners with them, but we were able to perform the *jallikattu* sport with the permission of the Court, with the restrictions that they had imposed. We abided by those rules and conducted the sport. After the next Government took over, they were not able to continue the sport. That is a different matter. In the year 2016, when Shri Prakash Javadekar was the Environment Minister, another Gazette Notification came, which said very clearly, “Provided that bulls may be continued to be exhibited or trained as a performing animal at events such as ‘*Jallikattu*’ in Tamil Nadu and ‘bullock cart races’ in Maharashtra, Karnataka, Punjab, Haryana, Kerala and Gujarat in the manner by the

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

customs of any community or practised traditionally under the customs or as a part of culture in any part of the country subject to the following conditions...”

Sir, I thank Mr. Prakash Javadekar for having brought out this Notification. Now, I think, Mr. Jairam Ramesh would agree that I have gone through the Bill. I have gone through the Gazette Notification and also the Supreme Court judgement which followed that. It says that after Mr. Prakash Javadekar brought out this Notification in the Gazette, it was challenged in the court of law by PETA. Now, let me quickly quote what the hon. Supreme Court said, “As an interim measure, we direct that there shall be stay on Notification dated 7<sup>th</sup> January, 2016, issued by the Ministry of Environment, Forests and Climate Change, until further orders.” So, it was stayed. A big agitation came up in Tamil Nadu, on a scale that no one had ever witnessed in the past. It was a silent protest. Students, youngsters, women and even small children participated in the agitation, because they were concerned about the culture. Some people may say that they didn’t need it, for one or the other reason. But people are concerned. India is basically a nation of varied cultures. It has got a tradition of its own. We

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

have never been a capitalist country. We have never been a country with commercial basics. We live on the lines of tradition. So, Tamil Nadu witnessed a very big agitation and the Tamil Nadu Government passed an Act unanimously. I am afraid, Sir, that it may again be challenged in a court of law.

(CONTD. BY USY/2Z)

USY-RPM/2Z/4.35

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (CONTD.):** Or, in future, I don't hesitate to say, if Shri Jairam Ramesh becomes the Minister of Environment and Forests may again impose something to ban *Jallikatu*. So, I have to be very cautious. ...(Interruptions)... In a democratic country, it may happen. If he or any like-minded person becomes the Minister -- unlike Shri Prakash Javadekar, who is very cordial with us — then there may be ...(Interruptions)...

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** I think, you should conclude now.

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Sir, it is a very serious issue. Either he or anyone like him may again come here. Or, it can also be challenged in the court of law. In that situation, I move this Resolution in this House that necessary amendments should be made and bulls must be exempted from the



**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

performing animals and it should be incorporated in the Ninth Schedule of the Constitution. That is my main emphasis in this Resolution. If it is included in the Ninth Schedule of the Constitution, it cannot be challenged in the court of law. We have got an experience. The Reservation Policy in Tamil Nadu was incorporated in the Ninth Schedule of the Constitution after great efforts. We don't want to witness agitations in Tamil Nadu every year. Of course, we agitate in a peaceful manner. But, it does not mean that we should agitate again and again. When the Parliament is here to enact laws; when the Government is here to do certain things, the Members also have some responsibility. In that respect, I would like to move this Resolution that necessary amendments should be made in the PCA to exempt bulls as performing animals and also incorporate it in the Ninth Schedule of the Constitution to enable *Jallikatu* to be performed as well as to encourage organic farming and to protect and preserve the indigenous cattle in our country. The bulls are becoming an extinct species. I am very much worried about that. Everyone is worried about that. I am very, very thankful to all the Members who expressed their concern and supported my Resolution. So, I am compelled to move my Resolution for adoption.

**संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी):** सर, ऑनरेबल तिरुची शिवा जी ने जो प्राइवेट मैम्बर रिजॉल्यूशन रखा है, उसमें बहुत अच्छे सजैशन्स हैं। Some suggestions are very good and fruitful for us also गवर्नमेंट द्वारा जो भी कानून बनाए जाते हैं, उनमें रिफॉर्म्स और अच्छी चीजें जोड़ने का एक अनवरत प्रोसेस होता है और उसमें कहीं कोई बाधा नहीं होती। श्री तिरुची शिवा ने बहुत अच्छे सुझाव दिए हैं, जिन्हें हम डेफिनिटली ध्यान में रखेंगे। इसमें बहुत अच्छे सुझाव हैं, जिन्हें ऑनरेबल मिनिस्टर ने भी एक्सेप्ट किया है। मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि जब हम इस दिशा में आगे बढ़ेंगे, तो डेफिनिटली आपके जो सजैशन्स हैं, जो सुझाव हैं, जो आपने इस बिल में रखे हैं, उन्हें हम बहुत पॉजिटिव और कंस्ट्रक्टिव तरीके से लेंगे। इसलिए सर, हमारी आपके माध्यम से श्री तिरुची शिवा अपील है कि वे इस रिजॉल्यूशन को विदड्रॉ करें।

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** So, Mr. Siva, with the assurance given by the Government, are you withdrawing your Resolution or should I put it to vote?

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Sir, I am very much appreciative and thankful to the hon. Minister for Parliamentary Affairs. He is always very much compassionate. Since the assurance has been given on behalf of other Minister, I am afraid what we will be able to do if something happens in future. In that situation, agitations cannot be made again and again. I think, it can unanimously be adopted. There is nothing wrong in it.

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF MICRO, SMALL AND MEDIUM ENTERPRISES (SHRI GIRIRAJ SINGH):** Mr. Siva, everybody is supporting you; the whole House is supporting you. सारे लोग आपके साथ हैं। इससे बढ़कर और कोई चीज नहीं होती है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री नारायण लाल पंचारिया :** हम सब लोग आपके साथ हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Sir, I take the words of the Minister. And, since many hon. Members are supporting me, I should also consider it. I think, the message should be strong enough from the Government that my Resolution will be taken into consideration and necessary amendments will be made in the PC Act and it will be incorporated in the Ninth Schedule of the Constitution.

(Contd. by 3a — HK)

HK-PSV/3A/4.40

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (CONTD.):** If that assurance is given, I am prepared to withdraw this.

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** Also, there is no possibility of my becoming the Minister of Environment once more.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** Has he the leave of the House to withdraw the Resolution?

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी): सर, मैंने पहले भी कहा है कि ऑनरेबल तिरुची शिवा जी के बहुत से अच्छे सजेशंस हैं। जब भी एप्रोप्रिएट टाइम होगा, उस समय हम लोग उस पर भी कंसिडर करेंगे। यह बहुत क्लियर कट बात है।

सूक्ष्म, लघु और मध्यम उद्यम मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री गिरिराज सिंह): इसलिए पूरा हाउस आपके साथ है।

**SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:** Sir, I withdraw this.

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** Has he the leave of the House to withdraw the Resolution?

*The Resolution was, by leave, withdrawn.*

(Ends)

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA):** Now, we have another Resolution of Shri Vishambhar Prasad Nishad regarding need to take welfare measures for farmers in Bundelkhand region and steps for overall development of the region.

**RESOLUTION RE: NEED FOR TAKING WELFARE MEASURES FOR FARMERS IN BUNDELKHAND REGION AND STEPS FOR OVERALL DEVELOPMENT OF REGION**

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद (उत्तर प्रदेश):** उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मुझे अवसर देने के लिए मैं आपको धन्यवाद देता हूँ और मैं अपना निम्नलिखित संकल्प उपस्थित करता हूँ:-

"इस तथ्य को ध्यान में रखते हुए कि-

- (क) बुन्देलखण्ड क्षेत्र में सूखे, बाढ़, पाला पड़ने व ओलावृष्टि से किसानों की फसलें नष्ट हो जाने से उनमें निराशा उत्पन्न हो रही है;
- (ख) इस क्षेत्र में उ. प्र. के सात जिले अर्थात् झांसी, ललितपुर, जालौन, बांदा, चित्रकूट, महोबा एवं हमीरपुर तथा मध्य प्रदेश के सात जिले अर्थात् छतरपुर, पन्ना, सागर, दमोह, टीकमगढ़, दतिया और ग्वालियर शामिल हैं;
- (ग) पिछले कई दशकों से बुन्देलखण्ड के किसान लगातार रोजगार की तलाश में बाहर पलायन कर रहे हैं;
- (घ) बुन्देलखण्ड में जंगली जानवरों व 'नीलगायों' से किसानों की फसलों का भारी नुकसान होने से उनमें हताशा उत्पन्न हो रही है;
- (ङ.) बुन्देलखण्ड क्षेत्र मुख्य रूप से वर्षा पर निर्भर रहने वाला कृषि क्षेत्र है और फसलें मुख्यतः मानसून पर निर्भर होती हैं जिससे उपज एवं आय में अनियमितता के कारण किसानों का जीवन अनिश्चित हो जाता है और जीना दूभर हो जाता है;
- (च) बुन्देलखण्ड क्षेत्र में लगातार पड़ रहे भयंकर सूखे के कारण फसलों की उपज निरंतर कम होती जा रही है जिसके फलस्वरूप किसान खेती से लागत मूल्य भी नहीं निकाल पा रहे हैं;
- (छ) इस क्षेत्र में कृषि आधारित उद्योगों और कुटीर उद्योगों की कमी के कारण रोजगार और वित्तीय आय की बहुत कमी है;

(ज) नकदी फसलों के प्रतिकूल मूल्य निर्धारण तथा कारोबार के खुलेआम शोषण के कारण कृषि एक घाटे का कार्य बन गया है और यह उ.प्र. के किसानों में व्याप्त ऋण भार तथा हताशा का प्रमुख कारण है;

सभा की यह राय है कि -

- (i) क्षेत्र में लघु तथा कुटीर उद्योगों की स्थापना की जानी चाहिए;
- (ii) बुन्देलखण्ड के चित्रकूट, बांदा तथा सतना क्षेत्र में केन्द्रीय पुलिस बल का प्रशिक्षण केंद्र खोला जाना चाहिए जिससे कि क्षेत्र के किसानों को सुरक्षा मिल सके;
- (iii) बुन्देलखण्ड में किसानों से ऋण वसूली समाप्त कर कर्ज माफ करना चाहिए तथा उन्हें कृषि हेतु खाद, बीज व बिजली मुफ्त दी जानी चाहिए;
- (iv) बुन्देलखण्ड के किसानों को पचास हजार करोड़ रुपयों का पैकेज दिया जाना चाहिए जिससे क्षेत्र के बहुत सारे अधूरे पड़े कार्य पूरे होने में सहायता मिलेगी और संवहनीय फसल संवर्द्धन, वृहत्-सूक्ष्म सिंचाई योजनाओं तथा क्षेत्र में अवसंरचना के विकास से संबंधित अन्य योजनाओं में सहायता मिलेगी;
- (v) वृद्ध किसानों की वृद्ध पत्नियों को वित्तीय सहायता प्रदान करने एवं उनके बच्चों को उच्च शिक्षा संबंधी सुविधाएं मुहैया कराने के लिए पांच सौ करोड़ रुपयों का एक पृथक कोष बनाया जाना चाहिए क्योंकि हजारों वृद्ध महिलाओं व विधवाओं को एक राहत और पुनर्वास पैकेज की बड़ी आशा है;
- (vi) जैसा कि वित्त मंत्री ने अपने बजट भाषण में वादा किया था, सरकार को एक मूल्य स्थिरता कोष और कृषि उत्पादों के लिए एक राष्ट्रीय बाजार की स्थापना करनी चाहिए, सूखा संभावित क्षेत्रों में सूक्ष्म सिंचाई एवं जल संभरण योजनाएं शुरू करनी चाहिए, ऋण बहाली के लिए नई और वृहद नाबार्ड निधि की स्थापना करनी चाहिए और भंडारण क्षमता में वृद्धि के लिए कदम उठाए जाने चाहिए;
- (vii) सूखे के कारणों के संबंध में उपयोगी जानकारी प्रदान की जानी चाहिए और इसके प्रभाव को कम करने के लिए बुआई के उचित समय की भविष्यवाणी की जानी चाहिए और वर्षा जल का समुचित प्रबंधन और फसल की निगरानी की जानी चाहिए;

- (viii) बुन्देलखण्ड के सभी गरीबों एवं मजदूरों के बारे में सर्वेक्षण कराया जाना चाहिए और उसके आधार पर बी.पी.एल. कार्ड एवं निःशुल्क आवास व शौचालय की सुविधा मुहैया कराई जानी चाहिए;
- (ix) केन्द्र सरकार को जंगली जानवरों व नील गायों द्वारा फसलों की बर्बादी की रोकने के लिए कदम उठाने चाहिए;
- (x) केन्द्र सरकार को दलहन और तिलहन के उत्पादन को बढ़ावा देने हेतु निःशुल्क खाद और बीज उपलब्ध कराने चाहिए;
- (xi) जनपद बांदा के ग्राम आँगासी के समीप यमुना नदी पर बांध बनाकर यमुना नहर बनायी जानी चाहिए जिससे बुन्देलखण्ड की सिंचाई की समस्या का समाधान हो सके;
- (xii) बुन्देलखण्ड क्षेत्र में मौजूदा तालाबों के अलावा खेतों में जगह-जगह वर्षा जल एकत्र करने के लिए पक्के तालाब बनाए जाने चाहिए जिससे आवश्यकता पड़ने पर किसान पक्के तालाब से अपने-अपने खेतों की सिंचाई कर फसलों से पैदावार कर सकें और इसके लिए केन्द्र सरकार द्वारा ब्याज मुक्त ऋण दिया जाना चाहिए;
- (xiii) इस क्षेत्र से पलायन रोकने हेतु मनरेगा जैसी योजनाओं के तहत 100 दिन से ज्यादा रोजगार देने हेतु योजना में संशोधन कर पूरे वर्ष काम देने पर विचार होना चाहिए;
- (xiv) इस क्षेत्र में फलदार वृक्ष लगाये जाने हेतु केन्द्रीय योजना के तहत एक समय सीमा के भीतर योजनाबद्ध तरीके से कार्य योजना का संचालन होना चाहिए;
- (xv) इस क्षेत्र में सिंचाई हेतु जमीन के नीचे पाइप लगाकर किसानों की फसलों की सिंचाई सुनिश्चित करनी चाहिए जिससे फसलों के उत्पादन में वृद्धि हो सके और किसानों की दशा में सुधार हो सके;
- (xvi) बुंदेलखंड के किसानों को कृषि हेतु आधुनिक तकनीकों का प्रयोग करने के लिए प्रोत्साहित किए जाने की आवश्यकता है;
- (xvii) बुंदेलखंड के समग्र विकास के लिए, पलायन और किसानों द्वारा आत्महत्याएं पूरी तरह से रोकने के लिए सभी वर्गों के 18 वर्ष से ऊपर के सभी व्यक्तियों को रोजगार की गारंटी दी जानी चाहिए;

- (xviii) चूंकि यह क्षेत्र शैक्षिक रूप से भी बहुत पिछड़ा है इसलिए शैक्षिक नीति में इस क्षेत्र के लिए पृथक् विशेष उपबंध होना चाहिए;
- (xix) बुंदेलखंड क्षेत्र में बिजली की समस्या को ध्यान में रखते हुए केन्द्र सरकार द्वारा विद्युत आपूर्ति रियायती दरों पर की जानी चाहिए; और
- (xx) किसानों की फसलों को जंगली जानवरों और नीलगायों से बचाने हेतु केंद्र सरकार को प्रत्येक न्याय पंचायत में एक पशु संरक्षण केंद्र और एक गौशाला की व्यवस्था करनी चाहिए।"

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं अपना यह निजी संकल्प इसलिए लाया हूँ, क्योंकि मैं बुंदेलखंड की धरती पर पैदा हुआ हूँ और वहाँ की आपदाओं से, वहाँ की परेशानियों से परिचित हूँ। मैंने परेशानियाँ झेली हैं, देखी हैं। बुंदेलखंड का जो क्षेत्र है, वह 1.60 लाख वर्ग किलोमीटर का क्षेत्र है, जिसमें उत्तर प्रदेश के 7 जिले आते हैं- झांसी, ललितपुर, जालौन, बांदा, चित्रकूट, महोबा एवं हमीरपुर तथा मध्य प्रदेश के 7 जिले आते हैं, जिनमें छतरपुर, पन्ना, सागर, दमोह, टीकमगढ़, दतिया और ग्वालियर शामिल हैं।

महोदय, मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि बुंदेलखंड लगातार 6-7 सालों से सूखे की चपेट में आ गया है। किसान वहाँ से पलायन कर रहे हैं, इसलिए मैं यह संकल्प लाया हूँ। पिछले कई दशकों से बुंदेलखंड के किसान लगातार रोजगार की तलाश में बाहर

**(उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री बसावाराज पाटिल) पीठासीन हुए)**

पलायन कर रहे हैं। बुंदेलखंड में जंगली जानवरों और नीलगायों से किसानों की फसलों का भारी नुकसान होने से उनमें हताशा उत्पन्न हो रही है। बुंदेलखंड में वहाँ की जो कृषि है, वह वर्षा पर आधारित है। मान्यवर, मानसूनी वर्षा के आधार पर वहाँ का



एग्रीकल्चर है। वर्षा कम होने की वजह से वहाँ का किसान अपनी फसल की बुआई नहीं कर पाता है। लगातार कई वर्षों से सूखे के कारण किसान आत्महत्या कर रहे हैं, पलायन कर रहे हैं। उसको रोकने के लिए हम लोग संकल्प के रूप में चाहते हैं कि केन्द्र सरकार बुंदेलखंड के लिए एक सुनिश्चित व्यवस्था करे। एक केन्द्रीय दल वहाँ जाए, वह उसका अध्ययन करे। वहाँ की जो परिस्थितियाँ हैं, जैसे बुंदेलखंड में जो लगातार सूखा पड़ रहा है, वहाँ की फसलें निरन्तर कम होती जा रही हैं, जिसके फलस्वरूप किसान खेती से लागत मूल्य भी नहीं निकाल पा रहा है। इस क्षेत्र में कृषि आधारित उद्योगों एवं कुटीर उद्योग-धंधों की कमी के कारण रोजगार और वित्तीय आय की बहुत कमी है। नकदी फसलों के प्रतिकूल मूल्य निर्धारण तथा कारोबार के खुलेआम शोषण के कारण कृषि एक घाटे का कार्य बन गया है। यह उत्तर प्रदेश के किसानों में व्याप्त ऋण भार तथा हताशा का प्रमुख कारण बन गया है।

मान्यवर, बुंदेलखंड का जो क्षेत्र है, वहाँ पीने के पानी की भी समस्या है, सिंचाई के लिए पानी की भी समस्या है। वहाँ यह भी देखा गया है कि अर्द्धरात्रि में किसान, जब वर्षा कम होती है और जब ओस पड़ती है, उसमें भी वह सोचता है कि थोड़ी ओस पड़ गई, तो उसमें भी बुआई करने का प्रयास करता है, लेकिन वह भी कारगर नहीं हो पाया है।

(3बी/वीएनके पर जारी)

VNK-KSK/3B/4.45

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद (क्रमागत) :** जहां तक पीने के पानी की समस्या है, उस संबंध में मैं आपके माध्यम से सदन का ध्यान इस बात की ओर दिलाना चाहता हूँ कि स्वर्गीय इंदिरा गांधी जी ने पाठा क्षेत्र के लिए विश्व बैंक से कर्जा लेने का काम किया था और उसके लिए एक बहुत बड़ी परियोजना बनाई गई थी, लेकिन आज तक पाठा क्षेत्र, बुंदेलखंड की पानी की समस्या उसी तरह से बनी हुई है। वहां का किसान निरंतर हताश हो रहा है। वैसे बुंदेलखंड खनिज संपदाओं का भंडार है। जो बड़े-बड़े खनिज माफिया हैं, चाहे वे उत्तर प्रदेश के हों या मध्य प्रदेश के हों, पूरे देश के खनिज माफिया वहां पर कब्जा जमाए हुए हैं। जितने बड़े-बड़े पहाड़ थे, उनमें खनन होते-होते पहाड़ 100-100 मीटर नीचे चले गए। खनन के कारण वहां के पर्यावरण की स्थिति बहुत खराब हो गई है। अगर आप वहां पर दिन में भी जाएं, तो वहां पर अंधेरा लगता है, क्योंकि खनन के कारण वहां पर बहुत ज्यादा धूल उड़ती है। वहां पर इसके कारण किसान की पूरी फसल बरबाद हो जाती है।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री शिव प्रताप शुक्ल :** इस संकल्प को अपनी सरकार से कराया होता, जिसने यह सब कराया। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद :** अब आपकी सरकार केन्द्र में भी है और प्रदेश में भी है, इसलिए आपसे यह मांग कर रहा हूँ कि आप इसको कराइएगा, क्योंकि आपके पास भारी बहुमत है।...(व्यवधान).... अगर आप नहीं कराएंगे, तो 2019 में आप बाहर हो जाएंगे।...(व्यवधान)...

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री बसावाराज पाटिल) :** ठीक है, आप अपनी बात कहिए।

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद :** मान्यवर, खनन के कारण किसानों के खेत में धूल की एक लेयर जम जाती है और वहां पर काम करने वाले जो मजदूर हैं, वहां के रहने वाले जो लोग हैं, इसके कारण वे नाना प्रकार की बीमारियों से ग्रसित हो जाते हैं। इसके कारण वहां के लोग कैंसर, टीबी आदि जैसे गंभीर बीमारी से ग्रसित हो जाते हैं। वहां के जो किसान हैं, गरीब आदमी हैं, मजदूर हैं, जो दिहाड़ी पर 100 रुपए या 50 रुपए में काम करते हैं, वे अपना इलाज नहीं करा पाते हैं।

मान्यवर, भारत सरकार ने 'स्वच्छता अभियान' भी चलाया है। 'स्वच्छता अभियान' के तहत बड़े पैमाने पर हर घर में शौचालय बनाए जाने हैं। उसके लिए भी बुंदेलखंड की ही मोरम, बालू, गिट्टी की आवश्यकता पड़ेगी। जब छत पड़ती है, तो बुंदेलखंड के ही ग्रेनाइट से पड़ती है। उधर की नदियों की लाल मोरम प्रसिद्ध है, वह दूर-दूर तक जाती है। वहां के निवासियों के लिए अलग से व्यवस्था होनी चाहिए। वहां पर लोग आते हैं और खनन करके चले जाते हैं, लेकिन इससे वहां के लोगों को कोई फायदा नहीं होता है। जिस एरिया में खनन कार्य हो रहा है, जहां नदियां हैं, वहां के निवासियों के लिए अलग से व्यवस्था होनी चाहिए। हम फिशरमैन कम्युनिटी से हैं। पहले जब देश में सड़कें नहीं थीं, यातायात के साधन नहीं थे, तब नदियों से सारा व्यापार होता था। आज गर्मी का मौसम है और हमारे फिशरमैन समाज के लोग नदियों के किनारे सब्जियां, खीरा, खरबूज, तरबूज आदि पैदा करने का काम करते हैं। हमारे फिशरमैन समाज के लोग नदियों के किनारे बालू में सब्जियां पैदा करने का काम करते

हैं और वहां से सब्जियां पूरे देश में जाती हैं। मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि आज वहां पर किसान पेशान है और वहां पर सबसे बड़ी समस्या 'अन्ना प्रथा' की है। वहां पर झुंड के रूप में हजारों देशी गायें, नील गायें तथा अन्य जंगली जानवर किसान की फसल को नष्ट कर देते हैं। इससे वहां का किसान पूरी तरह से तबाह और बरबाद हो गया है। वहां पर किसान रात-रात भर अपनी फसल की रखवाली करने का काम करता है। आज भी वहां पर किसान खेत में पड़ा हुआ है। अगर रात में नींद आ गई, तो पता चला कि नील गायों का झुंड आया और पूरा खेत चट कर गया। इसके लिए भी अलग से व्यवस्था होनी चाहिए। केन्द्र सरकार और हमारे मंत्रीगण चाहते हैं.... अभी दूसरे संकल्प पर चर्चा हो रही थी... हम चाहते हैं कि गौशालाएं बनें।

(3सी/एनकेआर-जीएसपी पर जारी)

NKR-GSP/3C/4.50

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद (क्रमागत) :** देसी गायें वहां इतनी ज्यादा तादाद में घूम रही हैं, जब तक गायें दूध देती हैं, लोग उन्हें रखते हैं, उसके बाद छोड़ देते हैं। ऐसी हजारों गायें वहां लावारिस घूम रही हैं जो किसानों की फसल को नुकसान पहुंचाती हैं। मैं चाहता हूँ कि प्रत्येक ग्राम पंचायत में वहां एक-एक गौशाला बने और गौमूत्र से जितनी औषधियां या दवाएं बनती हैं, वहां उनका उत्पादन हो। केन्द्र सरकार और राज्य सरकार केवल बुन्देलखंड के लोगों को ही नहीं, बल्कि दूसरे प्रदेशों को भी, वहां उपलब्ध गौमूत्र और उससे बनी औषधियों से लाभ पहुंचाने का काम करे।

बुन्देलखंड में तालाबों की भरमार है। वहां करीब 7800 पुराने तालाब हैं। दोनों प्रदेशों में बुन्देलखंड के जो 13 जिले हैं, उनका जीर्णोद्धार करने की आवश्यकता है। हम अखिलेश यादव जी को बधाई देंगे कि पिछले साल, जब वहां सूखा पड़ा, उन्होंने 100 तालाबों की लगभग एक महीने के अंदर खुदाई कराई, जबकि 50 साल से उनकी खुदाई नहीं हुई थी। इस साल हमें देखने को मिला कि वे सभी तालाब लबालब भर गए, जिससे किसानों को सिंचाई के लिए पानी मिला। आज भी सभी तालाब उसी तरह पानी से भरे हैं। चरखारी नाम की हमारे यहां एक जगह है, जहां चंदेलों के 7 तालाब एकसाथ connected हैं। उनमें पानी कभी नहीं सूखता था, लेकिन पिछले साल भयंकर सूखे के कारण, उनमें से कई तालाब सूख गए, जिससे वहां पीने के पानी की समस्या पैदा हो गई। बुन्देलखंड में कई बाँध हैं, जहां से पीने का पानी और सिंचाई का पानी किसानों को मिलता है और बिजली भी पैदा की जाती है। हमारे यहां माताटीला बाँध है, राजघाट बाँध है, अर्जुन बाँध है, उर्मिल बाँध है, सपरार बाँध है। इन डैमों से बुन्देलखंड के लोगों का पूरा जीवन-बसर होता है। लोगों को पीने का पानी मिलता है और किसानों को सिंचाई का साधन मिलता है। जिस साल बारिश कम होती है, ये डैम सूख जाते हैं, तालाब सूख जाते हैं। हम यह संकल्प इसलिए लाए हैं ताकि बुन्देलखंड के लिए यह सरकार विशेष व्यवस्था करे। जब चुनाव आते हैं, उस समय हर पार्टी कहती है कि हम वहां के लोगों के लिए काम करेंगे। कुछ लोग राज बनाने के लिए वादे करते हैं, लेकिन हम कहते हैं कि पहले आप वहां कुछ व्यवस्था तो करिए। जो लोग वहां भूखे मर रहे हैं और भूख के कारण यहां तक देखा गया है कि लोगों द्वारा बच्चों को बेचने तक की

घटनाएं सामने आई हैं। आत्महत्याएं हजारों की तादाद में वहां होती हैं, इसलिए बुन्देलखंड की यह गम्भीर समस्या है।

मेरा निवेदन है कि भारत सरकार इस वर्ष के बजट में एक सरकारी संकल्प लाए। हम कहना चाहेंगे कि माननीय मुलायम सिंह जी ने, जब 1989 में उनकी प्रदेश में सरकार थी, वे उत्तर प्रदेश के मुख्य मंत्री थे, उन्होंने बुन्देलखंड के पिछड़ेपन को देखते हुए बुन्देलखंड विकास निधि की स्थापना की थी। राजांश के रूप में, जिलांश के रूप में, 100-200 करोड़ रुपया प्रदेश सरकार अपने बजट में व्यवस्था कर देती थी। हम चाहते हैं कि उसी तरह से भारत सरकार भी वहां के लोगों को बचाने के लिए, लोगों के पलायन को रोकने के लिए, वहां होने वाली आत्महत्याओं को रोकने के लिए, अलग से बुन्देलखंड निधि की तरह कोई केन्द्रीय निधि बनाए, बजट बनाए जिससे बुन्देलखंड के लोगों का पलायन रुक सके। यदि ऐसा नहीं हुआ तो आने वाले समय में बुन्देलखंड एक रेगिस्तान का रूप धारण कर लेगा। बड़ी भयावह स्थिति पैदा हो जाएगी। वहां पानी को लेकर इतनी परेशानी होती है कि जब कुएं सूख जाते हैं, तो रात में 12 बजे के बाद, जो जल्दी उठा, जैसे ही 20-25 बालटी पानी कुएं में इकट्ठा हुआ, वह 4-6 बालटी पानी भरकर ले जाता है और बाकी जो लोग लेट हो गए, वे पानी से वंचित रह जाते हैं।

(DS/3D द्वारा जारी)

DS-SK/4.55/3D

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद (क्रमागत)** : वहाँ हमीदपुर और इचौली आदि 8-10 गाँवों के ऐसे एरियाज़ हैं, जहाँ लोग अपनी बच्चियों की शादी नहीं करते हैं। वे सोचते हैं कि

अगर हम अपनी बच्चियों की वहाँ शादी करेंगे, तो हमारी बच्चियों को वहाँ रात में पानी भरने जाना पड़ेगा। वहाँ के लोग कहते हैं कि खाना तो खा लीजिए, लेकिन पानी की व्यवस्था नहीं है। वहाँ यह स्थिति है। पाठा क्षेत्र में कहावत है कि *खसम चाहे मर जाए, लेकिन हमारी गागर न फूटे।* मतलब, वहाँ पानी का इतना महत्व है!

पिछले वर्ष देश में जब सूखा पड़ा, तो उससे करीब 13 राज्य प्रभावित हुए। बुंदेलखंड, उत्तर प्रदेश सूखे की चपेट में ज्यादा था। भारत सरकार ने वहाँ एक खाली ट्रेन भेज दी। वहाँ जब वह ट्रेन खड़ी थी, तो एक पत्रकार ने सोचा कि मैं उसकी फोटो ले लूँ। जब वह पत्रकार झांसी में उस ट्रेन में चढ़कर उसकी फोटो खींचने लगे तो वे ट्रेन की चपेट में आ गए और उनकी जान चली गई। बुंदेलखंड के लोगों को पानी तो नहीं मिला, लेकिन हमारा एक पत्रकार शहीद हो गया।

मान्यवर, माननीय अखिलेश यादव जी ने पानी के लिए सुझाव दिया, तो कहा गया कि ठीक है, हम कहीं से ट्रेन में पानी भरकर वहाँ भेज देंगे। रेल के किनारे सारी आबादी तो रहती नहीं है, बल्कि आबादी गाँव में रहती है। जब वहाँ के लिए टैंकर की आवश्यकता हुई, तो केन्द्र सरकार से साढ़े 10 लाख करोड़ रुपये की माँग की गई, ताकि वहाँ के लोगों तक पानी पहुँचाया जा सके। चूंकि केन्द्र सरकार ऐसा नहीं चाहती थी, इसलिए इनकी तरफ से पैसा नहीं मिला। जो सूखे के लिए पैसा माँगा गया था, वह पैसा भी नहीं मिला। हम चाहते हैं कि जिस तरह से बुंदेलखंड में तमाम भयावह स्थिति है, उसके लिए अलग से एक लाख करोड़ रुपये का पैकेज दिया जाए, जिससे वहाँ के लोगों के लिए और सिंचाई के लिए तमाम चीजों की व्यवस्था हो सके।

मान्यवर, बुंदेलखंड में जो लोग हैं, वे बैंकों से किसान क्रेडिट कार्ड ले लेते हैं। वहाँ की स्थिति यह है कि बैंक मैनेजर बिना रिश्तत लिए उनका क्रेडिट कार्ड नहीं बनाते और जब उनका रिन्यूअल करना होता है, तो उसके लिए भी वे पैसे लेते हैं। जब वहाँ सूखा पड़ जाता है, तो बीमा कंपनियाँ उनको फसल दुर्घटना बीमा नहीं देतीं, जबकि वे उनके खाते से किश्त तो काट लेती हैं। इस प्रकार की तमाम घटनाओं की जानकारी हमें मिली है। हम लोगों ने ये तमाम मामले उठाए हैं कि किसानों ने अगर फसल दुर्घटना बीमा के तहत फसल के लिए, बीज के लिए या सिंचाई के लिए क्रेडिट कार्ड लिया है और अगर उनकी फसल नष्ट हो जाती है, तो उनको बीमे की रकम मिलनी चाहिए।

महोदय, मैं माननीय मुलायम सिंह यादव जी और अखिलेश यादव जी को बधाई दूँगा कि उन्होंने उत्तर प्रदेश में किसान दुर्घटना बीमा के अंतर्गत 5 लाख रुपये देने की व्यवस्था की। उसके अंतर्गत किसी भी किसान का कहीं ऐक्सिडेंट हो जाता है या उसके साथ कोई घटना हो जाती है अथवा उसको कोई पागल कुत्ता या सियार काट लेता है और अगर उसके नाम पर एक बिस्वा भी जमीन है, तो उसको 5 लाख रुपये मिलेंगे। इसी प्रकार की व्यवस्था मैं भारत सरकार की तरफ से भी चाहता हूँ कि जैसी उत्तर प्रदेश में व्यवस्था है, उसी प्रकार से पूरे देश में व्यवस्था कर दी जाए। एक किसान के लिए 5 लाख रुपये की राशि तो कम है, इसलिए आप 10 लाख रुपये की राशि की व्यवस्था करें। आप किसान दुर्घटना बीमा के लिए कम से कम 10 लाख रुपये की



व्यवस्था कर दें, ताकि हमारा किसान, जो इस आपदा से परेशान है, उसको कुछ राहत मिल सके। ... (व्यवधान)...

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री बसावाराज पाटिल) :** अभी आप और कितनी देर बोलेंगे? ढाई घंटे पूरे होने में अभी पाँच मिनट बचे हैं। ... (व्यवधान)...

**संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी) :** सर, दो मिनट ही बचे हैं। ... (व्यवधान)...

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री बसावाराज पाटिल) :** यह पाँच मिनट लेट शुरू हुआ है, इसलिए पाँच मिनट आगे लिया जाए।

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद :** मान्यवर, हम यह चाहते हैं कि बुंदेलखंड के किसानों के सामने जिस तरह की परेशानी और आपदा है, उससे वे बर्दहाल और परेशान हैं। वहाँ न तो कोई कुटीर उद्योग-धंधा है और न ही वहाँ कोई रोजगार का साधन है। वहाँ का नौजवान वहाँ से बाहर निकलकर मुम्बई और सूरत जैसे शहरों में पलायन करता है। अभी जो नोटबंदी हुई, उसके कारण पूरे देश के उद्योग-धंधे बंद हो गए।

(3ई/एमसीएम पर जारी)

MCM-YSR/3E/5.00

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद (क्रमागत) :** आज वे लोग अपने घर वापस आ गए और लाखों लोग बेरोजगार हो गए। इस कारण काफी फैक्टरियां बंद हो गईं, कम्पनियां बंद हो गईं, तो उनके मालिक कहते हैं कि हमारी कम्पनी बंद होने के कारण आपको अब नहीं रख सकते। इस कारण वे लोग अपने घर आ गए, अपने वतन आ गए। अब वहाँ

उनके पास रहने की समस्या है, क्योंकि वे 5 साल, 10 साल पहले नौकरी के लिए घर छोड़ कर चले गए थे। अब उनके पास मकान नहीं हैं और वे गरीबी रेखा के नीचे हैं। तो भारत सरकार को चाहिए, जैसे तो आजादी के 70 साल बीत गए, आज तक केन्द्र सरकार यह आंकड़ा नहीं लगा पायी कि देश में कितने लोग गरीब हैं, कितने लोग अमीर हैं, किन को बीपीएल कार्ड मिलना चाहिए, किन को अंत्योदय कार्ड मिलना चाहिए, आज तक इसका सर्वे नहीं हुआ। स्थानीय निवासी जिनका नाम बीपीएल में है उनको एपीएल में कर दिया और एपीएल वालों को बीपीएल में कर दिया। तो लोगों को न तो राशन मिल पा रहा है और न उनके बच्चों को कोई सुविधा मिल पा रही है और न उनको मकान मिल पा रहा है।

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री बसावाराज पाटिल) :** प्राइवेट मेंबर बिल के हिसाब से यह और 5 मिनट चलेगा।

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद :** केन्द्र सरकार की जो योजना है, इसमें पहले इंदिरा आवास योजना चली थी। इंदिरा आवास योजना के बाद प्रधान मंत्री आवास योजना हो गई। मैं बधाई दूंगा उत्तर प्रदेश सरकार के मुख्य मंत्री अखिलेश यादव जी को, उन्होंने खास तौर से बुंदेलखंड के लोगों के लिए राम मनोहर लोहिया आवास योजना के तहत तीन लाख पांच हजार रुपए देने का काम किया। इससे दो कमरे का मकान बनेगा, जिसमें किचन और बिजली की व्यवस्था होगी। इसी तरह से हम केन्द्र सरकार से चाहते हैं कि एक लाख रुपए में प्रधान मंत्री आवास योजना के तहत कुछ नहीं होता। आपकी दाल इतनी महंगी हो गई। उत्तर प्रदेश में सीबीआई जांच भी चल रही है।

इससे वहां एक शौचालय भी नहीं बन पा रहा है। वहां पर किसी को बालू नहीं मिल पा रही है। कोई डस्ट से बना रहा है और कोई बना भी नहीं पा रहा है। तो आपकी यह स्वच्छता योजना भी फेल हो रही है। हम चाहते हैं कि आप लोग वहां के लोगों के लिए इसकी व्यवस्था करें, सब के लिए मकान, सब के लिए रोजगार। जो युवा 18 साल का हो जाता है उससे आप कहते हैं कि वोट दीजिए। वह बेचारा उत्साह से वोट देता है। लेकिन क्या उसको रोजगार की कोई व्यवस्था है? विदेशों में जो युवा 18 साल से अधिक का हो जाता है, चाहे उनको गवर्नमेंट जॉब मिले या प्राइवेट जॉब मिले, उसको रोजगार की गारंटी मिलती है। तो भारत सरकार को एक संकल्प लाना चाहिए, एक विधेयक लाना चाहिए कि नौजवानों के लिए जो 18 साल की उम्र का है और हमको वोट देता है तो उसको भी रोजगार पाने का अधिकार होना चाहिए।

बुंदेलखंड का हमारा नौजवान हताश है, निराश है, परेशान है। वह कभी-कभी गलत रास्ते पर चला जाता है। वहां का किसान रात में जब खेत की तराई करता है तो रात में बदमाश आकर उसको उठा लेते हैं। बदमाश उससे खाना मांगते हैं। अगर खाना नहीं देते हैं तो उसकी जान ले लेते हैं। फिर दिन में जब पुलिस आती है और कहती है कि तुमने बदमाश को खाना क्यों दिया, तो इससे वह अपना खेत छोड़ कर चला जाता है। तो इस प्रकार बुंदेलखंड की विषम परिस्थितियां हैं। वह पहाड़ों से घिरा हुआ है और इतना बीहड़ क्षेत्र है। वहां पर सिंचाई के साधन नहीं हैं। हम लोगों ने मांग की थी कि जिस तरह से गंगा नहर है, यमुना नदी है। तो यमुना नदी में एक तटबंध बना दिया जाए, जिससे पूरे बुंदेलखंड के लिए सिंचाई की व्यवस्था हो सके, इससे वहां

का किसान जो परेशान है, वहां से पलायन कर रहा है, आत्महत्या कर रहा है, तो उससे वह परेशानियों से ऊपर उठे। तो मैं अपने संकल्प के माध्यम से केन्द्र सरकार से मांग करता हूं, चूंकि वह यह कह कर बहाना नहीं बना सकती कि हमारे पास अधिकार नहीं है। अगर बुंदेलखंड के लोगों की आत्महत्या रोकनी है, उनकी भुखमरी दूर करनी है तथा उनकी आपदाओं से निबटारा करना है तो उनके लिए अलग से आपको पैकेज देना होगा।

(3F/SC पर जारी)

SC-VKK/5.05/3F

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद (क्रमागत) :** तो आपको उनके लिए अलग से पैकेज देना होगा। आप उन्हें एक लाख करोड़ का पैकेज दीजिए।

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री बसावाराज पाटिल) :** विशम्भर प्रसाद जी, यह चर्चा यहीं रुकेगी।

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद :** सर, आप इसे आगे continue करिए, ताकि हमारी यह चर्चा जारी रहे।

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री बसावाराज पाटिल) :** जी, फिर आगे यह continue होगी। Now, Special Mentions.

(Ends)

**SPECIAL MENTIONS\***AKG/9A**DEMAND FOR OPENING KENDRIYA VIDYALAYAS IN CERTAIN  
DISTRICTS OF BUNDELKHAND REGION IN UTTAR PRADESH**

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से केन्द्र सरकार का ध्यान इस ओर आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ कि उत्तर प्रदेश के बुंदेलखंड क्षेत्र में केन्द्रीय विद्यालयों की कमी है। केन्द्र की सेवाओं में कार्यरत कर्मचारियों व अधिकारियों के बच्चों को शिक्षा अध्ययन कराने में परेशानियाँ होती हैं तथा पिछड़े क्षेत्र में ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों के छात्रों को सरकारी विद्यालय न होने के कारण निजी स्कूलों में परेशानियों का सामना करना पड़ता है। इसके कारण बच्चे पढ़ नहीं पाते हैं, क्योंकि निजी स्कूलों की फीस ज्यादा होती है, जिसको बुंदेलखंड के जनपद बांदा, हमीरपुर, जालौन, चित्रकूट आदि के बच्चे नहीं दे पा रहे हैं। भारत सरकार के मानव संसाधन विकास मंत्रालय ने 50 नए केन्द्रीय विद्यालय खोले जाने की घोषणा की है। इस सम्बन्ध में हमारी माँग है कि बुंदेलखंड के पिछड़े क्षेत्र जनपद बांदा, हमीरपुर, जालौन और चित्रकूट में एक-एक नया केन्द्रीय विद्यालय खोला जाए, जिससे गरीब बच्चों को भी केन्द्रीय विद्यालय में शिक्षा मिल सके।

---

\*Laid on the Table.

अतः सदन के माध्यम से मैं केन्द्र सरकार से माँग करता हूँ कि उत्तर प्रदेश के जनपद बांदा, हमीरपुर, जालौन और चित्रकूट में 2017-18 में केन्द्रीय विद्यालय खोले जाएँ।

(समाप्त)

**9B/BHS**

**DEMAND FOR TAKING NECESSARY STEPS TO  
CELEBRATE MILLENNIUM BIRTH ANNIVERSARY OF SAINT  
SRI RAMANUJACHARYA IN COUNTRY**

**DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY (ANDHRA PRADESH):** Sir, Sri Sankaracharya, Ramanujacharya and Madhvacharya are great philosophers of Sanatan Dharma and have emancipated the ignorants to the right path. Saint Ramanujacharya was born in a village near Chennai in the year 1017 AD and he lived for 120 years and inspired all to practice equality in the society. He was a great social reformer. He treated the downtrodden at par with the elite. He made temples as centres of society where all artisans took active part. He rooted out untouchability and other vices that existed in the society. He gave everyone the same privilege of worshipping God. He

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

imbibed into the society that women need to be shown utmost respect and empowered them to serve the society as leaders.

Now Sri Ramanujacharya's thousandth year birthday is falling in May, 2017 and many organizations and associations have represented that the 1000<sup>th</sup> year birthday should be celebrated in a befitting manner by taking the following measures: 1) Issuing Rs.100, Rs.10 and Rs.5 coins with Sri Ramanujacharya image; 2) Naming a prominent road in Delhi and at other cities, in the name of Sri Ramanuja Marg; 3) Launching a national scheme on social welfare in the name of Sri Ramanuja; and 4) Building a Mandapam/Memorial to commemorate his 1000<sup>th</sup> year birthday.

I, therefore, request the hon. Prime Minister and the Central Government to initiate necessary action for this Saint's Millennium birthday celebrations. (Ends)

**Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-17.03.2017**

**THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BASAWARAJ PATIL):** Shrimati Jharna Das Baidya, not here. Dr. V. Maitreyan, not here. Shri Md. Nadimul Haque, not here. Shri Motilal Vora, not here. The House stands adjourned till 11 a.m. on Monday, the 20<sup>th</sup> March, 2017.

---

**The House then adjourned at seven minutes past five of the clock till eleven of the clock on Monday, the 20<sup>th</sup> March, 2017.**