

**The House met at eleven of the clock,
MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Papers to be Laid on the Table of the House. Shri Bandaru Dattatreya.

PAPERS LAID ON TABLE

SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI: Sir, on behalf of my colleague, Shri Bandaru Dattatreya, I lay on the Table —

I. (1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under Section 36 of the Employees State Insurance Act, 1948:—

- (a) Annual Report of the Employees' State Insurance Corporation (ESIC), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the Employees' State Insurance Corporation (ESIC), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, and the Audit Report thereon.

(2) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) above.

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the V.V. Giri National Labour Institute (VVG NLI), NOIDA, for the year 2014-15, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI: Sir, on behalf of my colleague, Shrimati Nirmala Sitharaman, I lay on the Table—

I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry (Department of Commerce), under sub-section (3) of Section 55 of the Special Economic Zones Act, 2005, along with Explanatory Note:—

- (1) S.O. 2665 (E), dated the 9th August, 2016, notifying certain offences as offences under certain Sections of the Customs Act, 1962, the Central Excise Act, 1944 and the Finance Act, 1994.
- (2) S.O. 2666 (E), dated the 9th August, 2016, authorizing the Additional Director General, Directorate of Revenue Intelligence for offences under the Customs Act, 1962 and the Additional Director General, Directorate General of Central Excise Intelligence for offences under the Central Excise Act, 1944 and the Finance Act, 1994, to be the enforcement officer(s) in respect of any notified offence or offences committed or likely to be committed in a Special Economic Zone.
- (3) S.O. 2667 (E), dated the 9th August, 2016, authorizing the jurisdictional Customs Commissioner, in respect of offences under the Customs Act, 1962 and Commissioner of Central Excise in respect of offences under the Central Excise Act, 1944 and the Finance Act, 1994 and notified under the Act, for the reasons to be recorded in writing, to carry out the investigation, inspection, search or seizure in a Special Economic Zone or Unit with prior intimation to the Development Commissioner concerned.

(4) G.S.R. 2 (E), dated the 3rd January, 2017, publishing the Special Economic Zones (Amendment) Rules, 2016.

(5) G.S.R. 12 (E), dated the 6th January, 2017, publishing the Special Economic Zones (Amendment) Rules, 2017.

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry (Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion), under sub-section (8) of Section 18 of the Explosives Act, 1884:—

(1) G.S.R. 1109 (E), dated the 1st December, 2016, publishing the Static and Mobile Pressure Vessels (Unfired) Rules, 2016.

(2) G.S.R. 1081 (E), dated the 22nd November, 2016, publishing the Gas Cylinders Rules, 2016.

श्री गिरिराज सिंह : महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्रों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :-

- (a) Fifty-fourth Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute for Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (Ni-MSME), Hyderabad, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

SHRI KIREN RIJJU: Sir, I lay on the Table, under sub-section (4) of Section 34 of the Protection of Human Rights Act, 1993, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Annual Accounts of the National Human

Rights Commission (NHRC), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, and the Audit Report thereon.

श्री विष्णु देव साय : महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्र सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :-

(1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013:—

- (a) Fifty-second Annual Report and Accounts of the Hindustan Steelworks Construction Limited (HSCL), Kolkata, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Company.

(2) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) above.

(Ends)

MESSAGE FROM LOK SABHA

THE ENEMY PROPERTY (AMENDMENT AND VALIDATION) BILL, 2017

ADDITIONAL-SECRETARY: Sir, I have to report to the House the following message received from the Lok Sabha, signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha:-

“In accordance with the provisions of rule 101 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to inform you that the following amendments made by Rajya Sabha in the Enemy Property (Amendment and Validation) Bill, 2016 at its sitting held on the 10th March, 2017, were taken into consideration

and agreed to by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 14th March, 2017:-

ENACTING FORMULA

1. That at page 1, line 1, ***for*** the word "Sixty-seventh", the word "Sixty-eighth" be ***substituted***.

CLAUSE 1

2. That at page 1, line 4, ***for*** the figure "2016", the figure "2017" be ***substituted***.

CLAUSE 2

3. That at page 2, line 24, ***for*** the word "law", the words "other laws" be ***substituted***.

CLAUSE 3

4. That at page 3, line 2, ***for*** the words "always deemed", the words "shall always be deemed" be ***substituted***.

CLAUSE 6

5. That at page 3, line 32, ***for*** the figure "2016", the figure "2017" be ***substituted***.
6. That at page 3, line 36, ***for*** the figure "2016", the figure "2017" be ***substituted***.

CLAUSE 8

7. That at page 4, line 17, ***for*** the figure "2016", the figure "2017" be ***substituted*** .

8. That at page 4, line 18, ***for*** the figure "2016", the figure "2017" be ***substituted*** .

CLAUSE 12

9. That at page 5, line 30, ***after*** the word "order", the words "or from the date of its publication in the Official Gazette, whichever is earlier" be ***substituted*** .

CLAUSE 14

10. That at page 5, ***for*** clause 14, the following be ***substituted***, namely:-

Insertion of new sections 18B and 18C

"14. After section 18A of the principal Act, (as so inserted by section 13 of this Act), the following sections shall be inserted, namely:--

Exclusion of jurisdiction of civil courts.

"18B. Save as otherwise provided in this Act, no civil court or authority shall have jurisdiction to entertain any suit or proceedings in respect of any property, subject matter of this Act, as amended by the Enemy Property (Amendment and Validation) Act, 2017, or any action taken by the Central Government or the Custodian in this regard.

Appeal to High Court.

18C. Any person aggrieved by an order of the Central Government under section 18 of this Act, may, within a period of sixty days from the date of communication or receipt of the order, file an appeal to the High Court on any question of fact or law arising out of such orders, and upon such appeal the High Court may, after hearing the parties, pass such orders thereon as it thinks proper:

Provided that the High Court may, if it is satisfied that the appellant was prevented by sufficient cause from filing an appeal within the said period, allow it to be filed within a further period not exceeding sixty days.

Explanation. -In this section, "High Court" means the High Court of a State or Union territory in which the property referred to in section 18 is situated."

CLAUSE 17

11. That at page 6, line 12, ***for*** the figure "2016", the figure "2017" be ***substituted***.

12. That at page 6, line 17, ***for*** the figure "2016", the figure "2017" be ***substituted***.

13. That at page 6, line 27, ***for*** the figure "2016", the figure "2017" be ***substituted.***

14. That at page 6, line 35, ***for*** the figure "2016", the figure "2017" be ***substituted.***

CLAUSE 19

15. That at page 6, line 40, ***for*** the figure "2016", the figure "2017" be ***substituted.***

16. That at page 6, line 43, ***for*** the figure "2016", the figure "2017" be ***substituted.***

17. That at page 6, line 44, ***for*** the figure "2016", the figure "2017" be ***substituted.***

18. That at page 6, line 47, ***for*** the figure "2016", the figure "2017" be ***substituted.***

19. That at page 6, line 48, ***for*** the word and figure "Ordinance, 2016", the words and figure "Fifth Ordinance, 2016" be

Ord. 8 of 2016. ***substituted.***

CLAUSE 22

20. That at page 7, ***for*** lines 28 to 32, the following be ***substituted,*** namely:-

Ord. 8 of 2016. "22.(I) The Enemy Property (Amendment and Validation) Fifth Ordinance, 2016 is hereby repealed.

Repeal and savings.

34 of 1968. (2) Notwithstanding such repeal, anything done or any action taken under the Enemy Property Act, 1968 as amended by the said Ordinance, shall be deemed to have been done or taken under the corresponding provisions of the said Act, as amended by this Act".

(Ends)

**REPORT OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY
STANDING COMMITTEE ON HOME AFFAIRS**

SHRI K. RAHMAN KHAN (KARNATAKA): Sir, I present the Two Hundred First Report (in English and Hindi) of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Home Affairs on the Demands for Grants (2017-18) of the Ministry of Home Affairs.

(Ends)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Reports of the Department-Related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Personnel, Public Grievances, Law and Justice. Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Roy.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, I have already given a request that Mr. Dilipbhai Pandya will present the Report.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay; Shri Dilipbhai Pandya.

**REPORTS OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED
PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON PERSONNEL,
PUBLIC GRIEVANCES, LAW AND JUSTICE**

SHRI DILIPBHAI PANDYA (GUJARAT): Sir, I present the following Reports (in English and Hindi) of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Personnel, Public Grievances, Law and Justice:—

- (i) Ninetieth Report on Demands for Grants (2017-18) of the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions; and
- (ii) Ninety-first Report on Demands for Grants (2017-18) of the Ministry of Law and Justice.

(Ends)

**REPORTS OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY
STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE**

DR. MAHENDRA PRASAD (BIHAR): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Finance (2016-17):—

- (i) Forty-fourth Report on 'Demands for Grants (2017-18)' of the Ministry of Corporate Affairs; and
- (ii) Forty-fifth Report on 'Demands for Grants (2017-18)' of the Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation.

(Ends)

**REPORTS OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED
PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON FOOD,
CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION**

SHRI SHADI LAL BATRA (HARYANA): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Food, Consumer Affairs and Public Distribution (2016-17):—

- (i) Thirteenth Report on Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in their Tenth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants (2016-17)' of the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution (Department of Food and Public Distribution); and
- (ii) Fourteenth Report on Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in their Eleventh Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) on 'Demands for Grants (2016-17)' of the Ministry of Consumer Affairs, Food and Public Distribution (Department of Consumer Affairs).

(Ends)

LEAVE OF ABSENCE

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have to inform the Members that a letter has been received from Shri Rewati Raman Singh, Member, stating that he is unable to attend the sittings of the current Session on health grounds. He has, therefore, requested for grant of Leave of Absence from 9th March to 12th April, 2017 of the current (242nd) Session of the Rajya Sabha.

Does he have the permission of the House for remaining absent from 9th March to 12th April, 2017 during the current (242nd) Session of the Rajya Sabha?

(No Hon. Member dissented)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I hope the House agrees. Permission to remain absent is granted.

(Ends)

(Followed by RL/1B)

-BHS/RL-/11.05/1B

STATEMENT RE. IMPLEMENTATION OF TWO HUNDRED AND SEVENTY-FIFTH REPORT OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON INDUSTRY

सूक्ष्म, लघु और मध्यम उद्यम मंत्री (श्री कलराज मिश्र): महोदय, मैं सूक्ष्म, लघु और मध्यम उद्यम मंत्रालय की अनुदान मांगों (2016-17) के संबंध में विभाग संबंधित उद्योग संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति के दो सौ पचहत्तरवें प्रतिवेदन में अंतर्विष्ट सिफारिशों के कार्यान्वयन की स्थिति के संबंध में एक वक्तव्य सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: Sir, I have a point of order.
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes.

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: Sir, it is on the Arrangement of Business, Rule 23. The day before yesterday, when Parliament was in Session, I raised the issue relating to the capture of fishermen by the Pakistan marines. The Parliamentary Affairs Minister, along with the MoS said that a detailed statement will be made. I would like to know when they are making the statement relating to that because it is not in the Business.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Was there an assurance?

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: It was not an assurance. They said it here. It is already in the minutes.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If there was an assurance, it will be complied with. Sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: No, Sir; it is in the minutes and I wanted to know when they are making it. It was not an assurance.
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; I cannot ask that.

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : उपसभापति महोदय, जेएनयू के एक छात्र
...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am allowing you. ...(Interruptions)... Sit down. ...(Interruptions)... I am allowing you, sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Your name is here. Ali Anwarji, sit down. Your name is here. ...(Interruptions)... I will call you. ...(Interruptions)... सबको टाइम मिलेगा।

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : उपसभापति जी, यह कोई साधारण मामला नहीं है। जेएनयू के एक छात्र ने ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: आपको इस पर बोलने का अवसर मिलेगा।

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: Sir, ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sit down. Sit down. ...(Interruptions)... No, no, let me take up the Zero Hour. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: Sir, ...(Interruptions)...

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : उपसभापति जी ,जेएनयू के एक छात्र ने ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: आपको इस पर बोलने का अवसर मिलेगा।

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, my notice is under Rule 267 over the brazen disregard of the people's mandate and the Constitution. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your name is here. I will allow you. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: My notice is under Rule 267. ...(Interruptions)... Please allow me. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Anand Sharmaji, I will allow you. ... (Interruptions)... I will allow you. ... (Interruptions)... आप कृपया बैठिए। I will call you. ... (Interruptions)... Sit down, I will call you. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: Sir, the other day, the Home Minister made a statement here and on that day, it was decided that on the next day clarifications will be sought.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Today, we can have. ... (Interruptions)... Yes, it is there. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: Therefore, Sir, it has to be taken up today.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, it is in the List of the Business. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: The Home Minister has to answer, reply to the clarifications that are sought by the Members. It has to be done today. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, all right. Now, Shri P.L. Punia. ... (Interruptions)... It is Zero Hour. ... (Interruptions)... Shri P.L. Punia. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: Sir, (Interruptions)...

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : उपसभापति जी, यह महत्वपूर्ण मामला है। हमने इस मामले में कार्य-स्थगन प्रस्ताव दिया है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am giving you. ...(Interruptions)... I will call you. ...(Interruptions)... आप कृपया बैठिए। आपको टाइम मिलेगा। ...(व्यवधान)...

Now, Shri P.L.Punia.

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: Sir, on the assurance, you should ask as to when they are making the statement. I want the statement. ...(Interruptions)... They told the House that they will make a statement. I want to know when they are making the statement. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have to examine whether such an assurance is there or not. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: Sir, it is there. It is clear in the minutes. It is in the minutes. If you want, I can read the minutes. ...(Interruptions)... If you want it, I can read the minutes. ...(Interruptions)... But, Sir, what is that? I mean you should ask them. ...(Interruptions)... I am asking the Parliamentary Affairs Minister through you as to when they are making the statement. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Would you like to react? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: Let the Minister say when he is making a statement. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, sit down. ...(Interruptions)... What he is saying is that the other day the hon. Minister promised that a statement will be made on the problem of fishermen captured by the Pakistanis. If there is such an assurance... ...(Interruptions)...

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी) : सर, मुझे इस बारे में मालूम नहीं है।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You talk to the concerned Minister and come back. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: Sir, a full statement... ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Minister is here. ...(Interruptions)... You sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी : मधुसूदन जी, आप जिस एश्योरेंस के बारे में कह रहे हैं, यदि मिनिस्टर ने एश्योरेंस दिया है, तो उसे 100 परसेंट फुलफिल किया जाएगा। I will convey it to the Minister about his assurance. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: And, request him to make a statement, if he is making it as early as possible. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI: Okay.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri P.L. Punia.

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: Sir, you had asked me to give notice and that the discussion will be taken up. ...(Interruptions)... I have given notice. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you have given notice...

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: Yes, I have.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then, the hon. Chairman will consider it. Sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Okay, please, Shri P.L. Punia.

(Followed by DC/1C)

-RL/DC-PSV/11.10/1C

श्री पी.एल. पुनिया: उपसभापति जी, जेएनयू के रिसर्च स्कॉलर जे.मुथुकृष्णन की आत्महत्या...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. That is not your subject.

श्री पी.एल. पुनिया: ठीक है, सर। मैं सब-प्लान पर बोलता हूँ। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes; it is on Sub-Plan. ...(Interruptions)...
बोलिए, बोलिए।

MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION OF CHAIR

SITUATION DUE TO ABOLITION OF SCHEDULED CASTE SUB-PLAN AND TRIBAL SUB-PLAN AND NON-ALLOCATION OF BUDGET IN PROPORTION TO POPULATION

श्री पी.एल. पुनिया (उत्तर प्रदेश): महोदय, आज़ादी के समय में अनुसूचित जाति/जनजाति के लगभग 95 फीसदी लोग बिलो पॉवर्टी लाइन थे। इसको दूर करने के लिए अनेक योजनाएँ बनीं। बाबा साहेब डॉ. भीमराव अम्बेडकर ने 26 नवम्बर, 1949 को, जब संविधान सभा की आखिरी बैठक हो रही थी, उसमें कहा था कि हमारे लिए, आगे आने वाली सरकारों के लिए सामाजिक और आर्थिक गैर-

बराबरी एक विशेष चुनौती होगी और इसको जब तक जल्दी से जल्दी खत्म नहीं किया जाता, गैर-बराबरी खत्म नहीं होती, अन्यथा इससे पीड़ित लोग इस संवैधानिक व्यवस्था को ध्वस्त कर देंगे। 1980 में इंदिरा जी ने शैड्यूल्ड कास्ट्स सब-प्लान एवं ट्राइबल सब-प्लान की योजना शुरू की थी। उसके हिसाब से एससी-एसटी की जितनी आबादी है, उसके अनुपात में बजट एलोकेट किया जाएगा और उसके माध्यम से उनको डायरेक्ट लाभ पहुँचाने वाली योजनाओं की फंडिंग होगी। लेकिन बड़े अफसोस की बात है कि अभी 2017-18 के बजट में, इस केन्द्रीय बजट में, एससी सब-प्लान, ट्राइबल सब-प्लान का कांसेप्ट खत्म कर दिया गया है और यह कहा गया कि हमने 52,393 करोड़ रुपये आवंटित किये हैं। लेकिन 2014-15 में यह 50,000 था, जिसको घटाकर 30,000 कर दिया। उससे आगे यह 38,000 हुआ और उसको ये कहते हैं कि हमने इतना बढ़ा दिया। यह तो उसके लगभग बराबर है। जो ड्यू है, यानी शैड्यूल्ड कास्ट्स का बजट 16.6 परसेंट होना चाहिए और शैड्यूल्ड ट्राइब का 8.6 परसेंट होना चाहिए, उसके हिसाब से पूरा गैप है और केवल 2.50 परसेंट बजट इसमें आवंटित किया गया है, जो बहुत ही शर्मनाक बात है। मैं जानना चाहूँगा कि शैड्यूल्ड कास्ट्स सब-प्लान का जो बकाया है, वह कब पूरा किया जाएगा, क्योंकि इसकी व्यवस्था में यह स्पष्ट है कि यह अमाउंट नॉन-लैप्सेबल और नॉन-डायवर्टेबल है। वित्त मंत्री जी यहाँ मौजूद हैं। मैं उनसे यह जानना चाहूँगा कि इसका हिसाब कब देंगे?

इसके अलावा, जो सेंट्रल सेक्टर की स्कीम्स हैं, सेंट्रली स्पॉन्सर्ड स्कीम्स हैं, उनमें भी भारी कटौती की गई है। इसमें लगभग 1,04,490 करोड़ रुपये की धनराशि

कम आवंटित की गई है। इसलिए मैं विशेष निवेदन करना चाहूँगा कि
...(व्यवधान)... शैड्यूल्ड कास्ट्स सब-प्लान का पूरा पैसा दिया जाए।

(समाप्त)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay; your time is over. Sit down. Now, Shri Anand Sharma. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI ALI ANWAR ANSARI (BIHAR): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI C.P. NARAYANAN (KERALA): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI K. SOMAPRASAD (KERALA): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All the names of the hon. Members, who have associated themselves with it, may be included.

(Ends)

CONCERN OVER MANNER OF FORMATION OF GOVERNMENTS IN GOA AND MANIPUR DISRESPECTING PEOPLE'S MANDATE

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (HIMACHAL PRADESH): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, elections are held in a parliamentary democracy and the people give

their mandate. And, after the results are declared, the mandate is accepted and respected by all. In the recent Assembly elections, the voters have given their verdict. I congratulate the Ruling Party that they have scored a big victory in the State of Uttar Pradesh. We are equally proud and happy that in the sensitive border State of Punjab, the voters have given a massive mandate to the Indian National Congress to form the Government. Sir, again, in a sensitive border State of Manipur, which has seen turbulence and insurgency in the past, the Indian National Congress has emerged as the single largest party with 28 MLAs and with assured support, the incumbent Chief Minister was in a position to form the Government. In the State of Goa, where the Ruling Party was in office, the Indian National Congress emerged as the single largest party. Now, there is an established position under law and under Constitution;-- I know, my friends on the other side will not agree,--and the fact is that there are two Judgements of the Constitution Bench of the Supreme Court. A nine-Judge Bench and a five-Judge Bench have made it absolutely clear and that is the settled position in law that if there is no clear majority of any party, the Governor is obliged,-- that is the law position--

(Contd. by KR/1D)

KR-VNK/1D/11.15

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (CONTD.): .. to first invite the leader of the largest party to form the Government and to prove their majority. In case they are not in a position only then the second largest party will be given an opportunity. Here, Sir, they have turned it upside down. I am sorry to say that the mandate has been violated, established law and the constitutional position have been disrespected, and a party which has won elections in a big State is stealing MLAs, stealing the mandate to cobble the Government. It is a murder of democracy only because they have won. They do not have the right to do what they have done. * ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Time is over. Now, Shri D. Raja. ..(Interruptions)... Time is over, time is over. Shri D. Raja. ..(Interruptions).. Time is over. Now, Shri D. Raja. ..(Interruptions).. Shri D. Raja. Time is over. ..(Interruptions).. Shri D. Raja. ..(Interruptions).. Sharmaji, your allotted time is over.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI): Sir, I have a point of order. My point of order

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

is that सर, अभी आनन्द शर्मा जी ने कहा ...(व्यवधान)... जनता का जो जनादेश है, हमने उसे accept भी किया है और उसकी रिस्पेक्ट भी की है। ...(व्यवधान)... मुझे अफसोस है कि इन्होंने उसको न accept किया और न रिस्पेक्ट किया, क्योंकि जो जीत का ग्लैमर होता है और हार का grace होता है...(व्यवधान)...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा : हमने तो इसके लिए आपको बधाई दी...(व्यवधान)... आपने तो बधाई भी नहीं दी।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी : आपने हार के grace को पूरी तरह से ध्वस्त कर दिया है, क्योंकि जो grace आपको हार के बाद जनादेश को स्वीकार करने के लिए दिखाना चाहिए था, वह आपने नहीं दिखाया। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, मेरा प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर रूल 238 के तहत है। इसमें यह है, “..reflect upon the conduct of persons in high authority unless the discussion is based on a substantive motion drawn in proper terms.”

इन्होंने ऑनरेबल गवर्नर के रोल पर जो सवाल उठाया है, उसको expunge किया जाए, क्योंकि यह बहुत क्लीयर है कि अगर ऑनरेबल गवर्नर के रोल पर कोई डिस्कशन करना है, तो उसके लिए substantive motion आएगा, उसमें इस तरह से sweeping statement नहीं आएगा।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will go through the record. If there is any reflection, I will expunge it. ..(Interruptions).. Now, Shri D. Raja. ..(Interruptions).. Shri D. Raja. (Ends)

**CONTINUED DISCRIMINATION AGAINST DALIT STUDENTS IN
UNIVERSITIES AND SUICIDE BY DALIT STUDENT OF JNU**

SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU): Sir, I raise this issue of JNU scholar.
..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Only what Shri D. Raja says will go on record.
Nothing else will go on record. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, it is a serious issue and I appeal to the Treasury
Benches, as well as, to the Opposition Benches to allow me to raise this
issue of the JNU scholar, Muthukrishnan, a dalit scholar, coming from
..(Interruptions)..Tamil Nadu. ..(Interruptions)..This is a serious issue.
..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Listen, he is raising a valid issue.
..(Interruptions).. Shri Raja is raising a valid issue. I think, you should give
a patient hearing, please. ..(Interruptions).. Treasury Benches should not
do that. ..(Interruptions).. Treasury Benches should not disturb; sit
down. ..(Interruptions).. Opposition Members, go back.
..(Interruptions).. Please go back. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI D. RAJA: The student comes from a Scheduled Caste family.
..(Interruptions).. I am raising a serious issue. ..(Interruptions).. What is
happening? ..(Interruptions).. This is a matter of public importance.
..(Interruptions).. The Leader of the House is sitting; and the Leader of
the Opposition is sitting. ..(Interruptions).. What is this?
..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would request the Congress Members to go back to their seats. ..(Interruptions).. I would request you to go back to your seats. ..(Interruptions).. Now, this is not possible. ..(Interruptions).. Please go back to your seats. ..(Interruptions).. Please go back to your seats. ..(Interruptions).. What is this? ..(Interruptions).. Please go back to your seats. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI D. RAJA: I want to raise an issue of discrimination against a Scheduled Caste student in the Central University. ..(Interruptions).. Please call for order in the House. ..(Interruptions).. How could I speak? ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mohd. Ali Khan, ..(Interruptions).. You see, now please listen to me. (Continued by

1D/KS)

KS-NKR/1E/11.20

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN (CONTD.): Now, please... ...(Interruptions)...
The House is adjourned up to 11.30 a.m.

**The House then adjourned at
twenty minutes past eleven of the clock.**

RSS/DS/1F/11.30

**The House reassembled at thirty minutes past eleven of the clock, MR.
DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri D. Raja to continue.... (Interruptions)...

Mr. Raja, you continue. I can hear you.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, there should be order in the House. It is a very serious issue...(Interruptions)... How can I raise such a serious issue in the din? The House should listen, Sir. Both sides should listen.... (Interruptions)... I want to raise this issue....(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Raja, you speak. I can hear... (Interruptions)...

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : सर, इनका इश्यू भी होना चाहिए, उसके बाद लीजिए।
...(व्यवधान)...

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी) : सर, इनसे पूछ लीजिए, ये चाहते क्या हैं? ...(व्यवधान).. हम तो इनको समझ नहीं रहे हैं, what they want. They want to revert the mandate of the common people. क्या ये जनादेश से वापस होना चाहते हैं? ...(व्यवधान)... अभी रस्सी तो जल गई, लेकिन बल नहीं छूट रहा है। ...(व्यवधान)... हमारा इनसे अनुरोध है कि ये नम्रता के साथ जनादेश को स्वीकार करें और उसका सम्मान भी करें। ...(व्यवधान)... मुझे नहीं लगता कि ये जिस तरह का व्यवहार कर रहे हैं ...(व्यवधान)... ये नरेन्द्र मोदी जी के खिलाफ जितने नारे लगाएँगे, उतना ही जनता नरेन्द्र मोदी जी को सिर पर बिठा लेगी, उनका सम्मान करेगी, क्योंकि नरेन्द्र मोदी जी इनकी मेहरबानी से देश के प्रधान मंत्री नहीं हैं। वे गरीबों और कमजोर तबकों के विकास के लिए काम कर रहे हैं, उनके सशक्तिकरण के लिए काम कर रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... जनता ने, गरीबों

ने उनको प्रधान मंत्री बनाया है। ये इस तरह से व्यवहार करते रहें, हमारे लिए कोई नुकसान नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI D.RAJA: Sir, see that there is order in the House....(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. shouting Members, matter being raised by Shri D.Raja and other Members is very important. Please allow. What will you achieve by shouting? Nothing can be achieved by this shouting. This is nothing but indiscipline. This is very bad. What can the Chair do?...(Interruptions)...

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : सर, यह ठीक नहीं हो रहा है। ...(व्यवधान)... यह equally important मामला है। ...(व्यवधान)... यह ठीक नहीं हो रहा है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no use shouting like this. It is a political matter. What can I do? I can't do anything. Please go back to your seats. ...(Interruptions)... Yes, Mr. Yechury, do you want to say something? I will be happy to hear you.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Yes, Sir. I want to say something on this issue. What I am saying is this. Sir, the point that has been raised by my colleague, Mr. Anand Sharma, is a correct point.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, that is okay. I have no objection.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Please bear with me for a minute, Sir. I was a part of the delegation that went to the hon. President, Dr. Shankar

Dayal Sharma, in 1996, with a majority in the Lok Sabha. He said, "No, the single largest party is the BJP", and he sworn-in the BJP Government, and Mr. Vajpayee's Government, which lasted for 13 days.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What can I do? It is a political point.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: But, the principle of the single largest party being called is established. That principle has been violated. The House must note that this is something of a violation that has happened.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: For that, shouting of slogans will help! Will that solve the problem? Mr. Yechuryji, coming to the Well of the House and shouting slogans will solve the problem! In the Rule Book, there are provisions.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: As the Chair, you will allow a discussion!

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, there is no motion before me. What can I do?

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: My motion is there.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is under Rule 267. See, if you feel that there is some constitutional break down, or, some authority has not abided by the Constitution, then, there is a provision in the Rule Book.

(contd. by 1g/KGG)

KGG-MCM/1G/11.35

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN (contd.): Why are you shouting slogans? Let me proceed. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, you give a ruling on his motion. It is an important issue. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Raising it under Rule 267 was not permitted but, instead, submission under Zero Hour was permitted. That is over now. If you want any substantive discussion, then give notice. ...(Interruptions)... There is a way for that, if you want. If you want a discussion, there is a way and do that.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I agree, Sir. But, he is saying that he moved the motion.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, he didn't move a motion. I did not allow.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: There is a motion, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It should be made clear. See, he has sought permission to raise it, under Rule 267, for the suspension of the Business. That permission was not granted. A motion can be moved only if the Chair permits. That permission was not granted. Instead, Mr. Chairman converted his notice into a Zero Hour submission, which was allowed. Now, that too is over. If you want a discussion on the subject you mentioned, there is a provision in the Rule Book. Do that. I am not objecting to it. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I am going by the presumption that it is a motion.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; there is no motion. ...(Interruptions)... A motion can be moved only with the permission of the Chair; that permission was not given. So, let me proceed now. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: We had moved a motion under Rule 267. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you want a substantive motion, you may give notice. Now, let us proceed with Zero Hour mentions. This shouting of slogans will not solve any problem. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : इस पर हमारी भी बात सुनिए।.....(व्यवधान)....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. D. Raja, please continue. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I appeal to all my colleagues...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You say your piece. You need not appeal. You say what you want to say.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, let there be order. Democracy can't run like this. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What are you doing? I told you to say what you wanted to say. You are not saying it. You use your time. This is the time to say what you want to say.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I want the protection of the Chair; there must be order. With sadness I am raising this issue; with anguish I am raising this issue.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why don't you say what you want to say? Why all these unnecessary things?

SHRI D. RAJA: That is what I am saying, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are wasting the time.

SHRI D. RAJA: Please listen to me, Sir. I am raising an issue—the issue of a dalit scholar, a research scholar studying in JNU who died in a pathetic manner, in mysterious circumstances. This is a very serious issue. His parents are dalits, living in the Namakkal district of Tamil Nadu. He is a Tamil student, a dalit student, studying in JNU. How could he take such extreme step of losing his life, Sir? What is happening in our country? What is happening in the Central universities in India? Why is there discrimination against students coming from dalit communities, tribal communities, minorities and OBCs? What is the democracy we are talking about? I appeal to the Government to take note of this mysterious death. Go for a thorough probe, investigation and find out what led the dalit scholar to take such a step? We will have to look at long-term issues like the dalits' admission policy which is discriminatory, which is preventing the entry of dalit students, tribal students, OBC students and

minority students. After Rohit Vemula, Sir, all these incidents are happening in our country. When Rohit Vemula died, the whole country rose in protest. There was a demand for a legislation against discrimination. It was considered to be an institutional murder. What about this, Sir? Who knows what were the circumstances! Why such things should happen? I am not pleading only for the dalit students. Even if any student commits such a suicide, or dies in such a way, it saddens us. They are the future of our country. They are students. Why should they take such extreme steps? Are we not concerned? Is this Parliament not concerned? Is this democracy not concerned? I am asking you; I am asking the Government. I am asking all the sides of this House: Why should we keep quiet? What is the step we take?

(Ends)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Tiruchi Siva to associate.

(Followed by KLS/1H)

KLS/SC/1H-11.40

प्र० राम गोपाल यादव : सर, मुझे इस पर बोलना है..(व्यवधान)..

श्री शरद यादव (बिहार) : सर, मैं माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को संबद्ध करता हूँ।

श्री प्रेम चन्द गुप्ता (झारखंड) : सर, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को संबद्ध करता हूँ।

श्री रवि प्रकाश वर्मा (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सर, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को संबद्ध करता हूँ।

डा० चन्द्रपाल सिंह यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सर, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को संबद्ध करता हूँ।

श्री नीरज शेखर (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सर, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को संबद्ध करता हूँ।

श्रीमती रजनी पाटिल (महाराष्ट्र) : सर, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को संबद्ध करती हूँ।

श्री मोहम्मद अली खान (आन्ध्र प्रदेश) : सर, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को संबद्ध करता हूँ।

جناب محمد علی خان: سر، میں بھی ماننیے سدسئیے کے ذریعہ اٹھائے گئے موضوع سے خود کو سمبڈ کرتا ہوں۔

श्री शान्ताराम नायक (गोवा) : सर, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को संबद्ध करता हूँ।

SOME HON. MEMBERS: We associate ourselves with the issue raised by the hon. Member. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUY CHAIRMAN: All of you have associated. ...(Interruptions)... They have given notice that is why I am allowing them. ...(Interruptions)... All right. ...(Interruptions)... LoP. ...(Interruptions)...

नेता विरोधी दल (श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद) : ऑनरेबल डिप्टी चेयरमैन सर, पांच स्टेट्स के इलेक्शन हुए और पांच स्टेट्स ...(व्यवधान)..

قائد حزب اختلاف (جناب غلام نبی آزاد): آنریبل ڈپٹی چیئرمین سر، پانچ اسٹیٹس کے الیکشن ہوئے اور پانچ اسٹیٹس --- (مداخلت)---

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: On this subject. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: I am on the subject which Mr. Anand Sharma has raised. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...(Interruptions)...

प्र० राम गोपाल यादव : पहले उसे खत्म हो जाने दीजिए।

श्री शरद यादव : अली अनवर अंसारी जी को बोलने दीजिए।

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: I am totally with him. ...(Interruptions)...

Okay, let it be finished and after that I will speak. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUY CHAIRMAN: Hon. LoP, because we are on this subject during Zero Hour, I can only allow on that subject now. ...(Interruptions).... So, I called Shri Tiruchi Siva. ...(Interruptions).... Your name is also there.

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : मैंने कार्य स्थगन का नोटिस दिया है।..(व्यवधान)..

श्री उपसभापति : लेकिन इनका नाम है। मैं क्या करूँ?..(व्यवधान)..

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : हमने भी कार्य स्थगन का नोटिस दिया है। हमें भी सुन लीजिए। ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री शरद यादव : अंसारी जी को बोलने दीजिए।..(व्यवधान)..

श्री उपसभापति : उनको भी बुलाएंगे। शरद यादव जी, तिरुची शिवा जी ने नोटिस दिया है, श्रीमती कानीमोझी ने भी इसी subject पर नोटिस दिया है, इसीलिए मैंने उनको बुलाया। उसके बाद मैं उन्हें भी बुलाऊंगा।..(व्यवधान)..

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : हमने भी कार्य स्थगन का नोटिस दिया है।..(व्यवधान)..

श्री उपसभापति : उनका दूसरा नोटिस है, लेकिन मैं उन्हें अवसर दूंगा।
..(व्यवधान)..

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : हमने कार्य स्थगन का नोटिस दिया है।..(व्यवधान)..

श्री उपसभापति : मैं आपको अवसर दूंगा, लेकिन आपका दूसरा नोटिस है। मैं आपको अवसर दूंगा।..(व्यवधान).. I will give you time. ...(Interruptions).. Mr. Tiruchi Siva, take one minute. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : मैंने इस पर कार्य स्थगन का नोटिस दिया है। अगर आप..(व्यवधान).. तो हमें विषय बताने की इजाजत होनी चाहिए।..(व्यवधान)..

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: No, Sir. ...(Interruptions)... I just visited the AIIMS hospital, I have to say something about that.

MR. DEPUY CHAIRMAN: Only one minute in any case. ...(Interruptions)... Association is only for one minute. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (TAMIL NADU): It is a serious issue, Sir. ...(Interruptions)... Hyderabad scholar, Rohith Vemula committed suicide. It has set off so many *dalit* rights movement. In this situation, Muthu Krishnan hailing from Salem of Tamil Nadu was reportedly found dead, hanging from his ceiling fan, who is a research scholar, a PhD research scholar in the J.N. University. We are very, very sorry to say that *dalit* students are getting admission under the reservation system. But,

at the same time, they are handicapped with many other issues.
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You associate now.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Kindly, Sir. Please understand. ...(Interruptions)..
Sir, it is economic deprivation and social discrimination.
...(Interruptions)... I just went to the AIIMS Hospital. I don't want to go
deep into it. The parents say that the person was not a depressed one
and his friends say that he was a happy person. There was no suicide
note found there and no other evidence which contains the reasons for
the untimely death of him or an extreme decision taken by that young
fellow. He was an ambitious student, Sir. ...(Interruptions)... So, there
must be provision. ...(Interruptions)... The FIR has not been filed.
...(Interruptions)... The postmortem has not yet been done.
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUY CHAIRMAN: Shrimati Kanimozhi. ...(Interruptions)... Okay,
it is all right. ...(Interruptions).. Kanimozhiji, one minute only.
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: The issue is very serious. ...(Interruptions)...
Recommendations have to be implemented. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUY CHAIRMAN: You start.

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: How can I start? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUY CHAIRMAN: Then nothing will go on record.

...(Interruptions)... Ram Gopalji. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: Sir, I have to speak. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUY CHAIRMAN: Then why don't you start? ...(Interruptions)...

This adjustment you cannot have. ...(Interruptions)...Nothing is going on record. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: You cannot say this, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:*

प्र० राम गोपाल यादव : सर, पिछले कुछ वर्षों से लगातार..(व्यवधान).. आपने मेरा नाम लिया।

श्री उपसभापति : बोलिए, बोलिए!..(व्यवधान)..राम गोपाल जी, आप बोलिए।

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not going on record. ...(Interruptions)...

प्र० राम गोपाल यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश): पिछले कुछ वर्षों से लगातार देश के विभिन्न हिस्सों में..(व्यवधान)..जेएनयू सबसे ज्यादा प्रतिष्ठित संस्था है, उसमें दलितों और वंचित वर्ग के लोगों के साथ लगातार अन्याय हो रहा है। ..(व्यवधान).. न केवल जेएनयू, बल्कि देश के दूसरे हिस्सों में भी ऐसा हो रहा है। ..(व्यवधान).. इसके लिए

***Not recorded.**

सबसे पहले मेरी यह मांग है कि जो देश के शिक्षा मंत्री हैं, एचआरडी मिनिस्टर हैं - जब दिल्ली में यह घटना हुई है, तो he should have been here. उनको हाउस में आकर बताना चाहिए कि इस तरह से यह घटना हुई है और इस घटना पर गवर्नमेंट क्या कार्यवाही कर रही है। कोई भी इस तरफ से बोलने को तैयार नहीं है।..(व्यवधान).. कोई बोलने को तैयार नहीं है। यह बहुत सीरियस घटना है, पहले भी..(व्यवधान)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Kanimozhiji. ...(Interruptions)... You have given notice. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA:*

प्र० राम गोपाल यादव : आंध्र प्रदेश में घटनाएं हो चुकी हैं। ये खड़े हो जाते हैं।..(व्यवधान)..कोई कुछ मानता ही नहीं है। ..(व्यवधान)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. ...(Interruptions)... I will allow. ...(Interruptions)...

प्र० राम गोपाल यादव : एचआरडी मिनिस्टर को बुलाएं।..(व्यवधान)..

(Followed by 1J/SSS)

SSS-GS/1J/11.45

श्री मेघराज जैन : सर, यह क्या बात है? ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI (TAMIL NADU): Sir, it was Muthukrishnan's dream to get into JNU. His dream had come true. Why would a student whose

***Not recorded.**

dream has come true end up killing himself?

प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव : एच.आर.डी. मिनिस्टर को यहां बुलवाइए। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: राम गोपाल जी, आप बैठ जाइए। ...(व्यवधान).... आप बैठ जाइए।
...(व्यवधान)...

SHRIMATI KANIMOZHI: I would just like to quote what he has written in his Facebook. “When equality is denied, everything is denied.” Why would a student who has got into JNU after struggling for one year end up like this? It is because one of his friends said that he cannot get into college because his English was not good. He sat in the library for one year, worked hard and made sure that he got into the institution. Why would a student with this kind of determination, who struggled all through his life to become a scholar, end up like this? There is another student, Umar Khalid, the Bhagat Singh Ambedkar Students’ Association activist, who has said, and I would like to quote him, “Our universities are being turned into graveyards for the oppressed.” Is this the state of affairs which we want to continue in this country?

(Ends)

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I associate myself with the concern expressed by Shri D. Raja.

श्री उपसभापति : अंसारी जी। ...(व्यवधान).... अंसारी जी, बोलिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी (बिहार) : सर, यह जो मुथुकृष्णन है, यह एम.फिल. का स्कॉलर लड़का है। इसने अपने फेसबुक पोस्ट में लिखा है कि इस यूनिवर्सिटी में दलित छात्रों के एडमिशन में भेदभाव हो रहा है। सर, यह पहला मामला नहीं है, रोहित वेमुला की खुदकुशी के बाद ...(व्यवधान)... यह दूसरा मामला है। जे.एन.यू. में नजीब ने एक विचारधारा के लोगों का विरोध किया, उसके साथ मारपीट हुई और उसको अगवा कर दिया गया, उसकी लाश तक का पता नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, इस तरह की लगातार घटनाएं हो रही हैं। बनारस यूनिवर्सिटी में ऐसा हो रहा है, जे.एन.यू. में ऐसा हो रहा है, दिल्ली यूनिवर्सिटी में ऐसा हो रहा है, जितनी भी सेंट्रल यूनिवर्सिटीज हैं, सब जगहों पर ऐसा हो रहा है। ...(व्यवधान)... मुथुकृष्णन के पिता ने लाश का पोस्टमार्टम करवाने के लिए कहा है और यह भी कहा है कि उसमें केरल का एक डॉक्टर भी होना चाहिए। यहां का यूनिवर्सिटी प्रशासन उसको दूसरा रंग दे रहा है। ...(समय की घंटी)...

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: Sir,...(Interruptions)... Sir, I associate...(Interruptions)... Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir....

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : सर, यह बहुत ही गंभीर मामला है। ...(व्यवधान)... यूनिवर्सिटी प्रशासन इसको दबाने की कोशिश कर रहा है।...(व्यवधान)... इसको प्रशासन के द्वारा, सरकार के द्वारा दूसरा रंग देने की कोशिश की जा रही है।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now, we will listen to the hon. Minister. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : सर, यह बहुत गंभीर मामला है। ...(व्यवधान)... इस पर हमने कार्य स्थगन प्रस्ताव का नोटिस दिया है। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, हमने कार्य स्थगन प्रस्ताव का नोटिस दिया है।...(व्यवधान)... इसलिए हमारा अधिकार बनता है कि ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We are all agreeing with you.(Interruptions)... We are all agreeing with you.(Interruptions)...

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : सर, एक बाप को यह अधिकार है ...(व्यवधान)... उसका मेडिकल बोर्ड पर भरोसा नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir,...

श्री पी.एल. पुनिया : सर, मैंने रूल 267 के तहत नोटिस दिया है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yechuryji, the Minister is reacting.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Before that, I would like to say something.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You listen to the Minister and then you can seek better clarification.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, he is correct. Normally in this situation, a statement from the HRD Minister should have been here. Now, since this Government has come, -- it is given in today's question and answer - - the crime rate against the *Dalits* have gone up from 19.6 to 23.4 per cent. The point is...

श्री पी.एल. पुनिया : सर, इधर भी देख लीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, इधर भी देख लीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the Minister react.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, the point is, why is it that people who have struggled and struggled all their lives, reached the portals of the highest centres of excellence in our country, the Central Universities, the *Dalits*, are committing suicides? There is something very, very wrong. They are submitted to a lot of harassment and oppression and, for that, this Government has to be responsible and answer. ...(Interruptions)....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let the hon. Minister speak. ...(Interruptions)...

THE MINISTER OF STATE (INDEPENDENT CHARGE) OF THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY (SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN): Thank you very much, Sir, for giving me this opportunity to respond to it.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I am on a point of order.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: This is a very sensitive issue on which every Member who has spoken has expressed concern for the *Dalits* and particularly when students are finding it extremely difficult to get ready and enter and find admission in universities, particularly universities of excellence. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let her complete. ...(Interruptions).... Let the Minister complete.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Therefore, I would like to give our side of what we have seen and what Shri Raj Nath Singh, the Home Minister, has been following. I went to the mortuary this morning, and I have met with the father of the boy, and I have met with the guardian of the boy.

(Contd. by NBR/1K)

-SSS/NBR-HMS/1K/11.50.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN (CONTD.): I had also spoken to all student leaders present there. Hon. Member, Shri Tiruchi Siva, was also there. Other hon. Members from other parties were also there. It is true that, within 48 hours, the FIR which was to be filed had not been filed. But, now, after we all sat there and heard everybody's voice -- father, guardian, student leaders and friends of the boy -- very clearly directed the police, as per instructions from the hon. Home Minister, that by 12 o' clock the FIR should be filed and a copy should be given to father, guardian and to any number of students who would want a copy of it.

Sir, I would just take one minute to explain that students and also well-wishers asked us as to why the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribes (Prevention of Atrocities) Act could not be invoked in the FIR which is yet to be filed. The FIR will be filed, hopefully, by 12 o' clock. Police had given an answer. But, however, invoking that amended Act, it is possible for police not to wait for a complaint specifically to state as to who has been abusing him. It is possible to state that, yes, there was an atrocity committed and that is what has been suggested to police. This is one thing.

Secondly, Sir, questions have been raised as to why abetment to suicide has not been touched. The FIR has not yet been filed; everything

is discussed and there is a lot of communication gap about which I take this opportunity to explain. Sir, why has abetment to suicide not been invoked? Why has police still not filed an FIR? We did ask, in front of everybody, police as to why they would not want to consider that clause? Police said that unless a doubtful expression is stated somewhere in the complaint they may not, as per rules, be able to put that section of IPC into it. But, we have asked, in a general fashion, to put it without naming anybody, because, after all, it was seen by many. We do not know. The inquiry will have to establish whether it was a suicide, where it had happened, what is the provocation and everything else. Subject to inquiry, we have asked police to make sure that these two sections are invoked and FIR is filed.

Many hon. Members have spoken about many larger issues. Sir, a mention has also been made about Thorat Committee. It is not a Committee which we have appointed. It has been there for some time. Recommendations of Thorat Committee and recommendations of other related Committees have not been considered and taken up for improving administrative facility for such students in universities and reforms have not been taken up in universities. I have, under the direction of the hon. Home Minister, told students that statements prepared by Professors, teachers or well-wishers or relatives or student-friends be given to police

-- many of them consider that it is not specific to this incident, but it has a bearing on the well-being of students particularly from the disposed class -- and suggested police to receive and register them as statements relating to this complaint. That is also happening. Therefore, what I want to assure all hon. Members here is: I have discussed and reported back to the hon. Home Minister after visiting AIIMS this morning. I spent about one-and-a-half hours with all of them. I have given a detailed Report to the hon. Minister and he has clearly told me to assure the House that everything which is being put into the police complaint in terms of larger and incident-based statements will all be given a serious consideration.

We are interested in making universities a better place for students, particularly who come from difficult and socially deprived sections, so that universities become a better place for them to study and be comfortable with.

We sympathize, we are fully with all hon. Members who have gone there and we will make sure that everything goes well. Sir, the family mentioned that he is the only son and there are two daughters. One daughter is B.Sc. (Nursing) and working as nurse in a private hospital. The other daughter is B.Ed. and working as teacher in some private school. Father desired that they be given some job opportunity. The hon. Home Minister has also very clearly stated that he will consider the

demand. I want to place it before the House and assure that we have given the maximum attention and we will continue giving it and ensure that the unfortunate incident is addressed and justice is done. Thank you.

(Ends)

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : सर, रोहित वेमुला के मामले में सरकार ने क्या किया? ..(व्यवधान).. नजीब के मामले में क्या किया? यह बहुत गंभीर मामला है। ..(व्यवधान)....

MR. DPUTY CHAIRMAN: One, second. ...(Interruptions)... One second. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : *

श्री पी०एल० पुनिया : सर, मैं भी बोलना चाहूंगा। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not going on record. ...(Interruptions)... It is not going on record. ...(Interruptions)... आप चुप रहिए। ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री पी०एल० पुनिया : *

(FOLLOWED BY USY/1L)

USY-ASC/1L/11.55

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is not going on record. ...(Interruptions)... Why are you not allowing me to say anything?

...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Sit down.
...(Interruptions)... You are not allowed. Please sit down.
...(Interruptions)... Why are you not allowing me to speak?
...(Interruptions)... I am not allowing you. ...(Interruptions)... You have
already enjoyed one Zero Hour submission. ...(Interruptions)... Please sit
down. ...(Interruptions)... Hon. Minister, the Members have raised a
general question whether there is a kind of insecure feeling or a

***Not recorded.**

feeling of discrimination amongst the SC students in our universities.
...(Interruptions)... I think, the Government should look into that aspect
also, besides this individual case. ...(Interruptions)... Please find out
whether it is a fact that the SC students are being discriminated. That's
all. ...(Interruptions)... Now, Shri K.K. Ragesh. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री पी.एल. पुनिया : सर, मैंने भी रूल 267 के तहत नोटिस दिया है।
...(व्यवधान)....

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, I have not enjoyed my Zero Hour...
...(Interruptions)...

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : सर, वहां पर OBC व minority के छात्रों को निकाला जा
रहा है। ...(व्यवधान)....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar, not present.
...(Interruptions)... Mr. Ragesh. ...(Interruptions)...

THREAT OF VOILENCE AGAINST CHIEF MINISTER OF KERALA

SHRI K.K. RAGESH (KERALA): Sir, I take this opportunity to draw the
attention of this august House towards the vicious campaign unleashed
by the saffron brigade. ...(Interruptions)...

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD):
Sir, shall I resume?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have already called him. Let him finish first.

SHRI K.K. RAGESH: A vicious campaign has been unleashed by the saffron brigade against the Chief Minister of Kerala, Shri Pinarayi Vijayan. Recently, in a public meeting, a leader of the saffron brigade offered a bounty of rupees one crore for killing Shri Pinarayi Vijayan, the Chief Minister of Kerala. ...(Interruptions)... He also threatened to kill CPM activists of Kerala and also throughout the country, as it had happened during the Gujarat genocide. I don't think that it is an isolated incident. Three months back, the Chief Minister of Kerala was supposed to address a public rally in Bhopal, organized by some Malayalee organizations. On the protest of the saffron brigade, the Government had advised that the Chief Minister should not attend that programme, by violating the federal principle and the democratic ethos enshrined in our Constitution. Last to last week, the Chief Minister was supposed to attend a programme at Mangalore. The saffron brigade had called for a *hartal*. But the people had rejected that call and the programme was very successful. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री अमर शंकर साबले : वहां हत्याएं हो रही हैं। ...(व्यवधान).....

SHRI K.K. RAGESH: Even after that, the saffron brigade is unleashing a venomous campaign against the Chief Minister of Kerala. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री नारायण लाल पंचारिया : खुले में हत्याएं हो रही हैं। ...(व्यवधान).....

श्री मेघराज जैन : वहां रोज हत्याएं हो रही हैं। ...(व्यवधान).....

SHRI K.K. RAGESH: On 19th, another programme is being organized at Hyderabad where also the Chief Minister of Kerala would attend that. But the same saffron brigade has said that they won't allow the Chief Minister of Kerala to attend that programme. Who are they to make such kind of a statement? Why is there such intolerance? They are targeting Kerala with the same agenda of communalism. They want to divide the people on the communal lines. ...(Interruptions)... The CPI(M) and Shri Pinarayi Vijayan have emerged as icons of defending and safeguarding the secular fabric of the State. That is why, the Chief Minister of Kerala is being attacked; that is why, the CPI(M) is being attacked. The CPI(M) activists are being attacked in Kerala. ...(Interruptions)... They want to divide the people of Kerala on communal lines. ...(Interruptions)... And, we are there to defend. That is why, we are being attacked. ...(Interruptions)... (Ends)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your time is over. ...(Interruptions)... Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad wants to say something. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I associate myself with what the hon. Member, Shri K.K. Ragesh, has said. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I also associate myself with what the hon. Member, Shri K.K. Ragesh, has said. But I want to say one thing. ...(Interruptions)...

(Contd.)

by 1m — PK)

PK-LP/12.00/1M

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (CONTD.): The RSS cannot take up...(Interruptions).. of self-proclaimed defenders and implementers of law in our country. ..(Interruptions).. That is something not acceptable and this House should universally condemn this. ..(Interruptions).. No amount of such flak can happen.(Interruptions)..

SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU): Sir, we all associate with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

(Ends)

(12.00-1.00 P.M. — Question Hour)