

SSS-LT/1A/11.00

**The House met at eleven of the clock,
MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair**

...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, we will take up...

SHRI A. NAVANEETHAKRISHNAN: Sir, the Governor of Tamil Nadu...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will allow you. You please go back to your seat. ...(Interruptions)... Papers to be laid on the Table. ...(Interruptions)... Please go back to your seat. I will allow you. After the formal Business, I will call you. You go back to your seat. ...(Interruptions)... No, no; please go back. ...(Interruptions)... Papers to be laid on the Table.

PAPERS LAID ON TABLE

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI : Sir, I lay on the Table—

(1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013:—

- (i) (a) Fifty-eighth Annual Report and Accounts of the Handicrafts and Handlooms Exports Corporation of India Limited (HHEC), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.
- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Central Cottage Industries Corporation of India Limited (CCIC), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

(2) Statements (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) above.

श्री फगन सिंह कुलस्ते : महोदय, मैं श्री श्रीपद यसो नायक की ओर से निम्नलिखित पत्रों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :-

- (i) (a) Twenty-fifth Annual Report and Accounts of the National Academy of Ayurveda, Rashtriya Ayurveda Vidyapeeth, New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Academy.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

papers mentioned at (i) (a) above.

- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Homoeopathy, Kolkata, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (ii) (a) above.

DR. JITENDRA SINGH: Sir, I lay on the Table—

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions (Department of Personnel and Training) Notification No. G.S.R. 59 (E), dated the 20th January, 2017, publishing the All India Services (Discipline and Appeal) Amendment Rules, 2017, under sub-section (2) of Section 3 of the All India Services Act, 1951.

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Central Government Employees Consumer Co-operative Society Limited (Kendriya Bhandar), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Society.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

श्री फग्गन सिंह कुलस्ते : महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्रों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :-

- (a) Annual Report of the National Institute of Health and Family Welfare (NIHFW), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the National Institute of Health and Family Welfare (NIHFW), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) and (b) above.

SHRI RAJEN GOHAIN: Sir, I lay on the Table—

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board) Notification No. S.O. 4055 (E), dated the 16th December, 2016, publishing the Authorisation of Rail Travellers' Service Agents (Second Amendment) Rules, 2016, under Section 199 of the Railways Act, 1989.

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Rail Land

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

Development Authority (RLDA), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Authority.
 - (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (i) (a) above.
- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Railway Welfare Organisation (IRWO), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Performance Review of the above Organisation, for the year 2015-16.
 - (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (ii) (a) above.

श्री परषोत्तम रूपाला : महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्रों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :-

- (a) Annual Report of the National Council for Cooperative Training (NCCT), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the National Council for Cooperative Training (NCCT), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, and the Audit Report thereon.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) and (b) above.

श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर : महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्रों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :-

- (i) (a) Annual Report of the Central Tibetan Schools Administration (CTSA), Delhi, for the year 2015-16.
- (b) Annual Accounts of the Central Tibetan Schools Administration (CTSA), Delhi, for the year 2015-16, and the Audit Report thereon.
- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Organisation.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (i) (a) and (b) above.
- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan, Union Territory Mission Authority, Dadra and Nagar Haveli, for the year 2014-15, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (ii) (a) above.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan, UT Mission Authority, Andaman and Nicobar Islands, Port Blair, for the year 2014-15, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
 - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
 - (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (iii) (a) above.
- (iv) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Bihar Education Project Council, Patna, implementing the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA), for the year 2014-15, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
 - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
 - (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (iv) (a) above.
- (v) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Odisha Primary Education Programme Authority (OPEPA), Bhubaneswar, for the year 2014-15, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
 - (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
 - (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (v) (a) above.
- (vi) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Sarva Shiksha

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

Abhiyan, State Mission Authority, Manipur, Imphal, for the year 2014-15, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

- (b) Statement by Government accepting the above Report.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (vi) (a) above.

श्री कृष्ण पाल : महोदय, मैं राष्ट्रीय स्वपरायणता, प्रमस्तिष्क घात, मानसिक मंदता और बहुनिःशक्तताग्रस्त व्यक्ति कल्याण न्यास अधिनियम, 1999 की धारा 25 के अधीन निम्नलिखित पत्रों की एक-एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :-

- (a) Sixteenth Annual Report and Accounts of the National Trust for the Welfare of Persons with Autism, Cerebral Palsy, Mental Retardation and Multiple Disabilities, New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Trust.

श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर : महोदय, मैं निम्नलिखित पत्र सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ :-

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

I. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Higher Education), under sub-section (2) of Section 43 of the Central University Act, 2009:—

(1) No. 195, dated the 12th September, 2012, regarding amendments to Statutes 11 and 13 of Guru Ghasidas Vishwavidyalaya.

(2) No. 326, dated the 17th August, 2016, regarding amendments to Statutes 15 and 2(4) of Central University of South Bihar.

(3) No. 327, dated the 17th August, 2016, publishing the Central University of South Bihar First Ordinances.

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

(i) (a) Annual Accounts of the Indira Gandhi National Open University (IGNOU), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, and the Audit Report thereon, under sub-section (4) of Section 29 of the Indira Gandhi National Open University Act, 1985.

(b) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (i) (a) above.

(ii) (a) Annual Report of the Indian Institute of Information Technology, Design & Manufacturing (IIITD&M), Jabalpur, for the year 2015-16.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

- (b) Annual Accounts of the Indian Institute of Information Technology, Design & Manufacturing (IIITD&M), Jabalpur, for the year 2015-16, and the Audit Report thereon.
 - (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
 - (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (ii) (a) above.
- (iii)
- (a) Annual Report of the Sardar Vallabhbhai National Institute of Technology, Surat, for the year 2014-15.
 - (b) Annual Accounts of the Sardar Vallabhbhai National Institute of Technology, Surat, for the year 2014-15, and the Audit Report thereon, under sub-section (4) of Section 22 of the National Institutes of Technology Act, 2007.
 - (c) Review by Government on the working of the above institute.
 - (d) Statements giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (iii) (a) and (b) above.
- (iv)
- (a) Annual Report of the National Council for Promotion of Sindhi Language (NCPSL), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16.
 - (b) Annual Accounts of the National Council for Promotion

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

of Sindhi Language (NCPSL), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, and the Audit Report thereon.

- (c) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.
- (d) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (iv) (a) and (b) above.
- (v) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri Rashtriya Sanskrit Vidyapeetha, New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Vidyapeetha.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (v) (a) above.

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Sir, I lay on the Table—

I. (1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) (b) of Section 394 of the Companies Act, 2013:—

- (a) Forty-sixth Annual Report and Accounts of the Cotton Corporation of India Limited (CCI), Navi Mumbai, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Corporation.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

(2) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) above.

II. A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the South India Textile Research Association (SITRA), Coimbatore, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Performance Review of the above Association, for the year 2015-16.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (a) above.

(Ends)

**REPORT OF DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY
STANDING COMMITTEE ON EXTERNAL AFFAIRS**

DR. KARAN SINGH (NCT OF DELHI): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Fourteenth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on External Affairs (2016-17) on action taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Eleventh Report on Demands for Grants of the Ministry of External Affairs for the year 2016-17.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

REPORT OF COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC UNDERTAKINGS

श्री नरेन्द्र बुढानिया (राजस्थान) : महोदय, मैं "राष्ट्रीय एल्युमिनियम कंपनी लिमिटेड (नाल्को)" के संबंध में सरकारी उपक्रमों संबंधी समिति के बारहवें प्रतिवेदन में अंतर्विष्ट समुक्तियों/सिफारिशों पर सरकार द्वारा की गई कार्रवाई के संबंध में समिति के सत्रहवें प्रतिवेदन की एक प्रति (अंग्रेज़ी तथा हिन्दी में) सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

**STATEMENT RE. IMPLEMENTATION OF ELEVENTH REPORT OF
DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING
COMMITTEE ON URBAN DEVELOPMENT**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT (RAO INDERJIT SINGH): Sir, I make a statement regarding Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Eleventh Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Urban Development on Demands for Grants (2016-17) pertaining to the Ministry of Urban Development.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

**STATEMENT RE. IMPLEMENTATION OF TENTH REPORT OF
DEPARTMENT-RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING
COMMITTEE ON RAILWAYS**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (SHRI RAJEN GOHAIN): Sir, I make a statement regarding Status of implementation of recommendations contained in the Tenth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Railways on 'Pending Projects'.

(Ends)

(Followed by RL/1B)

-SSS/RL-KLG/11.05/1B

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, now, admitted Zero Hour submissions.

...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I have given notice under Rule 267, and I want your ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, you have given. It is correct.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I will just read it out for your benefit or for the benefit of the House. "This House raised concerns that the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

Prime Minister refused to answer the basic questions raised in the debate on the Motion of Thanks." That is the notice that I have given. Along with that there have been comments that have been made by the hon. Prime Minister about my party's former General Secretary, who is dead and gone, and about a former Member of the Lok Sabha....
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is to be.... ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I am sorry. I am sorry, Please listen to me.
...(Interruptions)... One minute. Now, this is a tradition of this House...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Speak on your motion under Rule 267, please. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Yes, Sir, I am coming to it.
...(Interruptions)... Sir, we just want to know.... ...(Interruptions)...

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): I have a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, please.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, my point of order is... ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, what is that point of order?
...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is a point of order by the Minister.

...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: What is that point of order?

...(Interruptions)... Sir, first you dispose of my thing.

...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me listen to that. ...(Interruptions)...

Don't worry, I will allow you. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: My notice is on the agenda and you have

called me. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yechuryji... ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: So, dispose of that. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is what I am saying.

...(Interruptions)... I told you that I will hear you. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir,... ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Leader of the House wants to raise a

point of order. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir,... ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have to decide whether your motion is to

be allowed or not. ...(Interruptions)... So, it will be helpful to me.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

...(Interruptions)... Let me listen to him, and after hearing the point of order, I will call you. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I can't understand how there could be a point of order on this. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me hear that. ...(Interruptions)... I will decide that. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: No, I can raise a point of order saying that your mike sound was a little lower yesterday. Then, what is that point of order?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: So, unless I hear... ...(Interruptions)... Let me listen. ...(Interruptions)... I will come back to you. I am not denying you. ...(Interruptions)... I will come back to you.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: My point of order on Shri Yechury's motion is based on two grounds. Ground no. 1, does a motion under Rule 267 go against the ruling of the Chair? It was the Chair which decided the procedure, and the 267 motion, in effect, says, "That the Chair's ruling was wrong. I should be allowed to seek clarifications." No. 2. ...(Interruptions)... Let me just complete. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir,(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: No. 2, the President's Address and the Discussion is regulated by the rules. Under Rule 18,—and that is the Rule they wanted me to cite—"The Government has a right to reply." There is no right of any rejoinder provided for in that rule.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Yechuryji, you make your point.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, the Government has the right to reply. That is precisely what we are saying. We are saying that they have not replied. Instead of replying, it was abusive and, sometimes, comments that were made.... ..(Interruptions)... And, Sir, the ruling of the Chair is being invoked. I want to say very clearly. The Chair stood up and said, "This is the practice in this House that if a name is taken of a Member present, then, that Member has the right to reply and the speaker yields." This has not been done in this instance. What can be a greater indictment than that? That was the ruling of the Chair. I was not permitted then to raise that point and there was a complete distortion of the facts of what my party stands for. For black money, yes, we have always been fighting and we will always fight them. But, what the point is that this demonetization was not the way of getting that black money.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: So, you can do one thing.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: One question was asked...
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: So, I will allow you. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: One question was asked as to how much money has returned to the banks. This was one question and there is no answer. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: And, there is no answer.
...(Interruptions)... Till date, there is no answer. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I got you point. ...(Interruptions)... Now, let me... ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: There is no answer as to how much money has come back. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, let me... ...(Interruptions)... Okay, ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I am charging this Government of allowing black money holders to convert their black money into white money.
...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, all right. ...(Interruptions)... Okay, now, let me give my decision ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: They have allowed money laundering... ...(Interruptions)... They have allowed money laundering... ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me give my decision. ...(Interruptions)... Let me give my decision. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir,... ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will call you. ...(Interruptions)... Let me give my decision. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir,... ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have given notice and I heard you. ...(Interruptions)... I will give my decision now. ...(Interruptions)... Yechury ji, you have given notice under Rule 267 for suspension of the Business. I heard you. Now, this is on a subject matter which has been discussed here and disposed of by the hon. Chairman. ...(Interruptions)...

(Followed by NBR/1C)

-SSS/NBR-AKG/1C/11.10.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: What is disposed of? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Therefore, I don't want to be...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, in an unprecedented manner, the hon. Chairman asked him to...(Interruptions)...But, he left. ...(Interruptions)... Never does the hon. Chairman leave in between the Motion of Thanks on President's Address. ...(Interruptions)...Never.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You cannot comment on what...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Motion of Thanks on the hon. President...(Interruptions)...Never has such thing has happened. ...(Interruptions)...Disposed of by the hon. Chairman. ...(Interruptions)... Don't drag the hon. Chairman in this. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. Whoever was in the Chair yesterday that matter was disposed of yesterday itself. So, I cannot allow a re-discussion on that subject. Therefore, it is ruled out.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: What about the abuse, Sir?
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: What about the abuse, Sir?
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI NEERAJ SHEKHAR: What about that abuse, Sir.
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There are other avenues for that.
...(Interruptions)... Make use of them. ...(Interruptions)... See, please,
listen to me. You are a very senior, seasoned and a learned Member.
There are other avenues for remedying that. Find out and invoke them.
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, the final avenue in democracy is the
people. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I also agree with that. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I know that. ...(Interruptions)... But, what
I am saying is, abusing a former Member of Lok Sabha who is dead and
abusing a former General-Secretary of the CPM who is dead cannot be
tolerated without being answered. ...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can use other instruments. ... (Interruptions) ... In the rule book, there are ways of doing that; you can do that. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: But, I want reply from the hon. Prime Minister... ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. Your notice under Rule 267 is rejected. ... (Interruptions) ... That is the position. I cannot allow a discussion again on what had happened yesterday, because it was completed. ... (Interruptions) ... The discussion was over. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: It has not been completed. ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, it was completed. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: How is it completed? ... (Interruptions) ... How is it completed? ... (Interruptions) ... It has not been adopted. ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't question. ... (Interruptions) ... Tapan ji, please, listen. ... (Interruptions) ...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: There was not a single hon. Member here. ... (Interruptions) ... So, how is it completed? ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: There was not a single Member here yesterday. ... (Interruptions) ... How can you construe that to be adopted and accepted? ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yechury ji, we are all on points; there is nothing personal in this. What is the position with regard to the Chair? It was discussed yesterday. Yes; I agree with you that some point might not have been answered. ... (Interruptions) ... I agree with you. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Nothing has been answered. ... (Interruptions) ... It is full of abuse and abuse only. ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, sit down. ... (Interruptions) ... It always happens. But, if you are aggrieved on that, you can make use of the rule book. There are avenues. Make use of them. So, I have rejected your notice. I cannot allow. Now, there is notice from Shri Sharad Yadav. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I am on a point of order. ... (Interruptions) ...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Are you on a point of order? Okay.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: It is under Rule 238.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't be angry with me. You get your point of order. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I am not angry with you, Sir. I am angry with what has happened in the country.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your point of order?

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, it is Rule 238 which talks about rules to be observed while speaking and also look at Rule 235. Rule 238 is clear. Rule 238(iii) says about the use of offensive expressions about the conduct or proceedings. This is one. Rule 238(iv) says about reflect on any determination of the Council except on a motion for rescinding it. And, (v) says about reflect upon the conduct of persons in high authority unless the discussion is based on substantive motion drawn in proper terms.

Now, Sir, what I have to say is that the hon. Prime Minister, yesterday...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This had happened yesterday.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Please, please, Sir. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, what is happening? ...(Interruptions)... He insulted the memory of Indira Gandhi who is martyred Prime Minister of India. ...(Interruptions)... He referred to a book written by an executive Assistant. ...(Interruptions)... He did not even authenticate it and place it here. ...(Interruptions)... He is the Prime Minister. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, Shrimati Indira Gandhi and Shri Rajiv Dhawan are not here. ...(Interruptions)... Both have been passed away. ...(Interruptions)... It is a matter of shame. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You see, why did you not raise it at that time? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: He is the Prime Minister. ...(Interruptions)... He condemned the former Prime Minister. ...(Interruptions)... What he did is unacceptable to us. ...(Interruptions)... He has dragged the political debate to a new low. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: It is not acceptable. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is the point of raising it now? ...(Interruptions)... As far as the Chair is concerned, it is a closed chapter. ...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: If the hon. Prime Minister cannot control himself, we will control, we will oppose and we will assert our right. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Anand Sharmaji, as far as the Chair is concerned, it is a closed matter. ... (Interruptions)...

(CONTD. BY PK/1D)

PK-SCH/1D/11.15

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN (Contd.): Unless you give another notice..... (Interruptions).. You can give a notice. ... (Interruptions).. If you want to raise it, give notice. But, I cannot now reopen a discussion which was closed yesterday.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I gave notice, but you rejected. ... (Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. There are other ways (Interruptions).. I am only rejecting your notice under Rule 267. ... (Interruptions)..

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, my point of order is under Rule 238.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But I am only rejecting Rule 267 notice. ...*(Interruptions)*.. There are so many other ways by which you can give notice. ...*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: What is the sanctity of rules? ...*(Interruptions)*.. How can the Prime Minister say these things? ...*(Interruptions)*.. It is a violation. ..*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, you said 'No'. ..*(Interruptions)*..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; I only said, 'too late'. ...*(Interruptions)*.. *Yechuriji*, don't blame me. ...*(Interruptions)*.. I only rejected notice under Rule 267. ..*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I am not blaming you at all, Sir. ..*(Interruptions)*.. I am only complimenting you for listening to me all this while. ...*(Interruptions)*..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I listened to you. ...*(Interruptions)*.. I heard you. ...*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: We will move a motion. It is a case of a breach of privilege against the Prime Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*.. Let him come to the House.*(Interruptions)*..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, *Sharad Yadavji*.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Why did he not come when we were speaking? He insults, he abuses. You expect us to be quite; we will not be quite.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You could have raised it then. You should have raised it then, not now.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I had raised it. ...(Interruptions).. All my colleagues.....(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You should have raised it then, not now. Now, Sharad Yadavji.

श्री शरद यादव : श्रीमन्, मैं ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI BHUPENDER YADAV: Sir, I am on a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: After Sharadji, I have called him. ..(Interruptions).. Is it a point of order?

SHRI BHUPENDER YADAV: Yes, Sir, it is under Rule 240.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Sharad Yadavji, I will call you later. I have to allow a point of order.

SHRI BHUPENDER YADAV: How a Member should speak in the House is under Rule 238, which was referred to by Anand Sharmaji. But, here, I want to quote Rule 240 also. If a Member repeatedly

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-09.02.2017

speaks in the House irrelevant things, then, it is the duty of the House to stop him. ...(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Sharad Yadavji. ...(Interruptions)..

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I support him. Thank you very much for drawing attention to this Rule. Thank you very much, that the PM spoke totally irrelevant.....(Interruptions).. Totally irrelevant.(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sharad Yadavji.(Interruptions)..

श्री श्वेत मलिक : जो उन्होंने कहा, वह फैक्टुअल था।...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: No facts. ...(Interruptions).. Only abuse. ..(Interruptions).. There is no fact. ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have given the floor to Sharad Yadavji.

...(Interruptions).. Sharad Yadavji is a senior Member.

...(Interruptions).. Sharad Yadavji is a senior Member.

...(Interruptions).. सुनिए...(व्यवधान)... आप बैठिए।...(व्यवधान)...

Sharad Yadavji, you start speaking.(Interruptions)..

श्री शरद यादव : श्रीमन्, मैं ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Listen to Sharad Yadavji.

...(Interruptions).. आप बैठिए।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा : ये सिर्फ मोदी जी को प्रभावित करने के लिए इस तरह बोल रहे हैं।... (व्यवधान)...

श्री श्वेत मलिक : आप किसको प्रभावित कर रहे हैं? ... (व्यवधान)... आप बताइए कि आप किसको प्रभावित करने के लिए बोल रहे हैं? ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति : आप बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... शरद यादव जी, आप बोलिए।... (व्यवधान)... शरद यादव जी सीनियर मेम्बर हैं, पहले आप इनको सुन लीजिए।... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI AHMED PATEL: Sir, yesterday, he was not..... (Interruptions)..

श्री शरद यादव : सर, मैं आपसे विनती करना चाहता हूँ कि कल इस सदन में जो कुछ ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति : आप अपने नोटिस के सब्जेक्ट पर बोलिए।

श्री शरद यादव : जी हां, सर, मैं उसी पर बोल रहा हूँ।

कल सदन में जो हुआ है, उससे हमारी जो सारी की सारी परम्परा है, वह प्रभावित हुई है। जिस समय प्रधान मंत्री जी बोल रहे थे, उसी समय मैं इंटरवीन करना चाहता था और उनसे दो बातें कहना चाहता था, दो सुझाव देना चाहता था। व्हीट पर इम्पोर्ट ड्यूटी ज़ीरो कर दी गई है और 9000 रुपये में एक क्विंटल दाल मंगवाई जा रही है। प्रधान मंत्री जी ने मुझसे कहा कि शरद जी, आप बैठिए, हम आपको बाद में सुनेंगे।... (व्यवधान)...

कई माननीय सदस्य : उन्होंने यह नहीं बोला था।... (व्यवधान)...

श्री सीताराम येचुरी : उन्होंने यह बोला था।...(व्यवधान)... उन्होंने यह बोला था।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति : आप सुनिए।...(व्यवधान)... सुनिए।...(व्यवधान)...

(Followed by PB/RPM/1E)

RPM-USY/1E/11.20

श्री शरद यादव: यदि आपको लगता है कि मैं ठीक नहीं बोल रहा हूँ, तो मैं बैठ जाता हूँ। ...(व्यवधान)... यदि आपको लगता है कि ठीक नहीं बोल रहा हूँ, तो मैं बैठ जाता हूँ, मुझे इसमें कोई दिक्कत नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति : शरद जी, कृपया आप बोलिए।

श्री शरद यादव: उपसभापति जी, प्रधान मंत्री जी ने उस समय मुझसे कहा कि आप बैठिए, आपको हम सुनेंगे। ये कह रहे हैं कि उन्होंने ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति : शरद जी, कृपया आप बोलिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

मानव संसाधन विकास मंत्री (श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर): उपसभापति जी, उन्होंने कहा था कि हम हमेशा सुनते रहे हैं और सुनने के लिए ही ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What he says, it is his viewpoint.
...(Interruptions)... Please listen to him.

श्री सीताराम येचुरी: मंत्री जी, यहां आपकी बात नहीं हो रही है। यह बात प्रधान मंत्री जी के बारे में हो रही है। आपकी बात नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)... मैं आपकी वह बात मान लेता हूँ। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति : शरद जी, आप बोलिए। ... (व्यवधान) ... आप बोलिए, आप बोलिए।

श्री शरद यादव: मैं जो बात कह रहा हूँ, उस समय सभापति जी आसन पर बैठे हुए थे। जब वहाँ से विरोध हुआ कि प्रधान मंत्री जी के बोलने के बाद, अब समापन हो गया, अब नहीं बोलना चाहिए। सभापति जी ने इन्हें रिमाइंड किया, जो सब लोग बोल रहे थे, आप सब लोग यहाँ थे, उन्होंने कहा कि प्रधान मंत्री जी जब बोल रहे थे, तो शरद यादव जी ने जब खड़े होकर कहा, तो प्रधान मंत्री जी ने कहा था कि आप बाद में बोलिए। ... (व्यवधान) ... आप बाद में बोलिए। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री श्वेत मलिक : सर, उन्होंने कहा था कि हमारी पार्टी सुनती है, हम सुनते हैं और सुनते रहेंगे। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री उपसभापति : शरद जी, आप बोलिए। ... (व्यवधान) ...

एक माननीय सदस्य: उन्होंने पार्लियामेंटरी प्रोसीज़र समझाने की कोशिश की, लेकिन वे समझे ही नहीं। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री श्वेत मलिक: सर, रिकॉर्ड निकलवा कर देख लीजिए। ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री शरद यादव: अब बताइए। मैं कह रहा हूँ, मेरी बात नहीं है। मैं अपनी बात नहीं कह रहा हूँ। सभापति जी ने यह रिमाइंड कराया कि प्रधान मंत्री को जब शरद यादव ने इंटरवीन किया, तो ... (व्यवधान) ... आप मुझे क्यों बोलने नहीं दे रहे हैं? क्या इस तरह से सदन चलेगा? ... (व्यवधान) ... आप क्या समझ रहे हैं? ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्री उपसभापति : आप इधर के मालिक नहीं हैं। आप उधर के मालिक हैं, बैठिए।
...(व्यवधान)... बैठिए।

Sharadji, what is your point? ...(Interruptions)...

श्री शरद यादव: उपसभापति जी, मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि यह एक परम्परा है कि जब कोई मंत्री बोलेगा, तो यहां मंत्री के बयान के बाद कोई सदस्य बोल सकता है और यह परम्परा आज की नहीं है, बल्कि 70 वर्ष की है। जब यहां प्रधान मंत्री बोलेंगे या कोई मंत्री बोलेगा, तो ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is okay. ...(Interruptions)... I am not disputing that. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री शरद यादव: उपसभापति जी, यहां कुछ मैम्बर आ गए हैं, जो किसी को सुनना नहीं चाहते हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will allow you. ...(Interruptions)... Please go back to your seats. ...(Interruptions)... I will allow you. ...(Interruptions)... I will give you a chance. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री शरद यादव: सर, यह प्रोसीडिंग है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will allow you. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री शरद यादव: उपसभापति जी, मेरे बोलने के बाद, श्री नरेन्द्र मोदी, प्रधान मंत्री ने कहा, बाद में करते हैं ...(व्यवधान)... एक बार हो जाए, यानी मेरा भाषण हो जाए। ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will allow you. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री शरद यादव: सर, प्रधान मंत्री जी ने कहा ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति : शरद जी बोलिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री शरद यादव: सर, प्रधान मंत्री जी ने कहा कि एक बार मेरा भाषण हो जाए ...(व्यवधान)...

(1एफ/पीएसवी पर आगे)

PB-PSV/1F/11.25

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am sorry. ..(Interruptions)... Why do you do this? ...(Interruptions)... Why do you do this? ...(Interruptions)... Shri Hariprasad, what are you doing? ...(Interruptions)... The House is adjourned up to 12.00 hrs.

The House then adjourned at twenty-five minutes past eleven of the clock.

(12.00-1.00 P.M. - Question Hour)

