

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

GSP-SC/1A/11.00

**The House met at eleven of the clock,
MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair**

- - -

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

SHRI C.R. CHAUDHARY: Sir, I lay on the Table, under Section 23 of the Bureau of Indian Standards Act, 1986, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Bureau of Indian Standards, New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Bureau.

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Sir I lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Textiles) and the Handicrafts and Handlooms Exports Corporation of India Limited (HHEC), for the year 2016-17.

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Indian Institute of Carpet Technology (IICT), Bhadohi, Uttar Pradesh, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (i) (a) above.
- (ii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Carpet Export Promotion Council (CEPC), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
 - (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Council.
 - (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (ii) (a) above.

SHRI MANSUKH L. MANDAVIYA: Sir, lay on the Table, under sub-section (6) of Section 3 of the Essential Commodities Act, 1955, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Chemicals and Fertilizers (Department of Pharmaceuticals) Notification No. S.O. 4100 (E), dated the 21st December, 2016, publishing the Drugs (Prices Control) Third Amendment Order, 2016.

SHRI P.P. CHAUDHARY: Sir, lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—

- (i) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Society for Applied Microwave Electronics Engineering and Research (SAMEER), Mumbai, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
- (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Organisation.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

- (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (i) (a) above.
- (ii) (a) Twenty-first Annual Report and Accounts of the National Institute of Electronics and Information Technology (NIELIT), New Delhi, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
 - (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Institute.
 - (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (ii) (a) above.
- (iii) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Centre for Materials for Electronics Technology (C-MET), Pune, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
 - (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Centre.
 - (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (iii) (a) above.
- (iv) (a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Centre for Development of Advanced Computing (C-DAC), Mumbai, for the year 2015-16, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.
 - (b) Review by Government on the working of the above Centre.
 - (c) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (iv) (a) above.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

- (v) Two Hundred and Sixty-third Report of the Law Commission of India on The Protection of Children (Inter-Country Removal and Retention) Bill, 2016.

SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI: Sir, on behalf of my colleague, Shri Piyush Goyal, I lay on the Table, under clause (1) of article 151 of the Constitution, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India on Fuel Management of Coal Based Power Stations of NTPC Limited - Union Government (Commercial), Ministry of Power, Report No. 35 of 2016 (Performance Audit).

(Ends)

REPORTS OF JOINT COMMITTEE ON OFFICES OF PROFIT

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the Sixteenth, Seventeenth and Eighteenth Reports of the Joint Committee on Offices of Profit.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

LEAVE OF ABSENCE

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I have to inform that a letter has been received from Shri Kunal Kumar Ghosh stating that due to the restriction of not leaving the jurisdiction of Narkeldanga Police Station imposed by the High Court of Calcutta in the interim bail granted to him, he is unable to attend the sittings of the current (242nd) Session. He has, therefore, requested for grant of Leave of Absence for the 242nd Session.

Does he have the permission of the House for remaining absent from 31st January to 12th April, 2017 during the current (242nd) Session of Rajya Sabha?

(No hon. Member dissented)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Permission to remain absent is granted.

**ANNOUNCEMENT RE. GOVERNMENT BUSINESS FOR THE WEEK
COMMENCING 06TH FEBRUARY, 2017**

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी) : महोदय, मैं आपकी अनुमति से यह सूचित करता हूँ कि सोमवार, 06 फरवरी, 2017 से प्रारम्भ होने वाले सप्ताह के दौरान निम्नलिखित सरकारी कार्य लिए जाएंगे:

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

1. आज की कार्यसूची में शामिल निम्नलिखित में से बकाया सरकारी कार्य की किसी मद पर विचार:-

राष्ट्रपति जी के अभिभाषण पर धन्यवाद प्रस्ताव पर चर्चा।

2. वर्ष 2017-18 के लिए केन्द्रीय बजट पर सामान्य चर्चा।
3. लोक सभा द्वारा पारित तथा राज्य सभा की प्रवर समिति द्वारा प्रतिवेदित रूप में शत्रु सम्पत्ति (संशोधन और विधिमान्यकरण) विधेयक, 2016 पर विचार और पारित करना;
4. लोक सभा द्वारा पारित किए जाने के पश्चात निम्नलिखित विधेयकों पर विचार और पारित करना:-
 - (i) मज़दूरी संदाय (संशोधन) विधेयक, 2017
 - (ii) विनिर्दिष्ट बैंक नोट (उत्तरदायित्व का समाप्त होना) विधेयक, 2017

(समाप्त)

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, to protest against the illegal arrest of the leader of the Lok Sabha... ..(Interruptions)...

THE MINISTER OF TEXTILES (SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI): Sir, I have a point to make. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Point of order! ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, let me finish. ... (Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Sir, my colleague, Shri Derek O'Brien, who stood right now to attract the attention,...
 ...(Interruptions)... Sir, please allow me to make a point of order.
 ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me first listen to the point of order.
 ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, I have stood up. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will call you. ...(Interruptions)... I will call you.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: The Minister is having a point of order!
 ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Point of order has a preference.
 ...(Interruptions)... Point of order has precedence. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Sir, I am also a ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Point of order has precedence.
 ...(Interruptions)... Point of order has precedence. ...(Interruptions)...

देरेक जी, बैठिए..(व्यवधान).. देरेक जी, बैठिए। ..(व्यवधान)..

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: I am also a Member of this House, Sir. ...(Interruptions)... And, I hope, no Member in this House will disallow me in using the privilege that you all enjoy. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now, point of order. This has precedence. ...(Interruptions)... Let me listen to the point of order. ...(Interruptions)... I will allow you, Mr. Derek. ...(Interruptions)... Yes, hon. Minister, what do you wish to say?

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: On the Zero Hour mention, you have a point of order! ...(Interruptions)... No point of order in Zero Hour.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will allow you, Mr. Derek. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, on this 'point of order', I have a point of order. Can a Cabinet Minister raise a point of order? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will give the ruling. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Sir, I think, one needs to understand... ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. Minister is also a Member; no problem. ...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Sir, I am sure Mr. Anand Sharma...
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: No point of order in Zero Hour, Sir.
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me listen. ...(Interruptions)... Even
otherwise, I am listening to the Minister. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Sir, I am sure, Mr. Sharma will yield
here... ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: No point of order in Zero Hour, Sir.
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your problem? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: A colleague in the Rajya Sabha...
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: No point of order, Sir.
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. You have to call the rule and tell
me. ...(Interruptions)...

(followed by YSR-1B)

-GSP/YSR-GS/11.05/1B

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Sir, I am grateful to you for giving me the opportunity. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is the Rule under which you are raising this?

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Rule 258. My colleague, Shri Derek O'Brien, yesterday on a point that he wanted to articulate, and very rightfully so, did the same. However, he quoted an individual citizen who is not here...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, she is referring to yesterday...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Sir, I am referring to yesterday because the House was misled. ...(Interruptions)... Allow me to finish. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, he named an individual...(Interruptions)... He is a common citizen who is not covered by privilege...(Interruptions)...not available in the House to defend himself.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, this is no point of order. ...(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me listen to it. ...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: This is not a *neta* or a celebrity...(Interruptions).... This is a common citizen. ... (Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sukhenduji, let me listen to it. ... (Interruptions)... How can I say something unless I understand it? ... (Interruptions)..

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: To attack or defame an individual... (Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sukhenduji, because you are shouting, I can't hear that. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Expunge the name of the individual as per the convention of the House. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sukhenduji, neither I understand what you are saying nor what she is saying. ... (Interruptions)... I will decide it. ... (Interruptions)... Sukhenduji, I accept that you are the Vice-Chairman but you are authorised to give a ruling when you sit here, not when you are there. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, I have a right to speak. ... (Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes. ...(Interruptions)... Because the hon. Minister said that she wanted to raise a point of order. ...(Interruptions)... The Minister is also a Member, as far as I am concerned. So, I can allow her. Let me first understand what she is saying. Only then can I give a ruling. ...(Interruptions)... Listen to me. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, she is referring to yesterday...(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is correct. Let me understand that. ...(Interruptions)... Why do you give a ruling without understanding and without hearing this? ...(Interruptions)... This is my point. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, my humble submission is...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would listen to you also. ...(Interruptions).. In any case, the Minister has a right to be heard. ...(Interruptions)... Sit down. ...(Interruptions)... The Minister has a right to be heard. ...(Interruptions)... Sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

No, no. ...(Interruptions).. Sit down. ...(Interruptions).. The Minister has a right to be heard. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: Sir, under Rule 258, the individual, who was named yesterday by my colleague, Shri Derek O'Brien, is not a *neta*, not a celebrity. He is a common citizen who has a right to free speech but does not enjoy the privilege of this House. Sir, as per the convention of the House, I am beseeching you that kindly expunge the name of an individual as you have done so on many occasions.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would look into the record.

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: The individual who cannot defend himself...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will go through the record and do the needful. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: He is saying that a wrong done yesterday cannot be corrected today. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It can be corrected. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: It is a big fallacy. ...(Interruptions)...

Thank you, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If a wrong thing was done yesterday, it can be corrected. ...(Interruptions)... I would go through the record. ...(Interruptions)... If there is anything like that, I will do the needful. ...(Interruptions)... Now, Shri Derek O'Brien. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री शरद यादव: उपसभापति जी, हमें भी बोलना है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your problem? ...(Interruptions)... I will call you also. ...(Interruptions)... Shri Derek O'Brien. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, there are two points. I don't want to disrupt the House by going into the Well. But we need to make these two points.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Have you given any notice?

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Yes, Sir. There are two notices. One is on the hundred deaths.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is about Zero Hour. I will call you...(Interruptions)..

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, let me finish this. ...(Interruptions).. Give me thirty seconds. ...(Interruptions).. Sir, you asked me to stand up. I sat when you asked Smritiji to speak. ...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me understand one point.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, please let me make this point.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am allowing you, but let me understand this. Are you raising it under Rule 267?

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Yes, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Or is it a Zero Hour matter? Have you given any notice?

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, please let me make this point. You asked the hon. Minister to speak and it has nothing to do with what she has said. Sir, my limited point in thirty seconds is this. Illegal arrest of our Lok Sabha Leader of Trinamool Congress and an MP...(Interruptions)...

THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR): Who says this?

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: I did not interrupt. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him have his say. ...(Interruptions)..
Let him have his say. ...(Interruptions)..

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, when the Minister was speaking, I did not interrupt. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is only saying it is illegal. That is his view. Don't worry. That is his view only. ...(Interruptions).. No, no. ...(Interruptions)..

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI): Sir, there is no notice...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: This is not ...(Interruptions)... The Chair has allowed me.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Naqviji, I have allowed him. ...(Interruptions)... I have allowed you. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs wants to do your job. ...(Interruptions)... So, you ask him to come and sit in your Chair. ...(Interruptions)... What is this? ...(Interruptions)... He asked me to speak. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He already has a job.

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी: आप दूसरे सदस्यों का समय खराब कर रहे हैं।
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री देरेक ओब्राईन: नहीं, नहीं।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी: हम यह कह रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...आप दूसरे सदस्यों का समय खराब कर रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: आप बोलिए। आप बोलिए। ...(व्यवधान)... Mr. Derek, you speak.

श्री देरेक ओब्राईन: आप समय की बात मत कीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... आप समय की बात मत कीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Derek, you address the Chair. ... (Interruptions)... You say what you want to say. ... (Interruptions)...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी: आप दूसरे मेम्बर्स का टाइम खराब कर रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

(1C/HMS पर आगे)

-YSR/VKK-HMS/1C/11.10

श्री देरेक ओब्राईन : आप समय की बात मत कीजिए। सर, लाखों-लाखों लोग demonetization के कारण घंटों-घंटों लाइन में खड़े थे। So, don't talk to me about समय। Sir, I have two limited points. One, illegal arrest of our Lok Sabha leader and our Member; and two, if not today, I will try again. ... (Interruptions)... One second, Sir. ... (Interruptions)... We will try again on Monday morning. We want this House to maintain one-minute silence for the 120 deaths which have taken place. ... (Interruptions)... If

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

it does not happen, on this illegal arrest, we are walking out.

...(Interruptions)... Trinamool Congress is walking out.

...(Interruptions)...

(At this stage, some hon. Members left the Chamber.)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. ...(Interruptions)... Now, Shri Sharad Yadav. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, I have a point of order. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. Sharad Yadavji. ...(Interruptions).. I have called Sharad Yadavji. ...(Interruptions)... Okay, under what rule? ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, it is very simple. Can anybody raise an issue about a Member of the other House? ...(Interruptions)... Do you permit that? ...(Interruptions)... How do you raise a matter relating to a Member of the other House? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: He said that it is an illegal arrest. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Illegal or legal is not my concern. ...(Interruptions)... Listen to me. ...(Interruptions)... Why is Dr.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

Maitreyan getting so charged up about that? Please listen to me. A Member can raise here the matter of arrest of any citizen of this country. You please understand that. So, I allowed him to raise it. That's all. ... (Interruptions) ...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, please refer to it again. ... (Interruptions) ... You are probably away from truth. ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: That is unfair. ... (Interruptions) ... It should be expunged. ... (Interruptions) ... He has cast an aspersion on the Chair. ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, you have not understood the rule. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: But, he is casting aspersion on your judgement. ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, you should also read. ... (Interruptions) ... You are a well-educated person. It is only when you criticise a Member of the other House or the speech of a Member of the other House that I invoke the rule. When you speak about any other Member, of their plight or their difficulties or arrest, I will not interfere.

Furthermore, it is only his version that it is illegal. Only he said that. It is only his view. Why do you worry? The Government has a view. Government will say if it is otherwise. So, you do not worry about that. ... (Interruptions) ... Now, Sharad Yadavji.

श्री शरद यादव (बिहार) : उपसभापति महोदय, मैं आपकी अनुमति से एक गंभीर सवाल यहां उठाना चाहता हूँ। महोदय, कॉमन सिविल कोड में हिंदुस्तान में लोगों को अपने-अपने धर्म का पालन करने के पूरे-पूरे हक संविधान के तहत प्राप्त हैं। संविधान के आर्टिकल 44 में साफ लिखा है कि साउथ में, नॉर्थ में, ईस्ट और वेस्ट में, हिंदुओं के, ईसाइयों के, पारसियों के, आदिवासियों के अलग-अलग किस्म के लॉज हैं, लेकिन कॉमन सिविल कोड पर एक सवाल लगातार बहस का जरिया बना हुआ है। संविधान की मंशा यह है कि सब को pursue कर के, सब को समझाकर, सब लोगों की राय व मशवरे से इस पर विचार किया जाए, लेकिन लॉ कमीशन ने हमारी पार्टी, हमारी सरकार और नीतीश कुमार जी को इस बारे में लिखा है। महोदय, चाहे क्रिश्चियंस हैं, पारसी हैं, सिख हैं या जैन हैं, सब को अपने-अपने धर्म का पालन करने के लिए हमारे संविधान के तहत अधिकार मिले हैं। महोदय, हमारे यहां अलग-अलग traditions हैं, लेकिन संविधान के आर्टिकल 44 में साफ कहा है कि समझदारी से, प्रेम से, persuasion से सब को तैयार कर के आप कॉमन सिविल कोड ला सकते हैं, लेकिन लॉ कमीशन अभी से सब को पूछ

रहा है और इस तरह का काम कर रहा है जोकि ठीक नहीं है। महोदय, हमारा देश कई तरह की विविधताओं से भरा हुआ है।

(1 डी/एएससी पर जारी)

DC-ASC/11.15/1D

श्री शरद यादव (क्रमागत) : यह देश कई तरह की विविधताओं से इसलिए भरा हुआ है कि हमको देश में हर तरह से जो शांति है ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir,...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No discussion on this.

श्री शरद यादव: इस देश में जो पूरी तरह से ...(व्यवधान)... संविधान में मौलिक अधिकारों में यह नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing this. ...(Interruptions)...

No discussion. ...(Interruptions)... No discussion. I am only listening to him, to decide... ...(Interruptions)...

श्री शरद यादव: सबको यह हक मिला हुआ है और अपने-अपने धर्म के अनुसार चलने का सब तरह से इंतजाम है, लेकिन लॉ कमिशन सबकी सहमति लिए बगैर, सबसे बात किए बगैर...(व्यवधान)... सबसे चर्चा कीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सीताराम येचुरी : मेंडेट से बाहर जा रहा है । ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री शरद यादव : मेंडेट से से बाहर जा रहा है।...(व्यवधान)... यह ठीक नहीं है।
...(व्यवधान)...मेरा इतना ही निवेदन है कि यह ठीक नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay; I heard you. I got your point.

...(Interruptions).....

श्री शरद यादव : पहले सबसे सहमति लीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

(समाप्त)

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will tell you, Yechuryji. ...(Interruptions)...

No, no. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I associate. ...(Interruptions)... I associate because I think that it is a serious matter.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yechuryji, listen to me. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: It is a serious matter...(Interruptions)...

No authority... ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, it is serious and, that is why,...
...(Interruptions)...

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी : एक राज्य का मुख्य मंत्री ...(व्यवधान)... भेजते हैं।
...(व्यवधान)...इस तरह से ...(व्यवधान)... Yes or no! ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...(Interruptions)... Please listen.
...(Interruptions)... Listen, please. This subject... ...(Interruptions)...

Now, please understand. Ansariji, please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD):

Sir, I request you that we are in the midst of the elections...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is what I am saying.
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: And some people would definitely like to make it an agenda. My request is, since a Member of Parliament has raised it...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am coming to that. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Neither the Government should come into the picture nor any other person because then everybody would start.
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is what I am saying.
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Once the Government takes some stand, then we shall also have to take a decision.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay; let me say.

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: I think you should finish it here.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me make a point.

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: This was raised by a particular Member and finish it.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay; that is what I am saying. Yes.
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: The Government should also not say anything.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you for helping me, hon. LoP. That is my point because since Shri Sharad Yadav, a senior Member, had given notice for suspension under Rule 267, I only allowed him to raise it to decide as to whether the motion should be allowed or not. So I am not allowing the motion. I only heard him. That was the decision.
...(Interruptions)...

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी) : सर, पहली बात तो यह है कि जो शरद यादव जी ने कहा है ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't complicate. ...(Interruptions)..
Don't complicate. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी: कॉमन सिविल कोड कोई स्काई लैब नहीं है।
...(व्यवधान)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, once the Government says something ...(Interruptions)...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी: अगर राजकुमारी ...(व्यवधान)... कर रहा है...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't complicate. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी: तो वह ...(व्यवधान)... में कर रहा है ...(व्यवधान)... संविधान के तहत है। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: I am sorry to say that...(Interruptions)...

Then, we will have to... ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...(Interruptions)... Let us not have a discussion on this. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Let us not have any discussion. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री उपसभापति : नक़वी जी। ...(व्यवधान)... Naqviji, let us not have a discussion on this. Please forget it. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी : इसमें कंप्यूजन की बात नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)... कोई भी कंप्यूजन नहीं होना चाहिए। ...(व्यवधान)...ऐसा कोई भी कदम न उठाएं, जो राजकुमारी के बिना हो। ...(व्यवधान)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have not allowed that. ...(Interruptions)...
Naqviji, I have not allowed that. No discussion. ...(Interruptions)...
Listen Naqviji. Yechuryji, please sit down. I only allowed Sharadji to
raise it. I have not allowed the motion. So, that is closed. No
discussion on that because it is a sensitive issue. Let us not take it.
...(Interruptions)... Okay; now we go to the Zero Hour. Shri Ritabrata
Banerjee.

MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION OF CHAIR

DEMAND FOR DECLARING ANDAMAN CELLULAR JAIL AS NATIONAL MONUMENT

SHRI RITABRATA BANERJEE (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I want to raise
one important issue regarding the Andaman Cellular Jail in our country.
The Andaman Cellular Jail which is one of the tallest monuments
concerning the freedom struggle is unfortunately not under the
Archaeological Survey of India. I will urge upon the Government to
bring the Andaman Cellular Jail under the Archaeological Survey of
India. The revolutionaries had gone into this Andaman Jail in two
phases. In the first phase, before the First World War and in the second

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

phase, after the Second World War. In the Andaman Cellular Jail, the properly registered history is up to the first phase. But the second phase is not properly registered and they are selectively displayed in the museum. This is a very unfortunate thing because if we go to the top of the Cellular Jail, at the Watch Tower, there are marbles where the names of the revolutionaries are depicted. As I come from Bengal, incidentally, majority of the names craved in the marble are from Bengal. I just want to take this opportunity to mention here one incident regarding the Chittagong youth rebellion. The Chittagong youth rebellion was one of the most important incidents that took place at the time in undivided India in Chittagong, now in Bangladesh. A young school master headed 60 young school boys. They raided the armoury. They cut off the telegram and telephone posts, and Calcutta was severed from Chittagong. For two years, Chittagong declared independence. Incidentally, among all these people who were given death sentences, majority of them were under 18 years and their death sentences were converted into life imprisonment.

(Contd. by RSS/1E)

RSS/KLG/1E/11.20

SHRI RITABRATA BANERJEE (CONTD.): They had gone to the Andaman Cellular Jail. The youngest one was a 13 year old boy. Incidentally, unfortunately, the names of these people are missing from the Andaman Cellular Jail. The display does not have these names. The Names of these people must be included. Incidentally, Master Sujoy Sen and other inmates, and the revolutionary Ganesh Ghosh happened to be an elected Member of the other House of the Parliament representing the Communist Party of India (Marxist). These people who were involved in Chittagong, they did not give in writing to the British Government that they would be approvers of the British Government. Unfortunately, the jail has the names of approvers in a most coveted fashion, but these names are missing. I urge upon the Government to look into this history and these names must be incorporated; proper history must be incorporated, and the Archaeological Survey of India must take over the Andman Cellular Jail so that proper history is incorporated. What is happening there? History is scuttled. These people must be given due importance and due respect. Thank you, Sir.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRI D.RAJA (TAMIL NADU): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

SHRI LA.GANESAN (MADHYA PRADESH): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA (NOMINATED): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

SHRI SANTIUSE KUJUR (ASSAM): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

SHRI C.P. NARAYANAN (KERALA): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

SHRI K.SOMAPRASAD (KERALA): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

SHRI K.K. RAGESH (KERALA): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

SHRI MAJEED MEMON (MAHARASHTRA): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Ritabrata Banerjee.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Vivek Gupta, not present. Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu.

NEED TO EQUIP CENTRAL TEAMS VISITING SITES OF NATURAL CALAMITIES WITH MODERN TECHNICAL FACILITIES.

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (TELANGANA): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I seek the attention of the Union Government towards the obsolete, delayed method of sending Central teams to the calamity-prone areas and localities, and the necessity to improve the method of assessing the damages and the rehabilitation requirements during the calamities, such as, floods and drought, with the help of advanced modern technological geo special tools. In our country, we are regularly facing several types of calamities. Now, several parts of the country are reported to have very severe drought, and from several locations, floods are also reported. If the Union Government is to send a Central team even on a war footing, it will take minimum three months, and in the normal course, it is taking six to nine months to send a Central team and have the assessment, and to take note of the damages that have occurred, whereas, there is every necessity to have the Disaster

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

Management Mode, with the help of the satellite image and satellite mapping facilities, and with the support of the Meteorologic centres which we are having throughout the country. In each and every district, they can have the ready information about the calamities that are occurring, and the damages that are expected, and in close coordination with the State Government's Rehabilitation Departments and the Revenue Departments, they can also have the exact assessment even before sending any Central team to the location to have the assessment. But, as the delayed visit of the Central teams is creating a laughing situation, and we could not have the exact assessment about the real calamity that had occurred earlier, way back three months to nine months, I urge upon the Union Government to utilize the geo special satellite and modern advanced tools of the weather and the calamity assessment in the National Disaster Management Mode, and to send the Central teams when and where it is highly required, with adequate promptness, within 15 days of the message from the State Government, to have the exact assessment. Otherwise, this will become more obsolete, and this will not yield proper

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

support to the relief-expecting population of such aggrieved localities and areas of the country. Thank you very much.

(Ends)

SHRIMATI VIPLOVE THAKUR (HIMACHAL PRADESH): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu.

SHRI D. RAJA (TAMIL NADU): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu.

SHRI VIVEK K. TANKHA (MADHYA PRADESH): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu.

(Ends)

(Followed by 1F/KR)

AKG-KR/1F/11.25

**PROBLEMS BEING FACED BY STUDENTS DUE TO RESTRICTION
ON NUMBER OF ATTEMPTS FOR A.I.P.M.T.**

श्रीमती कहकशां परवीन (बिहार) : उपसभापति महोदय, मैं उन अभिभावकों और स्टूडेंट्स की भावनाओं को सदन में रखना चाहती हूँ, जो इस वक्त बहुत ही चिन्तित और परेशान हैं। माननीय सुप्रीम कोर्ट के आदेश के बाद गत वर्ष से देश में मेडिकल कॉलेज में प्रवेश की प्रक्रिया में एक बड़ा बदलाव किया गया है। NEET

को लागू कर दिया गया है और देश भर में मेडिकल कॉलेज में प्रवेश NEET के अंकों के आधार पर होने वाली counseling के जरिए दिए जा रहा हैं। NEET 2017 का notification और bulletin 31 जनवरी को CBSE द्वारा जारी कर दिया गया है। इस बार NEET के आयोजन में कई बदलाव किए गए हैं। परीक्षा के अधिकतम अवसरों की सीमा तीन निर्धारित कर दी गई है, वहीं अधिकतम आयु भी 25 वर्ष कर दी गई है। साथ ही साथ एक बात का उल्लेख किया गया है, जिसे स्पष्ट किया गया है कि यदि कोई छात्र गत वर्षों में तीन बार AIPMT या NEET की परीक्षा दे चुका है, तो उसे NEET 2017 की परीक्षा देने का मौका नहीं दिया जाएगा। महोदय, 7 मई को परीक्षा होनी है, तिथि तय है। तीन महीने पहले ही आई इस सूचना से हजारों छात्र परेशान हैं। ये वे छात्र हैं, जो 7 महीने से NEET की तैयारी कर रहे हैं। साल भर से तैयारी और उसके बाद परीक्षा में शामिल नहीं होना, इससे छात्र और उनके अभिभावक बड़ी दुखद स्थिति में हैं। इससे अभिभावकों के अरमानों के पर उड़ान भरने से पहले ही कट गए हैं।

माननीय महोदय, मेरा अनुरोध है कि इस तरह का कोई भी नियम अगले सत्र से होने वाली परीक्षा के लिए लागू किया जाए, क्योंकि अगर यह इस वर्ष से लागू किया गया, तो एक साल से तैयारी कर रहे उन छात्रों का क्या होगा। इससे उनके सपने चूर हो जाएँगे, उनकी साल भर की तैयारी बेकार हो जाएगी और खास कर उन बच्चों और अभिभावकों के लिए बहुत ही मुश्किल होगी, जिन्होंने कर्ज लेकर गाँवों से शहर में अपने बच्चों को पढ़ने के लिए भेजा है या फिर इसके

लिए अपनी जमीन बेच दी है। इन सब बातों का ध्यान रखते हुए इस पर ध्यान दिया जाए कि जो notification हुआ है, वह इस वर्ष से नहीं, बल्कि 2018 से ही लागू किया जाए, जिससे उन बच्चों को इम्तिहान देने का मौका मिले।

(समाप्त)

श्री राम नाथ ठाकुर (बिहार) : महोदय, मैं स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह (बिहार) : महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

श्री हरिवंश (बिहार) : महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

श्री राम कुमार कश्यप (हरियाणा) : महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

श्री महेन्द्र सिंह माहरा (उत्तराखण्ड) : महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

डा. अनिल कुमार साहनी (बिहार) : महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

श्रीमती विप्लव ठाकुर (हिमाचल प्रदेश) : महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ सम्बद्ध करती हूँ।

श्रीमती रजनी पाटिल (महाराष्ट्र) : महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ सम्बद्ध करती हूँ।

SHRIMATI JHARNA DAS BAIDYA (TRIPURA): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI RITABRATA BANERJEE (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I also associate myself with the submission made by the hon. Member.

SHRI C.P. NARAYANAN (KERALA): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI MAJEED MEMON (MAHARASHTRA): Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI VIVEK K. TANKHA (MADHYA PRADESH): Sir, I also associate myself with matter raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI SANTIUSE KUJUR (ASSAM): Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (TELANGANA): Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

(Ends)

**CONCERN OVER DELAY IN UPDATING NATIONAL REGISTER OF
CITIZENS IN ASSAM**

SHRI RIPUN BORA (ASSAM): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I want to draw the attention of the Government of India to the inordinate delay in updating of National Register of Citizens (NRC) in Assam. The entire country is aware that Assam was burning for years together due to the illegal migrants and foreign national issue. Ultimately, under the leadership of the then Prime Minister, late Shri Rajiv Gandhi, the historic Assam Accord was signed in the year 1985. At that time, the consensus for the cut-off year was that deletion, deportation and detection of foreigners in Assam was 24th March, 1971, the day of Indira-Mujib pact. After that what has happened was peace prevailed; and in the year 2004, under the leadership of the then Prime Minister, Dr Manmohan Singh, a tripartite talk was held between the then Chief Minister of Assam and the delegation of the AASU. In that meeting a decision was taken for updating of the National Register of Citizens. The National

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

Register of Citizens is nowhere in the country except in Assam. It was started in Assam in the year 1951. This decision was taken to solve the foreigners issue in Assam once for all. After a series of meetings, the Government of India had decided to fund the entire works for this purpose. Accordingly, in all development blocks, Gram Panchayats, NRC Seva Kendras were opened. Thousands of young boys and girls were appointed on a contractual basis to carry on the computer work and other office works. Forms were filled by the citizens. Scrutiny was also done. Then, spot verification was also done. Legacy data was also verified. Now, the draft publication has to be made. The Government has fixed the target to publish draft list by March, 2016. In 2014 General Elections and Assembly Elections, the BJP had made it a major election issue. They have promised to update NRC in time; and they would give Assam a correct voter list without the names of foreigners. But, unfortunately, after the BJP Government came to power in Assam and at the Centre, the work on this is being delayed. Now, there is an apprehension among the people that the Government has not given them forms.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The time is over.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRI VIVEK K. TANKHA (MADHYA PRADESH): Sir, I associate myself with matter raised by the hon. Member.

श्रीमती विप्लव ठाकुर (हिमाचल प्रदेश) : महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को इस विषय के साथ सम्बद्ध करती हूँ।

SHRI SANTIUSE KUJUR (ASSAM): Sir, I also associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

(Followed by 1G/KS)

KGG-RPM/1G/11.30

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your time is over. Please sit down.

SHRIMATI WANSUK SYIEM (MEGHALAYA): Sir, I too associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

(Ends)

PLIGHT OF PRINT MEDIA INDUSTRY

श्री हरिवंश (बिहार): उपसभापति जी, धन्यवाद। इस मुल्क ने जब आज़ादी की अंगड़ाई ली, तो देश ने यह आवाज़ सुनी कि जब तोप मुकाबिल हो, तो अखबार निकालो। वह अखबार उद्योग, प्रिंट मीडिया इंडस्ट्री आज खतरे में है। दुनिया में और अपने मुल्क में अखबारों ने पुनर्जागरण, सामाजिक बदलाव, आर्थिक और राजनीतिक चेतना फैलाने का जो काम किया, वह बताने की जरूरत नहीं है। वह

प्रिंट मीडिया आज दो वजहों से मुसीबत में है। पहली वजह-समय का प्रवाह, यानी टेक्नोलॉजिकल चेंज, सोशल मीडिया, टीवी, इंटरनेट, फेसबुक और एफएम वगैरह, ये मीडिया के ही नए-नए रूप हैं। यह ह्यूमन सिविलाइजेशन की प्रगति का हिस्सा है, इसमें बहुत कुछ नहीं हो सकता। दूसरी वजह- व्यवस्थागत है, जिसे हमारी सरकार और व्यवस्था ठीक करने में पहल कर सकती है।

महोदय, प्रिंट मीडिया, मुख्यतः पांच वजहों से खतरे में है। पहला- वेज बोर्ड का उस पर भारी असर आया है। दूसरा- जीएसटी में जो टैक्स प्रपोज्ड है, जो बढ़ने वाला है, उससे प्रिंट मीडिया के ऊपर और आर्थिक भार पड़ने वाला है। तीसरा- न्यूजप्रिंट की कॉस्ट में लगातार बढ़ोतरी, चौथा-other inputs की कॉस्ट बढ़ना और पांचवा- अखबार उद्योग का कहना है कि डिमॉनेटाइजेशन से उनके विज्ञापन पर काफी गहरा असर पड़ा है, लेकिन देश का ध्यान इस उद्योग की ओर तब गया, जब केन्द्र सरकार के सूचना मंत्रालय ने टाइम्स ऑफ इंडिया में छपी एक खबर के बाद यह कहा कि वह इसे एग्जामिन कर रहा है। मेरा सरकार से आग्रह है कि वह इस पर तत्काल पहल करे, क्योंकि जब हालात काबू से बाहर हो जाएंगे, तब पहल करने से बात नहीं बनेगी।

महोदय, यह सरकार 10 करोड़ रोजगार सृजित करने, यानी हर वर्ष दो करोड़ रोजगार क्रिएट किए जाने के आश्वासन के साथ सत्ता में आई थी। इसलिए अखबार उद्योग यानी प्रिंट मीडिया को बचाना जरूरी है। नए रोजगार तो सृजित नहीं हो रहे हैं, बल्कि प्रिंट उद्योग में छंटनी का दौर चल रहा है, जिसके कारण

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

एडीशन्स बन्द हो रहे हैं। खासतौर से छोटे और मध्यम अखबार अपने अस्तित्व से जूझ रहे हैं। इसलिए इस उद्योग के लाखों पत्रकारों और गैर-पत्रकारों की नौकरी और उद्योग को बचाने में पहल कर के सरकार मदद कर सकती है।

महोदय, अखबार अपनी आय के लिए 70-80 प्रतिशत विज्ञापन पर निर्भर हैं, जिसमें ग्रोथ रेट पिछले कई वर्षों से 4 से 6 फीसदी के बीच है। वेज बोर्ड आने के बाद 'हिन्दू' का प्री-टैक्स लॉस में देख रहा था, तो मुझे मालूम हुआ कि वर्ष 2013-14 और 2014-15 के बीच यह काफी बढ़ा। फिर प्रेस ट्रस्ट ऑफ इंडिया का स्टाफ कॉस्ट वर्ष 2013-14 में पिछले वर्ष के मुकाबले 174 परसेंट बढ़ा। यही हालत अन्य अखबारों और खासतौर से छोटे और मंझोले अखबारों की है।

महोदय, अखबार उद्योग को पेड न्यूज के दौर से बचाना है, उसकी साख और विश्वसनीयता की रक्षा करनी है, तो उसका अर्थ तंत्र मजबूत करना होगा। सरकार यह पहल करे कि अक्टूबर, 2010 के बाद उसने डीएवीपी के पेड रेट में कोई परिवर्तन नहीं किया, इसलिए वह तत्काल परिवर्तन करे और प्रिंट मीडिया को इस हालत से निकालने के लिए और जो उपाय हो सकते हैं, उन्हें करे, धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

SHRI RITABRATA BANERJEE (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI MAJEED MEMON (MAHARASHTRA): Sir, I too associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (TELANGANA): Sir, I too associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

श्रीमती कहकशां परवीन (बिहार): माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य द्वारा सदन में उठाए गए विषय से मैं अपने आपको सम्बद्ध करती हूं।

श्री राम नाथ ठाकुर (बिहार): माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य द्वारा सदन में उठाए गए विषय से मैं अपने आपको सम्बद्ध करता हूं।

श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह (बिहार): माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य द्वारा सदन में उठाए गए विषय से मैं अपने आपको सम्बद्ध करता हूं।

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी (बिहार): माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य द्वारा सदन में उठाए गए विषय से मैं अपने आपको सम्बद्ध करता हूं।

डा. अनिल कुमार साहनी (बिहार): माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य द्वारा सदन में उठाए गए विषय से मैं अपने आपको सम्बद्ध करता हूं।

श्री नीरज शेखर (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, माननीय सदस्य द्वारा सदन में उठाए गए विषय से मैं अपने आपको सम्बद्ध करता हूं।

SHRI RIPUN BORA (ASSAM): Sir, I too associate myself with the issue raised by the hon. Member.

(Ends)

PLIGHT OF POWERLOOM INDUSTRY IN COUNTRY

SHRI MAJEED MEMON (MAHARASHTRA): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, thank you very much for the opportunity given. It is with deep sense of regret that I seek attention of the Government of India, particularly the hon. Finance Minister and the Textile Minister, through this august House, to the fact that the Budget 2017-18, claiming to be pro-poor, does not even have a mention of the sinking powerloom industry in the country. There are various hubs throughout the country; more particularly, Malegaon, Bhiwandi, Ichalkaranji, Solapur in Maharashtra, Surat in Gujarat, Varanasi and Erode are the hubs of powerloom industry and these are literally on the brink of total sickness and closure. The issue was raised by us way back in July, 2016 through a Zero Hour Mention upon which the Textile Minister did convene a couple of meetings with the powerloom workers from various parts. Thereafter, we have also seen the Commerce Minister; a delegation was brought from various quarters of the country. The matter was heard but, unfortunately, in the Budget, we find that there is not even a whisper or a slightest relief that has been given to them. I have a humble request to the Government. Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, through you, I would like to

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

convey to the hon. Prime Minister that this particular industry, which is literally dying, needs to be supported. Or else, thousands and thousands of people are being disemployed. They are losing their jobs.

(Contd. by KS/1H)

KS-SCH/1H/11.35

SHRI MAJEED MEMON (contd.): They are starving. Some of them are on the verge of committing suicide. Now, in such a background, I only wanted to convey that we should not forget that a majority of those who are concerned with powerlooms belong to minority, and particularly the Muslim minority which has been certified to be backward in the sense of their economic condition as well as their education. Now, unless you give a helping hand to these people to come back into the mainstream, your slogan of 'सबका साथ, सबका विकास' becomes a mere paper tiger. I would draw the attention of those in authority that they should immediately consider and prevent these people; their suicides may be outnumbering the suicides of even the farmers. In such a situation, I am sorry that the Budget does not provide any relief to these people. ... (Interruptions)...

(End)

SHRI RITABRATA BANERJEE (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I associate myself with what the hon. Member has mentioned.

SHRI K. K. RAGESH (KERALA): Sir, I too associate myself with what the hon. Member has mentioned.

SHRI C. P. NARAYANAN (KERALA): Sir, I too associate myself with what the hon. Member has mentioned.

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी (बिहार) : सर, मैं माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

श्रीमती कहकशां परवीन (बिहार) : सर, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करती हूँ।

श्री राम नाथ ठाकुर (बिहार) : सर, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह (बिहार) : सर, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

श्री हरिवंश (बिहार) : सर, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य के उल्लेख का समर्थन करता हूँ।

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (TELANGANA): Sir, I also associate myself with what the hon. Member has mentioned.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRI SANTIUSE KUJUR (ASSAM): Sir, I also associate myself with what the hon. Member has mentioned. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Would you like to react? ...(Interruptions)... Listen to the Minister. ...(Interruptions)...

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Sir, we also associate ourselves with what the hon. Member has mentioned. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, all of you are associating. Your names will be added. Now, allow the Minister. ...(Interruptions)... All those who support it, their names will be added. ...(Interruptions)... All the names will be added. Now, Madam Minister, would you like to say something? ...(Interruptions)... Listen to the Minister.

THE MINISTER OF TEXTILES (SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI): Sir, I am grateful that the hon. Member... ...(Interruptions)...

श्री उपसभापति : आप सुनिए...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I am on a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, the Minister has started.

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: I am grateful to the hon. Member that while presenting his angst on the issue, he has also highlighted...
...(Interruptions)... Sir, I am not yielding.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: She has already started.

SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI: I hope my esteemed colleague would allow me to finish.

Sir, I am grateful that the hon. Member in his expression of angst has highlighted that post his submission to the august House regarding the concerns of the powerloom industry, my Ministry had convened various meetings with the powerloom industry and all stakeholders including inviting hon. MPs to be a party to those conversations so that we can find a holistic solution. Also, subsequent to those stakeholders' meetings, meetings were conducted under the aegis of the Ministry of Textiles with the Ministry of Power so that the challenges with regard to the rates of power, as has been articulated by the hon. Member in his communication to my Department, were also explored. But I am currently challenged that I cannot make declarations because of the Code of Conduct specifically which has been announced across the country, specific to the five State elections. I can only say this, Sir, that

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

the outcome of the stakeholders' meetings will be positive. I am duty-bound not to explain it in detail because, as my colleague has highlighted, it does affect a huge population in the segment of the minority community. Let him be assured that under the Pradhan Mantri Mudra Yojana, currently, reduced cost of capital is available and all these issues are being pursued. But I can only make a declaration of the benefits to the industry after the Code of Conduct is lifted.

(Ends)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now, Shri Md. Nadimul Haque, absent. ...(Interruptions).. Sit down. ...(Interruptions)... The Minister has already replied. Sit down. Shri Swapan Dasgupta.

REPORTED ATTACK ON RELIGIOUS FREEDOM IN WEST BENGAL

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA (NOMINATED): Sir, it is with a sense of deep dismay that I want to raise an issue of great importance which affects the State of West Bengal. Sir, as we all know, Saraswati Pooja is one of the most...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE: Sir, it is a State Subject.

...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. It is permitted. Sit down.

...(Interruptions)... Let him speak.

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, I have not even begun.

...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE: It is the State law, Sir.

...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, I have not even begun.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your problem with Saraswati

Pooja? ...(Interruptions)... What is your problem with Saraswati Pooja?

Sit down.

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, I have not even begun.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Unnecessarily you are creating problems.

...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, I have not even begun, Mr. O'Brien.

...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, we have no problem. But the problem is that the * has started creating problems... ..(Interruptions)...

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी) : ये repeatedly एक ऐसे संगठन का नाम लेते हैं, जो यहां पर नहीं है।...(व्यवधान)... इन्होंने जो कहा, उसको एक्सपंज किया जाए।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me listen. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, I raised this issue with a sense of deep dismay... ..(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why did you unnecessarily mention * ? I am expunging *. Why do you bring in * now? Sit down. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: This is the manner in which... ..(Interruptions)... I seek your protection. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I did it. Sit down. ... (Interruptions)... एक्सपंज करवा दिया है, आप बैठिए।...(व्यवधान)... सुनिए...(व्यवधान)... सुनिए...(व्यवधान)...

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, it is a cultural festival.
...(Interruptions)... If I am talking about a cultural festival...
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't be impatient. ...(Interruptions)...

(CONTD. BY KLS/1H)

KLS/VNK/1J-11.40

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN (CONTD): This is also intolerance.
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, this is the manner in
which...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You first listen to it. ...(Interruptions)... You
cannot listen to that, it is also intolerance. ...(Interruptions)... You
should know that. ...(Interruptions)... You should hear the other view
also. ...(Interruptions)... Even then you are not ready.
...(Interruptions)... First you listen to that. ...(Interruptions)... You listen
to that. ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Shri
Swapan Dasgupta is permitted. ...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: It is a matter of public importance. ... (Interruptions) ... It is a matter which affects the cultural identity of a State. ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Swapan Dasgupta was permitted by the hon. Chairman to speak here. He has a right. Let us listen to him and if you disagree, if you have anything else to say, that is a different matter. ... (Interruptions) ... I can think of allowing you. But don't prevent him and let him say what he wants to say. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Thank you very much, Sir. ... (Interruptions) ... I want to raise an issue which concerns the cultural identity... (Interruptions) ..

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE: Sir, it is a State Subject. ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is this? ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: It is a matter concerning ... (Interruptions) ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your problem? ... (Interruptions) ...
Mr. Nadimul Haque, sit down. ... (Interruptions) ... Sit down.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

...(Interruptions)... I am not allowing you. ...(Interruptions)... Only what Mr. Dasgupta says will go on record. ...(Interruptions)..

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, it concerns the cultural identity of a State. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has been permitted by the hon. Chairman. What are you doing?

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE: *

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, I want to say that if there is...(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is permitted by the hon. Chairman. ...(Interruptions)... You sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE: *

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: We have a bizarre situation. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O' BRIEN: *

***Not recorded.**

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, we have a bizarre situation, so I can raise this matter of public importance which concerns the cultural identity of a State. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Md. Nadimul Haque, I will have to name you. ...(Interruptions)... I will have to name you. Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... I will be forced to name you. Sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Why do you prevent another Member from raising his issue which is dear to him? If it is not dear to you, it is a different matter. ...(Interruptions)... This way we cannot function. If you think that the other person should say what you like, how can the Parliament function then? You may not like it. That does not mean that he cannot say it. No, I don't agree with that this way. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE: *

SHRI DEREK O' BRIEN: *

*Not recorded.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, he should be allowed. ... (Interruptions) ... He should be allowed. ... (Interruptions) .. You please keep quiet. ... (Interruptions) ... Mr. Swapan Dasgupta. ... (Interruptions) ... I want to know what he wants to say. ... (Interruptions) ... That is my problem. ... (Interruptions) ... I want to know what you want to say. You please say. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, I want to raise the matter of cultural identify of a State. ... (Interruptions) ... We are facing a situation where people are being terrorized. ... (Interruptions) ..

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will have to take action against you. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI DEREK O' BRIEN: *

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: I have not even begun my submission. ... (Interruptions) ..

*Not recorded.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Nadimul Haque, I will have to name you. ... (Interruptions)... I will have to name you, I am telling you. ... (Interruptions)... You sit down. ... (Interruptions)... I cannot allow this. Why are you creating this problem during Zero Hour?

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, it is a matter concerning the cultural identity of a State. Therefore, I would like to ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE: *

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी) : सर, जब सरस्वती पूजा के मुद्दे पर यहां पर इनका यह हाल है, तो पश्चिमी बंगाल में क्या करते होंगे?... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Everything in this country happens in one State or the other. You cannot come forward with this argument. ... (Interruptions)... I don't know what he has to say. ... (Interruptions).. Let me listen to that. Who are you to decide it before listening to that?

*Not recorded.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

...(Interruptions).. I will have to name you. Sit down. ...(Interruptions)...
Don't do anything. ...(Interruptions)... I will have to name you.
...(Interruptions)... I will have to name you. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Basant Panchami or Saraswati Puja is one of the most important cultural festivals which we all know that. ...(Interruptions)... If you know that, I think you would also realize that it is very important to know that people are allowed to observe it. ...(Interruptions)... After 65 years of continuous observance, now not observing this Saraswati Puja, I think it is a matter of shame. ...(Interruptions)... I can think it is not really a question ...(Interruptions)... Whatever the issue is, ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him speak. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O' BRIEN: *

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Why are people feeling guilty?
...(Interruptions)... Why are certain people feeling guilty about it?
...(Interruptions)...

*Not recorded

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your point? ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Swapan, you can raise your issue. ...(Interruptions)... Otherwise, your time will be over. ...(Interruptions)... You raise your issue. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, we want religious freedom for all communities in the State and just because...(Interruptions)... That does not exclude any community especially those who observe Saraswati Puja. Restrictions have been placed on media for trying to cover it.

(Contd by 1K/NBR)

-KLS/NBR-NKR/1K/11.45.

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA (CONTD.): People have been trying to place restrictions on immersion of Durga. So, the selective and vindictive attitude should be stopped. ...(Interruptions)... Religious freedom must exist for everybody. ...(Interruptions)... I think, it must exist for everybody ...(Interruptions)... No community can be excluded

*Not recorded.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

from it. ...(Interruptions)... And, I think, in West Bengal, today, we seek that. ...(Interruptions)... I want to raise that point. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, freedom of religion must exist for every community. That is the point. Thank you.

(Ends)

SHRI RAM NARAIN DUDI (RAJASTHAN): Sir, I associate myself with the Zero Hour submission of Shri Swapan Dasgupta.

SHRI NARAYAN LAL PANCHARIYA (RAJASTHAN): Sir, I also associate myself with the Zero Hour submission of Shri Swapan Dasgupta.

MAHANT SHAMBHUPRASADJI TUNDIYA (GUJARAT): Sir, I also associate myself with the Zero Hour submission of Shri Swapan Dasgupta.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Sir, we all associate ourselves with the submission made by the hon. Member.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

**NEED TO ANNOUNCE REHABILITATION PACKAGE
FOR GULF RETURNEES**

SHRI K.K. RAGESH (KERALA): Thank you, Sir. I appeal, through you, Sir, the Central Government for announcing a special package to rehabilitate the Gulf returnees who have lost their jobs due to the present oil crisis and also due to Nitaqat Law. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, Saudi Arabia started implementing Nitaqat Law in 2011 and this law ensures jobs for Saudi nationals, especially in private sector. Saudi Arabia private sector is mainly depending upon foreign workers, especially in retail and service sectors, and the foreign workers are mainly from India and Indian workers are mainly from Kerala.

After implementation of Nitaqat Law, till 2013, 1.41 lakh Indian workers have lost their jobs and had to return India from the Gulf countries. Majority of those workers who have lost their jobs are from Kerala. I know that the hon. Deputy Chairman is also well aware of the situation.

The present oil crisis has aggravated the situation. We have witnessed a number of lay-offs, non-payment of wages to workers and forcing workers to stay in labour camps even without food. Of course,

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

the Ministry of External Affairs has provided some food to those workers who compelled to stay back in labour camps. But, this is not going to serve the purpose.

Recently, Saudi Arabia has again declared another set of Nitaqat Laws which further aggravated the problems. Out of total households in Kerala, 25 per cent are dependent upon Gulf remittances for their livelihood. So, the problem of Gulf returnees is going to affect the State of Kerala in a very big way. It raised a serious concern as far as the economy of Kerala is concerned. It hit the State in a very big way.

So, I request the Central Government, through you, to announce rehabilitation package for Gulf returnees. Thank you. (Ends)

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (TELANGANA): Sir, I associate myself with the Zero Hour submission of Shri Ragesh ji.

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA (NOMINATED): Sir, I also associate myself with the Zero Hour submission of Shri Ragesh.

SHRI RANVIJAY SINGH JUDEV (CHHATTISGARH): Sir, I also associate myself with the Zero Hour submission of Shri Ragesh.

(Ends)

(FOLLOWED BY USY/1L)

USY-PSV/1L/11.50

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I have to say something.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; no. After Chhaya Verma, please.

There is one more Zero Hour notice. Let me finish it first.

**DELETION OF NAME OF FORMER PRIME MINISTER LATE SHRI
RAJIV GANDHI FROM SADBHAVANA DIVAS**

श्रीमती छाया वर्मा (छत्तीसगढ़): माननीय महोदय, 20 अगस्त को भारत के पूर्व प्रधान मंत्री राजीव गांधी जी के नाम पर 'सद्भावना दिवस' के रूप में पूरे भारत देश में कार्यक्रम का आयोजन किया जाता है। सभी बैनर्स, पोस्टर्स, पैम्फलेट्स, फ्लेक्स बोर्ड्स आदि में "राजीव जी के जन्म दिवस पर सद्भावना दिवस" ऐसा लिखा जाता है। लेकिन माननीय महोदय, मैं बताना चाहूँगी कि 2014 से पूर्व प्रधान मंत्री राजीव गांधी जी का नाम विलोपित करके 20 अगस्त को केवल 'सद्भावना दिवस' के रूप में ही मनाया जा रहा है। राजीव जी का नाम उसमें विलोपित कर दिया गया है। लगता है कि इनकी सद्भावना खत्म हो गई है।

माननीय महोदय, भारत के पूर्व प्रधान मंत्री, हमारे राजीव जी, पूर्व प्रधान मंत्री ही रहेंगे। अगर इनका यही रवैया रहा, तो वर्तमान को भूतपूर्व बनते देर नहीं लगेगी। जिसने भी यह हिमाकत की है, नाम बदलने की, या तो यह भूलवश हुआ

हो, तो सुधार लें और जान-बूझ कर यह किया हो, तो यह एक बहुत बड़ा * है। माननीय महोदय, ऐसा नहीं होना चाहिए। नाम को विलोपित न किया जाए। राज्य शासन और केन्द्र शासन भी उनका अनुपालन कर रही है। इस मंच के माध्यम से मैं कहना चाहूँगी कि नाम को यथावत् रखा जाए, धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

SHRIMATI RAJANI PATIL (MAHARASHTRA): Sir, I associate myself with what the hon. Member has said.

(Ends)

SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD (KARNATAKA): Sir, also I associate myself with what the hon. Member has said.

(Ends)

SHRI BISWAJIT DAIMARY (ASSAM): Sir, I also associate myself with what the hon. Member has said.

(Ends)

श्री आनंद भास्कर रापोलू (तेलंगाना): महोदय, मैं भी इस विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA (MAHARASHTRA): Sir, I also associate myself with what the hon. Member has said.

(Ends)

MS. DOLA SEN (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I also associate myself with what the hon. Member has said.

(Ends)

श्री महेन्द्र सिंह माहरा (उत्तराखण्ड): महोदय, मैं भी इस विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

श्री विवेक के. तन्खा (मध्य प्रदेश): महोदय, मैं भी इस विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

श्री सन्तियुस कुजूर (असम): महोदय, मैं भी इस विषय से स्वयं को सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (HIMACHAL PRADESH): Sir, Rajiv Gandhiji was a martyred Prime Minister of India. The country owes a debt of gratitude to its martyrs. ...(Interruptions).... Shri Rajiv Gandhi is a martyr of this country. He was the Prime Minister of India. And, this country had declared his birth anniversary as *Sadbhavana Divas*. Since 20th August, 2014, in all the Government advertisements, in all circulars,

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

in all notifications, Shri Rajiv Gandhi's name and his photographs have been removed. It is an insult to the memory of a great Prime Minister. This Government owes an explanation. It is functioning in an arbitrary and authoritarian manner. They are putting in names of people in various schemes, involving thousands of crores of rupees. They had done nothing for this country. Nothing means, they never occupied any office. Schemes have been named after the names of people who have never been in Government, who have never been in Parliament, let alone being Prime Minister. And, the names of the former Prime Ministers have been obliterated. It is a great insult. We condemn it. And, this Government owes an explanation, and they should rather apologize. ...(Interruptions)...

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी): सर, पहली बात तो यह है कि आनन्द शर्मा जी जो कह रहे हैं, मैं उससे बिल्कुल इतिफाक नहीं रखता। उन्हें यह लगता है कि पूरे देश के सारे के सारे संसाधनों पर, सारी की सारी स्कीम्स पर, सारे के सारे कार्यक्रमों पर एक ही पार्टी का और एक ही परिवार का अधिकार है, तो वह सम्भव नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा: वे इस देश के प्रधान मंत्री थे। ...(व्यवधान)... वे इस देश के प्रधान मंत्री थे। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी: इस देश में हजारों-हजार राष्ट्रभक्त हैं, हजारों-हजार ऐसे लोग हैं, जिन्होंने देश के लिए कुरबानी दी है। ...(व्यवधान)... देश के सम्मान, देश के स्वाभिमान के लिए उन्होंने अपना योगदान दिया है, उनको भूल जाएँ और अगर इनकी इच्छा यह है कि केवल एक परिवार और एक पार्टी के नाम पर सारी सरकारी योजनाएँ चलें, तो वह अब मोदी जी के समय में सम्भव नहीं है।
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा: * ...(व्यवधान)... यह काम करते हो? ...(व्यवधान)... नेहरू का नाम खत्म कर दो। ...(व्यवधान)... इंदिरा गांधी की शताब्दी हो, खत्म कर दो।
...(व्यवधान)... यह इतिहास है। इतिहास को नहीं बदल सकते। ...(व्यवधान)... आप चुन कर आए हो, बाहर भी निकाल दिए जाओगे। ...(व्यवधान)... आप इतिहास नहीं बदल सकते। ...(व्यवधान)...

(1एम/डीएस-एसएसएस पर आगे)

SSS-DS/1M/11.55

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Shri Azad, do you want to speak on this issue? I am on a different issue.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

नेता विरोधी दल (श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद) : सर, मैं इस मुद्दे पर अपने साथियों के साथ खड़ा होना चाहता हूँ कि जिन लोगों ने भारत को स्वतंत्र कराया, भारत को आज़ादी दिलाई, उनके नाम पर जो स्कीमें हैं, उनके नाम को ढाई साल से निरंतर बदला गया है। जैसा कि मेरे कलीग, आनन्द शर्मा जी ने बताया कि उनका कोई रोल नहीं था, लेकिन चूंकि एक रूलिंग पार्टी के साथ उनकी इनडायरेक्ट-डायरेक्ट एसोसिएशन थी, उसकी वजह से उन स्कीमों के नाम नेहरू, इंदिरा गांधी या राजीव गांधी के नाम से हटाकर उनके नाम पर रखे गए। लेकिन, "सद्भावना दिवस" विशेष रूप से राजीव गांधी के नाम पर था। राजीव गांधी क्या कोई साधारण प्राइम मिनिस्टर थे? यहाँ बहुत सारे लोग, जो पदों की वजह से सिक्योरिटीज़ लेकर बैठे हैं, उनकी सिक्योरिटी इसलिए रखी गई थी, क्योंकि जो देशद्रोही थे, वे उनको मारना चाहते थे। जब हमारे देश से दक्षिण को अलग करने का खतरा पैदा हो गया था, तब उन्होंने उन तत्वों को दूर रखने के लिए श्रीलंका में peace keeping force भेजने में रोल अदा किया। उसके बाद भी जब तक उन तत्वों ने उनकी जान नहीं ले ली, तब तक वे पीछे नहीं हटे। इस प्रकार, देश की एकता और देश की अखंडता के लिए उनकी जान चली गई। इस तरह, कांग्रेस के लीडर्स, चाहे वे महात्मा गांधी हों, इंदिरा गांधी हों या राजीव गांधी हों, उन्होंने देश की एकता और अखंडता के लिए अपने जीवन का बलिदान दिया है। उनके नाम की जगह पर उन स्कीमों के नाम किसी एक साधारण नेता के नाम पर रखा गया है, जिसका कोई रोल न तो भारत की आज़ादी के लिए रहा है और न ही देश की

एकता और अखंडता के लिए रहा है। अगर किसी का कोई रोल रहा है तो वह इस रूलिंग पार्टी के समर्थन के लिए रहा है। उनको एक ही पैरामीटर पर ट्रीट नहीं किया जा सकता। इसलिए जिन-जिन नेताओं के नाम पर वे स्कीमें थीं, उन्हें सरकार को चेंज नहीं करना चाहिए। जो "सद्भावना दिवस" है, इसके लिए तो कांग्रेस पार्टी किसी भी सूरत में यह बरदाश्त नहीं करेगी कि उसमें से उनका नाम बिल्कुल हटा दिया जाए।

قائد حزب اختلاف (جناب غلام نبی آزاد) : سر، میں اس مدّے پر اپنے ساتھیوں کے ساتھ کھڑا ہونا چاہتا ہوں کہ جن لوگوں نے بھارت کو سوتنتر کرایا، بھارت کو آزادی دلائی، ان کے نام پر جو اسکیمیں ہیں، ان کے نام کو ڈھائی سال سے لگاتار بدلا گیا ہے۔ جیسا کہ میرے ساتھی، آنند شرما جی نے بتایا کہ ان کا کوئی رول نہیں تھا، لیکن چونکہ ایک رولنگ پارٹی کے ساتھ ان کی ان-ڈائریکٹ، ڈائریکٹ ایسوسی ایشن تھی، اس کی وجہ سے ان اسکیموں کے نام نہرو، اندرا گاندھی یا راجیو گاندھی کے نام سے ہٹا کر ان کے نام پر رکھے گئے۔ لیکن 'سدبھاونہ دوس' خاص طور سے راجیو گاندھی کے نام پھر تھا۔ راجیو گاندھی کوئی سادھارن پرائم منسٹر تھے؟ یہاں بہت سارے لوگ، جو پدوں کی وجہ سے سیکورٹیز لے کر بیٹھے ہیں، ان کی سیکورٹی اس لئے رکھی گئی تھی، کیوں کہ جو دیش دروہی تھے، وہ ان کو مارنا چاہتے تھے۔ جب ہمارے دیش سے دکشن کو الگ کرنے کا خطرہ پیدا ہو گیا تھا، تب انہوں نے ان تڈووں کو دور رکھنے کے لئے سری لنکا میں peace keeping force بھیجنے میں رول ادا کیا۔ اس کے بعد بھی جب تک ان تڈووں نے ان کی جان نہیں لے لی، تب تک وہ پیچھے نہیں ہٹے۔ اس طرح، دیش کی ایکتا اور

دیش کی اکھنڈتا کے لئے ان کی جان چلی گئی۔ اس طرح، کانگریس کے لیڈرس، چاہے وہ مہاتما گاندھی ہوں، اندرا گاندھی ہوں یا راجیو گاندھی ہوں، انہوں نے دیش کی ایکتا اور اکھنڈتا کے لئے اپنے جیون کا بلیدان دیا ہے۔ ان کے نام کی جگہ پر ان اسکیموں کے نام پر کسی ایک سادھارن نیتا کے نام پر رکھا گیا ہے، جس کا کوئی رول نہ تو بھارت کی آزادی کے لئے رہا ہے اور نہ ہی دیش کی ایکتا اور اکھنڈتا کے لئے رہا ہے۔ اگر کسی کا کوئی رول رہا ہے تو وہ اس رولنگ پارٹی کے سمرتھن کے لئے رہا ہے۔ ان کے ایک ہی پیرامیٹر پر ٹریٹ نہیں کیا جاسکتا۔ اس لئے جن جن نیتاؤں کے نام پر وہ اسکیمیں تھیں، انہیں سرکار کو چینج نہیں کرنا چاہئے۔ جو سدبھاونا دوس ہے، اس کے لئے تو کانگریس پارٹی کسی بھی صورت میں یہ برداشت نہیں کرے گی کہ اس میں سے ان کا نام بالکل ہٹا دیا جائے۔

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I have to say something.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, you allowed me. May I now raise it?
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed Yechuryji.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, we totally agree with what the LoP said about the former Prime Minister, Shri Rajiv Gandhi. But I think, he mentioned about South ceding, and for that he sent IPKF, and all that which is unwarranted. ..(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD): I have mentioned the names of the killers. I have mentioned the names of those who killed him. ... (Interruptions)... (Ends)

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I want to raise an important issue and with anger and anguish I am raising this issue. I want a proper and thorough investigation in the manner in which the death of one of our very senior colleagues in the Parliament, a former Cabinet Minister, Shri E. Ahamed was handled, the way in which the news of his death was sought to be suppressed and there are various allegations. I have got various information. Some doctors say he was declared dead when he was taken to the hospital. Some say he died subsequently in the ICU. Then later he was shifted to the trauma centre saying that there are better facilities. And there has been interference; that is what I hear from the highest authorities in the country, from the PMO, and this is something that cannot be accepted. This is * for the Indian Parliament to accept this. I want this issue to be thoroughly investigated. I wish my information, what I heard of, is not correct, but

***Expunged as ordered by the Chair.**

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

if it is correct, then they must be made accountable and action must be taken against those who had behaved in this manner. The senior most leaders of our politics today were not allowed to see him in the hospital. His own children were not allowed to see him. Sir, tell me, any life support system can be put on anybody only with the permission of the nearest relative. Without that, how was that put and how was the announcement of the death delayed? If this can happen to somebody who spent half a century in our country's democratic process in the Parliament and Assemblies, then, you can imagine what will be the plight of the people! And this sort of a maneuvering is something that is completely unacceptable.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Minister would like to say something on that.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: No, no; Sir, I am asking you. I am asking you that an investigation must be ordered.(Interruptions)... I am asking you that an investigation must be ordered. People should be made accountable.

(Followed by PK/1N)

PK-SC/12.00/1N

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULM NABI AZAD): Since it is 12 o'clock, we would like to discuss this issue tomorrow. I and many of my colleagues were there upto 1 o'clock in the morning.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, it is time for the Question Hour.

....(Interruptions)..

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: So, they will say what they have to.

....(Interruptions).. We were witness to that. ..(Interruptions).. We will

discuss it tomorrow. ..(Interruptions).. It is all fabricated. ..(Interruptions)..

(Ends)

(12.00-1.00 P.M.-Question Hour)

KLS/2B-2.30

The House reassembled after lunch at thirty minutes past two of the clock, MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair

...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, I have a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me first do the introduction. I will allow you. Don't start with point of order as soon as I come.

PRIVATE MEMBERS' BUSINESS

BILLS INTRODUCED

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Private Members' Legislative Business -- Bills for introduction. Shri Rajkumar Dhoot. He is not present. Shri Bhupender Yadav. He is not present.

THE CONSTITUTION (AMENDMENT) BILL, 2016 (AMENDMENT OF ARTICLES 109,117, 198 AND 207)

DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO (TELANGANA): Sir, I move for leave to introduce a Bill further to amend the Constitution of India.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO: Sir, I introduce the Bill.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

**THE CLINICAL ESTABLISHMENTS
(REGISTRATION AND REGULATION) AMENDMENT BILL, 2016**

SHRI MOHD. ALI KHAN (ANDHRA PRADESH): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I move for leave to introduce a Bill further to amend the Clinical Establishments (Registration and Regulation) Act, 2010.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

SHRI MOHD. ALI KHAN: Sir, I introduce the Bill.

(Ends)

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, my point of order is on this Bill.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is correct. After introduction, I will allow you. Shri Shantaram Naik. He is not present. Shri Pradeep Tamta. He is not present. Shrimati Vandana Chavan. She is not present. Dr. Kanwar Deep Singh. He is not present. Shri Husain Dalwai. He is not present. Shri Sanjay Seth. He is not present. Dr. T. Subbarami Reddy. He is not present.

(Followed by 2C/SSS)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SSS-SC/2.35/2C

**THE CONSTITUTION (AMENDMENT) BILL, 2017 (AMENDMENT OF
ARTICLE 366)**

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I move for leave to introduce a Bill further to amend the Constitution of India.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, I introduce the Bill.

(Ends)

**THE REPRESENTATION OF THE PEOPLE
(AMENDMENT) BILL, 2016**

SHRI VIVEK GUPTA (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I move for leave to introduce a Bill further to amend the Representation of the People Act, 1951.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

SHRI VIVEK GUPTA: Sir, I introduce the Bill.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

THE POPULATION (STABILIZATION) BILL, 2017

SHRI VIVEK GUPTA (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I move for leave to introduce a Bill to increase the minimum age of marriage for women from eighteen years to twenty-one years and to establish a National Population Stabilization Authority to look into the schemes to encourage two child norm and having an appropriate gap between children, incentivizing adoption, creating recreational centres in villages, formulating policies wherein certain minimum criteria is present before a family can start having children and for all matters connected herewith and incidental thereto.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

SHRI VIVEK GUPTA : Sir, I introduce the Bill.

(Ends)

**THE CONSTITUTION (AMENDMENT) BILL, 2017 (INSERTION OF
NEW ARTICLES 275A AND 371K)**

SHRI VIVEK GUPTA (WEST BENGAL): Sir, I move for leave to introduce a Bill further to amend the Constitution of India.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

SHRI VIVEK GUPTA: Sir, I introduce the Bill.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Has Shri Sanjay Seth come?

SHRI SANJAY SETH: Yes, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can move the Bill.

THE RIGHT TO ADEQUATE HOUSING BILL, 2016

श्री संजय सेठ (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदय, मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूँ कि देश में गरीबी रेखा से नीचे रहने वाले अथवा निम्न आय वर्ग के अंतर्गत आने वाले परिवारों हेतु एक निःशुल्क अथवा ऐसी उचित लागत पर आवास प्रदान करके तथा आवास खरीदने हेतु निम्न आय वर्ग के परिवारों को ब्याज मुक्त ऋण प्रदान कर उनके लिए यथोचित निवास-गृह का उपबंध करने तथा तत्संश्लेषित और उसके आनुषंगिक विषयों का उपबंध करने के लिए एक विधेयक को पुरःस्थापित करने की अनुमति दी जाए।

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

श्री संजय सेठ : महोदय, मैं विधेयक को पुरःस्थापित करता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we will take up further consideration of the Bill. Today, being Friday, the House will sit up to 5.00 P.M. Do you all agree?

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Yes.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your point, Shri Jairam Ramesh?

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, please listen to me carefully because it is a very important point of order. It has a bearing on all the 30 Bills that have been listed today in today's List of Business and it will have a bearing on all Private Members' Bills in future. So, please bear with me for a couple of minutes, Sir. Sir, I am very careful. I am not going to say anything which will force you to expunge what I said.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why do you think like that?

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Last time, on a Private Members' Bill, you ended up expunging it. I will be very careful.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no; I will be very careful to expunge if there is anything unparliamentary.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: I am very careful, Sir. Sir, we all know under which Rule of the Rajya Sabha's Rule of Procedure and Conduct of Business a particular Private Members' Bill is classified as a 'Money Bill' or 'not a Money Bill'. We all know that. It is there in the Constitution. It is there in the Rules of Procedure. The decision of the Speaker of the Lok Sabha is final. You refer to it if there is a doubt and the Speaker gives a decision. So, that chapter is over. My clarification

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

which I am seeking from you relates not to Money Bills, but relates to Financial Bills of Category A.

(Contd. by NBR/2D)

-SSS/NBR-GS/2D/2.40.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (CONTD.): And, I have three clarifications to seek from you. First, I would like to know under which rule of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Council of States a particular Private Member's Bill is classified as a Financial Bill of Category 'A'. This is number one.

The second one is: I would like to know under which rule of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Council of States a reference is made to the Ministry of Law and Justice for determining whether a Private Member's Bill is a Financial Bill of Category 'A'.

My third clarification from you is: Under which rule of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Council of States is the decision of the Lok Sabha Secretary-General -- not the hon. Speaker -- taken as the final decision whether a Private Member's Bill is a Financial Bill of Category 'A'.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

So, in short, Sir, my clarification is on Financial Bill of Category 'A'. I have three questions: First, which rule is used to determine whether a Bill is Financial Bill of Category 'A'. Second, under which rule does the Rajya Sabha make a reference to the Ministry of Law and Justice to determine whether it is a Financial Bill of Category 'A'. And, third, under which rule does the Rajya Sabha accept decision of the Lok Sabha Secretary-General on that particular Bill being a Financial Bill of Category 'A'?

Sir, these clarifications affect all Private Members' Bills. It affects the independent functioning, autonomy and dignity of this House and it is because of this I have raised the point of order. Thank you.

(Ends)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now, I understood, you are very clever and intelligent too, because you are indirectly coming back to a particular Bill on which there is a ruling.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, it is only out of academic interest I have asked.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is why I have said you are very clever. I can appreciate the academic aspect. Since you did not refer to any particular ruling, I come to what you said.

First you want to know as to who will decide that it is a Financial Bill.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Under which rule?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will tell you. The Constitution is very clear about the Money Bill and the Constitution also mentioned clearly what constitutes a Financial Bill. With regard to Money Bill, if any question is raised or if there is any doubt, certainly, it is the hon. Speaker who will decide. But, with regard to Financial Bill, we need not refer it to the Speaker; it is for us to decide and the decision will be taken here. That is number one. But, it is again according to the provisions of the Constitution and rules, if there are any. That is relating to Financial Bill. So, we will take the decision.

What you want to ask, as per my understanding, is who decided that it is a Financial Bill? We decided it as a Financial Bill. For that, we are not asking the Speaker.

What is your second question?

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Under which rule is a reference made to the Ministry of Law and Justice?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have asked that question. You did not say, but I can say this. You asked that question out of a ruling given here because there is a reference. I know that. That is why you have asked it. But, you are intelligent enough not to divulge it; I understand that. I appreciate your keenness. But, the point is this.

(CONTD. BY USY/2E)

USY-HMS/2E/2.45

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN (CONTD.): That is a procedural matter, done in the Secretariat. Therefore, it cannot be discussed here. However, you are free to approach the Chairman in his Chamber and raise this issue. This being a Secretariat matter, I cannot allow a discussion on this here. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO: But, Sir, other Members also have a right to know as to what is happening behind the curtains. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: This is not an issue of one Bill. It affects all the Members. ...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes; yes. I do not dispute your point. Even though there is no point of order in what you have said, yet I concede that *prima facie* there is some point in it. I concede that. That is why ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down, Dr. Ramachandra Rao. I know you are interested in this. I also know that you are behind it. So, please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... You are not only standing behind, you are behind it. Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, that remark of yours that he is behind it...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is standing behind you. That is why I have said this. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: He is only physically behind me, not behind it. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. You put it like that. I have no problem.

श्री मोहम्मद अली खान : डिप्टी चेयरमैन सर, यह मुद्दा खाली श्री जयराम रमेश से जुड़ा नहीं है, यह इस हाउस से जुड़ा है। इसलिए इसका disposal भी हाउस के अंदर होना चाहिए।

جناب محمد علی خان : ڈپٹی چیئرمین سر، یہ مدعا خالی شری جے رام رمیش سے جڑا نہیں ہے، یہ اس ہاؤس سے جڑا ہے۔ اس لئے اس کا disposal بھی ہاؤس کے اندر ہونا چاہئے۔

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; no. Whatever reply is to be given, I am giving. I replied to the first point, 'Who decides'? We decide. Second, what is the rule? It is decided according to the provisions of the Constitution. But, since referring a Bill to the Law Ministry is a procedural matter, which is dealt with by the Secretariat, of course, the ultimate responsibility lies with the hon. Chairman. But, we cannot discuss a Secretariat's matter here. My advice is that you can approach the hon. Chairman in his Chamber. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. K. KESHAVA RAO: Then, I request you also to be present there. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; no. You have not raised it. Only he has raised it. ...(Interruptions)... Then, what was your third point?

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: My third point is, under which rule the Rajya Sabha decides on the decision of the Secretary-General, Lok Sabha, whether a Bill is a financial Bill or not? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no rule by which we decide. We go by the advice, if at all there is any, of our Secretary-General, not the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha. We do not seek advice from the Secretary General of the Lok Sabha. We do not do that. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, what you have said forces me to refer to a case in the recent past. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I had already told you. ...(Interruptions)...

I have understood. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Two months ago, the observation of the Secretary-General of Lok Sabha was quoted to determine whether a Bill...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; no. I have got your point. It is a public document. It is in the ruling. In the ruling, it is stated that the Lok Sabha Secretary-General 'opined'. So, that was an opinion. It was only an opinion. Anybody can give an opinion. I can listen to you and

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

your opinion can also be accepted. We have our own Secretariat. We have our own Secretary-General. But, we simply cannot reject that simply because the Secretary-General, Lok Sabha, has opined like that. That's all. Nothing more than that. That was only an opinion. We go by the decision of the Speaker, Lok Sabha, with regard to the Money Bill. But, the point you are referring here was only an opinion. Whatever ruling was given, it was our ruling. And, that is valid also. I think, I have replied to all the three questions.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: No, Sir. I am not satisfied. Whether a financial Bill is of Category 'A' or not, you are saying, is determined by this House. But, two months ago ...(Interruptions)... We were given to understand that that was not the basis for deciding whether it was a financial Bill or not. The basis was: Number one, the Lok Sabha Secretary-General; number two, the Ministry of Law and Justice.

(Followed. by 2f – PK)

PK-ASC/2F/2.50

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is only a reference.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Nowhere was it mentioned, Rajya Sabha Secretariat.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That was only a reference made, might have been made or might not have been made. But it is there. I accept, in the ruling it is there. Reference was made.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Under which rule did you make that reference?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. I have told you that point. That is a procedural matter. I am not ready to reply to that or discuss it. That is a procedural matter. You may approach the hon. Chairman. That's all. That is over. Okay. Nothing more.

DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO: Sir, I should also be allowed.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. That is enough.

DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO: I beg the Chair.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, okay. Nothing more. That is enough.

Now, further consideration of the Bill by Shri Tiruchi Siva. Mr. Siva, you spoke for five minutes that day. So, you will continue.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

**THE CONSTITUTION (AMENDMENT) BILL, 2015
(AMENDMENT OF ARTICLE 324) -- CONTD.**

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (TAMIL NADU): Sir, my Bill is to further amend the Constitution of India. Why it is needed, I have to elucidate first. Article 324 of the Constitution says, "The superintendence, direction and control of elections..... shall be vested in the Election Commission." In Article 324 (6), it says, "The President, or the Governor of a State, shall, when so requested by the Election Commission, make available to the Election Commission or to a Regional Commissioner such staff as may be necessary for the discharge of the functions conferred on the Election Commission by clause (1)." Sir, my Amendment is that, here, alongwith 'such staff as may be necessary', 'excluding the teachers' may be inserted. Because of the appointment of teachers as electoral officers, there is a lot of absenteeism of teachers in schools and a lot of repercussion has been felt. Many people belonging to the teacher community approached me and expressed their concerns. Because of being employed for election duty, they undergo a lot of strain, and because of that their concentration on studies is affected. Sir, the American

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

Commission on Teachers' Education very rightly observes that the quality of a nation depends upon the quality of its citizens. The quality of citizens depend, though not exclusively but in critical measure, upon the quality of their education. The education, undoubtedly, depends upon a single factor, that is, the quality of teachers. Sir, the importance of teachers is no secret. Schools and societies seek out for the best teachers they could get because of the belief that the success of the students depends only on teachers. A teacher not only imparts education but also inspires and motivates the students to grow and develop as good citizens. The quality and accent of learner achievement is certainly determined, primarily, by teachers' competence, sensitivity and teachers' motivation. A true democracy is one where education is universal. But in our country, after many decades of Independence, that is, in the dawn of the 21st Century only, the children aged 6 to 14 of our nation gained the Fundamental Right to Education under Article 21 (A). It says that the State shall provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of 6 to 14 years in such a manner as the State may by law determine. Sir, India's educational report card leaves ample room for improvement. In 2016, the World

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

Economic Forum's Human Capital Index, which takes into account educational quality in addition to access, ranked India at 105 out of 130 countries. It is a very sorry state of affairs. A developing country, rather a developed country, which is expected to be number one at the global level on many grounds, whereas in education, it is placed at the 105th place among 130 countries. Further, as per the Annual Status of Education Report Survey 2016, which is administered by the Indian NGO, PRATHAM, it was found that learning of mathematics is a serious and major source of concern.

(Contd. by PB/2G)

PB/2G/2.55

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (CONTD.): As per all-India figures, rural figures especially, for basic arithmetic in 2016, only 27 per cent of Class 3 students could do a basic two-digit subtraction. For Class 5 students, the proportion of students who could do a basic two-digit subtraction is, in fact, lower at 26.1 per cent. The reading levels of students is not much better either. As per the ASER Report, 46 per cent of Class 1 students could not even recognize the letters of their preferred language. For Class 3 students, only 25 per cent of the students were

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

able to read a Standard 2 level text. In another independent survey commissioned in 2014 by the Ministry of Human Resource Development, 60.64 lakh students were estimated to be out of school in the age group of 6-13 years. Again, the Ministry of HRD also commissioned two studies for the attendance assessment rate of students and teachers in 2006-07 and 2012-13. As per the study, 15.2 per cent of the teachers at primary schools were absent during 2012-13. The figure was worse for the upper primary schools, with teacher absenteeism at 16.9 per cent during 2012-13.

Sir, the importance of the role played by the Election Commission which is a constitutional body cannot be undermined. While the Parliament is empowered to frame law as regards conduct of elections, the 'superintendence, direction and control of holding the elections' is the sole responsibility of the Election Commission. Sir, recently, we got an information or a statistic that in Madhya Pradesh 4,000 schools don't have even one teacher. In this situation, when there are so many vacancies employment or appointment of teachers as Election Officers...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why is there no teacher in 4,000 schools?

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Yes. That has to be gone ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Are there no teachers, no qualified teachers?

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, schools don't have teachers at all.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We can get any number of teachers.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: It is very alarming, Sir, to receive that. And which are the States? I should say that, given that a total of 9,07,585 posts of teachers are vacant in the country. Already when so many vacancies are there, they are leaving the students without proper coaching. Even the teachers who are employed are sent to an election duty and they are being trained. Teachers, especially lady teachers, who go there, undergo a lot of sufferings. Any person who is employed or deputed for election duty is taken care of by other people whereas these teachers are not taken care of. They don't have any place to go and settle; they don't have any place of convenience for lady teachers for two or three days and they undergo a lot of mental strain during that period, and they are also stamped with some political affinity whatever may happen there. And when they come back, their concentration on teaching the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

students come down. It is alarming, Sir. You yourself said this; 9,07,585 posts are vacant.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How is that possible? That is what I am thinking. Is it? How can it be?

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Day-before-yesterday also, a question came that even in the Central Universities, posts of some 6,000 professors are vacant. ...(Interruptions)... Yesterday only, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: For university professors, there may be shortage of qualified ranks.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: No, Sir. They are in abundance. Qualified candidates are available much in the country. It is only because of the recruitment process. It is the administrative mistake only, Sir. It is not because of lack of candidates. Why? They are, of course, qualified. But the recruitment process is not proper in this country. The Delhi University itself has got 3,000 and odd vacancies. It is very, very sad. We say that we are bothered about the standard of education whereas the universities are lying vacant without professors and the schools are having an alarming vacancy of 9,00,000 and all. See, I don't go into evasive collection of reports. Even the Ministry of HRD in 2014 titled

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

'Education for all towards Quality with Equity' says which are the vacancies lying in the States. I will say it very, very, shortly. In Uttar Pradesh, vacancies against sanctioned SSA, Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan Posts, are 1,24,196.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: My God! How can it be?

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Vacancies against total posts sanctioned under State Programme, 1,45,334. On the whole, Sir, in U.P. only, 2,69,539 vacancies are there.

(Contd. by 2h/SKC)

SKC/2H/3.00

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (contd.): In Bihar, it is 2,19,066; in West Bengal, it is 1,05,200.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, I would like to support him on this. That was so earlier, but recently, in this week, more than 50,000 Primary Teachers are being recruited.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: It has to be appreciated that the State Government is taking the initiative.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But this is a serious matter.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: In Jharkhand, it is 69,163.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Is there anybody from the HRD Ministry? Nobody is here from the HRD Ministry. Then who would help me? ... (Interruptions)... The Parliamentary Affairs Minister is also not there. So, I would request Mr. M.J. Akbar to convey to the HRD Minister this very important point that in some States – if the numbers given here are correct – there are vacancies of more than a lakh teachers in Uttar Pradesh and a similar large number in Madhya Pradesh. If it is about the shortage of qualified teachers, there is no problem; we can have them from Kerala and Tamil Nadu that have enough number of qualified teachers. Fill up the vacancies. Otherwise, what is the point of education? Please convey the concern.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI M.J. AKBAR): Sir, we shall do that.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I have doubts about that. Many students pass out with the necessary qualifications and they are well-trained to become teachers, but they are not being employed.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. You may proceed further.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: So many people come to us who have completed M.Phil. and B.Ed. degrees. They say, “Give us a job paying Rs. 5,000;

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

we are ready to do any work.” So, it is not as if there is a lack of qualified teachers.

Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, on behalf of the teachers’ community, I express my thanks to the Chair, as you have instructed the Minister to take note of the issue.

Sir, given the large number of vacant posts of teachers, the absence of teachers from their regular teaching duties is adding to the distress of students. It has a major impact on students as it leads to non-completion of syllabi on time as well as low levels of learning.

Sir, the hon. Supreme Court, in its 2001 judgement on *the Election Commission of India versus St. Mary School & Others*, stated that ‘holding of an election is, no doubt, of paramount importance, but the education of children cannot be neglected for this purpose’. The Supreme Court has observed, “With the advent of technology, the requisitioning of a large number of people may not be necessary. We notice that the Election Commission has different roles to play. The Election Commission, in our opinion, can formulate an effective scheme to see that the service of a large number of teachers is not required.”

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

Sir, this is an observation made by the Supreme Court, not me. Some of my colleagues here, when we had a discussion aside, said, “If teachers are not appointed, where else can we go?” There are alternate arrangements. There are retired teachers who are already trained. There are so many unemployed youth whom you could recruit, give training to and use for election duty, which is a short-term duty. As it is, these teachers are working for hours lesser than that prescribed under the RTE Act. In this situation, if they are taken away from their regular duty in schools and their strain distracts them from teaching the students in a proper manner, it is much worrisome.

Sir, the hon. Supreme Court further noted in its judgement, “The state of primary education in India is deplorable. There is a heavy dropout from the schools, particularly from amongst the girls.” Sir, it would be important to note here that there is a huge pool of non-teaching staff and retired teachers who have experience in discharging election duties. It has been learnt recently that the Democratic Teachers Front had made a complaint to the National Commission for Protection of Child Rights and asked them to take stringent action against officials who had deputed teachers for non-educational duties.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

According to the DTF, the State of Punjab has 3,65,473 employees other than teachers who can carry out non-educational duties. Further, under the current structure, teachers are already putting in less than 45 hours of work and teachers in the State of Punjab taught only for 167 days as against the minimum of 220 days required for Class VIII.

Sir, in another judgement given by the Rajasthan High Court in May, 2015, in the *Syed Shahid Ali versus Director, Secondary Education and others*, the Court ordered that assigning additional non-teaching responsibilities to teachers needs to be seriously considered as it affects the primary responsibility of teaching, and the students are the worst sufferers because of such diversion of responsibilities. The Board results of the school in question showed a sharp decline in its performance, with the results of the students in Class X Mathematics Examination – Sir, this is, again, an alarming statistics – showing a decline from 77.41 per cent in 2010-11 to 41.17 per cent in 2011-12 and further, to a shocking low of 20.73 per cent in 2012-13.

(CONTD. BY HK/2J)

HK/2J/3.05

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (CONTD.): This is the result of the mathematics examination. When already much concentration has been diverted, it brings much worse situation when the teachers are diverted. This shows that teaching has been a casual duty when this additional responsibility is bestowed upon teachers. Sir, in the light of the Supreme Court's judgment, again I say, Sir, the Ministry of HRD issued guidelines on 13th of September, 2010. This clarified that Section 27 was placed to free teachers from deployment for non-educational duties other than those which are considered to be essential. Sadly, the guidelines given by the Ministry have failed to ensure that the Election Commission does not appoint teachers for election duty during teaching hours. This has not only resulted in students losing several days of classroom study, but also in their lower grades and inadequate learning. This lack of attention not only hampers their learning, but, in the long run, might also result in their 'unemployability', not unemployment but 'unemployability'. Recently, the ISRO has given a statement that out of the passed-out engineering graduates in this country, Sir, only 26 per cent are employable. It is the ISRO's

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

statement: "Out of the total number of passed-out engineering graduates, only 26 per cent are 'employable'. In this case when the students are deprived of this sort of lack of teaching by the teachers, for they are deputed for some other non-teaching duties, unemployability will increase. It is not 'unemployment', again I say 'unemployability'. In addition to affecting the performance of students, deployment of teachers on non-teaching duties such as elections further reflects in the schools. Schools are institutes where democratic ideals such as equality, freedom and justice are instilled in individuals. For democracy to continue to thrive, students must be taught to value it as a way of life. Qualities such as tolerance, acceptance, global awareness, etc., in addition to the academic skills of mathematics, science and social science, rest within the teachers, in all possible ways, to shape the child to face this competitive world that exists today. Teachers' beliefs, thoughts, decisions and determination and all these things should be communicated to students. Educational matters occupy a major part of the psychological context of the teaching process. Sir, children, up to the age of 14, mostly at the time of working, are at school than at home. So, the responsibility of bringing up the children rests mostly

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

with the teachers than the parents. In this case, when already there are a larger number of vacancies, the teachers who are already employed are diverted. This causes very serious and worrisome problem for the future. More educated and better educated citizens will also result in better governance and improved health outcome. Sir, the report I am quoting is a very, very good answer to the question when some people raise a question who else will be deputed. In the United States of America, local citizens above the age of 18 may volunteer to serve as election officers at a local polling station. These volunteers are given special training which would enable them to discharge their duties efficiently. According to a report 'Innovations in Election Administration', released by the Federal Election Commission of USA, 'One of the most surprising aspects of the volunteer programme is that requesting volunteer support actually appeals to people who otherwise may not consider working at a polling place. This opens up a whole new population of potential election workers, far beyond the limited resource base of retired senior citizens.' In Australia, the Australian Election Commission employs around 80,000 Australians on a short-term temporary basis for electoral events and duties, and they are

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

remunerated accordingly. Citizens of Australia, above the age of 18, can register with the Election Commission, and are thus deployed on election duties. Why can't our country follow the same? I think this is not wrong. It is a very good precedent. Those who are willing to serve as election officers can enroll themselves in the nearby ... (Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is the control over them if they misbehave? What will you do? What is the control over them if they do something hanky-panky? What will you do?

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, no one can be assured of that. No one can be assured how they will behave there. I don't want to degrade anyone.

(Contd. by GSP/2K)

GSP-PSV-2K-3.10

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (CONTD.): Whoever you may depute, we have only a trust on them that they will not act prejudicially. The same confidence or trust we have to have in the youth in this country. In fact, we should have more trust on them when they are offering their services themselves. Moreover, Sir, apart from the unemployed youth, the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

retired teachers also can be employed. Those who are already experienced in the election duties could be employed. This is the position, Sir.

Recently, in a press note, the Minister of State in the Ministry of Human Resource Development, Shri Katheria, said, "The Government is planning to relieve the teachers from the poll duties."

So, Sir, in my introductory speech, I would urge that keeping in view the interest of the nation, the future of the children who are in schools, and, the pain and suffering, which the teachers are undergoing while they are engaged in other non-teaching duties, this Bill should be passed. Due to these duties, teachers are not able to concentrate on teaching the students, thereby diminishing the already-declining standard of education in our nation. Apart from the vacancy position, which is very alarming, if this thing also continues, it will not help the education sector to grow. So, I urge the House to adopt this Bill.

Sir, since Mr. Katheria has already given a statement that the Government is planning to relieve the teachers from the poll duties, I sincerely hope that the Ministry will take necessary steps not to appoint teachers for election duties and it would suggest the Election

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

Commission accordingly. For this, I have brought this Constitution (Amendment) Bill, 2015 (Amendment of Article 324). Sir, addition of "such step excluding the teachers may be..." is my Amendment, Sir.

With these words, I move the Bill for consideration. Thank you very much.

The question was proposed.

श्रीमती विप्लव ठाकुर (हिमाचल प्रदेश): माननीय उपसभापति जी, मैं आपका धन्यवाद करती हूँ कि आपने इस बिल पर मुझे बोलने का अवसर दिया है, जो प्राइवेट मेम्बर्स बिल तिरुची शिवा जी लेकर आए हैं।

महोदय, यह एक बहुत महत्वपूर्ण बिल है, जोकि अमेंडमेंट बिल है, क्योंकि जो शिक्षा है, वह हमारे बच्चों के फ्यूचर बनाने का, आने वाली पीढ़ियों का एक आधार है। अगर उसी में ही कमी है, अगर उसी में कमजोरी रह जाती है, तो हमारी जो आने वाली पीढ़ी है, आने वाली जो जेनरेशन है, वह आगे नहीं बढ़ सकती। यही नहीं, टीचर्स को केवल चुनाव के समय ही नहीं लगाया जाता, अध्यापकों की जमात ऐसी जमात है, जिसको आलू की तरह सब जगह फिट कर दिया जाता है। जैसे कहते हैं कि आलू को कहीं भी डाल दीजिए, किसी भी सब्जी में डाल दीजिए, वैसे ही यह अध्यापकों की जमात है। अगर आपको सेंसस का काम करवाना है, तब अध्यापकों को भेज दो, अगर आपको बिलो पॉवर्टी लाइन का सर्वे करवाना है, तब अध्यापकों को भेज दो, मतलब अध्यापक हो गये कि क्या हो गया! यह नहीं

सोचा जाता कि जिन अध्यापकों के नीचे बच्चे पढ़ रहे हैं, उनका भविष्य क्या होगा? अभी जैसे इन्होंने बताया कि अध्यापकों की कितनी कमी है और विशेष करके जो प्राइमरी स्कूल्स हैं, जो पहली से पाँचवीं तक की क्लासेज़ होती हैं, जहाँ बच्चों को 'ए', 'बी', 'सी' सिखानी है, '1', '2', '3' सिखाना है और 'क', 'ख', 'ग' सिखाना है, अगर वहाँ ही अध्यापक नहीं रहेंगे, तो हम नींव कैसे डालेंगे? हम इतने-इतने बड़े टेक्निकल कॉलेजेज़, मेडिकल कॉलेजेज़, आईआईएम्स, एमबीए आदि सब कुछ खोल रहे हैं, लेकिन उन बच्चों की नींव नहीं बन रही है, क्योंकि वहाँ पर अध्यापक नहीं हैं। चुनाव के समय, जिस तरह से सुप्रीम कोर्ट की observation है, खास करके गाँवों में ऐसा होता है कि जो टीचर है, वह पहले एक्सरसाइज़ के लिए जाएगा, उसको सिखाया जाएगा कि आपको किस तरह से वोटिंग मशीन हैंडल करनी है, वहाँ उसको तीन दिन लग जाते हैं। फिर चार दिन पहले वह पोलिंग बूथ पर पहुँच जाता है। अब बताइए कि बच्चों का कितना नुकसान होता है, उसकी भरपाई कौन करेगा और इसके लिए कौन जिम्मेदार है? इसलिए मैं कहना चाहूँगी कि इसमें अमेंडमेंट होना चाहिए।

(2एल/वीएनके पर जारी)

-PSV/VNK-YSR/3.15/2L

श्रीमती विप्लव ठाकुर (क्रमागत) : टीचर्स की ड्यूटी न केवल चुनाव के लिए बल्कि और किसी भी काम के लिए नहीं लगानी चाहिए, क्योंकि टीचर्स या अध्यापक हमारे बच्चों के कर्णधार हैं। अगर वे स्कूल में नहीं रहेंगे, तो बच्चे क्या

पढ़ेंगे? विशेष करके गांवों के स्कूलों में जहां पर टीचर्स का होना बहुत जरूरी है, जहां पर पांचवीं क्लास तक के स्कूल के लिए या दसवीं या बारहवीं तक के स्कूल के लिए वैसे ही बहुत मुश्किल से अध्यापक मिलते हैं। जिन स्कूलों में टीचर्स की कमी होती है, वहां से भी उन टीचर्स को ऐसे कामों में लगा दिया जाता है। आप यह बताइए कि अगर हम अपने बच्चों के लिए अध्यापकों की कमी को दूर नहीं करेंगे और जो अध्यापक हैं, उनको ऐसे कामों में लगाएंगे, तो ऐसे में किस तरह से शिक्षा के क्षेत्र में उन्नति हो सकती है या उसको आगे बढ़ाया जा सकता है या उसमें इम्प्रूवमेंट हो सकती है? देश में ऐसे ही टीचर्स की कमी है और इस तरह के कामों में टीचर्स की ज्यूटी लगाने से इसमें और कमी आ जाती है। इस संबंध में चुनाव आयोग को भी चाहिए कि वह सरकार को ऐसी instructions दें कि माइनस टीचर किया जाए यानी टीचर्स को इस काम में नहीं लगाया जाए। इसके अलावा बहुत सारे स्टाफ हैं, गवर्नमेंट के सारे ऑफिसेज़ भरे पड़े हैं, वे employees से overburdened हैं, उनको क्यों नहीं ऐसे कामों के लिए इस्तेमाल किया जाता है? क्लर्क्स हैं, superintendents हैं, supervisors हैं, कई विभाग हैं, जहां पर employees हैं, उन्हें क्यों नहीं ऐसे कामों में लगाया जाता है? कहीं प्रिंसिपल जाएगा, कहीं हेडमास्टर जाएगा, कहीं कोई और टीचर जाएगा, ऐसा क्यों होता है? हम टीचर्स को इस तरह से क्यों देखते हैं? हम उनकी रिस्पेक्ट को क्यों नहीं देखते हैं कि वही हमारे बच्चों का भविष्य बनाने वाले हैं? इस संबंध में मैं चाहूंगी और कहूंगी कि इस अमेंडमेंट को माना जाना चाहिए और यह बिल्कुल किया जाना

चाहिए ताकि अध्यापकों की ड्यूटी चुनाव में नहीं लगे। मैं तो यह भी कहना चाहती हूँ कि अध्यापकों की ड्यूटी किसी भी काम के लिए नहीं लगनी चाहिए। अंत में मैं तिरुची शिवा जी द्वारा प्रस्तुत किए गए इस बिल का समर्थन करती हूँ, बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

SHRI LA. GANESAN (MADHYA PRADESH): Respected Mr. Deputy Chairman, I am very happy to have the opportunity to speak on this occasion. I have come here as a Member of the Rajya Sabha for the first time; as a Member of Parliament for the first time; and this is the first time that I have got a chance to speak. If you permit me, it may be a maiden speech. इस विषय पर बोलने के लिए इतना समय भी नहीं चाहिए, फिर भी तिरुची शिवा जी द्वारा प्रस्तुत किए गए अमेंडमेंट पर मैं अपने मन में जो सोच रहा हूँ, उसको मैं संक्षेप में रखना चाहता हूँ। I just want to briefly make two or three points on this.

I support him and I agree with the concern expressed by my good friend, Shri Tiruchi Siva. Nobody can object to that. Everybody agrees that this kind of treatment or work cannot be given at the cost of education. But the alternative has not been mentioned specifically. The alternative suggested here is that you pick up some people from

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

outside. It is more dangerous today because the political situation or politics is not that much clean in our country. I am very sorry to say this. The Government servants and teachers are afraid of the Ruling Party in the States. Something happens in the polling booth and they are not able to prevent it. In that case, what can we expect from the people who will be picked up from outside? That leaves a question mark on it. That is why I say that we have to think about the alternative. Otherwise, the remedy will be more dangerous than the disease. That is the only point that I want to make. My objection is only to that.

As far as the suggestion or the concern expressed by him for the teachers, who are given the election duty, is concerned, I agree with him. But elections are a serious affair. Even hon. President of India mentioned in his speech about conducting the Lok Sabha and the Assembly elections simultaneously.

(Contd. by VKK/2M)

-YSR/VKK-NKR/2M/3.20

SHRI LA. GANESAN (CONTD.): So, that is also being considered on the other side. Instead of piecemeal amendments, holistic approach must be there. Let the Government at the Centre appoint a group of

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

people or experts. Let them discuss. Let them even take into consideration the suggestion given by Mr. Siva and whatever laws and election rules we want to change. Once and for all, we will do it. This is the right time to do it. I have got my own suggestions. Where are the teachers employed in election work? In the beginning, they are employed for preparing the electoral list. Unfortunately, after Independence, even now, the Election Commission is not able to prepare a perfect voter list. It is not so even today. Many names are left; many dead people are somehow voting even today; photos are changed; male becomes female and female becomes male; addresses are changed. Even today, this is happening. Even then, I appreciate our Election Commission. In a country like India, where we have got a large population and the only country in the whole world where such a large number of people is voting, we are efficiently conducting the elections. I accept it. But, even then, it is not perfect. That is why teachers are involved. My suggestion is this. Nowadays, people are not writing letters. Gradually the post office is losing its relevance because the *tapals* are not coming. Nobody is normally writing it. Everything has come into cell phone or internet. Fortunately, I have to

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

really appreciate that our Government is making use of post office and now passport will be issued by post offices. Post office becomes a banking system. So, it is a good thing. They are engaged. But, my suggestion is, involve the post office and involve the postman. He is the only person who is visiting every house not only for one programme as a duty, but almost daily, he is visiting the houses. He knows each and everybody in the house. By name, he can recognise everybody. Involve the post office and involve the postmen. Then, you can prepare the voter list almost *pucca*. This is my suggestion. So, teachers need not be involved at that time. This is one aspect I want to put forward.

Sir, the second thing is that percentage of voting is not increasing in spite of our efforts. I was very happy about the Election Commission last time. Even from the Election Commission, they made a propaganda that 100 per cent or at least 80 to 90 per cent voting should be there. Even then, in a city like Chennai, moreover in a constituency like South Madras, where more educated people are there, the percentage of voting is hardly 60 per cent. What is the reason for that? We have to take this into consideration. Whether we can give some incentives for voting or otherwise, negatively, we can award some

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

punishment. That should also be thought of. While we are thinking about the whole election reforms, we have to take up all the aspects of it. These are all the aspects that we have to discuss in detail. Then, who will manage the election? There is a question mark. One small suggestion I can give. If it is a State election, naturally, the employees under the State Government are helping the State Government. I am sharing my experience of Tamil Nadu. This is the experience of Tamil Nadu. So, only Central Government employees should be involved in Assembly election. To a certain extent, that can solve the problem. ... (Interruptions) ... Allow me to complete. ... (Interruptions) ... Madam, I am not yielding to you. ... (Interruptions) ... Allow me to continue. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: For both Parliamentary as well as Assembly elections, the same teachers are there. Why are they concerned about the State Government? Whether it is AIADMK or DMK, it has nothing to do with that. It is not of that sort. You only make teachers accountable. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I think his views are based on his experience. ... (Interruptions) ...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He did not speak about any party. ... (Interruptions)... Vijilaji, he did not mention any party. ... (Interruptions).. He didn't blame your party or any party. He only said it generally. ... (Interruptions)... All right. Now, you sit down. ... (Interruptions)... Your name is next. At that time, you can speak. Sit down. ... (Interruptions)...

(Contd. by BHS/2N)

-VKK/BHS-DS/2N/3.25

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN (CONTD.): Your name is next. ... (Interruptions)... Then, you can speak. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI LA. GANESAN: Though I have not mentioned any political party..... (Interruptions)... but dear friend, Mr. Siva, is silent. ... (Interruptions)... Madam has..... (Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: She felt it. ... (Interruptions)... Even though you did not mention any party, she felt it. ... (Interruptions)... Sit down. ... (Interruptions)... Sit down. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: I align with the..... (Interruptions)... I support him. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. Sit down. ... (Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRI LA. GANESAN: Sir, you have well understood about what I have not told publically. ...(Interruptions)... As far as conducting simultaneous elections is concerned, I am one with that. There may be so many problems, as I already told you, experts should sit and discuss about it.

I would give you an example. Our very famous and able Chief Minister of Rajasthan, Shri Bhairon Singh Shekhawat, visited Tamil Nadu. I was State General Secretary, Organisation In-charge of Tamil Nadu, I accompanied him. That was the time when BJP failed in the elections. We lost the rule. Mr. Shekhawat was the Chief Minister. I asked him, as I was told that he was a very able and efficient Chief Minister of Rajasthan, as to how it is that he could not win the election. That was the time when the Central Government had dismissed some three or four State Governments over December 6th incident at Ayodhya. In the by-election, BJP got defeated in Rajasthan. So, Mr. Shekhawat told me his experience. This is a very interesting experience which is relevant about conducting the simultaneous elections of both Lok Sabha and Assemblies. He said, “You know what we will do. Just before the election, the State Government will announce all freebies and

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

all concessions and no taxes. We will get elected. In the first year Budget, we will not tax the people. It will be very soft Budget. Anyhow, to run the Government we want money. The second year of the Budget will be a little harsh. The third year, whatever money we want, we will be very harsh and we will tax more. Unfortunately, just when we presented the Budget in the third year, my Government got dismissed and the people were angry with me. Again, in the fourth year it would be less and in fifth year, practically, there will be no taxes. So, what happens you know, the problem is with the Central Government”. Now, today, the Election Commission has said that in the Budget you should not say anything which is favourable to the election-facing States. During the next year Budget time what is the guarantee that there will be no elections in other States of India? Every year there are some elections somewhere in India. Then, what will the Central Government do? The same thing happens with the State Governments also. Every time, it is there somewhere or other. So, the Central Government, only to persuade the voters, thinking about getting more votes, will not prepare a realistic Budget. That is the problem. That is why once in five years only the election should be there. That will solve all the problems of the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

Government. Not only that, the people have given mandate for a party. Allow them to work for four or five years and let them face the election. So, these are all the things, especially, about the national parties like BJP and the Congress Party, they may fail. And, so, everywhere, every year there will be some election in some State.

Yesterday, one of my colleagues has told about criticizing the Prime Minister going around on election campaigns. The Prime Minister does not want it. Allow him to work as Prime Minister. Allow the Ministers to work as Ministers. So, if it is once in five years, the Ministers can also concentrate on their respective responsibility. All these things should be put together.

Another point is about counting system nowadays. Why this much time? Recently, two years ago, there was an election in Sri Lanka. I was really surprised, the counting was over by the night and the results were declared early morning. Next day morning at 10 o'clock the Prime Minister took office. I was really surprised. Why can't we do it? So, all those things put together, I have mentioned only three-four points about the election. The points raised by Mr. Siva are very much relevant, but do not make amendment in the rules

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

piecemeal. Let us all sit together. The entire election issue will be discussed by experts and then permanently there will be some solution about elections whatever it is. This is my point. Thank you very much for giving me the time. (Ends)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much, Shri Ganesan. Now, Shrimati Vijila Sathyananth.

(Followed by DC/20)

DC/3.30/20

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: Sir, can I participate in both the discussions? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes; you can participate in this and in the next also.

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH (TAMIL NADU): Sir, now I have taken up my career in politics but earlier as I had served as a teacher, I could get the views of the teachers. Now several teachers remain engaged in non-academic activities, which include works related to the school funds, Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan, Rashtriya Madhyam Shiksha Abhiyan, thereby impacting the studies at the schools and violating Section 27 of the Right to Education Act, 2009, which clearly prohibits

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

such duties. That allows only three duties -- census, disaster and election duties, only on polling and counting days. But despite orders, I know that the teachers are made to do such other duties as the school heads don't relegate the work to the clerks. Now, in most of the schools, the Juniors/Assistants and the people who are used to do these jobs are very, very limited. It is a policy matter.

**(THE VICE-CHAIRMAN, SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY, in the
Chair)**

Even if they do, the clerks mostly refuse to carry out all the duties, thereby forcing the teachers to multitask. So the teachers have to teach as well as do all these works in addition. According to the document assessed by HT, the then DPI in 2007 had sent a letter to the then DEO, addressing some of the concerns which I read out in an article. The works not being done by the ministerial staff at the schools has been seriously noted by the officials. I would like to raise here many concerns including somewhere some teachers had very unfortunate happenings when they go to very remote villages for their election duties, for doing census and otherwise. But I also have another view in

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

this. How could the Election Commission then conduct the elections? Who will be accountable for that? Only the teachers! The post office staff can also be involved. But how far can they be involved? We need a great volume of people. Every constituency needs about lakhs of people to be engaged in this task. So in this operation, the Election Commission of India needs accountable people. All the officials like the officials from the local bodies are involved in this duty. But they are not sufficient for this work. So, our Election Commission engages teachers in these three duties, i.e., census, disaster and election duties. The point which I just want to add here is, just concentrate on academic work for teachers and bestow these activities during the vacation time. Likewise, we can have the Assembly elections and the Parliamentary elections together so that both will be conducted at the same time and at a stretch, these people can be engaged during their summer holidays where their normal work will not get interrupted. That is what I wanted to put forth here. As I have been an academician, I want to support my people, the teachers.

(Ends)

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): Now, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra Rao.

DR. K.V.P. RAMACHANDRA RAO (TELANGANA): Thank you very much, Sir, for giving me an opportunity to support hon. Tiruchi Siva's Bill.

(Contd. by KR/2P)

KR/2P/3.35

DR. K.P.V. RAMACHANDRA RAO (CONTD.): In regard to deployment of teachers on election duties, recently the Election Commission has modernized the system of elections itself. Nowadays, it is not like olden days where you need to do a lot of paper work and need to do a lot of explaining to the voters. Sir, generation after generation, the voters are becoming wise. The teachers need not be there to teach them how to cast their vote. Sir, in this regard the damage is being done to primary and secondary teachers by deploying them on election duties. Students who are supposed to have a good foundation are getting disturbed because of the absence of teachers, and because of the tensions that teachers go through and training that they go through during election time. If the teachers are not deployed,

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

we have to look at what the alternatives are. After modernization of the election procedure, the Election Commission can find people from various other sectors to conduct elections peacefully. I am very sure that they can come out with the alternatives with the help of the experts.

Once again, I thank you very much for giving me this opportunity to support Mr. Siva's Bill. Though he belongs to a party which doesn't believe in God but his name is Siva, still, I wholeheartedly support his Bill. Thank you.

(Ends)

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (TELANGANA): Respected Vice-Chairman, Sir, by moving the Bill to highlight the issue of teachers' involvement in the electoral process, my elder hon. colleague, Mr. Tiruchi Siva is seeking to focus on the quality of education and to yield psychologically to the teaching fraternity so that the foundations for the future generation would be safe in their hands.

In 2007, the Supreme Court had concretely observed that the primary and secondary school teachers should not be deployed on

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

electoral assignments to save them from discharging their educational responsibilities.

My concern is two-fold. Though the Government has looked at the issue of electoral conduction, it has deployed the Union Minister of Law to take note of the debate and reply to the points raised by the hon. Members. Here the Minister of Human Resource Development is having a larger responsibility to hear the observations on this Bill because in schools we need to look at the non-teaching responsibilities of the teachers.

(Continued by 3Q/KS)

KS-GS/2Q/3.40

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (contd.): Their non-teaching assignments include not only elections duties, Census duties, canvassing duties on certain national events. Not only that, they are made to attend to certain clerical duties also. They also carry out sort of watch and ward duties in the mid-day meal programmes in their schools. And because of all this, their concentration on teaching becomes much less with the result that ultimately the quality of education, particularly in Government schools, is rendered very poor,

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

which is also one of the reasons why most of the parents do not show much interest in sending their children to Government schools. Teachers in Government schools are assigned duties to serve mid-day meals to school children. Everybody knows that each teacher foregoes at least a minimum of two periods of 45 minutes each daily for attending to mid-day meal duties and to ensure that the meals are prepared on time and served properly. In this backdrop of teachers attending to Census duties, election duties, and not only Lok Sabha elections but even Assembly elections, cooperative societies' elections, panchayat elections and so on, and also in the backdrop of school teachers being utilised as campaigners for certain national events, and keeping in mind the huge human resource available, with so huge unemployment, why should we not think on the lines the United States thinks, or on the lines the Australians think? In the United States, Sir, teachers are never deployed for election duties; they are never sent to polling booths or counting centres. In Australia, they have a practice of engaging volunteers for short periods for organising and conducting elections as and when they are held. This has to be the basis for our electoral reforms. I appreciate the initiatives taken by the Election Commission.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

Now, they give voter slips on their own to each and every registered voter. They also give acknowledgement slips whenever certain doubts are expressed regarding the utility of EVMs and their functioning. Certain improvements are giving confidence to voters now that they can vote properly and the fairness of results is also ensured. When the Election Commission is taking extra interest, why should the Union Government not come forward and think of having a para-voluntary force comprising able, registered, unemployed, educated and even qualified retired persons? With this voluntary force, we can conduct free and fair elections; we can have them on Census duties, in rescue and rehabilitation work, etc. We can use these volunteers even to take care of the mid-day meal programmes in schools and similarly student-related and community-related programmes. These two aspects fall under two different Ministries. I hope the Union Minister of Law would communicate the concerns of this House over the deployment of teachers for electoral duties to the Election Commission.

(CONTD. BY RSS/2R)

RSS/2R/3.45

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (CONTD.): But also we expect that the Ministry of Human Resource Development will take note of the necessity of keeping the teachers psychologically free to enhance the quality of education and to give them only teaching and learning practices and keeping them away from the non-teaching roles. With this, we can ensure the students to have the confidence in the educational system and the parents will definitely be happy to send their children to the Government schools in large numbers. This is the requirement of the day to improve the quality of education and to improve the electoral process, and for that, let us think of para voluntary force to utilize and achieve the targeted goal. Thank you very much.

(Ends)

SHRI A.NAVANEETHAKRISHNAN (TAMIL NADU): Thank you, hon. Vice-Chairman. This is a Constitutional Amendment based upon the decision of the hon. High Court, which has been moved by our hon. Member. In the Statement of Objects and Reasons also, it is very

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

clearly mentioned that accordingly, teachers are supposed to be assigned election duties only on Sundays and other holidays. The Supreme Court has held that the election work should not be entrusted to the teachers for fourteen days, that is, their work shall not be affected because of the election work. I may be permitted to read the relevant portion. I quote: "We, however, notice that Election Commission before us also categorically stated that as far as possible, teachers should be put on electoral rolls revision works on holidays, non-teaching days, non-teaching hours, whereas, non-teaching staff be put on duty any time. We, therefore, direct that all teaching staff shall be put on the duties of roll revisions and election works on holidays and non-teaching days. Teachers should not ordinarily be put on duty on teaching days and within teaching hours. Non-teaching staff, however, may be put on such duties on any day, at any time, if permissible in law." Again, for the sake of repetition, I read it. "We, therefore, direct all the teaching staff shall be put on duties of roll revisions and election works on holidays and non-teaching days." So, the direction of the hon. Supreme Court is that the teaching staff shall be put on duties of roll revisions and election works on holidays and

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

non-teaching days. So, the entire teaching community is not excluded. This is my humble submission. So, they shall be put duties of roll revisions and election works on holidays and non-teaching days. This is what the Supreme Court judgment says. So, on working days, if it is affecting their classes, then, they shall not carry on with the work. My humble view is, subject to correction and approval by the hon. Members of this House, this Amendment is not at all required in pursuance of the directions of the hon. Supreme Court judgment. Article 324 of the Constitution of India vests the power of superintendence, direction and control of elections on the Election Commission. But, two very vital enactments were passed by our Parliament, namely, Representation of the People Act, 1950 and Representation of the People Act, 1951.

(contd. by 2s/KGG)

KGG/2S/3.50

SHRI A. NAVANEETHAKRISHNAN (contd.): These two enactments deal with requisitioning of officers for the purpose of election duties. So, I think, Section 159 is most important—staff of certain authorities to be made available for election work, which include every local authority;

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

every university established or incorporated by or under a Central, Provincial or State Act; a Government company defined; any other institution, concern or undertaking which is established by or under a Central, Provincial or State Act or which is controlled, or financed wholly or substantially by funds provided, directly or indirectly, by the Central Government or a State Government. So, if at all, the Government wants to take a policy-decision, the stakeholders may be consulted because now the people have more awareness. The law can't be passed without consulting the stakeholders. The persons going to be affected must be given an opportunity. So, the teachers' community may be given an opportunity to express what their views are. My interpretation, subject to correction and approval, is that the teaching community can't be employed during the teaching hours.

The Supreme Court further says that the teachers should not ordinarily be put on duties when they are on teaching duties. They are not totally excluded. Also, I am of the humble opinion that the teaching community is still maintaining an impartial and clean image about itself. They are the group of officials available in our governance who are discharging their duties while maintaining their impartiality. They are the

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

real role-models for the students. They are the future of India. Being role-models for students, they act independently, judiciously and impartially. There could be one or two complaints, which could be the subject-matter for inquiry.

My humble submission, first of all, would be that the Constitutional Amendment is not at all required. If at all required, it should be done only after consultation with all the stakeholders. Only the necessary amendments may be made in these two enactments.

I thank Mr. Vice-Chairman and conclude.

(Ends)

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY (ANDHRA PRADESH): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, thank you for the opportunity given to me though I had not given my name earlier. Sir, the Private Member's Bill introduced by Shri Tiruchi Siva has a rationale. In fact, the teachers, as of today, are all deployed not only during elections but also for census duties which are detrimental to the interests of students. It is a well-known fact. In fact, there is a Supreme Court judgment, though not directly on this. I can bring it to your notice the essence of the Supreme Court judgment. It has categorically stated that to engage teachers as personal

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

assistants, for which they are entitled, by the Ministers or Members of Parliament or Members of Assemblies is prohibited under law. There is no way that the teachers can be deployed either for political purposes or for electoral purposes. For that matter, it is so even for calculation of the census. Therefore, the Private Member's Bill has got a rationale. There is no way that the apex court judgment can be deviated or violated.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): Do you have the citation?

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: I don't have the citation, but I can produce it to you tomorrow. If you permit me, I can take a copy of the Supreme Court judgment and I can produce it to you. There is a specific prohibition imposed by the Supreme Court; by its verdict the deployment of teachers is specifically prohibited in this case. Therefore, I request this august House to adopt this Private Member's Bill and pass it so that the interests of the students are protected. Thank you very much, Sir.

(Ends)

(Followed by KLG/2T)

KLG-KLS/2T/3.55

डा. भूषण लाल जांगडे (छत्तीसगढ़): उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, जो चुनाव की प्रक्रिया है, उसमें काफी तादाद में हमारे कर्मचारियों की जरूरत पड़ती है। हमारे शिक्षक बंधुओं की इसमें बहुत संख्या रहती है और उनके माध्यम से ही चुनाव हो पाता है। शुरू से ही यह स्थिति हमारी चुनाव प्रक्रिया में रही है। हमारी चुनाव प्रक्रिया जब शुरू हुई थी, तो उस समय अलग-अलग पेटियां रहती थीं, उन अलग-अलग पेटियों में वोट डालना पड़ता था। उस समय जब हमारी यह चुनाव प्रक्रिया चली थी, तो उसमें केवल शिक्षक बंधु ही सहयोग दे पाते थे। अन्य कर्मचारियों की कमी के कारण से उस काम के लिए केवल शिक्षकों को ही लगाया जाता था, परन्तु धीरे-धीरे परिवर्तन होता रहा है। चूंकि आज मीडिया के कारण, इसके संचालन को लेकर बहुत सारे नए-नए उपकरण आने लगे हैं, इससे कुछ दिनों के बाद, जो हमारे तिरुची शिवा जी ने यह विधेयक रखा है, वह लागू हो सकता है, लेकिन अभी नहीं हो सकता है। उसका कारण यह है कि हमारे शिक्षकों की जो तादाद है, उसका उपयोग करना हमारे लिए जरूरी रहता है। यदि हम उसको अलग कर दें, तो आम नागरिकों से यह चुनाव की प्रक्रिया पूरी नहीं हो सकती है। दूसरी सबसे बड़ी बात यह है कि इन शिक्षकों के पास एक तरह से समय है, क्योंकि अन्य कर्मचारियों की ज्यूटी पूरे बारह के बारह महीने रहती है, शिक्षकों के शिक्षकीय कार्य में कम से कम कुछ महीनों का गैप रहता है। अगर उस गैप में चुनाव की प्रक्रिया चले, तो आपत्ति नहीं होनी चाहिए। हमारा चुनाव का जो तरीका है, उसमें

धीरे-धीरे परिवर्तन होने लगा है। जब चुनाव की प्रक्रिया में इस तरह सुधार होने लगेगा, तो निश्चित रूप से हमें चुनाव के कार्य में शिक्षकों की जरूरत नहीं पड़ेगी, ऐसा मैं महसूस करता हूँ।

महोदय, हम दूसरे देशों का अनुकरण करते हैं। दूसरे देशों में आम नागरिकों से इस तरह चुनाव की प्रक्रिया पूरी करने का मौका मिलता है, लेकिन हमारे यहां हम केवल सरकारी कर्मचारियों से ही चुनाव करवा सकते हैं और इसलिए सरकारी कर्मचारियों के नाम से हमें शिक्षकों का उपयोग करने के लिए बाध्य होना पड़ता है। आज हमारे देश में बहुत सी चीजों में सुधार होने की नौबत आई है। उस सुधार से मैं सोचता हूँ कि हमारे देश में जिस तरह से टेक्नीकल उपयोग बढ़ रहा है, उससे भविष्य में हमें इसका लाभ मिलेगा, ऐसा मैं महसूस करता हूँ। इसलिए मेरा खुद का और मेरे हिसाब से हमारे देश का मत है कि केवल शिक्षकों के द्वारा ही हमारे देश के चुनाव की प्रक्रिया पूरी हो सकेगी। इतना कहते हुए मैं अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

श्री शंकरभाई एन. वेगड़ (गुजरात): माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, हमारे यहां पहले बैलेट पेपर से चुनाव होता था और उस बैलेट पेपर से चुनाव होने के बाद जब उसकी गिनती होती थी, तब एक दिन, दो दिन, तीन-तीन दिन तक गिनती का काम चलता था, लेकिन जब से हमारे चुनाव आयोग ने वोटिंग मशीन से चुनाव कराना शुरू किया, तब से तो दोपहर से शाम तक रिजल्ट आ जाता है। इस काम

में जितना समय पहले शिक्षकों का बरबाद होता था, अब वह कम बरबाद हो रहा है। यह बात सही है कि छुट्टियों के दौरान बच्चों की पढ़ाई नहीं होती है, लेकिन पूरे विश्व में हमारा देश सबसे बड़ा लोकतांत्रिक देश है, इसलिए मेरे हिसाब से शिक्षकों का उपयोग अभी इसमें जरूरी है। इसका एक ही इलाज है, अगर समय बचाना है, टाइम बचाना है, हिंदुस्तान की धनराशि बचानी है, तो जैसा हमारे प्रधान मंत्री जी ने आह्वान किया है, एक ही साथ चुनाव हों, लोक सभा के और हर स्टेट की विधान सभा के चुनाव एक ही साथ हो जाएं। इससे हिंदुस्तान के सभी कर्मचारियों का समय भी बचेगा, धनराशि भी बचेगी और अच्छी तरह से चुनाव भी हो सकता है। इसलिए मेरा यह कहना है कि अभी ऐसा संशोधन, सुधार लाने की कोई जरूरत नहीं है। मैं इसको सपोर्ट नहीं करता हूँ, धन्यवाद।

(समाप्त)

(2यू/एसएसएस-एकेजी पर आगे)

SSS-AKG/2U/4.00

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW AND JUSTICE

(SHRI P. P. CHAUDHARY): Thank you, Sir, for permitting me. The Bill was moved by Shri Tiruchi Siva. This is in respect to the Amendment of Article 324 of the Constitution of India where he has suggested that the present provision may be substituted by the provision that the teacher

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

should not be involved in the process of election and he has suggested that “the President, or the Governor of a State, shall, when so requested by the Election Commission, make available to the Election Commission or to a Regional Commissioner such staff, excluding school teachers, as may be necessary for the discharge of the functions.” So, what is suggested by the hon. Member is that the school teacher may be excluded from participating in the process of election and in the Statement of Objects and Reasons the Supreme Court judgment has also been cited. And apart from it, it is stated that as per Article 21 of the Constitution of India, education is a fundamental right of children and that education of children is being affected. Therefore, teachers should not be deployed in the process of election and a reference to the provision of Section 27 of the Act of 2009 was also made. Now, Sir, apart from the Statement of Objects and Reasons, a reference of the Supreme Court judgment has been made, but a reference to the other direction of the Supreme Court has not been made. The Supreme Court direction is that the teacher should not be employed in the process of election, but the reference has not been made in the Statement of Objects and Reasons to the other

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

direction that the teacher can be employed in the process of election in non-teaching hours, when holidays are there. Sir, as per Article 139 of the Representation of People's Act, it is provided specifically. So, this Bill has been moved for amendment of Section 159 of the Representation of the People Act, 1951. In that Section a provision has been made that the Election Commission can requisite any staff and it includes teachers, Government servants and various authorities from various Departments because it is clearly mentioned that under this provision -- kindly see, the Representation of the People Act where the provision has been made -- that not only the teachers but the Election Commission can also requisite staff from the local authorities, staff from the universities, staff from Government companies as defined under the Companies Act and any other institution, concern or undertaking of the Government. So, not only the teachers from various streams and from various authorities, the other staff are also being requisited for conducting elections. For this purpose, no such amendment has been moved and this is a requirement of the law. Under the statute, the Election Commission can requisite the teachers and other staff from various other institutions. Now, so far as Article 21A of the Constitution

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

is concerned, it speaks about the Fundamental Right of Education, but in no way the Fundamental Right of Education of the students is being interfered. And as far as Section 27 of the Act of 2009 is concerned, it specifically provides that the services of the teachers can be taken. Although the Act of 2009 came into effect after the Supreme Court judgment, but under this provision a specific provision has been made that the services of the teachers can be taken. Section 27 of the Act of 2009 says “prohibits deployment of teachers for non-educational purposes, other than decennial population census, disaster relief duties or duties relating to elections to local authority, State Legislatures and Parliament, as the case maybe.”

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Is this the RTE Act?

SHRI P. P. CHAUDHARY: Yes, The Right to Education Act.

(Contd. by NBR/2W)

-SSS/NBR-RPM/2W/4.05.

SHRI P. P. CHAUDHARY (Contd): So, even under the RTE Act where the Fundamental Right of Education is prescribed, a provision has been made by Parliament that services of teachers can be requisitioned for the purpose of election of State Legislature, Parliament and election of

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

local authorities and local bodies. Therefore, there is a specific provision. So, apart from Article 324 of the Constitution, there is also a provision under Section 159 of the Representation of the People Act. There is also a provision under Section 27 of the Right to Education Act. But, no such suggestion has been made by the hon. Member that amendment should also be carried out to these provisions since these are still in force. So, Sir, this provision was made under Section 27 after the judgment of the Supreme Court and it specifically provides that services of teachers can be requisitioned and teachers can be deployed in the process of election.

Coming to the judgment of the Supreme Court, there is no blanket order as mentioned by the hon. Member. Hon. Member has mentioned as if Supreme Court has directed that deployment of teachers is prohibited.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): No, no.

The hon. Member said that it is an observation of the Supreme Court.

SHRI P. P. CHAUDHARY: Sir, now, kindly see the observation of the Supreme Court. It is at para 32. It says, 'We would, however, notice that the Election Commission before us also categorically stated that as

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

far as possible teacher would be put in electoral role, revision works on holidays, non-teaching days and non-teaching hours. Whereas, non-teaching staff be put on duty any time. We, therefore, direct that all the teaching staff shall be put on duty of roll revisions and election works on holidays and non-teaching days. Teachers should not ordinarily be put on duty on teaching days and within teaching hours." So, in pursuance of this, the Election Commission, from time to time, issued orders and one such order was issued way back in 2008, making it clear to all the concerned and respective authorities that teachers should not be deployed in view of the Supreme Court judgment. The order was issued by the Election Commission on 28th January, 2008. Sir, with your permission, I wish to read it. It says, "As of now, a holiday is declared on poll day. The Commission desired that if the day of dispatch of polling party happen to be the teaching day for schools then that day should also be declared a local holiday for school, wherever necessary. The Commission further directed whether teachers are appointed as Presiding Officer or other Polling Officer, the training session for them shall be conducted, as far as practical, on holidays." So, these are the orders. There is not a single order. But, there are so many orders.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

In view of the order of the hon. Supreme Court, the Election Commission has directed the following:

"Whenever teaching staff is put on duty of poll revision, the DEOs, EROs shall prescribe holiday and non-teaching days and non-teaching hours as the duty period of this work. Such appointees may be asked to avoid teaching hours and for undertaking roll revision work during roll revision wherever teachers are appointed as designated officers to make."

In view of the above, it is clear that even the Election Commission has taken precaution. So, the Bill moved by the hon. Member is devoid of any force and it lacks merit. The question is, in pursuance of the order of the hon. Supreme Court, the Election Commission has issued necessary orders and those orders are being followed.

Besides, we have to look at Article 51A of the Constitution which specifically provides the Fundamental Duties. It says, 'It shall be the duty of every citizen of India; (d) to defend the country and render national service when called upon to do so.'

(CONTD. BY USY/2X)

USY/2X/4.10

SHRI P. P. CHAUDHARY (CONTD.): Conducting election is basically a sovereign function. It cannot be conducted through the outsourced staff of various agencies of the private people because it is a question of accountability. It is a national service. Participation in democratic process is a national duty. It is not just a fundamental duty, but the process of democracy is the basic foundation of the Constitution of India. Apart from the constitutional provisions and apart from statutory provisions, the conduct of elections is just like a celebration. As per the basic structure of our Constitution, it is above Fundamental Rights. In case of a conflict between Fundamental Rights and the basic structure of the Constitution, the basic structure will have an overriding effect. So, the democracy is the essence of the Preamble of our Constitution, which is the basic structure of Constitution. Not only this, not only our students, even the foreign students visit India to see how elections are conducted in the biggest democracy of the world. They stay here for months together and study the election process. So, it is basically an education. It is not wastage of time. In other words, it is wrong to say that it is waste of teachers' time and wastage of teaching time. To my

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

mind, not only the teachers, there must also be a participation of the students in the process of elections. So, I suggest Mr. Tiruchi Siva to move another Bill for making a provision that not only teachers, but students should also participate in the process of democracy because it is the cardinal principle of the Constitution of India and the Preamble of the Constitution of India. ...(Interruptions)... We are, now, in a digital world. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: He is provoking me. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): No; no. Please be cool.

SHRI P.P. CHAUDHARY: Time is not far away, when we can have a 3-D form of education in all the schools all over the country. There are almost four lakh senior secondary schools in the country. So, the need of the teachers will be less. So, the participation of the teachers should be there in the election process. Participation of the students should be there in the election process, so that they can learn. It is a part of the education. We cannot say that it is not a part of the education. It is a part of the democratic process and helps us to learn about the strength of the democracy of our country. ...(Interruptions)... It has also been

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

raised that there is a paucity of teachers. ...(Interruptions)... I have come to understand that the matter of the paucity of teachers is pending before the Supreme Court of India. So, I would not like to comment on that count. Moreover, it is not under the domain of our Ministry.

As I have said, the elections are democratic process and conducting elections is a sovereign function. We cannot outsource the staff from private bodies for this purpose. This duty has to be performed by the people who can be held accountable and responsible. As I have already said, under section 159 of the Representation of People Act, 1959, not only teachers, the Election Commission takes staff not only from various Government departments, but also from the local authorities and even from the Government companies also. It is our duty to conduct free and fair elections. And, for this purpose, we need a large number of personnel to conduct the elections. It is only the schools that are spread in every part of the country. Their employees are spread all over the country. They are better equipped to participate in conduct of free and fair elections.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

Therefore, participation of teachers and also the participation of students should be made mandatory for a healthy democratic process.

(Contd. by 2y ____ PK)

PK-VNK/2Y/4.15

SHRI P. P. CHAUDHARY (CONTD.): It is an experience which is gained by the teachers. It is an experience which can also be gained by the students. If participation of students is not there, then, participation of teachers could be there. More experience about how our democracy is functioning will be gained by the teachers, which can, in turn, be taught by them to students in the schools.

Coming to the number of booths, now, approximately, 10,00,000 polling booths are there in our country. Approximately, 8,00,000 polling personnel are employed. Therefore, teachers alone are not enough. Requisitions are sent by the Election Commission for conducting of elections. That is why, Sir, our hon. Prime Minister has suggested that there must be a deliberation on the issue of conducting of simultaneous elections of Parliament, Lok Sabha, and the State Legislature. Sir, I thank all the Members who participated in the discussion -- Shrimati Viplove Thakur, Shri La. Ganesan who suggested use of technology in

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

education, Shrimati Vijila Sathyananth, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra Rao, Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu, Shri A. Navaneethakrishnan and Shri Shankarbhai Vegad. Sir, now, I request Shri Tiruchi Siva to kindly withdraw his Bill. Thank you very much, Sir.

(Ends)

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, actually, I was in a mood to withdraw the Bill after having heard the Minister's reply. But his reply was not convincing to me. He spoke as a Law Minister and not as a people's representative. He should represent all sections of the society. When the Minister of HRD has gone out to say ' deliberations are on to find out the solutions so that teachers are not occupied in such non-academic work which adversely affects the education of children', the Law Minister is speaking controversial. Two Ministers in the same Government are contradicting themselves. Sir, my intention to move this Bill was with a concern about two sections --one is the student community and the other is the teacher community. The students are deprived of having their education with the absenteeism of their school teachers. Already, I have said in my introductory speech -- I think the hon. Law Minister was not here then -- that

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

there are about 9,00,000 posts vacant in this country. Even in his own State, -- he knows very well -- the number is not less than a lakh. For UP and all, I have cited statistics also; I don't want to repeat that. So, already, there are vacancies and the teachers who are presently employed are being deployed for non-educational duties! I don't disagree with you that every one should have a responsibility in conducting elections, in holding elections, or, to be a part of that. But who are you deploying? In what type of job are they involved in? For example, I would say that in Tamil Nadu, when we were the ruling party, when our Leader, Dr. Kalaignar, was the Chief Minister, he engaged only lady teachers up to the level of fifth standard, because only they know how to deal with the students of that age. So, students, who are our future, need more attention of the teachers. As I rightly pointed out at the very outset itself, the quality of a nation depends upon its citizens, the citizens' quality is determined in a way, at least, by way of education and education is, undoubtedly, determined by the quality of the teachers. You were suggesting that they could be used during holidays. So, the teachers don't require rest at all! Whole day, they will be at school, teaching students of different ages and of different

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

temperaments, taking too much of pain; they have got their own families also; and, at the same time, you will also deploy them for non-educational duties, which means that teachers are not at all considered with some concern. So, the Minister, I think, spoke with a closed mind. He was not even able to convince me or say that it will be considered. The other Minister, who is related with the teachers and the students,(Interruptions).. -- let me complete -- has said that. I am glad that some people got themselves committed. They are against the teachers' community.

(Contd. by PB/2Z)

PB/2Z/4.20

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (CONTD.): Sir, the agony and the pain through which the teachers are undergoing when they are deployed for election duty, only they know that. I think, if opportunity warrants, some of the people would have listened to this debate. See, I have nothing personal with this. But a section of the society who is responsible for the future generation's upcoming, to bring them up, when they are in distress, when they are undergoing mental strain, when they are not able to take

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

care of their family because the whole day, they will be in the school ... (Interruptions)... Let me complete.

SHRI P. P. CHAUDHARY: Just a minute.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Let me complete. ... (Interruptions)... No, no. Please. I am not yielding. ... (Interruptions)... I will just conclude.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): Please continue.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: They spend the whole of the day at school with the students, teaching them, preparing themselves also. When they go to the school next day, they have to prepare themselves what to teach, how to teach. Other than the academic syllabus, they also have to teach them the value of life, the moral values of life, ethics of life. All these responsibilities are vested with the teachers and they have got their own family also, whereas, you will deploy them even during holidays for the election or non-academic duties. I think, it means there is no concern for the teachers' community. So, in that respect, you could at least consider it. What I suggested, in USA and in Australia, they have some voluntary programme. When I said that some people who can offer themselves to work for election duty could be deployed

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

for this purpose, some apprehension were raised even by my esteemed colleague, Mr. La. Ganesan, that they are not accountable. Who is accountable, who is not accountable, no one can be assured of. Everyone will be inclined to some political party or the other. A Judge in the court who is expected to be impartial, he also goes to a polling booth to vote. It doesn't mean that the party to which he is voting, he is associated with that. In a democratic country, every person has got a right to vote and that doesn't mean that they are inclined to that. So, the youth community, whom I said the 'unemployed youth', could be deployed for election duty after giving some proper training. You can deploy retired teachers. When you are re-recruiting teachers for teaching in the universities, why don't you recruit them or appoint them as electoral officer? So, I suggested some other alternates. You can find some other alternates if that doesn't work or if you have some apprehensions or you are doubtful about the sincerity and credibility of the youth community who are unemployed. They are going to become police officers, they are going to become teachers, and they are going to occupy many other positions. They are going to come here as law-makers. How can you doubt them that if they go to polling booth, they

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

will have some inclination? No. We cannot distrust anyone and we cannot undermine the sincerity or credibility of anyone. So, my basic intention is one that teachers must be relieved of this. Think of the lady teachers who go to these election booths. These polling booths will be in a remote corner somewhere where there will be no commodity. They don't have travelling facility. They will engage someone to go there. Where to stay at night? Who will take care of them? Who will provide them food? And those lady teachers don't have any place in a remotest village. In Bihar -- the hon. Minister, Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad, will agree -- in some polling booths, even those polling boxes are taken by way of boats. They don't have roads even. In such places, if some teachers are deployed, do we realize the pains that they undergo? Why don't we realize that? First of all, a politician or a law-maker should have a human approach. Then only law, then only everything else comes. When you are citing Supreme Court and some people are telling that this amendment is not necessary, I am happy that you confirm yourself that you are against the teaching community, you don't have any soft corner towards them. I quote it again. The Supreme Court has rightly observed, 'Holding of an election is no doubt of paramount importance

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

but the education of children cannot be neglected for this purpose! With an advent of technology, the requisitioning of a large number of people may not be necessary. We notice that the Election Commission has different roles to play. The Election Commission in our opinion can formulate an effective scheme to see that the services of a large number of teachers is not required. The state of primary education in India is in a deplorable condition. There is a heavy dropout from the schools particularly from the municipal schools. Sir, the Judiciary looks at issues on the lines of law but we, who are here as representatives of the people, should have an outlook of the people in a different manner. That should be human. We should have a concern for the poor, for the needy who are suffering. In that respect, so many teachers have represented to us. Some who have been teachers and now who are not teachers may not realize the pain or would have forgotten the pain.

(Contd. by 3a/SKC)

SKC/3A/4.25

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (Contd.): But those who are employed now have come to us and literally cried before me. It is that which prompted me to bring this Bill. He says, 'Why has he not brought a Bill for amending the RP Act?' That would follow, Mr. Minister. Even the Constitution is undergoing so many changes. We are amending the Constitution, which had been discussed at length for more than three years extensively in the Constituent Assembly. A Constitution that is considered superior all over the world is still undergoing amendments and you expect a Private Member Bill to bring forth all the amendments! Does your law or the Bills that you bring forth fully cover everything? Your Acts are amended again and again. They are relooked. So many things are being done. You brought the 2009 RP Act. What was the previous Act about? Why did you bring the 2009 Act? What does the RTE Act say? In a single Bill, I cannot provide that the RTE Act must be amended, the RP Act must be amended, the Constitution must be amended, and so on. That is not my job. My intention is to convey, through this House, or to create an awakening in the Government, to kindly consider and realize the pain and the agony that teachers of this country face because of their being deployed for election duties or non-

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

academic duties. When we talk about post offices, they are also engaged in various activities, but what is the job that the teachers are doing? They are dealing with children. They are teaching them. They are preparing them for the future of the country. They hold this big responsibility. Don't deprive them of this responsibility. Don't let them undergo mental strain. It is in this backdrop that I said that this amendment is necessary.

Sir, I am very thankful for this discussion. Many hon. Members have contributed and supported this Bill. The Minister's reply did not show any intent to consider this issue. Some people believe that whatever I bring forth must be opposed by them. In our State, if the State Government brings forth some legislation which is necessary for the people, we support it. There the Party does not come in.

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: Sir, we do not have any inclination to... (Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: But here, it is the convention... ..(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): Shrimati Vijila, please....(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, in a way, I am happy that they have themselves agreed that they are against the concerns of the teaching community and the pains that they are undergoing. ...(Interruptions)....

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: Sir, we are not against... (Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I am not yielding. I am not yielding. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: We are with the teachers. We stand by... ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... He has not named anybody. Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I am not yielding. The floor is meant for me. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): Please don't do this. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: Sir, he should not criticize what our Government... ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: It was deliberately done. ...(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

I am very happy that they have been exposed today again.
...(Interruptions)... They are against a section of the society.
...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): No, no.
This is not fair. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: Sir, the hon. Member should not
criticize any of the views placed before this House. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: That is because they are against the fact that a
Bill has been moved by a person from a Party that they oppose. They
have exposed themselves. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: That is not our intent.
...(Interruptions)... We are not against the teachers. We are with the
teachers. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): You have
made your point. ...(Interruptions)... Both of you have made your
points. Now, please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, everything is on record. ...(Interruptions)... It
was registered here that this amendment is not necessary.
...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: He must respect that somebody who.. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I do not wish to be interrupted. ...(Interruptions)... This is what I said. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): Please sit down. Let him complete. ...(Interruptions)... Don't divert the issue. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: I did not interrupt anybody. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: Sir, we are not interrupting, but by... ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): No, no. He has not named anybody. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: He should not blame us. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): He has not blamed you. He did not name any particular party. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: I didn't speak against anybody in particular. ... (Interruptions) ... I did say anything about anybody in particular. ... (Interruptions) ... The cat is out of the bag! The cat is out of the bag! ... (Interruptions) ... I didn't point at anyone, Sir. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: How will the Election Commission carry out this process? That is what we asked. ... (Interruptions) ...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I may be allowed to speak. ... (Interruptions) ... Everyone is concerned about... .. (Interruptions) ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): Please allow him to speak. ... (Interruptions) ... Mr. Siva, please address the Chair.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I said, we are concerned about this democratic country. Holding elections is a mandatory job. And I say it again to the hon. Minister that it is the people's responsibility to get involved themselves and contribute to democracy, not just by way of casting their votes. They may say that they are contributing to democracy, but they should also volunteer themselves by coming and working for the elections. They must help the Government and the Election Commission. Everyone has got that responsibility. When you

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

cite article 51A of the Constitution, 'Fundamental Duties', what does it say? It says that the parents have the responsibility to impart education to their children aged between 6 and 14. Now, while you are concerned about a part of the Constitution, I am concerned about other things as well. That is also a fundamental duty. When students are deprived of education because of the absence of teachers in the school, what will the parent do?

(CONTD. BY HK/3B)

HK/3B/4.30

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (CONTD.): So, Sir, my Bill's intention is simply based on two things. I am concerned about the future of the posterity. The younger generation should be fruitful citizens and they should set examples. Our country is thickly populated with youth community. Teachers are also undergoing the pain. I am very sorry that some people are opposing it. I don't mind that they have different views because this is a forum which has got different views. The debate is always that. Not everybody could be for; they could be against. But, at least, they should realize how it is to be done. They should have an

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

outlook for those who are undergoing trouble. It has to be done in a different manner. Technology is improving. There are so many people to offer themselves to take up the same duty. You consider some other sources. When I say, unemployed youth or retired teachers, you can say that you are not happy with this experiment. Then you find some other alternative. But you cannot outrightly reject that this amendment is not needed and only teachers should be committed and students should also come for election duties. Mr. Minister, I don't understand it. Students should not get involved in politics. It is the concern of even political parties. They should know politics but if they get into politics their future will be at stake. What is expected of teachers is basically to teach children and to shape the future of the country. In that situation, I brought this Bill. If I get a solid assurance from the Minister, I will withdraw it or else I move the Bill for passing.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW AND JUSTICE

(SHRI P.P. CHAUDHARY): Sir, the Supreme Court passed the direction in 2007 and in compliance with that direction that the teachers should not be engaged during the working hours or teaching hours, the Election Commission passed the order on 28th January, 2008.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

Thereafter, the Parliament enacted the Act of 2009, that is, the Right to Education Act, whereas the specific provision has been made under Section 27 with regard to the participation of teachers. So, compliance has already been made to a large extent and in view of that the services of teachers are only being utilized on holidays and non-teaching hours. The other staff in the country is not enough to conduct such a massive election in such a big country. We are the biggest democratic country where elections are held and where lakhs of polling booths are set up. We use all the staff, not only the teachers. What we are saying is that we are not only using the teachers, we are also using the other Government servants; we are using servants from local authorities and we are using services even from the companies. So far as the teachers are concerned, they are spread all over the country in rural areas. Democracy is the basic structure of the Constitution. To strengthen and conduct the free and fair elections, the services of teachers are required. In view of the Supreme Court's judgment, the services of the teachers are being utilized only during holidays and strict compliance is being made. So, I again request hon. Tiruchi Siva to kindly withdraw it. Hon. Prime Minister's electoral reforms are in pipeline. Whatever

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

suggestions the hon. Member has given, we will take them into consideration; everything is in pipeline. Thank you, very much.

(Ends)

THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD): Sir, I am very grateful that you have given me the floor, though the hon. Minister of State has done a very good job. Sir, I know hon. Member, Mr. Siva, for a long time and he is a distinguished friend and colleague. He has articulated a very serious concern and I do appreciate his concern that teachers must be put to the maximum use for teaching the students only. And that point is fairly well taken. I don't want to go into the judgment also. The judgment also says -- hon. Vice-Chairman, you have a very wide knowledge -- 'Ordinarily they should not be put on working days.' So, it is a wish of the Supreme Court. In view of the mandate of Article 324, hon. Vice-Chairman is very much aware, the entire domain is of the Election Commission. Since the hon. Member has articulated his concern, I wish to assure hon. Member, Mr. Siva, that these concerns shall be conveyed to the Election Commission.

(Contd. by YSR/3C)

-HK/YSR-SC/4.35/3C

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (CONTD.): That is what we will do. A serious issue arose here and the Election Commission should do the best while upholding the majesty of free and fair election. Please ensure that students and teachers are not unnecessarily disturbed. Kindly appreciate, hon. Vice-Chairman, the fact that whenever examinations are there, elections are normally not held during that time to disturb it in all the States of India, including your State. That care we do take. But a specific issue has been raised. We will convey this very serious concern to the Commission and I hope the Commission will take proactive measures. Our Government, the Prime Minister and the entire House are concerned that we need to further improve the electoral system. A lot of things are in the pipeline and there will be an all-Party discussion also. In fact, on behalf of the Government, I will tell my officers to convey it to the Election Commission that whenever there is any all-Party meeting with regard to electoral reforms, maybe hon. Siva's views should also be conveyed there to see the all-Party consensus on that.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

With these kinds of assurances which I am giving to you, I would request you to kindly withdraw the Bill.

(Ends)

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, this is what is expected of a Minister. As the MoS has suggested, nothing is static in the world. Even on the Constitution, there is a view that it needs to be relooked. When the Supreme Court gives a judgement, we enact a law to supersede that judgement. We have got powers to do that. You cannot cite a Supreme Court judgement and say that we should stop at it. You cannot cite an earlier Act and say that we should stop at it. We should always have an open mind to relook into the views and depending upon the existing situation, we need to amend the laws. That is how the evolution of law has taken place.

I thank my very good friend. I take the privilege of calling him as my very good friend for more than two decades. The hon. Minister is a legal luminary. He has rightly given me the assurance. I know very well that a Bill cannot bring so many revolutions and changes and that too a private Member's Bill. I just wanted to convey the sentiments of the teaching community and the pain which it is experiencing. As a

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

representative of the people, I think I have conveyed it rightly. So many hon. Members have participated in that. Taking his assurance into confidence, I withdraw the Bill. Thank you very much.

The Bill was, by leave, withdrawn.

(Ends)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): Now, I take up the Women (Equal Participation in Decision Making) Bill, 2015. Shri Anubhav Mohanty. He is absent.

Now, I turn to the Declaration of Countries as Sponsor of Terrorism Bill, 2016. Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar.

THE DECLARATION OF COUNTRIES AS SPONSOR OF TERRORISM BILL, 2016

SHRI RAJEEV CHANDRASEKHAR (KARNATAKA): Sir, I beg to move:

That the Bill to declare any country as state sponsor of terrorism and withdraw economic and trade relations with such country and to create legal, economic and travel sanctions for citizens of that country and for matters connected therewith or incidental thereto, be taken into consideration.

Sir, I thank you for allowing this Bill to be debated. On 18th September 2016, there was a terror attack in Uri and 19 lives were lost.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

This was one more incident in a series of incidents that this country had seen and those were lives in a series of lives that India had lost over many decades confronting terrorism.

But for me, it marked a turning point, at least, in my mind and I publicly promised that I would take on the important responsibility of calling Pakistan for what they are and what they have always been – a state sponsor of terrorism.

That is why, Sir, in the Winter Session of Parliament, I submitted a Resolution declaring Pakistan a terror state and I also moved a Private Member's Bill which is the Bill that has come up today for discussion and consideration. It is to call out countries like Pakistan that continue to associate, promote, patronise and sponsor terrorism against our nation. I also wrote to the leaders of all political parties to support this Resolution. Regrettably, the Resolution was not taken up. But the Bill was introduced in the Winter Session. Today, I am very happy to have this discussion commenced.

Sir, why this Bill? Many people told me that this is like another Private Member's Bill and that it will not see light of the day, etc. As I

have seen from my colleague Shri Tiruchi Siva's Bills, Bills like this do have a purpose.

(Contd. by VKK/3D)

-YSR/VKK/3D/4.40

SHRI RAJEEV CHANDRASEKHAR (CONTD.): They start a discussion and a conversation in this House that will perhaps not end and give the people of India a conversation or start a conversation on what should be really our relationship with Pakistan given that there is incontrovertible evidence that they support terrorism. Sir, for decades, India and other countries in the region have been victims of numerous terror attacks from organisations and individuals based in and with the support of elements in Pakistan. Yet, for decades, we have remained engaged with Pakistan in an attempt to draw it into the mainstream.

Sir, there is a basic tenet in criminality which you as a lawyer will recognise. Basic tenet of criminality and criminal conduct is that if criminals are not declared criminals and are not made to bear the consequences of their criminal actions, they will continue to be criminals. Sir, I am not a lawyer, but I extend this hypothesis or thesis that this is also true for countries that aid and abet terrorism and use

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

terrorism as a misguided tool of their State policy. Sir, if they are not brought to account, they will continue to violate all established laws and conduct. Sir, therefore, this Bill is to finally put into motion the process of calling terror sponsors to account for years of terror sponsorship and for causing losses of innocent lives not just in India but in the region around us, in other parts of the region and the world.

Sir, there is another important reason. The world is getting tired and has lost patience with rogue nations, nations that don't conform to global standards of civilised conduct and compliance with law as State sponsors of terrorism. And as world opinion consolidates around the conduct of some countries like Pakistan, the focus will naturally come on what the approach of India and the Indian Parliament to this threat is. Sir, I humbly state that it cannot be our case, as Parliament and as a country, that the world declare and treat Pakistan as a terror-sponsor while all we have done is a 1994 Parliamentary Resolution. Sir, I state humbly that it is time that we stopped running to other countries to declare Pakistan a terror State and stood up and did this job ourselves.

Sir, what is Pakistan's record? There is not one man or woman in this country that does not recognise its direct role in fostering terrorism

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

against India and not just for the last few years but for several decades. Not one man or woman of this country does not want Pakistan to be held to account. Pakistan's history and track record of fostering terrorism and terrorists is long and indeed distinguishable and incontrovertible. For example, Sir, the year 2016, the year that has just gone past, began with a terror attack in Pathankot on 2nd January in which seven people lost their lives. This was followed by a series of attacks in Gurdaspur, Machil, Pampore, Uri and Nagrota to name just a few. The year 2016 itself ended with an attack in Pampore. In all, we lost 87 lives and 165 militants were killed in 2016. How can we as Parliament forget 13th December, 2001 when this very Parliament, the temple of our democracy, was attacked by Pakistan-based terrorists killing as many as 15 people and injuring at least 20 people before our security forces gunned them down? How can we forget 26.11.2008, the Mumbai terror attacks? As the world watched in horror on television screens, Pakistan-based terrorists created a bloodbath in a series of 12 coordinated shooting and bombing attacks which lasted four days, killing 164 and wounding over 300 people. Sir, despite overwhelming evidence, including from captured terrorist Kasab and David Headley

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

pointing to Pakistan, that country continues to do nothing about prosecuting those responsible, confirming and reconfirming its deep involvement as a State that supports these attacks.

Sir, the irony is, despite undeniable evidence, incontrovertible evidence and widespread desire of the people of India, we have continued to engage Pakistan diplomatically, culturally and economically in a meaningless engagement, which, in my opinion, serves only one purpose – for time to pass by and memories to fade about the last terror attack. These meaningless dialogues have exposed one fundamental reality that Pakistani State will not do anything unless they are coerced or pressured to do so.

(Contd. by BHS/3E)

-VKK/BHS-HMS/3E/4.45

SHRI RAJEEV CHANDRASEKHAR (CONTD.): It is a fact, Sir, and we all can recognise it and we all must recognise it, that it is only after the Kargil bloody nose on Pakistan, the 97th bloody nose on Pakistan, that Pakistan turned responsive.

According to data from 1988 to 29th January, 2017, 14,741 civilians have been killed in terror attacks in this country, 6,274 security force

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

personnel lost their lives and we have killed 23,146 terrorists. On 22nd January, 1994, we, in this very House, unanimously adopted a Resolution condemning “strongly the continued support and encouragement Pakistan is extending to subversive and terrorist activities in the Indian State of Jammu & Kashmir”, stopping short of a stronger resolution to send a message to not only Pakistan but also the rest of the world that we will not take Pakistan sponsored terrorism as business as usual. We stopped short, Sir.

Until now, successive Governments, except for Shrimati Indira Gandhi's 1971 defeat of Pakistan in Bangladesh and Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee's crushing of Pakistan in Kargil, have done very little and continued to have meaningless debates and kept running to major powers to pressure Pakistan. It is for first time with this Government that we have demonstrated military resolve and use of the Army with its surgical strikes. But there is more that we can do and must do by using our diplomatic, legal and economic strengths. Our basket of options to bring Pakistan to book must be expanded beyond military. Which is precisely why I have introduced this Bill to use economic trade, sports, cultural sanctions with Pakistan, to review and repeal the Most-

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

Favoured Nation Status given by India to Pakistan and to review the Indus Water Treaty and to further punish those who aid and abet Pakistan.

Sir, let me just describe the Bill in a few sentences. The Bill is to declare any country, this is the format that will help India, and the Parliament and the Government can declare any Government, any state that sponsors terrorism against India. Whilst we recognise Pakistan as our principle aider and abettor of terrorism, this Bill can apply in future to other countries also that directly or indirectly aid terror attacks against India. I will not mention the names, Sir, but we have a fair understanding of which the other countries are.

This Bill, in Section 2(b), defines what a state sponsor of terrorism is. It is any country which, through its instrumentalities or retired officials or through deliberate negligence, provides support to terrorist acts directly or indirectly. Sir, this Bill defines terrorist act. It defines in 2(b) the state sponsor of terrorism and in 2(c) it defines terrorist act.

As one of the principal victims of terrorism for many, many decades, we can set the basis of defining what a terror act is even while

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

the United Nations still struggles to define terrorism. It is one of the ironies of the contemporary age that the United Nations even today struggles for declaring Hafiz Saeed a terrorist because they are quibbling about the definition of terrorist act. So, this Act defines under 2(c) what a terrorist act is. Through the following clauses, it lays out in very clear form what the economic and other consequences are that would be applicable to a state sponsor of terrorism that aids, abets, directly or indirectly, the terrorist act.

Sir, take for example, it talks about Heads of States of state sponsor of terrorism being prohibited to travel to and from India. It talks about business entities that are linked to the state sponsor of terrorism being sanctioned against conducting trade, investment or any form of other economic and commercial activity with any entity or the state, the country of India.

(Contd. by DC/3F)

DC-ASC/4.50/3F

SHRI RAJEEV CHANDRASEKHAR (CONTD.): It talks about overflight restrictions for entities that are linked to the state sponsor of terrorism. It talks about coastal prohibitions for entities that are linked to the state

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

sponsor of terrorism. Sir, I will conclude now. I can go on and on about this but I believe that the Government and Parliament must act now. The winds of change are blowing in the world against terrorism and terror sponsors. This is obvious and was obvious in the universal condemnation of Pakistan during the Uri terror attacks. In a sense it is a little ironical also that we, as a Parliament, have not done anything more than the 1994 Resolution because in September, 2016, the US Congress introduced a Bill. Senator Ted Poe and Congressman Dana Rohrabacher introduced a Bill titled, "Pakistan State Sponsor of Terrorism Designated Act". They were quite clear. They actually included the name "Pakistan" in the name of the Bill. I am actually trying to be much broader and saying this is not directed at Pakistan, but it is a declaration of state sponsor of terrorism. Senator Poe introducing the Bill stated and I quote, "Not only is Pakistan an untrustworthy ally, Islamabad has also aided and abetted enemies of the United States for years. From harbouring Osama Bin Laden to its cozy relationship with the Haqqani network, there is more than enough evidence to determine whose side Pakistan is on in the war of terror. And it is not America's." Sir, if you just take the word "America" out of

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

that quote and insert “India”, that quote holds good for us. Therefore, Sir, it is ironical and I repeat that while the US Congress, a nation that is miles away from Pakistan, has introduced a Bill and is debating a Bill or has debated a Bill, our Parliament has done very little since 1994. And I am going to cite one more quote from the same gentleman. He states, “Pakistan’s reckless behavior in this regard is a serious security risk to its neighbours and India, unfortunately, pays the price all too often. Not only is Pakistan an untrustworthy ally, Islamabad has also aided and abetted enemies for years.” So, Sir, let me end by saying, the terror attacks on India has not just caused loss to lives, it has caused significant economic loss to us. On one hand our businesses bleed due to Pakistan-sponsored terror, yet on the other hand we have continued to grant Pakistan the Most Favoured Nation status without the same being granted to us reciprocally. Pakistan poses a continual risk to the peace, security and stability of the region, harbouring terrorists and funding terror outfits that have orchestrated terrorism the world over. In addition to its diplomatic and military options, India can and should use its economic and trade strengths to send out a strong and firm message that we intend to change the relationship with Pakistan into

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

one where Pakistan is a more responsible and accountable neighbour. There is no justification in the world that allows a nation or group to perpetrate violent crime against innocent people. With this Bill, Sir, we in Parliament can reflect the will of our people because there is not a man or woman—as I said earlier—in this country who does not want that Pakistan be declared a State that sponsors terrorism. Sir, it is time that we should define what national interest means because we are seeing what the rest of the world is doing to protect their nations and their own people. I appeal to the House and all my colleagues here to start a discussion around this Bill to signal, internally and externally, the depth of our national resolve that there will be no more half measures when it comes to protecting India and its people from terrorism. Thank you, Sir. *Jai Hind*.

(Ends)

The question was proposed.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): Now, Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu. Your time will be up to 5 o' clock only.

श्री आनंद भास्कर रापोलू (तेलंगाना) : माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, सम्माननीय स्वतंत्र सदस्य दिखने के लिए तो स्वतंत्र दिखता है, मगर सत्ताधारी

सदस्यों से बहुत जुड़ा होता है। मेरे भाई राजीव चन्द्रशेखर द्वारा प्राइवेट रूप में लाए गए बिल के ऊपर चर्चा के दौरान, मैं सोच रहा हूँ कि कहां गए वे दिन?

(3G/KLG पर जारी)

KLG-KR/3G/4.55

श्री आनंद भास्कर रापोलू (क्रमागत): हम सोचते थे कि चाय पर चर्चा के लिए कराची तक जा सकते हैं, पाया पाने के लिए पेशावर तक जा सकते हैं, 2014 के बाद आप माहौल इतना बदलने वाले हैं कि अगल-बगल में हमेशा शरीफ और मोदी बैठने वाले हैं। What has happened exactly in between? With this, I am looking at the initiative of my esteemed friend, Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar. Our people, particularly the younger generation, are expressing their views during the sport and cultural events; and making us to follow what to do and what not to do, how to behave with a neighbour, how to stand, put forth our view, how to stand up. Since the present Government could not withstand and stand up to the exigencies of bilateral relations and cross border terrorism. They have very closely allied with the ruling dispensation. The hon. Member, Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar had to go for a resolution first, and now to come with a Private Member Bill to debate on this sensitive issue. We know that how we have invited the investigators across the border. They have

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

come over here to have the luxury of the VIP movement in the classified and restricted areas.

I belong to a party which is known for its sacrifices. We all know how Indira Gandhi had sacrificed her life; and how she stood for and what she had achieved. What was the achievement of my leader, late Rajiv Gandhi? We all know how we used to have India as a great idea of the sub-continent. Where exactly are we standing now? These are all the things that are coming to my mind while discussing about my friend, Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar's Bill. ..(Interruptions).. Yes, your concern. I appreciate your effort to make a detailed study and come up with 10 clauses. It is a great detailed Bill. This can be taken up by the Government for further consideration. But why has this occurred? Why is this happening? This is unnecessarily a futile exercise. It is not at all diplomatic. It is just a novice. It won't take the expert view and guidance from the right people. This type of decline has happened in our bilateral relations. What is happening in the Pakistan-occupied Kashmir? How are we looking at that problem? What are the concerns of the people living there? What is happening in Balochistan? How are we responding to those people? But just a lip sympathy is not going to serve in any

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

way. The son of Gujarat used to speak about those sensitive issues. He knows how sensitive the Rann of Kutch is. We know how he used to provoke the then UPA Government and challenge the Government with 56 inches chest. 56 इंच का वह सीना कहाँ गया? ...(व्यवधान)... वह सीना कहाँ गया? हम सोच-सोच कर गिर पड़ रहे हैं और साधना में, दिखाने में, करने में, हर चीज में आप गिरते-गिरते आ रहे हैं, इसीलिए यह बिल लाए हैं। Respected Vice-Chairman, this is a point of highlight. This is an occasion for the Union Government to take note of.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): Mr. Rapolu, as the Deputy Chairman has already informed, this Bill could be discussed till 5 o'clock; and the House should adjourn after that. But we have a certain other Business to take up. This Bill will be carried forward to the next day of Private Members' Bill as and when the House decides.

(Continued by 3H/KR)

KR/AKG/3H/5.00

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (CONTD.): Now the statement by the hon. Minister of State in the Ministry of Shipping, Shri Mansukh L. Mandaviya.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

**STATEMENT RE. ACTIONS TAKEN IN AFTERMATH OF SHIP
COLLISION OFF KAMARAJAR HARBOUR**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SHIPPING (SHRI MANSUKH L. MANDAVIYA): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, with your permission, I rise to make a statement on the actions taken in the aftermath of ship collision which took place off Kamarajar harbour.

Two vessels namely, M.T. BW MAPLE and M.T. DAWN KANCHIPURAM while crossing each other collided at 3.45 A.M. on 28 January, 2017 off the Kamarajar harbour. The vessel M.T. DAWN KANCHIPURAM, which was carrying 32813 Tonnes of POL, suffered a rupture which led to oil spill. There was no casualty or injury to the crew members. My colleague, Shri Pon. Radhakrishnan visited the collision site on 30.01.2017 and inspected the area where the vessels were anchored and gave appropriate directions to the Kamarajar Port officers.

Kamarajar Port deployed oil boom around the vessel to contain seepage. After examination, the damaged vessel was towed safely and berthed at Kamarajar Port on 30 January 2017. This vessel has already

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

discharged 30013 tonnes of POL and the remaining quantity is expected to be discharged today. This major step has prevented any further possibility of oil spill.

A massive cleanup operation was launched in Tiruvallur, Chennai and Kancheepuram Districts by engaging more than 2000 persons at various sites including Emavur, Chennai Fishing Harbour, Marina Beach, Besant Nagar, Kottivakkam, Palavakkam, Neelankarai and Injambakkam beaches. The Coast Guard has been co-coordinating the cleaning operations jointly with Chennai Port, Kamarajar Port, the State Government and its agencies, Indian Oil Corporation, NGOs, Cadet Trainees from maritime educational institutions and fishermen. A team of senior officers from Ministry of Shipping, Ministry of Petroleum & Natural Gas and D.G. Shipping were sent for an on the spot inspection of the affected areas and to coordinate and review the cleaning operations. They also met the Chief Secretary, Government of Tamil Nadu who has also held review meetings and is regularly monitoring the remedial measures being taken. The District administration is actively involved in the cleanup operations. The

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

Chennai Port and Kamarajar Port have set up Control Rooms.

At Ernavur, which had the maximum drift of sludge, booms have been deployed along the shore line to contain the oil spread. More than 1000 people were deployed here with portable pollution cleaning equipment for shore line cleaning. The required logistics and equipment support has been provided by the 'Chennai and Kamarajar Ports. Sufficient gum boots, gloves, buckets, mugs, liquid hand wash and drums have been provided to facilitate manual cleaning. In addition, 3 Super Suckers and submersible pumps have also been deployed to remove the oil spill. Coast Guard has also sprayed Oil Spill Dispersants for removal of oil slick.

(Continued by 3J/KS)

KS-RPM/3K/5.05

SHRI MANSUKH L. MANDAVIYA (contd.): The total quantity of sludge which has been removed till today is 65 tonnes. In addition, Super Suckers have removed 54 tonnes which contains 70 per cent water. More than 80 per cent of the work has been completed and most of the residual work is expected to be completed within two-three days. The

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

Indian Oil Corporation has provided special bio-remediation material for treatment of the collected oil sludge for its safe disposal.

The Coast Guard ship and helicopters are carrying out regular sorties for continuous monitoring of oil slick. If oil spillage accumulation is spotted anywhere, manpower and material under the overall supervision of Coast Guard will be deployed.

The Directorate General of Shipping has instituted an inquiry under the Merchant Shipping Act to ascertain the cause and contributory factors that led to the accident. The Government is taking all measures to manage the situation. My colleague, Shri Radhakrishnan P., will also be visiting the affected area again to take stock of the situation.

(Ends)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): Thank you. Now, clarifications. Shri Tiruchi Siva.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Thank you, Vice-Chairman, Sir.

Sir, this is a very, very serious issue in Chennai. Fishermen are not able to... ..(Interruptions)...

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): No speech, please; only clarifications.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (TAMIL NADU): Yes, I am seeking clarifications, Sir. Fishermen are not able to go out for fishing. I have a very specific clarification. This vessel, which has carried 32,813 tonnes has now discharged 30,013 tonnes; 2,800 tonnes is still remaining. But we would like to know how much has spilled over. The first information that was given by the Port Trust was that it was just one ton. Later, his hon. colleague mentioned 20 tonnes. But now, they say that 65 tonnes of sludge has been removed and the Super Suckers have removed 54 tonnes; also, they say it contains 70 per cent of water. But how has this been evolved? We do not know. So, even when they have agreed that 65 tonnes of sludge has been removed, I feel that much more is left there. Very rare species have perished and died due to this oil spill. Apart from the Government's efforts to remove the sludge, the youth present at the Marina Beach, who were agitating a few days back for *Jallikattu*, voluntarily came forward to help, and they used simple buckets. Now, technology has gone ahead to a different level and while foreign countries use much higher levels of technology, we are still

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

depending upon buckets and manual operations. I think the Government's intervention on a war-footing alone would save the fishermen and other people as well as the species found in the sea. So, Mr. Minister, you are saying that 80 per cent of the work has been done; but, in reality, it is not so. The situation in Chennai is still very bad. The oil spill has started spreading towards Neelankarai. It was near the Kamarajar Port, but now it has spread up to Mamallapuram. So, this point about 80 per cent recovery is not acceptable, but I would urge the Government to act much more swiftly to set right the situation. Kindly give us the correct statistics. People should not be misguided; we should not be misled with information saying it was one ton earlier, 20 tonnes later and now, 60 tonnes and 54 tonnes. So, any information that is given by the authorities should be factual. It should not mislead the people.

(Ends)

श्री अजय संचेती (महाराष्ट्र): माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, जो वहां एक्सीडेंट हुआ है, मैं उस सिलसिले में क्लेरीफिकेशन तो नहीं, लेकिन भारत सरकार को सिर्फ इस बात के लिए बधाई देना चाहता हूं कि without any casualty इतनी

बड़ी दुर्घटना को स्टेट गवर्नमेंट की मदद से काबू करने की कोशिश की गई है। इसलिए मैं भारत सरकार और राज्य सरकार, दोनों को बधाई देता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, one small thing. It says that the vessel had a rupture. When vessels carry such substances that could cause ecological damage, much care should be taken to check if the vessels are certified to sail on the sea.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): So, it is a suggestion.

(FOLLOWED BY RSS/3K)

PSV-RSS/3K/5.10

पोत परिवहन मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मनसुख एल. मांडविया): सर, एम.टी. बीडब्ल्यू मैपल और एम.टी. डॉन कांचीपुरम नामक दो शिप्स का एक्सीडेंट हुआ। जब यह एक्सीडेंट हुआ, तो उसके तुरन्त बाद ही सरकार और वहाँ की जो लोकल व्यवस्था थी, डिजास्टर मैनेजमेंट की सारी टीम वहाँ पहुँची। वहाँ पहुँचने के बाद उसको तुरन्त ही tow कर लिया, जिससे कि उसमें से ज्यादा ऑयल बह न जाए। उसमें से जितना भी ऑयल बह गया, उसके संदर्भ में तुरन्त ही कार्यवाही की। तत्काल कदम के तौर पर ऑयल एंड नैचुरल गैस वालों की टीम, हमारी टीम, हमारे मिनिस्टर भी वहाँ गए और वहाँ जाकर सब मॉनिटर किया। मॉनिटर करने

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

के बाद जो टीम काम में लगी हुई थी, फिशरमेन या जो भी उसमें जुड़े, जिस-जिस की भी आवश्यकता थी, सभी को उस काम में लगा दिया गया। सर, मुझे इस बात की खुशी है कि दो-तीन दिनों में यह सारा ऑपरेशन पूरा होने को आया है। तिरुची शिवा जी ने जो कहा कि उसमें जो तेल बह गया है, उसमें 65 टन जो गाद है, वह तो हट गयी, लेकिन इसके अतिरिक्त जो 54 टन गाद है, उसको भी रिमूव किया गया है। उसमें थोड़ा सा odour भी होगा। उसके लिए भी suckers और submersible pumps तथा जिस-जिस मशीनरी की भी आवश्यकता है, वह मशीनरी हम लगा रहे हैं। अच्छी बात यह है कि दो-तीन दिनों में वहाँ से जो जानकारी उपलब्ध हुई है और माननीय सदस्य ने कहा है कि शायद उसको और भी गति मिले। आज हमने वहाँ से सरकार से बोला भी है कि वहाँ मॉनिटरिंग करने के लिए हमारी शिपिंग मिनिस्ट्री के ऑफिसर्स भी वहाँ उपस्थित हैं और वहाँ टाइम-टु-टाइम मॉनिटर कर रहे हैं। इसमें कैजुअल्टी नहीं हुई है और जो ऑयल बह गया है, उसको भी दो-तीन दिन में सेफली रिमूव किया जाएगा। कामराजार पोर्ट में जो hazardous है, उसको रिमूव करने की सारी कार्यवाही खूब एक्टिवली चल रही है और उसका रिमूवल किया जाएगा।

(समाप्त)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY): Now, Special Mentions. Shri Basawaraj Patil, not present. Prof. M.V. Rajeev Gowda, not present.

Uncorrected/ Not for Publication-03.02.2017

श्री आनंद भास्कर रापोलू: वाइस चेयरमैन साहब, मेरी स्पीच कंटीन्यू होगी न?

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सुखेन्दु शेखर राय): वह बाद में देखा जाएगा।

श्री आनंद भास्कर रापोलू: बाद में कैसे, सर?

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री सुखेन्दु शेखर राय): वह बाद में देखा जाएगा। ...(व्यवधान)...

अगर टाइम है, तो मौका जरूर मिलेगा। ...(व्यवधान)... यह बिल कंटीन्यू होगा और अगर आपकी पार्टी का टाइम बचा हुआ है, तो आपको मौका जरूर मिलेगा।

Now, the House stands adjourned till 11 a.m. on Monday, the 6th February, 2017.

The House then adjourned at twelve minutes past five of the clock till eleven of the clock on Monday, the 6th February, 2017.